The role of Welsh language media in the construction and perceptions of identity during middle childhood.

PhD: Helen Davies
Aberystwyth University
Volume I of II
Abstract

The aim of this research was to identify the role that minority language media plays in the construction and perceptions of identity during middle childhood, focusing on 10 to 12-year-old bilingual children in Wales. Often referred to as the 'transition phase', this period represents an important developmental milestone in the context of identity formation, where 'the individual who was a child is now en route to becoming an adult' (Durkin 1995: 508). The focus of this work is to attain a better understanding of how young [Welsh/English] bilingual children in Wales navigate these multiple identities.

In order to achieve the aims of this research, the focus was placed on language and identity in relation to children's use of and engagement with minority-language media. For many bilingual communities, there is a natural interaction that occurs between both languages through code-switching (cf. Wei, 2000). For multilingual children and young people, issues of cultural belonging and cultural identity can add to issues and challenges of self-representation and identity. Language competencies can vary and, for many, confidence in their own language ability can determine language use.
Acknowledgements

The completion of this doctoral research could not have been possible without the continued support from the staff at Aberystwyth University, family and friends. I would like to give special thanks to both Dr Merris Griffiths and Professor Elin Haf Gruffydd Jones for their guidance and support throughout this process. Special thanks must be given to Merris for her detailed feedback, endless discussions over coffee and curry, and when needed, her tough love approach! I would also like to thank the staff at the Postgraduate office, especially Ceris Medhurst Jones for all her help with the administrative side of things.

An enormous thanks must go to the schools and parents for allowing this research to happen but most importantly the children, for without them this research would be nothing. The focus group sessions were always fascinating, insightful and extremely good fun. The maturity they brought to the research process made data-gathering an interesting and pleasurable experience, and for that I thank you all.

In terms of family and friends, the support I have received has been overwhelming, making this journey considerably more bearable. To my husband, Barrie Weston, I would like to thank you for the endless cups of tea, late night proof readings and your incredible sense of humour that has kept me sane over the past four years. I'd also like to thank my Dad, my sister Catherine and brother-in-law Karmelo for your continued support!

Finally, the biggest thanks must go to my mother, Dr Marlene Davies, who has been my rock through this process. Thank you for taking the time to read every single piece of work connected to this project providing feedback and encouragement along the way. Both you and Dad have always stressed the importance of education and have instilled a can-do attitude in me, for which I am eternally grateful. Diolch!
Preface

As a bilingual child growing up in Wales during the 1980s and 1990s S4C (Sianel Pedwar Cymru\(^1\)), the designated Welsh-language broadcasting service (S4C), had always been there, nestled in the pre-digital, analogue service. Though perhaps not my first channel of choice as a child, it was nevertheless a feature, occupying its own designated media space, providing an alternative Welsh-language option. For those who fought relentlessly for the right to provide the Welsh-language with a broadcasting voice, the channel represented the fight against language oppression and became a symbol of the Welsh-language maintenance campaign. For thousands of Welsh-speaking children, however, it simply represented a platform whereby characters such as *SuperTed* and *Wil Cwac Cwac* came to life. Understanding the significance that bilingual children during middle childhood place on Welsh-language media was one of the driving forces behind this research.

This doctoral research project came about following a Knowledge Transfer Partnership between Aberystwyth University and the Cardiff-based production company Boomerang+ (now Boom pictures). While the KTP project sought to better understand the media practices and preferences of young Welsh speaking audiences in Wales, little attention had been given to the wider issues relating to the role Welsh-language media play in the construction of linguistic identity.

\(^1\) Channel Four Wales
Table of Content

1  CHAPTER 1 ......................................................................................................................... 1
   1.1  Introduction .................................................................................................................. 1
   1.2  Foundation of the Research ....................................................................................... 7
   1.3  A Brief Historical Account of Broadcasting in Wales and its Impact on National
        Consciousness ............................................................................................................. 10
   1.4  Aims and Objectives ................................................................................................. 16
   1.5  Research Questions .................................................................................................... 24
   1.6  Breakdown of Chapters ............................................................................................. 28

2  CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW ............................................................................. 31
   2.1  Introduction ................................................................................................................ 31
   2.2  The Basic Themes: Identity construction in relation to Language, Media and
        Childhood ..................................................................................................................... 33
         2.2.1  Language and Linguistic Identities: Contextualising the Welsh Minority-language
               Maintenance Campaign in Relation to Identity and Language Choice .................. 34
         2.2.2  Bilingualism and Diglossia: The Complexities of Bilingual Communities .......... 36
         2.2.3  The Media and Media Identities: Onscreen Visibility and the Changing Media
               Landscape in the Production of Children’s Content .................................................. 42
         2.2.4  Childhood and Childhood Identities: The Social Construction of Childhood .... 45
   2.3  Organising Themes: A Cross-Disciplinary Study: Understanding the Relationships
        that Exist Between Each Theme ..................................................................................... 48
         2.3.1  The Media as a Nation-Building Tool .................................................................. 50
         2.3.2  Language Prestige and Minority Language Media ................................................. 54
         2.3.3  The Importance of Scheduling in Children’s Broadcasting ................................. 57
         2.3.4  Children’s Minority-Language Media in the Digital Age .................................. 63
         2.3.5  The Complex Relationship between Welsh Medium Education and Welsh-language
               Media ....................................................................................................................... 65
         2.3.6  Welsh-language Education: A Varied Approach .................................................... 67
   2.4  Global Themes: The Transition Phase ......................................................................... 70
         2.4.1  Peer and Adult Relations: Language Choice and Self-Expression ....................... 71
         2.4.2  Education and the Transition Phase ..................................................................... 74
         2.4.3  Self-Identification and Affiliation to Culture and Place During the Transition Phase...
               ............................................................................................................................... 75
   2.5  Summary ...................................................................................................................... 75

3  CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY ....................................................................................... 78
   3.1  Introduction ................................................................................................................ 78
   3.2  Section 1: Data Gathering Research Methodologies ...................................................... 80
        3.2.1  Theoretical Overview: The Importance of Conducting Research with Children and
               Appropriate Methodological Approaches .................................................................. 80
               3.2.1.1  Focus Groups ................................................................................................. 81
               3.2.1.2  Creative and Task-Based Research Methods ..................................................... 84
3.2.1.3 Ethical Considerations ................................................................. 85
3.2.2 Pre-research and Pilot Studies: The Application of Knowledge to Research Design.. 88
  3.2.2.1 Using Visual Stimuli: Show-reel ................................................... 90
  3.2.2.2 Compare-and-Contrast Task: Magazine-Styles Programme ..................... 91
  3.2.2.3 Focus Groups Featuring Arts Based Activity ..................................... 91
  3.2.2.4 Pilot Study Outcomes ............................................................... 92
3.2.3 Focus Group Schedule ........................................................................ 96
3.2.4 Site and Sample Selection .................................................................... 101
  3.2.4.1 Difficulties and Justifications ......................................................... 111

3.3 Section 2 Data Analysis Research Methodologies ...................................... 112
  3.3.1 Theoretical Overview of Data Analysis Methodologies Appropriate for Focus Group Research ........................................................................................................... 112
  3.3.1.1 Thematic Analysis .......................................................................... 113
  3.3.1.2 The Successful Application of Thematic Analysis: Transcription .............. 114
  3.3.1.3 The Successful Application of Thematic Analysis: Thematic Coding ......... 116
  3.3.2 The Application of Thematic Analysis to the Research ............................ 119
  3.3.2.1 Linguistic Identity and Media Identity: Interconnecting Themes .............. 122
  3.3.2.2 Media Identity and Childhood Identity: Interconnecting Themes .......... 124
  3.3.2.3 Childhood Identity and Linguistic Identity: Interconnecting Themes ........ 127
  3.3.2.4 Mapping Continuities and Change ................................................... 128
  3.3.2.5 Writing up Thematic Analysis: Presenting the Findings ....................... 129

3.4 Summary .................................................................................................. 130

4 CHAPTER 4: INTERCONNECTIONS BETWEEN LINGUISTIC AND MEDIA IDENTITIES: FINDINGS ................................................................. 132

4.1 Introduction ................................................................................................ 132

4.2 Media as a Tool for Language Acquisition (Phase 1 Findings) ..................... 133
  4.2.1 Phase 2 Findings: A Comparative Study Mapping Continuities and Change in Relation to Media as a Tool for Language Acquisition ......................................................... 142

4.3 Welsh-Language Media as a Nation-Building Tool ..................................... 151
  4.3.1 Phase 2 Findings: A Comparative Study Mapping Continuities and Change in Relation to Welsh-Language Media as a Nation-Building Tool ......................................................... 162

4.4 Summary .................................................................................................. 176

5 CHAPTER 5: INTERCONNECTIONS BETWEEN MEDIA AND CHILDHOOD IDENTITIES: FINDINGS ................................................................. 178

5.1 Introduction .............................................................................................. 178

5.2 Media Engagement and Self-Representation ............................................. 179
  5.2.1 Negative Accounts of Onscreen Inclusion/ Participation ............................ 181
  5.2.2 Positive Accounts of Onscreen Inclusion/ Participation ............................ 185
  5.2.3 Phase 2 Findings: A Comparative Study Mapping Continuities and Change in Relation to Both Negative and Positive Accounts of Onscreen Inclusion/ Participation ............................ 187
  5.2.4 Online Use and Engagement .................................................................. 191
  5.2.5 Phase 2 Findings: A Comparative Study Mapping Continuities and Change in Relation to Online Use and Engagement ................................................................. 194

5.3 Access and Service .................................................................................... 198
  5.3.1 Shared Viewing Experience ................................................................... 198
List of Figures

Figure 1, ‘Proportion of people (age 3 and over) able to speak Welsh’, Source: National Survey for Wales, 2013-2014: Welsh Language Survey, page 21.

Figure 2: ‘Percentage of people who speak Welsh by age and source’, Source: National Survey for Wales, 2013-2014: Welsh Language Survey page 19

Figure 3: ‘Percentage of how often fluent Welsh-speakers speak Welsh by age’, source: National Survey for Wales, 2013-2014: Welsh Language Survey, page 29

Figure 4: Year 2 Learners assessed in Welsh first Language, figures taken from the Welsh-medium Education Strategy Annual Report 2015, Welsh Government.

Figure 5: Structure of Thematic Network (Attride-Sterling 2001: 387)

Figure 6: The relationship between bilingualism and diglossia (Fishman, 1967:

Figure 7: Example of Scheduling Board

Figure 8: Focus Group Question Set 1

Figure 9: Focus Group Question Set 2

Figure 10: Focus Group Question Set 3

Figure 11: Focus Group Question Set 4

Figure 12: Focus Group Question Set 5

Figure 13: Focus Group Question Set 6

Figure 14: Site and Participant Selection Indicating Linguistic, Gender, Age, Geographic and Socio-Economic Statistics.

Figure 15: Classifications of Media as a Tool for Language Acquisition

Figure 16: Classifications of Media as a Nation Building Tool

Figure 17: Classifications of Media Engagement and Self-representation

Figure 18: Classifications of Access and Service
Figure 19: Classifications of Viewing Preferences

Figure 20: Classifications of Language Use

Figure 21: Thematic Network System Mapping the Dual-phase Approach

Figure 22: Onscreen Participation and Appearances

Figure 23: Classification of Content

Figure 24: 10 Top Ten Most Listed Programmes during Exercise 1 & 2 Phase 1

Figure 25: 10 Top Ten Most Listed Programmes during Exercise 1 & 2 Phase 2

Figure 26: Individual Programme selection, Exercise 1 Findings

Figure 27: Comparable Pie Charts to demonstrate changing programme preferences for Exercises 1 and 2 from Phase 1 to Phase 2.

Figure 28: Number of Selected children’s programmes During Exercise 2
Chapter 1

1.1 Introduction

The United Kingdom comprises of four countries, namely England, Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland. Its present formation represents a complex history of displacement, unions, controls, conflicts and independence that have shaped the current landscape of the Isles of Britain and Ireland (cf. Davies, 1999). For many within the Celtic peripheries, the dominance of England in this union has often been seen as problematic, even damaging to the cultural, economic and linguistic life of the Celtic nations within the United Kingdom.

The formal union between England and Wales dates back to the thirteenth century and the Statute of Rhuddlan, which, following the death of Llewelyn ap Gruffudd, saw the Principality of Wales appropriated by the English Crown. While this new administration, led by Edward I, resulted in the implementation of English Criminal Law in Wales, the Law of Wales was permitted in other matters (Davies, 1993). However, in 1536 under the Act of Union between England and Wales, the annexation of Wales by the United Kingdom of England saw the complete abolition of the Welsh legal system in favour of the English arrangement. This subsequently led to the Welsh language being ousted from any official role or status. Despite the Welsh language losing its official status, Welsh remained the spoken language of the people of Wales and, following the translation of the Bible into Welsh in 1588, became the de facto language of religion in Wales.

With the rise of the (Second) British Empire during eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, the assimilation or Anglicisation of Wales into the wider ‘British’ state was crucial to the growth of the Empire. Often referred to as the period of ‘great transformation’ (Polanyi, 2001), the social, political and economic changes that occurred in Europe during the Industrial Revolution sparked a wave of interest

---

2 Llewelyn ap Gruffudd is regarded as the last true Prince of Wales who led a revolt against the Kingdom of England under the rule of King Edward I. Regarded as the lord who was the keystone where the Welsh conjugated, his death in 1282 marked the destruction of the polity of Wales his ancestors had fostered (Gruffudd cited in Davies, 1993).
in ideas of collective identity, nationhood and the importance of the nation-state. These changes were often associated with and facilitated by the rise of mass communication in the form of print media. According to Gellner (1983), the formation of the nation-state represented a means of delivering capitalist industrialisation. Nationalist policies were formulated in order to create or ‘invent’ nations, with national ‘cultures’ spread by print media and ‘values’ instilled through education (ibid). Anderson (1983), on the other hand, explained how rapid urbanisation and increased secularisation led to new ideas of identity constructed around the nation and nation-state. Advances in printing during the nineteenth century led to the widespread distribution of national newspapers, allowing people to not only imagine the nation, but to also ‘see themselves as members of linguistic communities’ (Smith 1999: 8).

This notion of linguistic communities was often seen as problematic when looking at Wales within the context of the British nation-state, due to the continued use of the Welsh-language. During the turn of the nineteenth century, it is estimated that the majority of the population of Wales spoke Welsh habitually. Official figures on the number of Welsh speakers in Wales do not appear until the 1891 census, where, for the first time, questions were asked in relation to the Welsh language. The 1891 census revealed that 30.1% of the population spoke only Welsh, with a further 23.9% speaking both Welsh and English (ONS, 2001: 4). This fundamental social and cultural difference between England and Wales often led to negative perceptions of the Welsh. During this period, Wales, like many small nations and regions of Europe, ‘sought to create an image of itself as a unique and individual entity’ (Bala, 2013: 1).

Barlow et al. (2005) note how this formal union between England and Wales has often been characterised ‘at best, as less than positive and, at worst, even destructive, impacting negatively on the economy, the environment and the social and cultural life of Wales’ (Barlow et al., 2005: 5). One example of the destructive nature of this union was the publication of the Blue Books³ in 1847. Commissioned by the House of Commons, this public inquiry reviewing the state

---

of Welsh education in Wales stated that the Welsh language was a ‘disastrous barrier to all moral improvement and popular progress in Wales’ (extract from the Blue Books cited in Hechter, 1999: 75). In addition to the ‘linguistic barriers’ facing the people of Wales, due to their perceived ignorance of the English language, the rise of non-conformity in Wales was also considered a factor contributing to their immorality. As a response to these negative perceptions, Welsh nationalism grew as a means of safeguarding Welsh values and the Welsh language. As noted by the historian Gwynne A. Williams (1985), Wales became a nation able to invent and recreate its existence through intangible cultural heritage, education and, in turn, mass communication.

Despite efforts to devalue and even eradicate the Welsh language, it is still spoken in Wales today by around 562,000 people, or 19.8% of the population (ONS Census figures, 2011). While this figure is lower than the recorded figure taken from the 2001 census (20.8%) (IWA, 2001), figures from the Welsh-medium Education Strategy Annual Report in 2015 indicate that 22.2% of year 2 children in Wales were attending Welsh-medium primary schools in 2014. The rise in the number of young Welsh speakers has often been attributed to the successful implementation of Welsh language education policies, which have in turn been supported by an established Welsh-language media.

The media now represent an important aspect of social life, not only as a means of mass communication, but also as an economic and political commodity (Anderson, 1983: 37). Since the mid-twentieth century broadcast media have become an increasingly important symbol of the minority language maintenance campaign. Riggins (1992: 3) asks, ‘what better strategy could there be for ensuring minority survival than the development by minorities of their own media conveying their own views in their own language?’ While mass media may not be an achievable reality for all minority-language communities, according to Fishman, it has become a ‘fetish for some minority language activists’ (Fishman, 1991: 482). Wales’s rich broadcast-media tradition encompassing both traditional media4 and new/multi-platform media is often seen as a benchmark

---

4 In this instance, ‘traditional media’ refers to the traditional forms of broadcast media, namely radio and television services.
of a successful implementation of multi-platform minority-language media service. This media tradition dates back to the early 1900s and is rooted in the political, social and cultural struggle of the Welsh people to preserve their cultural heritage, and specifically language. The foundation of a Welsh-language radio service (BBC Radio Cymru) in 1977, a designated Welsh-language television channel (S4C) in 1982, and most recently (in 2014) a fully responsive, multi-platform Welsh news service (BBC Cymru Fyw) have been the results of a highly politicised struggle, which, at times, divided the Welsh nation. According to Davies (2014: 68), broadcasting has been the most disputatious issue where the Welsh language has been concerned, with education being a ‘close second’.

