

## Aberystwyth University

### *Learning to perform*

Ivaldi, Antonia; Sanderson, Alice Scarlett; Hall, Gareth; Forrester, Michael

*Published in:*

Learning, Culture and Social Interaction

*DOI:*

[10.1016/j.lcsi.2020.100459](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lcsi.2020.100459)

*Publication date:*

2021

*Citation for published version (APA):*

Ivaldi, A., Sanderson, A. S., Hall, G., & Forrester, M. (2021). Learning to perform: A conversation analytic systematic review of learning and teaching practices in performing arts lesson interactions. *Learning, Culture and Social Interaction*, 28, [100459]. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lcsi.2020.100459>

#### **Document License**

CC BY-NC-ND

#### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the Aberystwyth Research Portal (the Institutional Repository) are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the Aberystwyth Research Portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the Aberystwyth Research Portal

#### **Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

tel: +44 1970 62 2400  
email: [is@aber.ac.uk](mailto:is@aber.ac.uk)

## Supplementary Materials

### Synthesis of Practices in detail

<b>1. ESTABLISHING AND MANIPULATING RHYTHM, SPACE &amp; TIMEFRAME: 10 publications [02/03/04/06/09/10/13/17/19/21]</b>	
<i>Dimensions</i>	<i>Description</i>
Performing in time to claps/clicks/ counts [Music and dance: 02/03/06/09/10/19/21]	Conductor/teacher counts in, claps or clicks fingers to co-ordinate class to a rhythm or tempo (or a change), to ensure performing in time. Can occur prior to – or overlapping with – the performance or show a lack of synchrony in time changes. Overlaps also with Practice 4 where there is emphasis on the count-in or rhythm.
Elongation of words to show tempo [Music: 02]	Elongation of words to show tempo or lengthening of vowels which directs the next performance in a specific way.
Creating space or filling in time in demonstration or action [Music and dance: 02/03/04/13/17]	Non-lexical vocalisations and pauses that sustain, extend or contract the turn space. This allows for repeats and movement or filling in time before demonstrations can begin. In a similar vein, talking through pauses allows continued playing without it affecting the timeframe.
Spatial directives depicting duration and tempo [Music: 06/21]	Spatial (verbal) phrases or directives that indicate note duration and suggested tempo, for example, “hold for two beats” or “don’t rush”.

<b>2. MAKING CORRECTIONS: 17 publications [01/02/03/04/05/06/09/15/17/21/23/25/28/29/30/31/32]</b>	
<i>Dimensions</i>	<i>Description</i>
Contrasting between desirable (correct)/undesirable (incorrect) versions [Music and dance: 01/03/04/05/06/09/15/17/23/30]	Includes moving out of the home position where teacher leans forwards and backwards in alignment with the phrase ‘instead’ to distinguish between the correct and incorrect version; using bodily quotes (enactment of the previous action) to demonstrate incorrect performance which is quickly followed by the correct version. The bodily quote provides the student with the opportunity to view their own performance against the correct one [03/30]; nonsense syllables in vocalizations, caricatures, mocking, or playing badly to exaggerate the incorrect version [03/04/05/06/17/23]; giving a positive assessment followed by a negative assessment or instructional talk, which then sets up the correction [05/06]; contrast pairs that help to distinguish between the incorrect playing and the correct one – they can also help to set up the correctable [06/09/17]; teacher contrasted between their own playing and the student’s through switching pronouns or talking in the third person, which helped to depersonalize the feedback when highlighting the differences in playing [30]. Finally, there were examples when demonstrations just occurred without a correct version appearing [15].
Demonstrating correct version with an object [Music: 17/23]	Teacher/conductor demonstrates the correct version of the performance with an object (baton) in assisting the correction of the shortness of a sound [17] or by moving the bow of the student to the correct position [23].
Corrections made in situ [Music: 02/31]	Corrections that occur during performance so the student can make an adjustment without stopping the performance. E.g., the teacher giving directives over the performance or pointing upwards during playing suggests a correction in intonation is needed [02] or touching the student’s shoulder whilst playing to correct posture [31].
Vocal framing/descriptions of upcoming corrections [Music and dance: 03/05/15/28/29]	Vocal framing or description of correction helps to engineer the corrective sequence and for the demonstration to be seen as a quote – helping to align body with talk [03/05], whilst an “if-then” or “which means” construction sets up troubled source and frames the demonstration or explains further what’s needed [15/29]. Where teacher themselves stops playing can also frame point of difficulty [28].
Teacher making own correction/problem, solving problems [Music and dance: 15/28/29/30]	Teacher having to correct themselves, e.g., erasing out on the board. This can also include the teacher giving the student the solution (e.g., “take time breathing”).