The main objective of this research was to investigate the role that the Welsh language media played in the construction and perception of identity during middle childhood in contemporary Wales. While media engagement was the primary focus for mapping identity construction, education has also played an important part in shaping the narrative surrounding national consciousness and linguistic identity in Wales. Whilst Wales may now boast an established Welsh-language multi-platform service, Blandford (2007: 87) explains how the fight to maintain S4C, the world’s most ‘heavily subsidised television station’ (in relation to its audience) continues in a globalised multi-channel media market. Despite the successful evolution of a service with partial Welsh-language provision in 1982 to a ‘wholly Welsh language channel’ (www.S4C) by 2010, S4C is faced with enormous challenges in this ever-changing media landscape. In 1999, Kelly-Holmes (1999: 1) wrote of the perceived destabilising effect the multi-channel environment may have on the development of society, specifically the potential effect on identities, our sense of time, space and place, and especially language. Low audience ratings reported in the press, together with a significant shift in the funding arrangement and a 24% cut to the annual budget (S4C, 2014) meant, at the time of this research, the future of Welsh-language broadcasting in Wales looked increasingly threatened. In 2014, S4C published a report entitled *The Future of Welsh Language Television*. This was the broadcaster’s first public

---

5 In 1982 S4C only provided viewers with 22 hours of Welsh language programming a week, with the remaining content consisting of programs aired on Channel 4.

6 S4C currently operates as a wholly Welsh language channel, broadcasting over 115 hours of programmes each week.
contribution to the discussion, looking at the service’s future beyond 2017. The uncertainty linked to the future of the service arguably poses a real threat to Wales, both economically and culturally, and understanding how this might affect young people in Wales sits at the heart of this research.

In recent years, the media landscape has altered dramatically through the introduction of digital, multi-platform and multi-channel free-to-view services, changing the way in which the media are consumed globally. Such innovations have had a profound effect on Public Service Broadcasting (PSB), with Ofcom’s recent review of PSB in the UK identifying some immediate concerns surrounding the provision of news consumption, the portrayals of British society through drama, content tailored to the specific needs of the UK Nations, and children’s programming (Ofcom 2015). In the UK, there are five PSBs, namely the BBC, ITV, Channel 4, S4C and Channel 5 (DCMS, 2015: 77), which all have varying funding and service commitments. Following budget cuts proposed in late 2010 and the internal restructuring of the channel, S4C now receives £6.8 million per annum from a direct Government grant and a further £64.5 million per annum via the licence fee (ibid: 30). As the BBC provided the majority of S4C’s budget, the recent debates surrounding the future of the BBC (specifically its funding) posed a significant potential threat to the Welsh-language service (Culture Media and Sport Committee: Future of the BBC, 2015).

At a time when additional cuts are being considered across the board, the drive to protect and maintain services like S4C became increasingly ideological. According to House of Commons Welsh Affairs Committee: S4C (2011: 6) report, S4C ‘holds an iconic position in Wales’. The report explained how, ‘following its nearly thirty years of broadcasting’, there was a general consensus amongst the people of Wales that S4C had ‘helped shaped the identity of the Welsh nation’ (ibid). The former Controller of BBC Wales, Geraint Talfan Davies, who, at the time of publication was the Chairman of the Institute of Welsh Affairs, substantiated such claims. According to Talfan Davies, this shaping of national consciousness was based on three distinctive values. Firstly, its intrinsic value as

---

7 The Department of Culture, Media and Sport.
8 These budget allocations are based on 2016 figures.
a broadcaster, through commissioning and airing quality content that appealed to the people of Wales. Secondly, its public value through its ability to support Welsh-language education and create a thriving media industry delivering economic benefits, and thirdly, its institutional value, in terms of servicing the Welsh-speaking communities in Wales (ibid.).

There is no denying that the media represent an important aspect of social, economic, political and ever-increasing cultural life. The topic of the media and the perceived ways in which it can influence identity construction is an area that has attracted the attention of academic researchers in recent years. This is especially relevant in terms of the current changes occurring in the media landscape on both a national and global scale. Rapid technological advances, the mass production of media goods, and the subsequent increase in accessibility to multi-platform media have led to a transformation in the way that people consume media. However, it is the consumption of media by children and young people that has sparked the biggest debate. Often seen as a generation defined by their engagement with technology, Buckingham explained how terms such as ‘digital generation’ (Livingstone, 2009: 1) or ‘millennial’ (Howe & Strauss, 2000) could be ‘found in popular commentaries in fields as diverse as commerce, government, education and youth activism’ (Buckingham, 2006: 1). Despite increased interest in the broad spectrum of media produced specifically for children and media consumed by children, a large proportion of work has focused on the anxieties and fears expressed by parents/adults. According to Buckingham (2001: 1), there now exists an almost ‘generational rhetoric’ when discussing the impact of (new) media on children. One area that remains relatively under-researched is children’s engagement with minority-language media, especially in relation to Wales and Welsh-language media.

Understanding the significance bilingual preadolescent children place on Welsh-language media was a key driving force behind this research. As children mature and enter preadolescence, their social worlds change dramatically. Categorised as the time between the ages of eight- and twelve-years-old (Borland, 1998: 19), middle childhood spans a period of significant social change in the lives of young people, namely the transition from primary to secondary school. Durkin (1995:
508) noted how, during this socially constructed phase, a young person’s ‘status’ shifts from being a senior pupil in a manageable environment to a naïve newcomer in ‘an anonymous bureaucracy’. Focusing on this latter period of middle childhood, this research looked specifically at tween\(^9\) engagement with Welsh-language media. In doing so, it enabled wider discussions on issues relating to minority-language maintenance, bilingualism, education, and developmental social psychology. Placing media at the core of this research enabled complex discussions surrounding linguistic and cultural identities to be formulated from an analysis of children’s engagement with Welsh-language media.

This chapter introduces the development of this research from its foundations as a Knowledge Transfer Partnership (KTP) project to the formulation of a substantive doctorate thesis. Entitled ‘Tween Audiences and Welsh-language Television Production: Impacts on Economic Prosperity and Cultural Life’, this two-year KTP research project (2010 - 2012) sought to investigate the media practices and preferences of tween audiences in Wales. A detailed account of the project is provided below, followed by a historical account of broadcasting in Wales, to contextualise the research. From this foundation, the aims and objectives of this thesis are established. This chapter concludes with a brief synopsis of the ensuing chapters.

1.2 Foundation of the Research

In 2010, S4C’s main producer of children’s tween and preschool content in Wales – Boomerang+ (now Boom Pictures) and Aberystwyth University launched a collaborative KTP research project. The aim of this research-based project was to investigate the media practices and preferences of young children in Wales as a means of better understanding the target audiences. Often underrepresented in social science research, children represent a social group that have arguably been overlooked for years. Comprehensive academic research, which focuses on

\(^9\) The term ‘tween’ is used to describe children aged between 7 and 13, especially in relation to popular culture.
middle childhood, has been limited to a handful of scholars including Buckingham (2006), Messenger Davies (2011), and Griffiths (2011). However, the importance of hearing the voice of children in matters involving them is a key issue for those who advocate a participatory approach to social research, and has become increasing important in recent years (James & Prout, 1997).

The start of the KTP project in 2010 coincided with the launch of a new service aimed at 7 to 13 year olds by Boomerang+ for the Welsh-language broadcaster S4C. For the past 16 years, the magazine programme Uned 5 (Antena) had provided the service for children and teens on S4C. However, following the strategic decision to target younger viewers by offering ‘a variety of programmes covering different genres’ (S4C, 2011: 4), the tender to rebrand the service was won by Boomerang+. In April 2010, Boomerang+ launched the new service under the brand Stwnsh. The service aired for two hours every weekday between 16.00 and 18.00 with the additional live weekend service, Stwnsh Sadwrn, aired between 9.00 and 11.00 on Saturday mornings. The service provision also incorporated interactive elements with the launch of a multifunctioning website, an integral part to the new look service. With Boomerang+ investing significant resources into children’s content, the company was eager to gain a better understanding of the target audience. The KTP project offered a means by which academic research methods could be incorporated into the company’s creative practices, to enable Boomerang+ to gain a better understanding of the young bilingual demographic.

The KTP project represented an important step in bridging the gap between industry and academia, with S4C and the Royal Television Society taking an active interest in the research. However, just months after its launch, the DCMS announced that it would be cutting S4C’s annual budget by a 24% over the next four years (BBC, Jul 2010). Along with this crippling financial blow, the DCMS also announced a three-year plan to hand funding of the channel over to the BBC. This abandonment of S4C’s funding formula has since been described as the most ‘damaging thing to happen to the Welsh-language in the last two years’ (Welsh Government, 2012: 3), with the changes leading to a complete internal restructure and revaluation of content and services. During this period of
uncertainty, the production of children’s media came under serious scrutiny. While preschool programming *Cyw* was praised for its educational value, low viewing figures for *Stwnsh* lead to a drastic reduction to the dedicated weekly children’s schedule.

Despite this doctoral thesis being rooted in the KTP project, the limitations of the commercially focused research highlighted a number of areas in need of further investigation. While the focus had been on gaining a better understanding of the media practices and preferences of Welsh-speaking young audiences, wider cultural issues, specifically linguistic representation by Welsh-language media had not been a primary concern of the KTP research. While the KTP findings responded to the commercial needs of the company, they also revealed the complexities of bilingualism in Wales, such as varying language competencies of the child and the influence this had on media preferences. In addition to this, as the (KTP) project focused on tween audiences including the transition from primary to secondary school, the changes in media engagement and use suggested a further need to examine the role the media play in the developmental stages of identity construction during middle childhood.

The KTP findings revealed a significant gap in the academic research relating to understanding the role Welsh-language media play in the construction of individual, group, regional and national identities amongst bilingual preadolescent children. While the highest proportion of loyal S4C viewers (amongst 7-to-13-year-olds) came from rural areas (at the time of the research), there were no Welsh-language tween programmes that focused on rural life on S4C. The research found that children from rural communities often felt underrepresented on screen, and expressed disappointment at the lack of content that covered topics of specific interest to them on *Stwnsh*. Placing media engagement at the core of this doctoral investigation provided a means by which wider issues relating to regional, linguistic, childhood and national identities could be explored. As media engagement is part of the everyday lives of children, Welsh-language media shaped the discussion surrounding identity formation amongst children during middle childhood.
1.3 A Brief Historical Account of Broadcasting in Wales and its Impact on National Consciousness

The historical evolution of mass media and mass communication, from print to broadcast and multiplatform media, has played an important role in the promotion of national consciousness. The strengthening of the nation-state provided real political and economic advantages to creating a national consciousness, with the development of mass media playing a significant role throughout history as a means of representing cultural bonds or nationhood. Hartley explains how during the first fifty years of television broadcasting the “nation” and “television” were frequently understood to be coterminous (Hartley 2004: 8). Over the past 40 years, minority-language campaign movements have understood the important role that broadcast media can play in relation to language maintenance. It has the capacity to provide both cultural and educational support, in addition to creating a vibrant, creative media industry embedded within a minority-language community. When looking at the development of minority language media in Wales, the connections between national consciousness and Welsh-language media are closely connected. Welsh-language media sits at the centre of this doctoral research, due in part to the relationship that exists between Welsh-language education and the media, but also due to the significance of media in the lives of young people. In order to contextualise the research an understanding of the historical and political development of both Welsh-language media and Welsh-language education is required.

According to Mackay, broadcasting is ‘central to understanding national identity in Wales’ (Mackay, 1999: 1), especially in terms of the Welsh-language maintenance campaign. Hourigan explains how during the mid-twentieth century the establishment (and subsequent dominance) of monolingual (English) broadcast media was deemed to be one of the greatest threats to the Welsh language (Hourigan, 2007: 72). Following the arrival of the BBC in Wales in 1923, little effort was made to provide the Welsh-speaking communities of Wales with a broadcasting voice. According to Davies, the lack of Welsh-language transmissions and London-centric bias of the BBC was contributing to the
‘complete Anglicisation of the intellectual life of the nation’ (Davies, 1994: 48), with the BBC’s monolingual policies a menace ‘to the life of the Welsh-language’ (ibid). Despite Wales having stations in both Cardiff and Swansea by 1924, the Welsh stations were part of what was known as the ‘West Region’ (Medhurst, 2016).

In 1951 the voice of the home nations was finally heard and acknowledged, with the BBC being publicly criticized in the *Beveridge Committee Report on Broadcasting* for being too London-centric (Barlow *et al.*, 2005: 103). During the 1920s and early 1930s, the BBC had seen the decentralisation or devolution of broadcasting in the UK as problematic, with the democratisation of broadcasting being met with strong opposition. However, in 1937, after a ‘lengthy campaign’ (Medhurst, 2016) a broadcasting transmitter was opened in Penmon, on the Isle of Anglesey, which signalled the ‘beginning of the Welsh Region’ (ibid). Despite this, and as a result of the outbreak of war, the full implementation of this devolution in radio broadcasting in Wales ‘did not become a fully-fledged region until 1945’ (Barlow *et al.*, 2005: 103). Even after 1945 little changed in regards to attitude towards the devolution of broadcasting. The northern regional director of the BBC had tried to prevent these changes on the grounds that those involved ‘would be driven into politics and twisted and warped away from their primary business of broadcasting, as part of the inclusive nation to which they belong’ (ibid). However, Barlow *et al.* explain how the nation he referred to, in this instance, was Britain and not Wales, sparking further questions relating to the inclusiveness of the BBC and its role in cultural and linguistic oppression. Johnson and Turnock (2005: 93) explain how there was a ‘widespread view that the media influenced cultural life’ and subsequently had the potential to be utilised for nationalist agendas. These new agendas culminated in the first National Television Conference held in 1959 in Cardiff, where 80 organisations met to discuss the possibilities of creating a Welsh-language service (Medhurst, 2007: 130-131).

---

10 The democratisation of broadcasting in the UK sought to allow Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales a stronger voice in regional broadcasting.
By the 1960s there were significant political moves made towards developing an independent Welsh-language broadcasting service, and on August 30th 1960, the ITA\(^{11}\) announced that they were seeking a programme contractor in the west Wales region. In September 1962 the Television Association began broadcasting under the brand Teledu Cymru, with the remit set by the Postmaster General to produce 10 hours per week of Welsh-language and (English-language) Welsh-interest content (Medhurst, 2007: 131-132). The significance of the launch of Teledu Cymru came at a time where Welsh nationalism was on the rise in Wales. In February of 1962, Saunders Lewis, one of Wales’s most prolific literary critics and political activists, addressed the Welsh nation through a radio broadcast titled ‘Tynged yr Iaith’ (translated as The Fate of the Language) (Knowles, 1999: 289). Regarded as one of the ‘defining moments in the history Welsh nationalism’ (ibid), Lewis’s radio broadcast declared that, while self-governance may be an important element of Welsh nationalism, ‘no government is worth having that does not safeguard and revive the language’ (Lewis cited in Knowles, 1999: 290). Inspired by Lewis, in August 1962 Cymdeithas yr Iaith\(^{12}\) was formed, with the aim of changing the status of the Welsh language and raise the language’s profile within and beyond Wales.

Despite the success of Teledu Cymru in broadcasting a small number of Welsh-language television programmes on BBC Wales and HTV Cymru (the ITV franchise in Wales), many were left feeling dissatisfied due to the off-peak and often inconvenient time slots allocated to the programmes. Many felt that this devalued Welsh-language content and, by association, its viewers. Once again, the nation was divided, with some feeling that the Welsh-speaking community’s demands were being met at the expense of the non-Welsh speaking community. Smith summarises this as being a case of ‘one person’s culture is another person’s poison’ (Smith, 2009: 38), highlighting the difficulties of public service broadcasting and its aim neither to ‘privilege one at the expense of the other nor to patronise some with less than all deserve’ (ibid.). The need to increase the amount of content and provide a home for the Welsh language became the driving force behind Cymdeithas yr Iaith’s broadcasting campaign.

\(^{11}\) The Independent Television Authority.

\(^{12}\) The Welsh Language Society.
Despite the formation of Teledu Cymru being regarded as a victorious moment for the Welsh-language campaign, by May 1963 the company had ‘ceased all local originated programming and acted as a relay station only’ (Medhurst, 2007: 131). Due to poor market research, internal management issues, and transmission problems, the station ran into financial difficulties and was officially taken over by ITV Wales and West Television in May 1964 (Astra, 2012). Hourigan explains how the invisibility of the Welsh-language community ‘on television was eroding the size of the community and damaging the status and the viability of the language’ (Hourigan, 2007: 72). Branded as cultural imperialism, campaigners identified key issues concerning the lack of Welsh-language content on existing broadcasting services. One area of key concern was the significant ‘lack of programming suitable for Welsh-speaking children’ (Hourigan, 2007: 72).