Exaggeration/emphasis orientates to correctable [Music: 06/21]	Exaggeration helps to highlight the correction, e.g., exaggeration of the correctable, forceful delivery or singing loudly to highlight the conductor's rejection of the performance, trouble source or the correct version [06/21]. Exaggeration as a practice is discussed more in Practice 4.
Making corrections through repeats [Music: 09/29]	E.g., corrections of pronunciations through multiple repetitions, which also serves to confirm the correction as correct.
Interrupting to make correction [Music and dance: 03/06/09/25].	Both teachers and conductors may interrupt the performance that indicates that a correction is needed or upcoming, thus a correction sequence is initiated [03/06/09/25].
Directing gaze to the problem [Music and dance: 03/09]	Teacher/conductor directing gaze or looking at body parts or objects to make salient the problematic behaviour and in assisting the correction [03/09].
Apportioning blame or locating problem [Music: 17/29]	Blame is apportioned as to who the culprit of the problem is, or who is wrong or right, when making the correction [29], which is also achieved by looking at the relevant musicians to locate the correction to them [17].
Assessments/evaluations leading to corrections. [Music: 02/05/28/29/32]	Assessments or evaluations made by the teacher/conductor that highlight areas of work, and thus, correction [05/28]. The frequency or severity of the problem may also be highlighted ("e.g., reference to "all the time", or "can of worms") [29]; and the teacher may prompt the student to play more so that a full assessment could be made [02]. In rare circumstances the student invites assessments from the teacher (e.g., "is that better") [28]. In contrast, improvement is depicted through upgraded assessments (e.g., "now you're caressing it" or "getting closer") [28/32], or that a lack of guidance, correction or playing indicates that no further work is required [28].
Clarifying of correction [Music and dance: 05/09/15]	Clarifying how to do something or explaining further in order to assist correction.
Other-initiated corrections [Music and dance: 02/09/15/17/28]	Self-corrections from students were made through apologies, restarts and stops to enable them to make their own correction [02]; a choir member overlapping singing with a negative evaluation that initiates a repair sequence [09]; the student correcting or questioning the teacher, or justifying playing decisions using the score as evidence [15/28]; and the conductor withholding a correction or only giving technical advice in order to provide an opportunity for self-correction [17].

**3. MIMING AND MIRRORING TO PROVIDE INFORMATION AND UNDERSTANDING: 8 publications [04/05/10/17/22/23/30/31]**

<i>Dimensions</i>	<i>Description</i>
Gestural mirroring of the vocalization [Music: 05/17/23/30]	E.g., fist shape emphasizing the word strong, the conductor passing the baton from one hand to the other to mimic the spoken words of “sustain” and “continuous”, moving the hand in an upwards and downwards motion to quote smoothness in line with the vocalization, or pointing to their ear when referring to listening.
Mirror/mimic movements of the body or object [Music and dance: 04/05/23/30].	Mirroring or mimicking of movements of the body or object, e.g., using high and low vowels to mirror the movement of the jaw to match the high to low register of the clarinet, using hand gestures to mimic fabric to be moved in a particular way, or miming the bow to illustrate what the teacher wants.
Body movements to show/mime range of playing or position of instrument [Music: 10/23/30]	Movements that depict the range of playing or positions or movement in breathing, e.g., the accompanist beating head and raising it up and down to co-ordinate with the bow’s structure and to show range of playing [10], or length of note through long bows or intervals through hand gestures [23], and teachers using circular motion or moving hands backwards or forwards to depict exhalation or inhalation required [30].
Gestures/singing to re-enact, confirm or describe [Music: 05/22/23/30/31]	Gestures or singing that confirm, re-enact or describe information, such as tone, accent or note duration, to indicate the piece of music being enacted or task to be achieved [05/22/23/30/31], thus helping understanding. It can also be used to illustrate what the teacher doesn’t want, for example, looking bored [23].
Making analogies between other sounds and tasks [Music: 10]	e.g., using animal sounds to show how the music is similar to familiar animal sounds.