The importance of providing Welsh-language content for children also resonated with the increased need to provide the children of Wales with Welsh-medium education. In 1944, the Education Act allowed for Local Education Authorities in Wales to consider ‘opening Welsh-medium schools’ (ibid) with the first publicly-funded Welsh-medium primary school (Ysgol Dewi Sant) opening in Llanelli in 1947\(^\text{13}\) (cf. Williams 2003). With the provision of Welsh-language education on the rise during the 1960s and 1970s, the need for additional linguistic infrastructure such as Welsh-language media became increasingly important. These changes to the Education Act saw the Welsh-language become increasingly politicised. The changes to the political landscape also saw an increase in Welsh nationalism. Medhurst (2005) explains how there was a ‘widespread view that the media influenced cultural life’ (Medhurst, 2005: 93) and, subsequently, had the potential to be utilised for nationalist agendas.

The actions of Cymdeithas yr Iaith drew national attention to the perceived plight of the language, due in part to the conscious decision to target national broadcasting bodies. In order to achieve its goal of securing a Welsh-language channel, Cymdeithas yr Iaith used the might of the mass media to highlight its

\(^{13}\) The first Welsh-medium school in Wales was Ysgol Gymraeg Aberystwyth. Established in 1939, this school was privately funded.
significance as a medium. With a Welsh-language radio station in place by 1977 (BBC Radio Cymru), the focus was once again turned to the development of a Welsh-language television channel to serve the Welsh-speaking community.

Towards the end of the 1970s, with the general election looming, both the Labour and Conservative parties promised that legislation for a new Welsh-language television channel would be put before Parliament (Hourigan, 2007: 74) as part of their manifestos. However, following the election of a Conservative Government in 1979, the newly appointed Home Secretary, Willie Whitelaw, decided to reverse the promise. Whitelaw suggested that ‘except for an occasional opt-out, the service should be the same as that which was offered in the rest of the UK’ (Astra, 2012). This decision caused outrage amongst members of Plaid Cymru (the main nationalist party in Wales), Cymdeithas yr Iaith and other Welsh-language campaign groups. While many people refused to pay their television licence fees, others took more drastic measures, such as staging attacks on television transmitters. The president of Plaid Cymru and former MP for Carmarthen, Gwynfor Evans, even threatened to go on a hunger strike if the Conservative Government did not honour its commitment to provide a Welsh-language television channel. Such actions highlight just how politicised the campaign had become and how important broadcast media were regarded by the Welsh-language maintenance campaign, echoing the ideologies linked to the new wave of social theories. Sorens (2005: 309) explains how, for many, Welsh nationalism represented the struggle to preserve the Welsh language as opposed to gaining political autonomy. Establishing Welsh-language broadcasting became central in providing a voice for the movement. In response to the public and political pressures, on the 1st of November 1982 S4C, the first Welsh-language channel was launched.

Unlike the BBC, which is funded by UK licence payers, S4C was established under a very distinct funding arrangement. For the first 15 years, S4C was funded by a Government grant linked to the level of UK television advertising income in the previous year. However, in 1996, the Broadcasting Act replaced the income/advertising revenue to retail price inflation, based on S4C’s share of advertising revenue in 1997. In 2009-10, this consisted of approximately £100
million of public funding (House of Commons Welsh Affairs Committee, 2011: 5) and a further £3 million (approximately) generated through advertising. In addition to this, indirectly funding provided through BBC content provision, where the BBC supplied S4C with a minimum of 10 hours a week of programming were financed by the television licence fee (www.parliament.uk, 2011). However, from 2013, the main responsibility for funding S4C was reallocated from the DCMS, to the BBC. This change was announced under the Comprehensive Spending Review in 2010, a period in which funding to a number of government bodies and departments were experiencing cuts as a measure to address the economic recession (Edwards, 2011). Wales Assembly Member, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, and MP, Jonathan Edwards expressed their ‘deepest disappointment at the UK Government’s lack of respect for broadcasting in Wales’ (ibid).

Following this review period, a licence fee settlement was agreed; whereby the majority of S4C’s funding was handed over to the BBC Trust (S4C, 2014) form the DCMS. The Future of the Welsh Language Review notes how ‘under the terms of the licence fee settlement of October 2010’, the channel would receive a ‘reduction in funding equivalent to 36% in real terms’ (ibid), with the DCMS reducing its funding of the channel by 94% (to £6.787 million), and the BBC becoming responsible for providing around £76 million (90%) of S4C’s funding (ibid). The decision came up against strong criticism resulting in a rally organised by Cymdeithas yr Iaith against the cuts to the channel in 2010. The rally was one of the largest protests seen by the organisation in over 20 years (Golwg360, 2010). Strong support was given to the children’s brand Cyw14, with emotive cries of ‘Peidiwch â ladd Cyw!’ (translated as ‘Don’t Kill Cyw!’). Protests sought to highlight the potential threat such cuts would have on the provision of Welsh-language content for children. As a result of these fiscal changes, the service provided on S4C has altered dramatically. While S4C still operates a full service15, the scheduling of tween programming has been reduced in comparison

---

14 Cyw is S4C’s pre-school brand, represented by a yellow chick character named ‘Cyw’ (the Welsh word for chick).

15 S4C’s daily service airs programmes between the hours of 6 a.m. and midnight, in addition to an online provision and catch-up service via BBC iPlayer and S4C clic.
to the service provided pre 2010. While a full discussion of this is provided in Chapter 2, the KTP research revealed that this decision to reduce the service provided for tween audiences was met with strong opposition by young audiences.

1.4 Aims and Objectives

My experience of working as project manager (Associate) on the KTP project highlighted some fundamental issues relating to the way in which Welsh-language media are perceived and utilised by bilingual tweens in Wales. The comprehensive work conducted as part of the KTP project highlighted the complexities of bilingualism in Wales from the perspective of preadolescents. For young people in the transition phase between childhood and adolescence, issues of self-representation and identity can prove challenging. Socially, developmentally and linguistically, this transitional phase presents significant challenges for this age group.

The linguistic landscape of Wales is a complex one, and one where children are often placed at the core when debating the future survival of the language. Successful Welsh-language education policies now mean that the number of Welsh-speakers under the age of 15 surpasses that of any other age group (Welsh Government, 2015: 29). Figure 1 highlights the percentage of Welsh-speakers across Wales taken from the 2011 census. Areas referred to as the Welsh-speaking heartland include areas of Carmarthen, Ceredigion, Gwynedd and Anglesey. While it is clear from the map that the northwest has the highest proportion of speakers, the demand for Welsh-medium education in the southeast of Wales has increased in recent years. Figures taken form the latest Welsh-medium Education Strategy Annual Report show that southeast Wales has seen a 2 percentage point increase in the number of children attending Welsh-medium primary schools between 2010 and 2014. In 2010 only 8.2% of the children in the southeast attended Welsh-medium primary schools compared with 10.2% in 2014. While figures in Cardiff remained relatively stable during this time period (15.2% in 2010 dropping to 15.1% in 2014),
Caerphilly recorded a ‘substantial 5.4 percentage point increase’ (Welsh Government, 2015: 22) during this same period. The high levels of demand have even caused controversy in some instances with plans in place to close some ‘English-medium primary school in order to increase Welsh-medium capacity’ (England, 2012: 1). Figure 2 and Figure 3 also demonstrate how, statistically, the highest percentages of Welsh-speakers in Wales are those under the age of 15.

According to the 2013-2014 National Survey, 40% of 3-to 15-year-olds are fluent Welsh speakers, with almost 90% of them speaking Welsh either on a daily or weekly basis (Figure 3). Despite these positive figures, some doubt has been cast over the validity of these figures due to overestimations by parents of their children's language abilities (Gruffudd, 2012). According to the IWA\textsuperscript{16}, a far more accurate indicator of the number of Welsh speaking children can be taken from the Welsh-medium Education Strategy Annual Report that looks at all year 2 learners assessed in Welsh as a first language. This provides an indication of the number of children attending Welsh medium primary schools in Wales, a figure that has risen 0.3 percentage points between 2012 and 2014 from 21.9% to 22.2% by 2014 (Welsh-medium Education Strategy Annual Report, 2015). While these figures suggest a positive outlook for the future of the language, the dramatic drop in language use by fluent speakers aged 16-29 is alarming.

\textsuperscript{16}The Institute of Welsh Affairs.
Figure 1, ‘Proportion of people (age 3 and over) able to speak Welsh’, Source: National Survey for Wales, 2013-2014: Welsh Language Survey, page 21.
Figure 2: ‘Percentage of people who speak Welsh by age and source’, Source: National Survey for Wales, 2013-2014: *Welsh Language Survey* page 19

Figure 3: ‘Percentage of How often fluent Welsh-speakers speak Welsh by age’, source: National Survey for Wales, 2013-2014: *Welsh Language Survey*, page 29
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Local Authorities</th>
<th>2010 (%)</th>
<th>2014 (%)</th>
<th>2010-14 (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Isle of Anglesey</td>
<td>70.2</td>
<td>72.1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gwynedd</td>
<td>99.7</td>
<td>97.8</td>
<td>-1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conwy</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>25.1</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denbighshire</td>
<td>23.2</td>
<td>24.5</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flintshire</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>-1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wrexham</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>12.0</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>North Wales</strong></td>
<td><strong>34.8</strong></td>
<td><strong>34.5</strong></td>
<td><strong>-0.3</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Powys</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ceredigion</td>
<td>76.1</td>
<td>74.0</td>
<td>-2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pembrokeshire</td>
<td>21.9</td>
<td>19.7</td>
<td>-2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carmarthenshire</td>
<td>55.0</td>
<td>55.4</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swansea</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neath Port Talbot</td>
<td>14.9</td>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>South West and Mid Wales</strong></td>
<td><strong>28.6</strong></td>
<td><strong>29.4</strong></td>
<td><strong>0.9</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bridgend</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>-1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vale o Glamorgan</td>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>12.9</td>
<td>-0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhondda Cynon Taf</td>
<td>20.3</td>
<td>19.9</td>
<td>-0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merthyr Tydfil</td>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>11.7</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cardiff</td>
<td>15.2</td>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>-0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Central South</strong></td>
<td><strong>15.3</strong></td>
<td><strong>14.8</strong></td>
<td><strong>-0.5</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caerphilly</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>18.9</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blaenau Gwent</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Torfaen</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monmouthshire</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newport</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>South East Wales</strong></td>
<td><strong>8.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>10.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>2.0</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Wales</strong></td>
<td><strong>21.8</strong></td>
<td><strong>22.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>0.4</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4: Year 2 Learners assessed in Welsh first Language, figures taken from the Welsh-medium Education Strategy Annual Report 2015, Welsh Government.
While these national statistics published by the Welsh Government provide an overview of the linguistic landscape of Wales, they do not, however, provide an accurate picture of the complexities of the linguistic landscape that exists in Wales. As demonstrated in Figure 1, concentrations of Welsh-speakers are region specific, and as a result of this, the approach to Welsh-language education is also dependant on location. The provision of primary school education in both Gwynedd and Anglesey in northwest Wales is based on the ‘maintenance model’ for education, whereby all primary school education in these counties is delivered through the medium of Welsh (Lewis, 2006). The other 20 counties of Wales offer the choice between English-medium education (where Welsh as a second language is compulsory) and Welsh-medium education (where the main language of instruction is in Welsh).

Figure 4 lists the percentage of Year 2 children attending Welsh-medium primary schools from all 22 counties, and the difference between the highest (Gwynedd, 97.8%) and lowest (Newport, 4.5%) is vast. While education provides one explanation for the high levels of use amongst 3 to 15-year-olds, the sharp decline in the use of Welsh-language amongst 16-to 29-year-olds, perhaps displays an overdependence on education. As a result of this, it is not surprising that the current 5-year Welsh Language Strategy (Welsh Government, 2012) aimed to further promote and facilitate the use of the Welsh language through strengthening linguistic infrastructure and opportunities for use. The six strategies identified were:

i. The encouragement and support of the Welsh language within families

ii. To increase the provision of Welsh-medium activities for children and young people and to increase their awareness of the value of the language.

iii. To strengthen the position of the Welsh language in the community.

iv. To increase opportunities for people to use Welsh in the workplace.
v. To improve Welsh language services to citizens.

vi. To strengthen the infrastructure for the language, including digital technology.

*A Living Language: a Language for Living Report, 2012*

While this strategy focused on increased opportunities for language use through increased investment in resources, little focus was placed on understanding how existing services such as the provision of media content for young audiences were being utilised.

As noted in section 1.3, the historical evolution of Welsh-language broadcast media in Wales represents a significant milestone in the Welsh-language maintenance campaign, and highlights the importance placed on the service for its contribution to a sense of national consciousness. As with Welsh-language education, Welsh-language media provide the language with additional infrastructure to support growth and maintenance. However, despite the rise in Welsh-medium schools across Wales, especially in areas outside the traditional Welsh-speaking heartlands, the future of the language still remains a contested issue. Despite the statisticians predicting a notable rise in the number of Welsh-language speakers between the 2001 and 2010 census, actual figures show a decline of 0.8% (ONS, 2011) in the number of Welsh-language speakers in Wales during this period. While Welsh-medium education is increasing in popularity, there is a growing concern amongst some academics and language activists that, in some areas, Welsh language-use is being confined to the classroom.

Work by Hodges (2009) focuses specifically on the Rhymney Valley in southeast Wales and notes how language use is dependent on 'language transmission spheres' (Hodges, 2009: 17), namely family, education, community and work. Her work tracked the use of Welsh by a group of school leavers who had attended Welsh-medium primary and secondary schools in the Rhymney Valley. In areas with low percentages of Welsh speakers, and little or no Welsh spoken in the home, the education sphere becomes the formal setting for language use.
Hodge's research found that amongst the school leavers in her study, the only sphere where some members of the sample regularly used Welsh ‘was within the workplace’ (Hodge, 2009:31). She notes how ‘past pupils ‘needed the formal framework provided by the workplace to use the language on a daily basis’ (ibid). Language use and fluency, along with inward and outward migration, has resulted in a steady decline in the number of Welsh-language speakers, according to census figures, with the only increase noted during the period between 1991 and 2001 – where the figure rose from 18.7% to 20.8% (cf. *A Living Language: a Language for Living Report*, 2012: 7).

The aim of this research was to identify the role that minority language media plays in the construction and perceptions of identity during middle childhood, focusing on 10 to 12-year-old bilingual children in Wales during the so-called ‘transition phase’ between primary and secondary education. This period represents an important developmental milestone in the context of identity formation, where ‘the individual who was a child is now *en route* to becoming an adult’ (Durkin 1995: 508). The educational structure of schooling in England and Wales follows a sequence of stages. These stages are categorised based on year groups and outline the subjects and requirements children and young people must study. The transition phase marks, not only the move from primary to secondary school, but also the transition from Key Stage 2\(^{17}\) to Key Stage 3\(^{18}\). For young bilingual children in this transition phase the negotiation of childhood/preadolescence and linguistic identities can prove challenging, especially when considering the belief, that children are now developing an additional identity linked to the globalisation of broadcast media (cf. Moran and Chung, 2008). The purpose of this work is to attain a better understanding of how young [Welsh/English] bilingual children in Wales navigate these multiple identities.

In order to achieve the aims of this research, the focus was placed on language and identity in relation to children’s use of and engagement with minority-

\[\text{\small 17 Key Stage 2 refers to the required subjects and requirements children in years 3 to 6 must study.}\]
\[\text{\small 18 Key Stage 2 refers to the required subjects and requirements children in years 7 to 9 must study.}\]
language media. For many bilingual communities, there is a natural interaction that occurs between both languages through code-switching (cf. Wei, 2000). For multilingual children and young people, issues of cultural belonging and cultural identity can add to issues and challenges of self-representation and identity. Language competencies can vary and, for many, confidence in their own language ability can determine language use.

Working with the same groups of children over the course of a 12 month-period, this research mapped their changing attitudes towards childhood identities, linguistic identities and media identities. While understanding the complexities of identity construction sits at the centre of this research, the dual-phased aspect of the investigation represented an original contribution to knowledge. Five groups of children from across Wales participated in focus group sessions during their last year of primary school and again, a year later, during their first year of secondary school. In order to represent the sociocultural diversity of Wales and the complexities of the varying linguistic landscape, the sample needed to represent both urban and rural communities, in addition to areas with high and low numbers of Welsh speakers. Two areas in northwest Wales were selected; one in a rural location and the other in an urban location. A third area was also selected in north Wales, representing the northeast, an area where the Welsh-language is spoken by fewer than 12% of the local community (see Figure 14). Two locations were selected in the southeast, one in a former industrial town where fewer than 10% of the community are Welsh-speaking, and an affluent area of Cardiff where around 34% of the local community are Welsh-speaking, a figure significantly higher that the city’s average of around 15% (see Figure 14). This dual-phased qualitative study investigated how the children’s engagement with Welsh-language media contributed to their sense of self, their language preferences and their media practices.

1.5 Research Questions

The significance of focusing on the transition between primary and secondary school was identified based on the shortfalls of the KTP research. As noted, the
start of the KTP project coincided with the re-launch of children’s programming on the channel in 2010. The decision to target the younger tween audiences for the new look service as opposed to the 13+ teen audience previously serviced by Uned 5 presented some interesting findings, such as a degree of frustration by some loyal viewers. As the KTP research was concerned with both mapping viewing preferences of children in the latter years of primary school and the early years of secondary school, the reality of providing a service that bridged an age-range between 7 and 13-year-olds (with limited time in the schedule) appeared to be an extremely tall order. The KTP research was interested in discovering whether the service provided for preadolescents answered their social and cultural needs. In addition to the age-appropriateness of content provided by the channel, understanding how preadolescence fitted in to the complex linguistic makeup of Wales also required further research. Considering the high proportion of Welsh-language children and teens aged between 3 and 15-year-olds (highlighted in Figure 3), compared with other age groups, the evidence would suggest that a high proportion of these Welsh speakers came from non-Welsh speaking homes, meaning that the linguistic support network for children varied dramatically based on location, community and family network. Despite this, the Welsh-language maintenance campaign, as previously noted, has been based on formulating a rich tapestry of linguistic infrastructures to support the cultural and educational core of language maintenance, gaining a better understanding of how successful these measures were implemented and received was an integral part of this investigation.

The overarching research question therefore focused on the role Welsh-language media played in the perceptions of linguistic identity amongst preadolescence children. The key question for this doctorate thesis was as follows.

*Does the media mediate or maintain perceptions of language and identity for bilingual children in Wales, and to what extent do social changes during the transition phase between primary and secondary school influence these perceptions?*
Within this, four more nuanced questions were formulated based on the need to better understand the role that the Welsh-language media play in the construction of identity amongst young bilinguals. The first three questions focused on the interconnections between various elements of identity, namely linguistic identities, media identities and childhood identities. This research focused on gaining a sociolinguistic understanding of linguistic identities of young bilinguals through mapping their engagement with, and perceptions of Welsh-language media.

1. What importance do children in Wales place on Welsh-language media?

   To what extent does geographic location influence engagement with Welsh-language media?

Question 1 focused on the importance of Welsh-language media from the perspective of the child. As noted, Talfan Davies (2011) explained how there are three main values associated to Welsh-language media, values that are subsequently understood by the people of Wales. According to him, the service is understood to have intrinsic, institutional and public value. The aim of this question was to see the extent to which these values were recognised by the channel’s younger audience members. In addition to this, considering the complexities of the linguistic landscape of Wales, a sub-question was also posed to explore whether geographic locations corresponding to different linguistic communities altered the child’s perception of the service.

2. Do Welsh-language programmes aimed at tweens answer the social and cultural needs of the target audience?

   How does media engagement influence perceptions of self?

Question 2 was designed to explore the role the media play in the construction of childhood identities and how media engagement influences perceptions of self. As noted, the changing media landscape and the familiarity children now have with new media and technology has sparked increased academic interest in the role the media play in the construction of self. While new media were an area of interest, this question also sought to discover the role traditional broadcast
media play in the construction of identity, especially when considering the
emphasis Welsh-language media place on the involvement of the audience in the
production of content for children. Having worked closely with the production
company, Boomerang+, the remit for using audience participation in the creation
of content was an area of particular interest. Considering the on-screen presence
of the preadolescent child, there was a need to understand the impact that on-
screen visibility had on the child’s perception of self.

3. To what extend does linguistic competence influence tween perceptions
of Welsh identity?

_Are Welsh-language programmes perceived by tweens to be representative
of the whole Welsh-speaking community in Wales?_

Question 3 focused on linguistic competencies and subsequently the
inclusiveness of services such as S4C for the wider Welsh-speaking communities
of preadolescents. Providing a ‘tween’ service that has the ability to appeal to a
nation of bilingual preadolescence of varying linguistic abilities varied is
challenging, especially when considering the level of choice digital media has
now provided the viewer. Considering the drastic cuts and future concerns
relating to the future of public service broadcasting in (both the UK and) Wales,
the need to understand how Welsh-language media was committed to the
contrasting linguistic landscape was an area that I felt had significant relevance
to the current and topical debates surrounding the service’s future.

4. How significant are the social changes that occur during the transition
phase on the construction of identity amongst Welsh bilinguals during
middle childhood?

The fourth and final question focused on the transition phase between primary
and secondary school, a significant milestone in the lives of young people.
Described as the transition phase, the social and cultural changes that occur
during this developmental stage was of significant interest, as it remains a fairly
under-researched area in relation to linguistic identities. This research question
sought to better understand how the socially constructed narrative of change
influences perceptions of identity.
Middle childhood or preadolescence represents a period of significant change. Not only are there social factors to consider, such as the move from primary to secondary school, but the physical changes are also beginning to happen that influence the maturing child’s perception of self. The move from primary to secondary school marks a significant shift in the educational structure. The ‘child-centred’ approach to primary education that allows the children ‘opportunity to grow and develop in their own way’ (Howe, 2011: 6) is replaced by the subject-centred approach to secondary school education. During this period, the peer group becomes increasingly important with the parent/child dynamic also altering as the child develops and gains independence. The focus of this question was to explore these social changes from the perspective of the bilingual preadolescent.

1.6 Breakdown of Chapters

As a cross-disciplinary study, Chapter 2, Literature Review maps the terrain by identifying the academic disciplines that will be explored, namely [media theory, childhood studies and sociolinguistics]. It also considers examples of research, which transect these broad fields, in order to exemplify how key concepts interconnect. This theme-focused approach to the literature review presents three main areas for investigation; firstly, a thematic approach to the general themes drawing on literature that investigates linguistic identities, media identities and childhood identities; secondly, a cross-disciplinary investigation of the relationships that exist between these general themes, and finally, an overview of literature that concentrates on the transition phase between primary and secondary school.

Chapter 3, Methodology, is divided into two sections; the first explores and presents the methodologies of data gathering with the second focusing on the methodologies of data analysis. Section 1 begins with a theoretical overview of the appropriate methodological approaches for conducting research with children and the ethical considerations required, followed by an outline of the qualitative project-specific data collection methods utilised in this research,
namely focus groups and creative research methods. Combining traditional qualitative methodologies with creative research methods provided a layered approach to the research. Section 2 concentrates on the analytical methodologies utilised in this project, exploring both the appropriate analytical methodologies for focus group research, before detailing the chosen data analysis methodology, namely thematic analysis. Drawing on Crabtree and Miller’s (1992) template analysis model, a detailed account of how thematic analysis was utilised is presented.

As a dual-phased research investigation conducted over two years, covering the transition from primary to secondary school, it was important to formulate a coherent structure for presenting the findings. Chapters 4, 5 and 6 are subsequently divided into theme-based chapters, presenting the interconnections between linguistic identity, media identity and childhood identity. King and Horrocks (2010: 165) explain thematic analysis as the process by which a narrative is created to ‘cast light upon the topic in hand’ through the identification of themes. Chapter 4, Findings, looks specifically at the interconnecting themes relating to linguistic identity and media identity, exploring the use of Welsh-language media by schools as an example of linguistic infrastructure, and, secondly the concept and practice of media as a nation building tool (with reference to minority language media). Chapter 5, Findings, draws on the interconnections between media identity and childhood identity through focusing on engagement and participation with Welsh-language media. By considering the diverse linguistic landscape of young bilinguals in Wales, this chapter concentrates on viewing preferences (and access to Welsh-language) services. Chapter 6, Findings, explores the interconnections between childhood identity and linguistic identity through focusing on language use, by investigating the role peer group relationships has on language use.

As this was a dual-phased research project mapping significant continuities and changes during the transition phase between primary and secondary, each of the results chapters draws on findings from both Phase 1 and Phase 2 of the data gathering process. Through cross-referencing, the significance of the transition phase was measured by comparing responses given during Phase 1 and Phase 2
of the research, and subsequently represented the research’s original contribution to knowledge.

The thesis concludes with Chapter 7, Discussion and Conclusion, through offering a comprehensive overview of the research findings and an evaluation of the methodological approaches used for both data collection and analysis. The successes and shortcomings of the research provide an indication as to possible areas of interest, which might be fruitfully investigated in future.
Chapter 2: Literature Review

2.1 Introduction

Linguistic diversity is one of the key issues addressed in this research, and understanding how the linguistic landscape of Wales varies was vital to the way in which we understand children’s engagement with Welsh-language media specifically, and – by association – the Welsh language, in general. For the purpose of this research, it was important to view language as a two-fold issue, firstly, as it sits within the study of language and identity in general (cf. Bucholtz and Hall, 2010), and secondly, language and identity as it is mediated in Welsh-language media content. In addition to understanding the complexities of linguistic identities, the purpose of this research was to locate these themes in terms of preadolescent bilingual audiences in Wales.

The aim of this chapter is to offer a comprehensive overview of the main themes presented in this research project, focusing on language, childhood and media in the context of bilingual preadolescent children in Wales. As a cross-disciplinary study drawing on literature from media studies, childhood studies and sociolinguistics, this chapter presents the literature thematically.

Placing the sample (young bilingual children during this period of transition) at the centre of this review facilitates a cross-disciplinary discussion of the literature. As a cross-disciplinary study, this ‘soft clustering’ (Wilbur, 2002: 386) approach allows for a fluid understanding of how each theme is interconnected in relation to the sample. Figure 5 demonstrates a thematic networking process as referred to by Attride-Stirling (2001: 389). This process identifies three thematic areas, the basic, the organisational, and the global. Using this as a general guide, this chapter highlights the network of themes relevant to the study and demonstrates how each theme is interconnected.
As outlined in Chapter 1, the purpose of this research was to conduct a sociolinguistic study of the linguistic identities of preadolescent bilinguals during the transition phase between primary and secondary school, with Welsh-language media used as a means by which these ideas could be contextualised. Using Figure 5 as the organising principle, this chapter is divided into three sections. The first section offers a general overview of the three main areas of research, namely language, media and childhood. Therefore, the basic themes in this instance related to language, media and childhood focusing on the construction of identity within each case. The second section reviews the literature on cross-disciplinary themes, providing an understanding of specific relationships that exist between the various strands (Organising Themes). Finally, the third section focuses on the research sample and the significance of continuity and change in terms of identity construction and concepts of ‘self’ during the transition phase between primary and secondary school (Global Theme).
2.2 The Basic Themes: Identity construction in relation to Language, Media and Childhood.

This section looking at the ‘basic’ themes of this investigation focuses on the construction of identity in relation to language, media and childhood. Lawler explains how the notion of identity ‘hinges on the apparent paradoxical combination of sameness and difference’ (Lawler, 2008: 2). Identities can be collective, referring to, for example one’s gender, race or religion etc. as shared with others, but can also be individual, highlighting differences and uniqueness. Language is an implicit aspect of culture and, by association, identity. The first themes discussed focus on the understanding of self through language choice and use. Drawing on the evolution of language maintenance in Wales, this sub-section explores how young people, through language choice identify with national identities. Considering the linguistic complexities of bilingual communities, the second theme focuses on existing theories relating to bilingualism and diglossia, looking at the early work of Fishman (1967) and Ferguson (1959), before exploring the contemporary work of Baker focusing specifically on the Welsh context. The third theme concentrates on media identities in relation to broadcast media. Despite the growing body of academic work in recent years focusing on the relationship between new media and identity construction (through engagement with online gaming and social networking sites), this sub-section focuses on traditional broadcast media and how the changes seen in the production of children’s television programmes have altered the television narrative through the increased inclusion of the audience. The focus here is placed on the inclusion remit outlined in S4C’s Future of Welsh Language Television Report. To conclude, the final theme concentrated on the academic shift in the understanding of childhood as a socially constructed phenomenon in order to explore childhood identities.
2.2.1 Language and Linguistic Identities: Contextualising the Welsh Minority-language Maintenance Campaign in Relation to Identity and Language Choice

Mesthrie explains how language is not merely ‘denotational’ (Mesthrie, 2000: 6), but plays an integral part in defining individuality and collectivity, both consciously and subconsciously. Language, as defined by Hourigan (2004), represents an experience of culture and an embodiment of one’s past, present and future aspirations, with speakers inevitably emitting signs that define, for example, their social class, gender or age. The connection between language and identity is ‘a fundamental element of our experience of being human’ (Carmen and Watt, 2010: 1). Language not only offers a way of describing who we are through the process of naming, but also has the ability to assign identities indirectly, when we ‘base our judgements of who people are on the way they speak’ (ibid). Dialectical differences, for example, can instantly give away a person’s region of origin, helping to determine an aspect of an individual’s identity through geographically placing them based on their accent. Carmen and Watt explain how ‘language-mediated attributions of identity’ (ibid) are ingrained in every aspect of social life.

A national language as defined by Omoniyi refers to a language that has been assigned ‘on the basis of aggregate and sentimental recognition...as embodying and symbolising the identity of all those included in the national group’ (Omoniyi 2010: 241). Billig refers to the importance of a national language as a ‘prime determinant of nationalist identity’ (Billig, 1995: 29), where those speaking the same language are liable to claim a sense of ‘national bond’ (ibid.). However, many languages do not enjoy the status of a recognised national language or official language, and subsequently the significance of this can be problematic. Arguably such claims made by Omoniyi can often be naïve when considering bi/multilingual communities, as this would suggest that certain languages, and subsequently identities are less valued than others. Scourfield et al. explain how the prominent nineteenth century theories of the nation-state often contrasted with the ‘community-based sense of language’ (Scourfield et al. 2006: 130) that existed within the Celtic peripheries. According to O’Reilly (2001: 8), ‘certain
languages came to be seen as the vehicles of rational thought while others were deemed ‘emotional’ or ‘simply inadequate’. While dominant language communities were believed to promote rational ideas of the modern state, traditional or community languages were regarded as being ‘stateless’ (ibid) and subsequently seen as a ‘threat to the state’ (ibid).

The investment in the Welsh-language maintenance campaign in recent years, especially in terms of increasing the number of children who speak Welsh, has resulted in the linguistic landscape of Wales becoming dramatically altered. While linguistic oppression and language prestige had been the concern of a number of academics in the past, the role children in Wales, specifically in terms of Welsh-language education presents an additional, complex layer in the Welsh-language maintenance discussion. As noted in Chapter 1, Welsh-medium education has been a key feature in altering the linguistic landscape of Wales in recent years. In areas such as Cardiff, England (2012: 1) notes how ‘plans to close an English-medium primary school in order to increase Welsh-medium capacity’ caused controversy, prompting the argument that ‘English-medium education is being disadvantaged in the rush to cater for the demand for Welsh’ (ibid).

Despite a positive growth in the demand for Welsh-medium education, which challenges the historical accounts of linguistic inadequacies highlighted by O’Reilly (2001), language use still remains a contested issue. Again looking at the figures presented in Figure 3, young people aged between 16 and 29 remain the age group that use the Welsh-language the least in their daily lives. While it is important to understand the historical evolution of the minority language maintenance campaign in Wales, the focus is now shifting and being placed on understanding how young people identify with their linguistic and national identities through language choice.

Work by Thompson (2001) and Scourfield et al. (2006) draws attention to the ‘practical aspects of the representations of nations and national identities’ by children (Scourfield et al. 2006: 48). Scourfield et al. (ibid) explain how much of the literature on the sociology of childhood has under-developed concepts of agency in terms of the construction of national identity/consciousness. In
response, their work looks to actively appropriate ‘narratives of the nation’ (ibid) and how children orientate themselves within cultural settings.

2.2.2 Bilingualism and Diglossia: The Complexities of Bilingual Communities

A popular metaphor exists in linguistics that compares language to a ‘living organism’ (Wei, 2000: 3), where the antithesis is language death. However, Wei explains how language is a ‘human faculty’ that ‘co-evolves with us…it is we who give language its life, change it, and if so desired, abandon it’ (ibid). This statement simplifies language through its communicative function. However, the situation is far more complex, especially when considering the cultural significance assigned to language. Bilingualism or multilingualism is a common linguistic situation that exists worldwide, and refers to the use of more than one language by a group or community. While bilingualism refers to the use of two different languages, many language communities are defined by their use of language varieties, or even specific dialects. In 1959, Charles Ferguson introduced the term ‘diglossia’ to describe a ‘particular kind of standardisation where two varieties of language exist side by side throughout the community, with each having a definite role to play’ (Ferguson, 1959: 33). Functionality, therefore, is what distinguishes diglossia from bilingualism. Considering that 40% of children under the age of 15 in Wales now speak Welsh (2013-2014 National Survey figures, see Figure 2), arguably the work focusing on bilingualism and diglossia needs to be revisited from the perspective of the minority-language movement.

Ferguson himself noted how his early work was in fact, preliminary, and soon academics saw the need for further exploration into his theories, specifically in terms of understanding the differences between diglossia and bilingualism. In 1967, Joshua Fishman presented a comprehensive study focusing on the relationship between bilingualism and diglossia.
The first situation listed by Fishman (1967) is characterised by both diglossia and bilingualism. This situation requires widespread bilingualism, allowing for two languages to function in different specific settings. The example given by Fishman is Paraguay, where two languages - Spanish and Guarani (an indigenous South American language), have specific functions within society (cf. Fishman, 1967: 48-49). Spanish is the dominant language of formal education, government and high culture, while Guarani is the language spoken in informal domains such as the home.

The second language situation is one of diglossia without bilingualism. Fishman (1967: 50) explains this, as being the situation whereby the ruling elites and the masses are not members of the same speech community. In such situations, the ruling elites use of a ‘fashionable $H$ tongue’ (ibid) or high variety, for ‘intragroup’ purposes, while the masses speak another, not necessarily linguistically related for their intragroup purpose’ (ibid), often referred to as $L$ tongue or low variety.
The third situation is that of bilingualism without diglossia. According to Fishman, this situation highlights how bilingualism is ‘essentially a characterisation of individual linguistic behaviour, whereas diglossia is a characterisation of linguistic organisation at the sociolinguistic level’ (Fishman, 1967: 51). In terms of structure and agency, bilingualism is perhaps best explained as displaying agency, whereby an individual or group choose to use a specific language, whilst diglossia is an example of linguistic structure, determined by societal/institutional function. According to Fishman, there is a danger of pidginization in situations where bilingualism occurs without the benefits of structured linguistic understanding of language function assigned to specific domains (ibid: 52).