<b>4. HIGHLIGHTING MOVEMENTS AND DEMONSTRATIONS: 14 publications [02/03/04/05/06/09/10/13/17/19/21/22/28/31]</b>	
<i>Dimensions</i>	<i>Description</i>
Decomposing/breaking down of movements [Music and dance: 03/13/17]	This breaking down of movements allows for attention to be given to specific areas.
Nonsense syllables used to emphasize [Music: 05]	To emphasize the indistinct nature of the student's performance.
Emphasis to influence/direct another's delivery [Music: 22]	Emphasis on words and in singing to engineer/direct same result by other speaker/performer.
Deliberate intention to exaggerate [Music: 10]	Showing intended exaggeration for the purpose of showing intent to highlight an action or utterance, e.g., saying "wow" to show surprise, or to open mouth in a deliberately exaggerated way.
Enhancing visibility [Dance: 03]	Enhancing visibility by demonstrating slowly or moving around the room so teacher could be seen from different angles. This may also be achieved in the repetition of demonstrations for observability.
Introducing/framing demonstrations [Music and dance: 13/19/28]	Introducing, explaining or framing movements to help make the object relevant, e.g., teacher might utter "you go" then provide the demonstration.
Add-ons [Dance: 04]	e.g., "so it's not this", after a bodily-vocal demonstration to emphasize further what it is not.
Pointing to specific aspects of the score/instrument [Music: 02/05/10/31]	Pointing to the score or instrument to re-orientate gaze and to show or confirm which aspect is being discussed. This might also include placing the object in front of the student's eye gaze to orientate attention and focal point of learning.
Synchronous verbal and embodied action to strengthen instruction [Music and dance: 03/04/05/10/13/19]	Verbal and embodied actions occur in synchrony in order to strengthen or emphasize the instruction. This may be to make relevant the demonstration, or highlight which part of a re-enactment is being referred to [05]; help describe or guide the students through the demonstration and what needs learning [13/19]; show contrast with the movements [04]; or add further meaning to demonstrations [10]. Related to this was the co-ordination of both verbal and embodied actions through the use of the present tense [03], and the use of pitch to complement and co-ordinate timing of demonstration [04].

Exaggeration/emphasis orientates to correctable [Music and dance: 03/06/09/21]	Used to orientate to a correctable (this might also include highlighting the incorrect one). This may include a forceful delivery of a correct passage, or mocking of an incorrect one [06]; presenting the troubled source itself e.g., “viola” [09]; arm gestures to emphasize corrected parts [09]; or singing loudly the problem source [21].
Emphasizing count-in or rhythm [Dance: 4/19]	Can be done by non-vocalizations as well as gestures. See further, Practice 1.
Changing tempo of vocalization [Music: 05]	Changing the tempo of vocalisation draws attention to issue and sets up next performance in a specific way.
Elongations and deep breaths to highlight [Music: 09]	Attention is brought to the object by elongating the sounds and using deep breaths.

<b>5. TEACHER/CONDUCTOR CONTROLLING THE BEGINNINGS/RESTARTS/END OF ACTIVITIES: 13 publications [01/02/04/07/09/10/12/17/25/28/29/31/32]</b>	
<i>Dimensions</i>	<i>Description</i>
Walking to and from student/performance space [Music and dance: 01/04/07/12/25]	Entering in and out of the performance space, or returning to the home position, indicates when performing should start and stop.
Removes object to make playing impossible [Music: 01/10/31/32]	Removing objects (e.g., score) makes performing impossible, and therefore ends the activity. This may also include the teacher taking the student’s hand [01/10/32]. The student can also control this activity by handing over their instrument to the teacher or running away (in the case of a young pupil), thus showing a lack of compliance [31/32].
Discourse markers that engineer starts and stops [Music: 02/09/10/17/29]	e.g., “alright” or “okay”, or in-breaths that ends, or returns to, or sets up the activity.
Teacher’s/conductor’s requests ends activity [Music: 09/17]	Teacher/conductor’s requests or repeats of correctables e.g., “short please” that can signal a return to, or end of, an activity and opens up a new activity or next phase.

Teacher's/conductor's gestures/gaze ends activity [Music: 17]	Teacher/conductor's gaze to re-orientate musicians or use of gestures, e.g., crossing and uncrossing of arms that ends activity.
Restarting comment initiates re-run of performance [Music: 12/29/31/32]	E.g., "let's do that again" or "first with the right hand" initiates another attempt or re-run of performance.
Accompanist controlling restarts [Music: 01]	Accompanist can also control the restarts by playing or not playing.
Engaging in new material [Music: 28]	E.g., teacher turning the page, or moving to a different piece ends the previous activity.
Overall summaries [Music: 28]	Overall summaries of the student's playing serve to move the lesson on or close it [28].
Uninterrupted playing suggests correct version [Music: 02]	Uninterrupted playing suggests correct playing and that a restart is not necessary.