Finally, Fishman recognises the extremely rare language situation that occurs where neither diglossia nor bilingualism exists. Isolation appears to be the only viable explanation for this situation, as interaction with other language groups or communities are often an inevitable occurrence through social and economic contact.

The significance of Fishman’s work in terms of this research is based on the complexities of the Welsh-language community, especially in light of the developments that have occurred in the changing status of the Welsh-language in recent years. In 1993, the Welsh Language Act put forward measures to ensure English and Welsh were recognised as having equal status within the public sector, and in 2010 the Welsh language was granted official status within Wales. Despite only 19.8% of the Welsh population being able to speak Welsh, figures indicate that 40% of children under 15 are Welsh speakers (Figure 2). However, it would be naïve to assume that this figure translated into everyday language use. Arguably, due to the increased popularity of Welsh-language education, especially in areas outside of the Welsh-speaking heartlands, a shift is occurring in the functionality placed on the language. While Welsh-medium education still remains optional for most people in Wales19, its function and use remains subject to choice. The complexities in defining Welsh-language use and function are of

---

19 Welsh-medium primary education is optional in 20 of the 22 county councils in Wales with exception of Gwynedd and Anglesey, where Welsh-medium primary education is mandatory.
significant interest to this investigation, due to the children involved in this research representing a variety of Welsh/English minority/majority language communities. As a result of this, engagement with Welsh-language media also remains subject to choice, and is dependent on a number of factors including preference, accessibility, function and ability.

Subsequently, the complexities of the linguistic setting in Wales make the use of Fishman’s model for bilingualism and diglossia highly problematic. Looking at Fishman’s model, Welsh-language communities in Wales represent a linguistic situation whereby bilingualism is present often without diglossia. According to Fishman, this unstable linguistic situation can result in the pidginization of languages. However, according to Baker (2011), despite the Welsh- and English-language officially having equal status and functionality in Wales, the outcome of bilingualism without diglossia may not necessary result in Fishman’s theory of pidginization (c.f. Fishman 1967: 52). Baker explains how there are alternative outcomes, and makes reference to Garcia’s (2009) concept of transglossia, where language co-existence can be achieved. Individual choice enables people to choose a language for various functions. The majority of children in Wales, for example, have the choice of being educated in Welsh, English or both. While I agree with Baker’s use of transglossia to describe the Welsh-language situation, the issue of regional variations still exists, especially when considering the varying degrees with which Welsh can be regarded as a minority language within a community.

The understanding of speech communities in Wales needs to be considered on a far more localised level. Gwynedd, for example, which is in northwest Wales, is traditionally seen as one of the main Welsh-speaking heartlands. The area has the highest percentage of Welsh-speakers, at 69% (ONS, 2011) and the Welsh-language is considered a community language. While a number of regional dialects exist throughout Wales, for example Dyfedeg and Wenglish,

---

20 The term dialect refers to any ‘variety of language that is spoken in a distinctive way by an identifiable group of speakers’ (Coupland and Jaworski, 2009: 23). Dialect can therefore be an indicator of a person’s regional or social background.

21 Dyfedeg refers to the term used to describe the regional dialects of west Wales.

22 Traditionally Wenglish is used as an umbrella term to describe the distinct English dialects of the south Wales valleys, ‘a unique blend of residual Welsh and the distinctive patterns of spoken
arguably the most celebrated and culturally recognised (Welsh-language) dialect is Cofi\(^{23}\), spoken by a large number of people in the Caernarfon area. With a reported 87.4\% of the population of Caernarfon being Welsh-speakers, higher than the county average of 67\% (ONS, 2012) and significantly higher than the national average of 19.8\%, the localised speech community of the area is extremely interesting. Khan explains how Cofi Welsh ‘often acted as a platform for the younger generation to progress to a more formal form of the [Welsh] language’ (Khan, 2013 cited in the Daily Post), spoken in schools and formal settings. In addition to the ‘formal’ or standard variety of Welsh spoken at school and the colloquial Cofi dialect, the people of Caernarfon also speak English. Referring to the Peblig social housing estate in Caernarfon, Khan goes on to explain how ‘the difficulty people have here is that they don’t tend to read Welsh – their ability to read in English is considerably better and you’ll notice when they fill in forms or go to the bank that they conduct their business in English’ (ibid). The significance of this demonstrates the varying functions assigned to language.

Understanding the importance that regionalism plays in defining language situations is of significant importance to this study. Whilst, historically, the Welsh-speaking communities in Wales have been categorised as a community where diglossia exists without bilingualism, whereby the ruling elites spoke English and the masses spoke Welsh. The current situation in Wales is far more representative of a speech community where bilingualism exists without diglossia, with both English and Welsh now officially recognised as national languages. Despite this, areas such as Caernarfon where languages (in this instance Welsh and English) are still assigned functionality, it could be argued that these communities display characteristics of both diglossia and bilingualism,

\(^{23}\) Cofi is a colloquial term used to describe both the regional dialect of Caernarfon and a person from the town. Research conducted by Madoc-Jones et al. suggests that speakers of Cofi are often identified as being of a lower class or ‘common’ (Madoc-Jones et al., 2013: 407).
whereby stable diglossia exists between Cofi and formal Welsh, in addition to English representing the language of business and often popular culture.

Whether or not academics agree with the claims that multiple versions of Fishman’s four-fold model exist in the Welsh-speaking communities in Wales, Hudson explains how defining examples of diglossia is extremely complex and does not always match the theoretical framework. He explains how a number of case studies of diglossia are ‘not completely homogeneous, and that even the most unequivocal cases of diglossia... present contrasts in detail that are at times considerable, yet always instructive for a theory of diglossia and for sociolinguistic theory more generally’ (Hudson, 2002: 2).

Considering that two of the groups involved in this investigation came from Gwynedd, and one specifically from Caernarfon, understanding the significance of dialectical variations was important when considering linguistic identities and their relevance to this study. The lack of academic writing on the importance of regional Welsh dialects, including Cofi, from a child’s perspective is an area in need of academic attention. At present, there appears to be very little in the way of comprehensive research focusing on diglossia and bilingualism in terms of bilingual preadolescents. While the Cofi dialect may only have been significant to a small number of children included in this research, understanding ‘legitimate’ dialectical variations such as Cofi had the potential to untangle the complicated discussions surrounding less favorable dialects such as Wenglish, often disregarded due to its perceived dependence on the English-language through borrowing.

While Cofi remains relatively under-researched in terms of academic writing, its presence in popular culture has meant that its profile and subsequent prestige has been raised significantly. Through projects such as the Cofis Bach24, the Cofi profile has been raised, with the charity endorsed by one of north Wales’ largest media production companies, Cwmni Da. Despite Cofi to a certain degree representing the mixing of English and Welsh through bilingual code-

---

24 Cofis Bach provides free artistic opportunities for children and young people, linked to one of north Wales’ most underprivileged estates; the Ysgubor Goch, Caernarfon.
switching, this regional dialect has, in recent years, become the focus of popular culture (through publications such as *Hiwmor y Cofi* (2009) by Dewi Rhys) and even crossing over into high culture (through the production of the unique multi genre opera; *Cofi Opera* by composer Owain Llwyd). However, other versions of this process have not been embraced in the same manner. Briefly touched upon by the work of Jon Anderson (2010: 230), with specific reference to John Edwards' 1985 publication *Wenglish*, the ‘oddity’ of *Wenglish*, is described by Edwards as the Welsh/English dialect of the south Wales valleys (Edwards, 1985). Despite Edwards’s work mainly acting as a glossary of terms and ‘catalogue of usage’ (Coupland and Thomas, 1990: 11) as opposed to a comprehensive sociolinguistic study, Coupland and Thomas stress that it would be naïve to dismiss its relevance. In fact, Coupland and Thomas encourage future research in matters relating to *Wenglish*, arguing that it would be unwise to disregard *Wenglish* consciousness, emphasising the complexities of linguistic and ethnic affiliations. Despite Edwards’s efforts, reinforced by the weight of sociolinguists such as Coupland and Thomas, *Wenglish* still remains a contested issue for language purists, centred on concerns regarding linguistic dilution, especially amongst young people, and its legitimacy as a Welsh (not English) dialect.

2.2.3 The Media and Media Identities: Onscreen Visibility and the Changing Media Landscape in the Production of Children’s Content

Increased choice and technological advances has meant that the production of children’s television content and addressing the needs of young audiences is now far more complex. Understanding children’s media as a legitimate area in need of academic research has been discussed at length by academics such as Buckingham (2006), Messenger Davies (2011), Griffiths (2011) and Lury (2002). Subsequently, the developments in programme styles and content based on an

---

25 Bilingual code-switching, as described by Wei, refers to the ‘integration of one language in another’ (Wei, 2000: 15). In such instances, the ‘two languages involved do not play the same role in sentence making’ (ibid), usually one language sets the grammatical framework and the second provides additional elements such as vocabulary ‘to fit into the frame work’ (ibid).
increased awareness of a varied child audience have led to the need for better understandings of these changes and their significance for the audience.

Petterson (2014) explores the various ways in which the production of children's content has developed since the 1980s, with the inclusion of equipment and technologies used in the production of television content becoming an integrated element of the television narrative. Looking specifically at Swedish public service children's content, Petterson notes how ‘TV technology has been narrated in several different ways over the years’ (Petterson, 2014: 22). Petterson explains how during the 1980s the production teams sought to represent an onscreen child with which the audience at home could identify.

Petterson's (2014) work is relevant to this study as he identifies the production models that were utilised by S4C as part of their inclusion and participation remit. In S4C's *Future of Welsh Language Television* Report (2014), specific reference is made to the collaborations between production companies and schools with regards to the making of children's media content. The report notes how enabling children to be 'included on screen' (S4C, 2014: 18-19) allows viewers to 'expand their experience of entertainment and media' (ibid). Arguably, S4C is creating what Lury refers to as children 'employed by adults to perform children in a planned way' (Lury, 2010 in Petterson, 2014: 19).

During the late 1990s, the changing media landscape in Sweden saw a shift in production styles, where production technology became embedded in the programme narrative (Petterson, 2014). Along with Petterson's examples from Swedish children's television, magazine-style programmes such as *SM:TV Live* and *Sam and Mark's TMI Friday* in the UK also adopted a style that featured key production elements. Cameras, sound and editing equipment were often in shot, blurring the boundaries between the familiar and unfamiliar. These programmes encouraged the use of media technologies *on show*, with 'no sign of hiding television equipment from the viewers' (ibid: 21). While the inclusion of technology became part of the narrative, no explanation of how these elements

---

26*SM:TV Live* was a British Saturday Morning Programme broadcast on ITV. It was first broadcast in 1998 and ran until 2003.

27*Sam and Mark's TMI Friday* was first aired on BBC 2 as TMI in 2006. The programme was later rebranded as TMI Friday and shown on the CBBC channel on Fridays.
worked was provided, leaving the viewer with additional codes to decipher. While this arguably produced an element of sophistication to the way in which media production was understood or received by children, it may also simply represent a sign of the times, demonstrating how children’s understanding of technology has become engrained in their cultural understanding. Bignell (2005) looks specifically at Teletubbies28 and the way in which the embedded television sets in the stomachs of the characters are symbolic, dissolving the distinction between the ‘alien and the familiar’ (Bignell, 2005, cited in Messenger Davies, 2010: 164). The continued use and embedding of technology in the production of children’s content continues to evolve. Cooper (2015) notes how the forthcoming remake of the Teletubbies will see the embedded television screens replaced by ‘touchscreens devices’ in the characters’ stomachs. Considering the work surrounding generational theories and the notion of a ‘digital generation’ (Buckingham, 2013 and Livingstone, 2009), the distinction between the alien and the familiar may, in fact, be less prominent for modern children, as technologies and the use of devices (such as tablets and smart phones) are far more engrained in their understanding of day-to-day life.

The final situation explored by Petterson is ‘technology as the narrative, (Petterson, 2014: 21). The Swedish example explains how, in addition to the inclusion of media equipment, members of the production teams were also included in the format of the show, creating a holistic element to the programme by combining the creative process and end product. Buckingham (2002) explains how children’s popular culture often involves a negotiation of ‘cultural power’ between the producers and consumers of children’s content (Buckingham, 2002: 7). The production team in this instance become part of the set, with specific roles identified allowing the audience to grasp the narrative through understanding the process. Despite this, a fundamental point made by Buckingham is that this ‘blurring’ of boundaries and identities between producer and audience highlights that children’s media are not ‘produced by children but for children’ (ibid: 6). Buckingham’s statement resonated with the ethos of this research, and the way in which this research was conducted in order to gain a

28 Teletubbies is a British pre-school live action series first broadcast (by the BBC) in 1997.
better understanding of this relatively under-researched group and their media identities.

While Petterson’s work on technology and media narratives, and S4C’s report, identify production patterns and styles, what is not discussed is the impact that the relationship between technology and media narratives has on the audience (both onscreen and at home), especially in terms of identity construction. What this research aimed to address was the impact of onscreen inclusion on identity construction, and whether inclusion of this kind alters the relationship that audiences have with (specifically, minority-language) media.

2.2.4 Childhood and Childhood Identities: The Social Construction of Childhood

Defining or naming specific age groups within different societies appears to be a continuous challenge facing academics researching children and childhood. Montgomery (2009) explains how there are two key findings that are ‘constantly reiterated’ (Montgomery, 2009: 50) among those who study childhood. Firstly, that childhood is a socially constructed phenomenon and, secondly, that ‘biological immaturity is assigned social meaning dependant on the cultural setting’ (ibid.).

James and Prout (1997) note how it is important to view the institution of childhood as ‘an interpretive frame for understanding the early years of human life’ (James and Prout, 1997: 3). Unlike traditional views of childhood, where children are viewed ‘as “consumers” of the culture established by adults’ (Corsaro 2005: 7), new constructive and interpretive theories explain how children (along with adults) must be ‘seen as active in the construction of their own social lives’ (James and Prout 1997: 8), thereby acknowledging that children are active agents in the formation of their own identities. Historic developments in the construction of childhood can help explain how the broader understandings of political, economic and cultural factors shape our understanding of childhood identities.
The sociology of childhood and the increased academic work in this field echoes a re-evaluation of ‘the status and role of children in society’ (Woodhead and Faulkner, 2000:10). In a lecture given by Ron Davie to the Psychological Society in 1991, entitled ‘Listen to the child: a time for change’, he argued that ‘children’s perspectives should be given due weight’ (Davie cited in Woodhead and Faulkner, 2000: 11). The significance of Davie’s lecture coincided with the first publication of another seminal text in the study and understanding of the sociology of childhood; *The Construction and Reconstruction of Childhood*, by James and Prout in 1990. At the time of publication, the sociology of childhood was just ‘beginning to emerge as a distinct sub-discipline’ (James and Prout, 1997: ix). Subsequently, it was not until the publication of the second edition of this work in 1997 that the key concepts ‘mushroomed’ (ibid) by generating a raft of new work. In light of this progress, researchers and academics were now encouraged to re-evaluate children’s social position within society (ibid). Though ideas have developed significantly in the last eighteen years, James and Prout’s notion of agency, or more specifically empowerment, has become an important factor when conducting research that involves children.

While the changing perspectives of how we (specifically in the West) view childhood is linked to the work of James and Prout, their work is based on the significant changes that have appeared throughout history, many of which have been documented by academics such as the French medieval historian, Philippe Ariès, whose work, entitled *Centuries of Childhood* (first published in 1960 in French, with an English translation following in 1962) challenged previous ideas. Though this was not the first book to challenge such ideas of childhood, and while it was not without its problems, it had a significant impact on the academic world. Whilst the ‘biological facts’ of birth and infancy were conventionally used to explain the ‘social facts of childhood’, James and Prout argue that little attention was given to the accompanying cultural components in the understanding of the historic socialisation of childhood prior to Ariès’s work (James and Prout, 1997: 16). Ariès (1962) proposed that ‘in medieval society the idea of childhood did not exist; this is not to suggest that children were neglected, forsaken or despised’ (Ariès, 1962: 125 cited in Montgomery, 2009: 46).
During the 1960s and 70s, the time of Ariès’ publication, a ‘new wave of social theory’ was emerging in post-industrialised countries, which moved away from the universal categorisation of social groups (Klandermans, 1989: 26 cited in Hourigan 2001: 79). As with the categorisation of ‘women’ in pre-feminist thinking, ideas of childhood were also being re-evaluated; meanings attached to the notion of ‘the child’ and ‘childhood’ were thought to ‘differ across time or space’ (James and Prout, 1997: 14), destabilising the traditional understandings of child development and socialisation.

A number of academics, including Hendrick (1997), have written extensively on the historic developments that have occurred in the construction of childhood. The categorisation of the various stages of childhood construction in Hendrick’s work and the chronological facts presented by Maybin and Woodhead (2003) both highlight how social change has influenced the way in which society views and understands childhood. Maybin and Woodhead explain how social and economic shifts have subsequently led to the prolonging of childhood, especially in the West. They make specific reference to the influence of public schools in this process, where children were schooled from the age of 13 to 18. While these institutions catered for an elite minority in society, they ‘gained a remarkable hold on the imagination of all sectors of British society’ (Maybin and Woodhead, 2003: 107). Subsequently, this led to what Maybin and Woodhead describe as the invention of adolescence. Following the idea of a prolonged childhood and the notion that there exists a ‘transitional period between the end of childhood and the attainment of adult social status’ (Whiting and Whiting, 1987 cited in Montgomery, 2009: 202), many scholars have suggested that the ideology of adolescence is largely a ‘Western construction’ (Montgomery, 2009: 202). Such cultural constructs are linked to the early twentieth-century theories of American psychologist G. Stanley Hall and his 1904 publication Adolescence.

Through further developments in the study of childhood, additional categorisations have been made over the years. As with the categorisation of adolescence, middle childhood or preadolescence is now used to refer to children aged between 7 and 13. However, Borland et al. explain how this period of middle childhood was seen less as a ‘prelude to the teen years’ (Borland et al.,
1998: 20) and more as marking the ‘beginning of adolescence’ (ibid),
demonstrating the difficulties and complexities of categorising stages in human
development.

Adler and Adler (2001) note how, compared with studies on adolescence, middle
childhood has received less academic attention. In recent years, however,
research in this area has become much more focused as changes have occurred
in the ‘cultural configuration of childhood’ (Adler and Adler, 2001: 5). Whilst
there is an understanding that identity construction is an important element in
adolescent development, preadolescence is a time when ‘children struggle to
gain stable identities’ (Corsaro and Eder, 1999: 48). Adler and Adler explain how
preadolescence represents the period towards the end of a child’s time at
elementary school (primary school), where they experience the ‘beginning thrust
towards independence’ (Adler and Adler, 2001: 198). As such, this is arguably a
time of rapid change in relation to expressions of identity, which could have a
bearing on how children locate themselves in relation to language use and
preference.

This section has outlined some of the significant social changes experienced by
(western) societies over the years with regards to how children are viewed
and/or ‘located’. Recognising children as active social actors has been a
significant turning point within social science research, where the inclusion of
children in the data-gathering process is now seen as essential to understanding
specific issues relating to childhood (where notions of identity formation would
be one such factor). The justification for placing the children at the heart of this
investigation was to provide a platform to allow them to express their own views
and opinions, whilst allowing the research to gain insight directly from the
participants.

2.3 Organising Themes: A Cross-Disciplinary Study: Understanding the
Relationships that Exist Between Each Theme

This section looks at the relationships that exist between the three main areas of
interest, namely language, media and childhood by drawing on a wealth of cross-
disciplinary literature in the fields of sociolinguistics, media studies and childhood studies. Using Attride-Sterling’s (2001) Thematic Networking Model, this section focuses on the organising themes (to use Attride-Sterling’s terminology) specific to this research. This soft clustering approach draws on relationships between language and media, media and childhood, and childhood and language. By presenting the literature in a cross-disciplinary manner, a holistic approach to the literature is generated, in addition to highlighting the perceived shortfalls in specific areas of the existing literature.

Through focusing on the interconnections between language, media and childhood six themes were identified. The first theme focuses on the role media plays in nation building with specific reference to the use of media in minority-language maintenance campaigns. Reference is made to the work of Messenger Davies (2010) and her work on indigenous media for cultural preservation in modern society. Launched in 1982, S4C represents one of the most iconic cultural institutions in Wales. In addition to its prominent position as a key pillar in the infrastructure of Welsh-language maintenance, economically the creative industries in Wales employ an estimated 75,000 people in Wales (Welsh Government, 2013). Considering the significance of this industry both culturally and economically to Wales, the second theme focuses on the connections between minority language media and language prestige examining Wright’s notion that Welsh-language media gives ‘access to prestige work to Welsh-language speakers’ (Wright, 1998: 57). The following two themes focus on the changing media landscape in the digital age and the impact this is having on temporal viewing by children. The significance of the schedule is discussed in relation to the development of on-demand and catch-up services, with scheduling discussed from the perspective of routine, often a significant element in terms of how children develop and become increasingly socialised. The fifth theme discussed in this section focuses on the complex relationship that exists between Welsh-language education and Welsh-language media.

almost impossible to discuss one without the other. Despite the supportive nature of this relationship in regards to the language maintenance campaign, it can also be problematic, especially for young audiences having to differentiate between education and entertainment.

This section concludes by looking at the interconnections between bilingual education and language prestige. Again drawing on one of the key successes in the Welsh-language maintenance campaign, namely Welsh-language education, the topic of language prestige is revisited from the perspective of education.

2.3.1 The Media as a Nation-Building Tool

Television is a 'human construct' (Fiske and Hartley, 1978: 5) that 'responds to the conditions within which it exists' (ibid). Fiske & Hartley explain how language represents the means by which people participate in society, with television offering an extension of this process. An understanding of how language and television can somehow 'mediate reality' (ibid) can help explain the importance that minority-language campaigners have placed on the need for minority-language media.

The importance, for many, of establishing a viable Welsh-language media service was more than simply safeguarding the language. It also represented a means by which other cultural traditions could be preserved and maintained in modern society. Lysaght (2009) refers to the significant symbolic importance of broadcasting 'national' events. The coverage of national events can be a driving force for minority-language channels, with the media coverage of Eisteddfodau in Wales being a powerful example of this. An Eisteddfod is ‘traditionally a competition-based festival’ (www.eisteddfod, 2016) encompassing all aspects of culture and the arts in Wales. While the tradition is believed to date back to the twelfth century, the modern Eisteddfod dates back to 1789 (Edwards, 1990). Mulholland notes how the ‘revival of the Eisteddfod was a significant part of the late-eighteenth and early-nineteenth-century reconstruction of Welsh regional, national and ethnic identity’ (Mulholland, 2013: 67). Since the revival of the modern Eisteddfod, annual Eisteddfodau have been held ever since, with a
National Eisteddfod held each year during the month of August, an international Eisteddfod held annually in Llangollen during July, and the Urdd Eisteddfod, for children and young people held annually in May. The Urdd29 Eisteddfod, first held in 1928, is a unique event for children and young people under the age of 25. Participants compete in a number of events both on and off the stage, ranging from music and literature to dance and art. As one of Europe’s largest youth touring festivals, it attracts over 100,000 visitors a year, with over 15,000 children and young people competing annually (www.UrddEisteddfod, 2014).

Comprehensive coverage of the Urdd Eisteddfod (which usually takes place during the month of May) is broadcast on S4C. Significant changes are made to the channel’s schedule during the weeklong event, especially in the context of children’s programmes. The Urdd Eisteddfod represents a significant event in the context of the school calendar, with a clear educational imperative. Coverage of the event includes a number of programmes being aired live from the Eisteddfod ‘maes’30. As children compete in a number of events throughout the week, the coverage demonstrates one of the best examples of ‘children on TV’ by the broadcaster (see Appendix 1 for the Friday television listings from the 2015 Urdd Eisteddfod week on S4C). The changes to the schedule demonstrate the significance placed on the cultural event for children and young people.

Drawing on Messenger Davies’s work on cultural identity, the coverage of the Urdd Eisteddfod is a clear example of the political ideology behind the drive to preserve indigenous television production for children through the broadcast of national events (Messenger Davies, 2010: 63). She goes on to explain how ‘indigenous media production’ is often regarded as a means of safeguarding children’s sense of cultural belonging in addition to promoting ‘multicultural information’ (ibid). The significance of such comprehensive coverage can be seen as a rejection of what Scourfield et al. refer to as the ‘McDisney’ (Scourfield et al.,

29 Urdd Gobaith Cymru was founded in 1922 by Sir Ifan ab Owen Edwards. His vision was to appeal to the children of Wales to join a new movement, which aimed to ‘protect the Welsh language in a world where the English language dominated every aspect of life outside the home’ (www.UrddEisteddfod).
30 Literally translated as the Eisteddfod Field, the ‘maes’ refers to the main location where the Eisteddfod is being held, with the pavilion located at its center. There are a number of other stages and venues located on the maes, along with food and drink vendors, stalls, services and exhibition spaces.
attitude to globalised mass media, in which children’s exposure to
global mass media ‘would supplant more locally-based kinds of identification’
(ibid). The debate highlighted by Scourfield et al. has significant relevance to this
research project as it focuses on the importance that children place on local
identity in times of ‘highly globalised mass-media’ (Scourfield et al., 2006: 4). As
children are ‘highly active participants of consumer cultures’ (ibid) some writers
on globalisation believe that they may lose ‘all possibility of developing a sense
of local or ethnic attachment’ (ibid). The broadcasting of the Urdd Eisteddfod,
along with the touring nature of the festival is a clear example of what Messenger
Davies refers to as indigenous media safeguarding children’s sense of cultural
belonging. The location of the Urdd Eisteddfod changes every year, alternating
between north and south Wales and is not exclusive to areas where there are
high proportions of Welsh speakers. The significance of this is to promote
inclusion and strengthen linguistic infrastructure on a localised level.
Preparation leading up to both the National and Urdd Eisteddfodau are
community-focused. Schools and local communities play an active role in
creating the Eisteddfod, with the benefits to the local communities known to be
both cultural (through the increased presence of Welsh and the promotion of the
arts) and economic (through local revenue).

Due to the cultural significance of events such as the Urdd Eisteddfod, coverage
(as displayed in Appendix 1) of these events feature prominently in both S4C and
Radio Cymru's schedules. In addition to the Eisteddfod featuring heavily in these
schedules, the BBC and S4C have a prominent presence on the ‘maes’, both
operating onsite studio’s for live broadcasts, performances and concerts. As a
result of this, the relationship that exists between Welsh-language media and the
Eisteddfod is extremely deep-rooted adding to the complex debate surrounding
the state’s involvement in the provision of Welsh-language media (as public
service broadcasters). The issue regarding the state’s role in providing media
services for minority-language communities is a highly contested issue,
especially considering the current media landscape where increased choice and
availability is creating a more competitive media market. While the funding
situation of S4C in Wales has altered over the years, S4C has always been a public
service broadcaster. However, the debate surrounding state support of minority-language media in the age of globalisation is a topic that attracts serious academic debate. Kelly-Holmes (2001), in her comparative study of Irish and Breton broadcasting, offers an insight into the diversities that exist within the ‘sector of minority-language broadcasting’ (Kelly-Holmes, 2001: 1). TG4, like S4C, is a broadcasting body that is predominantly funded by the state. Following Irish independence, the Irish government invested in the ideology of the Irish language: ‘one language, one people’, despite the relatively small number of ‘organic speakers’ (ibid). Kelly-Holmes (2005) explains how there is an expectation within Ireland that the service should be funded by the State, (a viewpoint that also rings true in Wales). However, Fennell (cited in Kelly-Holmes, 2005: 50) argues that TG4 is ‘first and foremost is a television station’ and ‘not a language revival movement’. The difficulty in defining a minority-language channel as simply a television channel often conflicts with the ideological values and expectations placed on such services. In a report published by the Welsh Affairs Committee (2011), Talfan Davies notes how Welsh-language media represents more than simply a television station. He writes how its iconic status has helped to shape the identity of the Welsh nation through instilling a distinct set of values, namely intrinsic, public and institutional (House of Commons Welsh Affairs Committee: S4C, 2011). While the channel’s intrinsic value refers to the content produced by the channel, and subsequently how it is received and valued by its audience, the public and institutional value is based on cultural understanding. One of the main areas of interest for this research was to better understand how young audiences understand such concepts and the viability of such claims in a media landscape that has and remains subject to significant changes. Cormack (2007) argues that language activists may see this relationship as one of support; however, academic understanding of the impact that this relationship has is still relatively under-researched, especially in terms of the effects of different media on language maintenance.

31 TG4 is Ireland’s Irish language channel.
2.3.2 Language Prestige and Minority Language Media

As previously mentioned, language prestige refers to the ‘social value placed on a language’ (O’Rourke and Ramallo, 2011, 141). For many minority-language communities, social value can refer to the ability to produce and broadcast content in their language, leading to what Cormack (2007:58) explains as a community that is ‘fully modernised, capable of taking part in contemporary life’.

The new wave of social theory that emerged during the 1960s and 1970s saw minority-language groups’ place own-language broadcasting at the forefront of their language-maintenance campaign. While many, such as Gans (cited in Edwards, 1994: 128), saw such cultural movements as merely ‘symbolic’, Hourigan (2001) explains how European minority language groups placed themselves at the heart of many controversial actions, addressing the needs that minority-language communities had for own-language media. In November 1970, Zeruko Argia – a Basque-language magazine – announced the creation of its own publishing company, which was backed by well-known names in Basque culture. While attempts had been made to revive the magazine (first published in 1921) during the 1950s, under the Franco regime, only a few copies were published. In light of the new wave of social movements, Argia set out the mission for the magazine to be ‘For Basques of different persuasions’ (Elkartea, 2010: 29), regardless of their religion, education, political affiliations, status, age or region. In this instance, the aim was to promote and celebrate a unified Basque identity. Despite this example drawing on the tradition of print media, the significance of this campaign in relation to this research is rooted in the complexities of understanding society and minority language communities in Western Europe. When discussing language, class and social identities are often regarded as significant factors worthy of investigation. While it would be naïve to underestimate the significance of class in sociolinguistics, Elkartea (2010) argues that linguistic communities can exist beyond the boundaries of class, because they are primarily united by language. When looking at the literature that currently exists on children’s media and identity, social class is often a defining feature of the research (Buckingham, 1993). However, the situation with a number of minority-language communities in post-industrial Europe is
that minority language use is not necessarily a pre-determined factor in social class, especially when considering Fishman’s models relating to diglossia and bilingualism, and specifically in the context of bilingualism without diglossia. In fact, as noted by Trosset, complex ‘prestige systems’ (1993: 55) can develop within minority-language communities, which come to ‘constitute a cultural elite’ (ibid). One of the main aims of this research was to investigate the relationship that a variety of communities across Wales had with the Welsh-language in terms of prestige. Considering the significant rise in Welsh-medium education, especially in areas outside of the Welsh-speaking heartlands, high levels of demand suggest an element of desirability connected to the Welsh-language. In fact, Hodges even proposes parents ‘choosing Welsh-medium education for their children, within an increasingly Anglicised area’ (Hodges, 2009: 21-22), are arguably partaking in Bourdieu’s theory of cultural capital, whereby social assets (such as language) promote social mobility beyond financial means. However, while a clear shift is emerging in terms of the status of the Welsh-language, a language traditionally restricted to the informal domains, what we are presented with now is a ‘prestige’ debate surrounding dialectical and language-competency issues.

Savage et al. develop this notion of cultural elite or cultural class further in their work on class-identities. According to their research, the situation that exists in Wales is one of ‘class-based recognition of the power of culture’ (Savage et al., 2010: 71). This hypothesis is based on the use of the term crachach (the literal translation meaning ‘posh’) by a group of Welsh working-class participants. Participants stressed a distinct difference between class and crachach, with crachach referring to a kind of cultural poshness or elite. Savage et al. explain how there appears to be a ‘distinct Welsh form of class awareness’ (ibid: 71) which has the ability to mobilise the resources of national identity. While there is no specific reference made to the Welsh language in the work of Savage et al., language is understood to be an implicit aspect of culture. Ruck (2013), citing an anonymous Welsh poet, explains how the crachach have really developed over the past 30 to 40 years through the gravitation of the establishment of Wales to Cardiff. Ruck’s critical appraisal of this cultural elite is explained by the
increasing number of senior positions within Welsh institutions (such as the BBC, WJEC and similar) held by ‘white, middle-aged, Welsh speakers’ (Ruck, 2013) also known as crachach. He is particularly critical of Welsh-language media in Wales, accusing the establishment of being nepotistic - comparing the crachach to an extreme network that makes even the ‘Masons look inadequate’ (ibid). However, it could be argued that this situation is somewhat confined to the larger towns and cities, especially Cardiff where a number of the large institutional bodies such as S4C and the WJEC are located. While a microclimate of language prestige may exist in these larger towns and cities, namely Cardiff, there may not necessarily be a situation of linguistic prestige based on linguistic variants spoken by natives of those areas. Situations of linguistic prestige are said to be much more prominent in areas where Welsh is more widely spoken. In a study investigating language attitudes, Garrett et al. note how amongst the Welsh-speaking community, the southwest accent/dialect\(^{32}\) (SW) has the highest attributed linguistic prestige, with Cardiff and the northeast (NE) the lowest, being ‘deemed far less pleasant and far less Welsh’ (Garrett et al., 2003: 131).

The purpose of this investigation is to understand the potential role that the media play in constructing notions of regional, national and linguistic identities amongst young audiences within a specific language community. The linguistic situation in Wales is both varied and complex. It would be misleading to refer to Welsh as a ‘minority-language’ in the Welsh-speaking heartlands of Gwynedd, Carmarthen or Ceredigion where between 50 and 70% of the population are Welsh speaking (see Figure 1). As a result, it could be argued that areas of the northwest and southwest do not assign such linguistic prestige to the Welsh language on a local level. On a national level, however, linguistic prestige exists through a consideration of a superior linguistic variant, considered ‘truly Welsh-sounding’ (Garrett, et al., 2003: 131), at times exemplified through the media.