<b>6. CUES FOR WHERE TO START/PICK UP FROM: 12 publications [02/04/05/06/09/10/19/21/22/23/29/31]</b>	
<i>Dimensions</i>	<i>Description</i>
Cues provided through teacher's playing/singing [Music and dance: 02/04/06/22]	Teacher playing/singing acts as cues for where to start from/pick up from/locate issue.
Location cues [Music and dance: 04/05/06/09/19/21/22/23/29]	Structuring instructions, deictics, or cues that show where to start from or that provide a specific location.
Cues from preceding features that provide information as where to come in/pick up from next [Music: 21/22]	E.g., preceding notes, tempo or pitch.
Practice projectors (or notice of upcoming playing) [Music and dance: 02/05/10/19/31]	Practice projectors may be used, or upcoming notice that the students will have to perform soon, e.g., "let's have a go". Can also include imperative directives e.g., "just play".



<b>7. STUDENTS SHOWING UNDERSTANDING: 16 publications [01/02/03/05/09/10/12/13/15/19/22/28/29/30/31/32]</b>	
<i>Dimensions</i>	<i>Descriptions</i>
Demonstration/playing shows understanding [Music and dance: 02/03/05/12/13/15/19/22/30/31]	These are often a preferred response to a teacher’s vocalization, or a problem that is resolved [02/03/05/13/22]. This might be a trying out of the teacher’s suggestions (e.g., new fingering or at least looking at their fingers to demonstrate compliance and understanding, or trying out steps alongside the teacher). However, this compliance or understanding might be rejected if the student reverts back to their own original way of doing the activity [30/31]. Similarly, an incorrect answer, silence, hesitation, pausing, staying still, or avoidance such as looking down can show misunderstanding or the need for more information [05/12/15/19].
Acknowledgement tokens show understanding [Music and dance: [01/02/03/10/12/22/28/30/31/32]	Can include nodding to show receipt, compliance and understanding.
Students’ use of ‘want’ [Dance: 15]	The use of ‘want’ registers the students’ understanding of what the teacher is wanting them to do.
Writing on score [Music: 09]	Writing/marking the score to acknowledge and show understanding of the teacher’s directives or advice.
Pre-empting what the teacher will say [Music: 28]	Pre-empting what the teacher is going to say or suggesting teacher’s assessment was not a surprise indicates prior knowledge. This also includes an overlapping on the corrective contrast pair which shows recognition of correction and alignment.
Claims at understanding [Music: 28/29]	E.g., “oh I see” or acknowledgement that they are doing it right, e.g., “hurrah”.

<b>8. GETTING READY TO PERFORM: 9 publications [01/04/05/07/10/13/19/22/29]</b>	
<i>Dimensions</i>	<i>Description</i>
Shifting of body weight [Music and dance: 07/13/19]	Shifting of body weight from one foot to another, swaying, or moving backwards and forwards.
Preparing or making contact with voice/instrument/music [Music: 01/05/07]	E.g., pointing to instrument, opening mouth, placing instrument (clarinet) in mouth, accompanist putting hands to piano keys, taking an in-breath, or teacher pointing to the music. It may also include the actual playing of initial notes/chord.
Summarizing a move of teacher [Dance: 04]	Summarizing a move of the teacher's as they move into their own practice.
Making small bodily movements in readiness [Dance: 19]	After a completed turn, students making small bodily movements in readiness to move such as touching face, playing with hair or tapping toes.
Co-ordinating action [Music and dance: 01/07/10/19/22/29]	Turning heads/looking at others/partner, getting ready for action and co-ordinating playing, e.g., turning to face the audience or accompanist, moving closer to partner, or connecting hands. Can also include the teacher looking at the student to engineer action or conductor moving back to playing position to get orchestra ready.

<b>9. MAKING LEARNING INCLUSIVE AND COLLABORATIVE: 6 publications [12/21/25/28/29/30]</b>	
<i>Dimensions</i>	<i>Descriptions</i>
Inviting audience into the learning dialogue [Music: 12/25]	Through walking over to, turning to or pointing to the audience/other students to give feedback or to question them includes everyone in the learning, and identifies student as beneficiary of audience feedback.
Creating, including, and combining different viewpoints [Music: 21/28/30]	May include reference to the composer's intentions through pronoun use or pointing to the score [30], or in the solving of problems together (e.g., "that's what we'll do") [21/28/30].

<p>Drawing on own perspectives to become part of the collaboration or problem [Music: 29/30]</p>	<p>Can include the teachers' own experiences or those of other musicians to enable the students' experience to become a shared one (e.g., experiencing nerves whilst performing), which can help to normalize the issue.</p>
<p>Creating different categories and identities within all participants [Music: 12/28/30]</p>	<p>Teachers creating categories or participants through pointing or pronoun use that separates out the identities of the player from the audience [28], or to allocate an issue to a specific group of musicians [30]. This illustrates when an issue or teaching practice is applicable to all or only certain performers, and thus is not always inclusive. The teacher can also place themselves in different categories within the learning dialogue through gesture, e.g., applauding the student which places them as an audience member [12].</p>