\(^{32}\) Despite the terms accent and dialect having distinct meanings, with dialect referring to a linguistic variety spoken by a person in terms of their accent, vocabulary and grammatical features, accent refers to the way a person sounds based on the way they pronounce certain words, these terms are often used interchangeably (cf. Garrett et al., 2003).
2.3.3 The Importance of Scheduling in Children’s Broadcasting

Before the digital age of multichannel television, broadcasters like the BBC would show preschool programmes in the morning, followed by children’s programmes in the afternoon, coinciding with the children’s return from school, aired until 6.00pm (Orlebar, 2011: 29). Orlebar explains that there were a number of reasons for doing this. Firstly, the amount of television content dedicated to children was contained; subsequently limiting the amount of television children could watch, amidst any fears of overexposure to media use by children. Secondly, as the programmes were aired on the mainstream channels, it was easier for them to be seen by parents, allowing for content to be monitored. Finally, and perhaps most significantly, scheduling had been constructed in such a way that it neatly fitted in with the daily routine of the child, essentially filling the gap between the end of the school day and evening mealtime. Due to the significant changes seen to the media landscape, multichannel television featuring ‘branded’ children’s channels, programme content, and the number of hours of television that children consume, has become more difficult to monitor. The existence of dedicated Freeview channels such as CBBC and CBeebies, which are on air from 7am until 7pm every day, coupled with on-demand services, provide children with much greater viewing flexibility. Orlebar (2011: 29) explains how ‘parents in the twenty-first century have no idea what sort of programmes their children are watching’. While perhaps a little presumptuous to generalise based on this statement, this is an interesting observation in light of the way in which children are socialised.

When looking at S4C in the specific context of Wales, the former scheduling traditions of pre-multi-channel television remain. Despite preschool content increasing on S4C with Cyw (S4C’s preschool brand) aired from 7am until 1pm and again from 4 pm until 5 pm (see Appendix 2), Stwnsh (S4C’s tween brand) is only aired from 5 pm until 6 pm. While children’s lives and routines have not changed significantly over the past thirty years in terms of school timetables, changes to the media landscape may in fact have detrimental effects on the existing/potential audience of S4C’s tween content. In a report published in 1987, the first comprehensive study mapping the successes and shortfalls of S4C
in its first five years broadcasting, Thomas (1987) drew attention to the problematic scheduling of the channels broadcasting of children's content. In his review, he noted how S4C did not start broadcasting its children's content until 5.05p.m, significantly later than its competitor-channels, HTV and the BBC, which began their broadcasts at 3:30 pm (Thomas 1987). Thomas suggested that the implications of such actions resulted in a loss of viewers to other channels. Despite the concerns voiced by Thomas almost thirty-years-ago, when looking at the current situation on S4C in relation to tween programing, very little appears to have altered in this respect.

Children’s content is now freely available on Freeview, Sky and cable subscription channels resulting in children not having to depend on schedules in order to ensure they have access to their favourite programmes. On-demand services also provide a platform where children and parents can watch content after it has been aired. Despite this, routine, as noted by Giddens (1989: 277), plays an important part in social life. Studies on early childhood note how routine is an important element in the development of ‘mutual interaction’ (Durkin, 1995:67) between infant and parent. As children mature routines extend beyond the parameters of family life, with schools and after-school activities providing additional temporal routines. Subsequently, when considering the changes seen in the media landscape, disregarding the importance of scheduling is perhaps a little naïve even in the digital age.

Attitudes towards scheduling were an important part of this investigation, and (the need to better understand) the constraints of allocated viewing were of significant interest.

Given the significant changes to the ways in which public service broadcasting in Wales is funded, S4C has to make significant decisions in terms of service provision. Internally, restructuring the organisation from the top down and making significant alterations to the schedule have altered the television landscape in Wales. The real changes, however, are beyond the control of the organisation, as the global media landscape is rapidly shifting. The increased levels of choice created by the rollout of digital television services and developments in multiplatform media have both contributed to changing the
media landscape, by creating new opportunities, and issued challenges to broadcasters and production companies. While changes such as the analogue/digital switchover may have been significant for older generations, (including young people, who were children during the 1990s and early 2000s), this current generation of children – the so-called ‘digital generation’ (Livingstone, 2009: 1) – take such levels of participation and choice that digital services can provide as natural.

Considering the digital switchover took place in Wales prior to the beginning of the data-gathering process for this investigation (on the 12th of August 2009 (Digital UK, 2012), all children involved in this research project were accustomed to digital television. The significance of the digital switchover in Wales has meant that there is now a definite monolingual trend in broadcasting. Programmes broadcast on S4C are now exclusively in Welsh, where once they co-existed with English-language programmes. As a result of the digital switchover in 2009, a second Welsh-language service was made available in Wales through ‘new digital capacity provided by S4C’ (Jones, 2010: 8). The channel was initially used to broadcast proceedings of the National Assembly for Wales (Y Senedd), and was called S4C2. Jones (2010) explains how very little statistical information exists on the reach of S4C2 since BARB reports provide no information on the channel’s viewing figures. The report also discusses the possibility of using the channel space for a new Welsh-language service for children, replacing coverage from Y Senedd with a service similar to that delivered by the BBC through its CBBC and CBeebies service. The proposed plans stated that the service should ‘have relevancy to all children in Wales’ (Jones, 2010: 13), indicating that, while the service should be a ‘mainly Welsh-language service’ (ibid), elements of English-language programming could be included.

The significance of this statement resonates with key conflicting viewpoints relating to children’s minority language media, namely the threat posed by English-language media. Once again, ideas relating to the erosion of temporal programming (Lury, 2002) are reiterated in Jones’ report about serving children.

---

33 BARB refers to the Broadcasters’ Audience Research Board. Founded in 1981, BARB provide a ‘television audience measurement service for broadcasters and the advertising industry’ (www.BARB).
in the digital future, arguing against the significance of scheduling. According to Jones, ‘scheduling is an old-fashioned concept’ unfamiliar to a generation of young audiences who are only accustomed to a media landscape of increased availability and ‘on-demand’ content (Jones, 2010: 3). Considering the nature of Jones’s report, devaluing the significance of the schedule can be seen as a powerful argument for the development of a comprehensive children’s service on S4C, a service to rival the English-language service provided by the BBC. Despite his strong argument for the provision of a comprehensive service for children on a separate channel, this would come at a great financial cost, and subsequently has not yet materialised. According to Jones (2010: 13), ‘Welsh-language television is becoming less and less relevant in the lives of children and teenagers, partly due to the changing attitudes of the target audience to media, mobility and choice’. The significance of the schedule in the lives of tween audiences still remains a contested issue amongst academics, broadcasters and media practitioners, especially when considering minority language media. While general global trends do exist in the production and consumption of media, a consideration is needed for cultural variants. While choice and competition have always been factors in attracting audiences to S4C, Thomas (1987) explains how, despite the importance of young audiences and their future potential as loyal viewers, scheduling has, since the creation of S4C, often been largely overlooked.

Despite Jones’s (2010) report being relatively recent, the current economic and political climate has transformed children’s media in Wales. While pre-school programming has increased dramatically (S4C Press Office 2011), the decline in programmes aimed at tween audiences is significant in terms of the scheduling debate. Extended hours for Cyw, with both morning and afternoon broadcasts, seems to pander to the needs of younger pre-school audiences, but the time-slot assigned to tween audiences has, and continues to alter. These changes have seen the daily afternoon slot allocated to tween programming fluctuate between 1 and 2 hours. Such continuous alterations require children to be familiar with the schedule or risk missing the designated viewing time. While the significance of this may be debated given the catch-up services available, the Ofcom results
indicate that only 33% of children aged between 5-and-15 make use of such services (Ofcom, 2014: 41). Detailed figures indicate that this figure is even lower amongst children aged 8-and-11 (the specific catchment of this research) were only 28% noted using such services, compared with 42% amongst children aged between 12-and-15. What is interesting about these figures is the sharp rise is use of such services coinciding with the transition phase.

When S4C’s tween content was rebranded in 2010, the time-slot allocated to Stwnsh was between 4.00 and 6.00 p.m. In May 2015, however, the tween service looked much more like the early schedule Thomas refers to from 1987, with programmes beginning at 5.00pm. When considering the evidence presented in Ofcom’s figures, the significance of the schedule to preadolescent viewers is once again brought into question, indicating that preconceived ideas relating to the ‘digital generation’ need further, more specific investigation.

As noted, the changes made to the way S4C is funded (S4C, 2011), the success of channel’s pre-school brand, Cyw (S4C Press Office, 2011), and the relatively poor viewing figures of S4C’s tween brand, Stwnsh (S4C Press Office, 2010) have resulted in dramatic changes being made to the schedule. If Lury’s claims about how current child audiences being ‘unable to understand the television schedule solely as a temporal procession of events’ (Lury, 2002: 25) are valid, then Welsh-language tween content is in danger of becoming obsolete. The continual changes to the tween schedule are in danger of alienating the target audience.

One area of specific interest to this research is how changes to scheduling can create distance between a broadcaster and its target audience. In the context of children, this flags concerns about future channel loyalties and affiliations. In terms of research focusing specifically on Wales and S4C, very little has been done to tackle this issue in recent years. It is the intention of this thesis to make an original contribution to knowledge in this respect.

The discussion surrounding children’s media and identity is an extremely complex one spanning a number of disciplines. One area of specific interest in relation to this research project is the role that the changing media landscape plays in influencing viewing trends. Lury’s work concentrates on the way in
which channels negotiate the spread of media culture. She explains how we have now left the ‘four channel era’ behind (Lury 2002: 25) and have entered the digital era of choice where schedules have become increasingly branded. A number of channels, Lury argues, have encouraged the erosion of ‘temporal and aesthetic boundaries between children’s “television culture” and adult or teen viewing pleasure’ (ibid: 15) through producing programmes with a wider appeal. Other channels have deliberately positioned themselves as channels exclusively for children, through utilising available digital space (CBBC and BBC3, for example, share the same frequency despite occupying different locations on the EPG\(^{34}\)). Lury argues that such changes in the media landscape have led to the understanding that channels are ‘no longer given but chosen’ (Lury, 2002: 25). Unlike larger broadcasters such as the BBC who have the capacity to reposition themselves in this way, minority-language channels such as S4C still remain a single channel needing to service an entire nation of Welsh-speakers. While the notion of creating a channel specifically for children occupying the second Welsh-language service S4C2 was proposed by Jones (2010), drastic cuts to the budget have resulted in the abandonment of this second Welsh-language service. The difficulties facing broadcasters like S4C is their inability to follow the same pathway as rival broadcasters such as iTV, BBC and Channel 4 who have the capacity and finances to operate multi-channel services. While S4C has successfully created audience specific brands such as Cyw and, to a lesser extent Stwnsh, one of the major criticisms voiced by the children included in the initial KTP research was the increased scheduling time allocated to preschool programmes (Cyw) at the expense of tween audiences. While the vision of creating a specific channel for children’s content on S4C’s second service never materialising, you would be forgiven for thinking that this was a reality when looking at the weekday schedule (see Appendix 2). During the day very little time has been allocated to anything other than preschool programmes, with a total of 7 hours dedicated to preschool programmes compared with 1.5 hours dedicated to tween and teen audiences, the choice available for older children is significantly less than that available for younger children. While there are clear

\(^{34}\) The Electronic Programme Guide.
financial reasons for this disparity, understanding how young audiences felt about this was an avenue in need of research.

The work of Abelman and Atkin on assessing issues of television viewing motivation, brand awareness and ‘network affiliation’ (Abelman and Atkin, 2000: 145-6) suggests that strong brand identities for channels (especially in the context of children’s television) have become a crucially important element in establishing and maintaining a target audience. Successful channel brands, for example, can be powerful in terms of creating viewer loyalties, and is neatly demonstrated by the preschool programming on S4C (Cyw). However, failure to produce a Welsh-language children’s service may have a knock-on effect with channel or brand loyalties wavering amongst young audiences, and affiliations lying with English- over Welsh-language outputs.

2.3.4 Children’s Minority-Language Media in the Digital Age

In 1999, Mackay drew specific attention to the failings of Welsh-language media in reaching its audience. He argued that this is due, in part, to the lack of research dedicated to understanding the service’s users and consumers (Mackay, 1999: 16). However, he does not limit this criticism to S4C alone, and makes reference to the lack of research across a number of the Welsh institutional bodies such as The National Museum of Wales and BBC Wales (ibid: 15). More than 10 years on from the publication of his work, S4C is arguably still struggling to attract viewers, especially preadolescent audiences. A number of possible reasons are given to explain the shortcomings of the Welsh-language media, such as the challenging prospect of producing multiplatform content (Ian Jones S4C’s chief executive, cited in Wales Online, 2012). When discussing children’s media multiplatform content has become increasingly important as it forms a fundamental component of children’s overall media experience. Programmes aimed at children often have multiplatform dimensions, designed to offer the target audience a richer media experience. The need to develop online Welsh-language content appears prominently in literature on the future of S4C, especially in terms of content aimed at children. Huw Jones, the former Chief Executive of S4C, noted that the launch of S4C’s website was as significant to the
Welsh language as the translation of the Bible into Welsh (Mackay, 1999: 14). However, Mackay remains sceptical of Jones’s optimism and explains how inequalities in terms of access to new technologies and media in the late 1990s and early 2000s were problematic throughout Wales. Mackay, of course, is referring to a pre-digital-switchover Wales, where some areas of the country were unable to receive the basic terrestrial channels. He also makes reference to poor Internet access in Wales and other parts of the UK, highlighting the fact that only a ‘third of households in the UK’ (ibid) had computers at the time, with only half of those households connected to the Internet (Mackay, 1999: 15). Ap Dyfrig et al. (2006) refers to Ofcom’s figures from 2006 which show an increase to 56% in the number of households in Wales owning a computer, with 49% of households connected to the Internet. However, this was still significantly lower than the UK national average of 66% (with computers) and 57% (connected to the Internet) at the time, and could be related to lower earnings in Wales and, more specifically, ‘patchy’ broadband connectivity. More recent figures taken from Ofcom’s 2015 Communications Market Report show that broadband take-up in Wales now stands at 78%, a significant increase of 7% since Ofcom’s 2012 report, the greatest increase seen by any of the (UK) regions.

While the media landscape has changed dramatically since the publication of this article, many of Mackay’s points remain valid. He stresses that caution should be taken when considering new media and technologies, looking at the possibilities for ‘communication and community’ (Mackay, 1999: 16) in terms of language maintenance. Mackay explains how ‘We need to understand the practices and preferences of the body of people who make up Wales as, in everyday lives and routines, the complex array of global UK, Welsh and local media are implicated in constructing identities’ (ibid).

Mackay’s final point ties in with the very nature of this research project, highlighting the need for academic research to be conducted in relation to Welsh-language media engagement by existing and potential audiences, in order to understand whether or not Welsh-language media are answering the socio-cultural needs of its consumers. Lysaght explains that, while language preservation may initially be the ‘aim of broadcasters in an environment of
sociolinguistic threat’ (Lysaght, 2009: 47), understanding, defining, and redefining the expectations of the audience should be done in order to understand audience expectations. Lysaght also draws attention to the common challenges facing minority-language media platforms. Challenges include ‘funding, (and) availability of fluent speakers with the requisite technical skills’ in addition to the importance of ‘identifying and researching an audience’ (ibid).

2.3.5 The Complex Relationship between Welsh Medium Education and Welsh-language Media

The complex relationship that exists between Welsh-language media and Welsh medium education in Wales makes it almost impossible to discuss one without the other. For minority language maintenance movements, the growth of language through the promotion of education often sits at the heart of successful campaigns. However, there is a danger that an over-dependency on education as the main tool for language maintenance can result in negative perceptions of minority language use being formed by younger generations, especially those from areas where Welsh is not the dominant language of the home or surrounding community. As outlined by The European Bureau for Lesser-Used Languages (EBLUL) and the European Centre for Minority Issues (ECMI), language vitality is based on three required conditions: ‘the capacity to use the language; opportunities to use it; and the desire to do so’ (Grin & Moring, 2002: 5). As noted in Chapter 1, in 2012, the Welsh Government released its five-year Welsh-language strategy (A living language: a language for living 2012-2017). In addition to the importance placed on Welsh-language education, the aims of this strategy were to promote a holistic approach to language maintenance through facilitating the use of the Welsh-language in everyday life and strengthening infrastructure, such as digital technology for the language (Welsh Government, 2012: 16). The focus placed on infrastructure and digital technology also plays an important role within this research. S4C represents one of the most iconic institutions that make up the rich infrastructure for Welsh-language maintenance, and in terms of language prestige ‘gives access to prestige work to Welsh language speakers’ (Wright, 1998: 57). Drawing on the EBLUL and the ECMI model for language vitality, it could be argued that educational institutions
provide the capacity to use the language through instruction, while Welsh-language media provides one example of an opportunity to use and engage with the language. When considering children’s television content, the boundaries between education and entertainment – especially when considering minority language media often become blurred through the deliberate merging of these two institutions. As noted in Chapter 1, language maintenance strategies often emphasise the importance of combining the use of education and other linguistic infrastructures such as media. Understanding how this dynamic works in reality is an area in need of further research, especially when considering this from the perspective of the child, an active member of the education system.

According to the Welsh Affairs Committee, ‘S4C plays a major role in promoting the Welsh language through a medium which reaches children and young people in particular and in many cases complementing bi-lingual education in schools’ (House of Commons, 2011, 9). When considered from the standpoint of the child, especially the preadolescent bilinguals, the third required condition as outlined by the EBLUL and ECMI – ‘desirability’, comes into question. When reflecting on children’s television, there are concerns that blurring the boundaries between education and entertainment can affect audience engagement with channels or brands. Despite conflicting views regarding S4C’s role in supporting education, the organisation confirmed, in 2013, that schools and colleges licensed with the Educational Recording Agency (ERA) had the right to make non-commercial educational use of the channel’s on-demand online programme service (S4C Press Release, 2013), subsequently further merging these two separate spheres.

One of the main reasons for using Welsh-language media to complement Welsh-language education is based on the medium’s informality. According to Lemish’s work on second-language acquisition, television can act as a tool in aiding vocabulary development through a non-threatening, non-demanding social environment (Lemish, 2007: 158). Schools and other educational institutions on the other hand represent a far more formal setting for instruction.
2.3.6 Welsh-language Education: A Varied Approach

Mendoza-Denton and Osborne explain how bi-/multilingualism is ‘the most common linguistic condition of societies’ (2010: 113). Despite this, however, both academic and popular accounts of the topic have often struggled with monolingual biases. The notable shift in perceptions of the Welsh language is closely connected to the education system in Wales. There are two schools of thought: the positive perception relates to the education-based language strategies, for example *Iaith Pawb*\(^{35}\), while the negative perception relates to continued monolingual biases that see bilingual education as somehow damaging to a child’s development (Wei, 2000). According to Lewis, the Welsh and bilingual education system over the past sixty years has played a ‘vital role in ensuring the transmission of the Welsh-language from one generation to the next’ (Lewis, 2006: 22). As noted in Chapter 1, the 1944 Education Act allowed for Local Education Authorities in Wales to consider ‘opening Welsh-medium schools’ (ibid), and in 1947 the first publically-funded Welsh-medium primary school was opened in Llanelli (Williams, 2003). While the aim of establishing Welsh-medium schools was initially designed to serve the Welsh-speaking communities of Wales, the rise in the number of children from non-Welsh-speaking homes attending Welsh schools has been significant. During the 2009–2010 Census period, for example, 22% of children in Wales were taught Welsh as a first language in Year 1 (England, 2012). Subsequently, the number of Welsh-medium schools in both primary and secondary sectors has increased. Lewis notes that the number of Welsh-medium primary schools in Wales was 448 in 2003, with a further 72 schools using Welsh as a teaching method for some areas of the curriculum (Welsh in Schools 2003, cited in Lewis, 2006: 22). However, the linguistic situation in Wales is not simply based on increased demand for Welsh-language education. The desirability of Welsh-language education, in part, can be attributed to both socio-cultural and socio-economic factors.

Both language prestige, which refers to the social value placed on a language, and linguistic prestige, which refers to the value placed on language variants (Wolfram, 2009), are important elements of this research study. Language

---

\(^{35}\) *Iaith Pawb* refers to the 2003 Welsh Assembly Government’s initiative for a bilingual Wales.
prestige is often valued in terms of social mobility and is often linked to ‘inclusion in the education system and... the labour market’ (O’Rourke and Ramallo, 2011: 141). O’Rourke and Ramallo explain this connection between social mobility and language knowledge as constituting the main motivating force behind minority language maintenance movements. The children involved in this doctoral research all attended Welsh-medium schools despite not all coming from Welsh-speaking homes. Understanding how the children perceived language prestige through their engagement with the language was central to this study.

As previously discussed, when referring to bilingualism and diglossia, the status of the Welsh language has dramatically changed over the past 50 years. The status of the Welsh-language, despite some continual monolingual biases (Shipton, 2008 cited in Mendoza-Denton and Osborne, 2010: 113), has grown significantly over the years. The Welsh language now shares equal status with English as a national/official language of Wales, arguably demonstrating a shift in language prestige. As with language prestige, linguistic prestige also presents a hierarchical system linked to socially constructed perceptions. However, in the specific case of Wales and the Welsh-language community, this does not necessarily have any connection to socio-economics. For example, when considering the work of Garrett et al. (2003) in relation to the existence of ‘truly Welsh-sounding’ (Garrett, et al., 2003: 131) accents, a working class (Welsh-language) accent from Carmarthen may carry higher linguistic prestige than a middle-class (Welsh-language) accent from Cardiff. The reason for this could be attributed to the perceived authenticity of accents from the Welsh-speaking heartlands. Coupland notes how linguistic authenticity is ‘based in beliefs about ontology – how language ‘really is’, on the ground; how we find it to be when we seek it out ‘in the community’ (Coupland, 2007: 181). Linguistic prestige therefore is associated to the authenticity of its sound and, in this instance has very little to do with the socio-economic status of its speaker.

The children in this study come from a variety of rural, semi-urban and urban areas across Wales, where language varieties are very different as a result of dialect and linguistic heritage. The sample included children from the Welsh-
speaking heartlands of Gwynedd to the predominately English-speaking communities of southeast Wales. Linguistic forms, which convey social significance, are said to ‘carry overt prestige’ (Wolfram (2009: 45), while non-standard forms, which are considered to oppose the social significance, carry ‘covert prestige’ (ibid). Wolfram provides an example that sits neatly within this research project. Reference is made to a youth adopting a ‘vernacular form in order to maintain solidarity’ with his or her peer group despite stigmatising himself from the ‘wider, mainstream context of the school environment’ (ibid).

As mentioned earlier, Gwynedd in North Wales is one of two counties in Wales were Welsh-language primary school education is compulsory through full language immersion. In terms of the child’s encounter of schooling, the experience varies depending on the child’s competence. Children attending immersion schools with little or no prior Welsh-language knowledge are immersed in an intensive language programme. Despite some criticism from some parents, the 2011 census revealed that 92% of children aged 5-15 in Gwynedd were able to speak Welsh. Due to the high numbers of Welsh speakers in Gwynedd (69% according to the 2011 Census), the approach to Welsh-language education in the county differs to that taken in other areas of Wales. For those from Welsh-language homes, Welsh-medium education represents L1 maintenance, while, for those from non-Welsh-speaking homes, Welsh-language education represents ‘immersion in the target language’ (Baker, 1993: 229). The approach to teaching is, as a result, dependent on the numbers of L1 maintenance and L2 immersion children in these areas. Despite being a little outdated in terms of statistics, Lewis (2006: 24) notes that ‘6.2% of the pupil population in Welsh primary schools’ were L1 maintenance in 2005. Whilst being a relatively low figure nationwide, ‘the ratio between pupils from Welsh-speaking homes and those from non-Welsh-speaking homes varies considerably [53.9% from Welsh-speaking homes in Gwynedd (which has the highest percentage of Welsh speakers at 69.0%); 0.0% from Welsh-speaking homes in Blaenau Gwent]’ (ibid). As a result of this, Gwynedd has been able to lead the way in creating a ‘full immersion’ education system on a countywide basis due, in part, to the strength of the L1 maintenance community. The significance of work by
academics such as Lewis and Baker demonstrates the varying strategies utilised by the government to create an education system that works for both L1 maintenance and L2 immersion children. These different approaches to education best demonstrate the linguistic diversity of the Welsh-language community, and the notion that a single approach to Welsh-langue education does not work nationwide. In relation to this research, and considering the relationship that exists between Welsh-language media and Welsh-language education, it is perhaps unrealistic to assume that a singular media model will work for such a varied linguistic community. Despite this, there appears to be little in the way of research in this field.

### 2.4 Global Themes: The Transition Phase

The term ‘transition’ is frequently referred to in the literature on childhood and adolescence in relation to biological change. However, according to Durkin (1995) one of the most significant transitions in western society is the change in organisational context from primary to secondary school. As stated earlier, for Durkin, one of the key factors to consider here is the ‘shift from being one of the senior pupils in a manageable environment to becoming one of the naïve newcomers in an anonymous bureaucracy’ (Durkin, 1995: 508). According to Durkin, this shift from primary to secondary school can have a significant impact on the development of self-understanding amongst preadolescents. In a study conducted by Materska et al. in 1987 looking at the coherence of self-understanding amongst children aged between 10-and14-years-old, results indicated the greatest inconsistencies appeared within the 11- to 12-year-old age group. Materska et al. (1987, cited in Durkin, 1995: 508) believed that for those who were ‘just entering a junior high school’; the impact of school transition temporarily disrupted the child’s organisation of self-concept (ibid: 514). Understanding how this temporary disruption affects the organisation of self-concept sits at the heart of this research.

This final section is divided into three sub-sections exploring three different themes based on the transition phase between primary and secondary school.
The first theme focuses on peer and adult relations and the influences these have on language choice and self-expression. The second theme focused on the school institution and the affects the transition from a primary school environment to a secondary school environment can have on children. In addition to the environmental change the method of instruction also changes, therefore gaining a better understanding of the literature available was important to this research in order to contextualise the research findings. Finally, the notion of affiliation to place and culture was revisited focusing on the transition phase and the possible affects this period of change can have on an individual.

2.4.1 Peer and Adult Relations: Language Choice and Self-Expression

The work of Adler and Adler (2001) on peer power explains how the concept of preadolescence, as a specific age period, is relatively new. Despite this, Frønes (1994, cited in Adler and Adler, 2001: 5) explains how the study of late childhood and early adolescence has become increasingly important because it represents a time where the ‘individualisation process’ (ibid) is at its most intense as a result of the changes in the cultural configuration of childhood. Physical changes in relation to puberty are developing, along with significant social restructuring and organisation, with the move from primary to secondary school education and increased autonomy from family life (Durkin, 1995: 508). Adler and Adler (2001) explain how increased specialisation of society has meant that children during this preadolescence phase need to acquire additional knowledge and skills to function successfully within a society of changing peer dynamics, increased academic pressure, and understandings of group and individual identities. This section focuses on the literature available in relation to the interdisciplinary themes in terms of the transition phase.

While parent-child relations are extremely important in the understanding of childhood, the growing influence of peer groups grows increasingly significant during middle childhood. Youniss (1999: 13) explains how studies on peer culture have evolved dramatically since the 1980s with regards to ‘the social construction of the individual’. Adler and Adler (2001), referring to Harris (1995), explain how peer groups are ‘much more critical to socialisation than
family groups, because intra- and intergroup processes, not dynamic relationships, are responsible for the transmission of culture...of children's personality characteristics’ (Adler and Adler (2001: 13-14). Issues of conformity to peer groups have a dramatic effect on popular culture orientation and, inevitably, identity formation.

As children enter into middle childhood, the parent-child relationship changes and the role of peers become increasingly important (Durkin 1995). According to Bronfenbrenner (1970, cited in Durkin, 1995: 252), this is not a rejection of parental dependency by children per se, but it represents a two-way process whereby increased independence and engagement with peers is both desired (by children) and encouraged, to some extent, by parents. As children progress from primary to secondary school education, their peer group and social world expands. While the number of peers increases, social affiliations alter dramatically, with fewer 'best friends' and more acquaintances.

Strasburger et al. (2002: 15) explain how studies of adolescent peer relations have often focused on the negative accounts through 'initiation of behaviours such as cigarette smoking...and drug use'. However, they go on to explain that the process is far more complex than this, as peer groups and friendship circles can also provide a source of support and increased self-esteem. This is an important factor to consider in this thesis, especially when considering the varying groups of children who participated in the research.

Linguistic identities sit at the centre of this investigation and exploring how children perceive their own bilingualism in relation to their other childhood identities is of significant interest. As children develop both cognitively and socially, their involvement with peer groups also increases. In addition to this increased independence and changing social affiliations can have a profound effect on the construction of identity. Bowie explains how one area where this has been well documented is in the influence changing peer affiliations can have on 'linguistic behaviour' (Bowie, 2010: 55). Mendoza-Denton (1997, 2008) explains how, as adolescents develop and change in terms of their peer group relations, so too can their linguistic behaviour in order to ‘reflect their new social
reality’ (Mendoza-Denton, 1997, 2008, cited in Bowie, 2010: 55). Language is a central issue in this research investigation, especially in terms of how attitudes towards language develop and change during the transition phase between primary and secondary school, a period where significant changes in peer relations are happening. Language competencies (in both Welsh and English), regional dialects and the language of the home were all key variables. Progression from primary to secondary school education involves an increased peer group setting, with secondary school significantly larger that primary. For example, a child from a non-Welsh-speaking home may be in the minority in their primary school but encounter many more peers in secondary school who also come from non-Welsh-speaking homes. In terms of social development, becoming part of a wider peer group may provide a situation in which children become more confident in both their surroundings and their language choices.

Language choice and language behaviour play a significant role in the way in which individuals conceptualise ‘self’ in relation to others. Language is a means by which people articulate specific elements of identity, and this is emphasised in the work of Bowie (2010) and Mendoza-Denton (1997, 2008), specifically in relation to language choice and affiliations to group membership. Adler and Adler explain how the formations of cliques, or ‘friendship groups’ (Adler and Adler, 1995: 145), are especially prominent during the latter years of elementary (primary) schools, encompassing a ‘high likelihood that members will identify each other sociometrically as mutually connected’ (ibid). Specific reference is made to the way in which ‘children clump together into racial, class-stratified and gender-segregated groups’ (ibid). While there is no specific reference made to the classification of specific linguistic groups (in terms of bilingualism or bilingual competencies), the social grouping together of children based on similarities would suggest that a similar situation could be possible based on language competences. Considering the linguistic diversity that exists amongst the Welsh-language community, specifically in regards to bilingual competencies and use, understanding how peer group dynamics are formulated amongst preadolescents was of particular interest to this investigation. The process of identity construction is a complex and multidimensional one, in which a number
of influences are at play. Berndt (1999: 51) explains how interactions with peers can play a 'major role in identity formation'. Through interacting with others, emerging identities can be both formed and challenged.

2.4.2 Education and the Transition Phase

According to Durkin (1995), the transition from primary to secondary school is understood to represent one of the defining features of middle childhood. The significance of this shift is highlighted by a number of academics in this field. Very few, however, with the exception of Howe (2011), offer an in-depth analysis of the educational restructuring that occurs between primary and secondary schools. Howe offers a historical account of the developmental changes that exist in the educational system in the UK and how these changes have influenced the organisational structure of both primary and secondary school. His work looks at the role of the teacher and ability-led structures of categorising children based on academic merit. According to his work, 11 was the age by which children were deemed ready to be ‘directed down one path or another’ (Howe, 2011: 3), with entry to grammar, technical and secondary modern schools (determined by the 11 plus) introduced in 1944. While grammar schools no longer exist in Wales, and the structure of education within the rest of the UK has also altered since the 1940s, secondary schools still remain subject-focused, with an emphasis on qualifications and league tables. The emphasis within secondary school is based on future decisions linked to career choices and university placements. Secondary school teachers are representative of subject areas, while primary school teachers in general ‘see their specialism as children or learning’ (Howe 2011: 6). As primary schools focus on the basics of ‘reading, writing and arithmetic’ (ibid), the teachers’ role within the classroom becomes much more central to the educational structure. The shift from the collective (whole-class) to the individual represents a significant part of the transition phase, and an explanation as to why this shift is so significant in terms of egocentrism (Durkin, 1995). Comparing Howe’s observations to those of Adler and Adler (2001), in respect to the changing peer dynamics, the organisational structures put in place by the education system in the UK perhaps thrusts change upon children.
2.4.3 Self-Identification and Affiliation to Culture and Place During the Transition Phase

As previously mentioned, the main purpose of this doctoral research is to determine whether the media mediates or maintains perceptions of language and identity with a specific focus on children in the transition phase between middle childhood and adolescence. The historic development of children’s material culture (specifically mass media) and the way in which we understand childhood is inherently bound up with notions of identity construction. According to Scourfield et al. (2006: 43), research indicates that children develop ‘increased sense of national identity between the ages of five/six and eleven/twelve’. Research on children’s cognitive-development revealed how perceptions of others are often linked to an understanding of the familiar and unfamiliar. According to the research, ‘children become more prejudiced in the early years of primary school, and this then fades by the end of middle childhood’ (ibid). Considering the various linguistic communities (in regards to the Welsh-language) that exist in Wales, this notion of prejudice represented an interesting avenue in need of further research in terms of how children respond to varying degrees of bilingualism, and/or vernaculars. When exploring the relationship between culture (specifically language) and place in relation to Wales, it is impossible to ignore the socio-cultural North-South divide. Earlier in this chapter reference was made to the varying levels of prestige assigned to the difference Welsh vernaculars. Drawing on the references made by Scourfield et al. (2006) to prejudice and national identity, this research sought to explore these ideas further through applying them to regional identities.

2.5 Summary

Due to the cross-disciplinary nature of this research, the literature review was divided into three key areas based on Attride-Sterling’s (2001) thematic network structure.

---

36 Vernacular refers to the native dialect or language spoken by a specific group of people.
The Basic Themes: *identity construction in relation to language, media and childhood* focused on four main areas. The first, *contextualising the Welsh minority-language maintenance campaign in relation to identity and language choice* explored the literature on the linguistic dilemma of language prolificacy versus language use. The second, *bilingualism and diglossia: The complexities of bilingual communities* drew on the early concepts of Fishman (1967) and Ferguson (1959). While applying Fishman's models to any speech community is highly problematic (due to the uniqueness of individual language communities), it does provide a context for the complexities of the Welsh-language situation. This was followed by a discussion on media identities, concentrating on *onscreen visibility and the changing media landscape in the production of children’s content*. The changes seen to the production of media content (aimed at children) was explored in this section focusing on how changes to the media landscape have altered the television narrative. Specific attention was given to the way in which children’s media production has become more sophisticated, and how Welsh-language media production is located in terms of these changes. Finally, literature on childhood and childhood identities was examined with specific consideration given to work on *the social construction of childhood*.

The Organising Themes: Section 2 of this chapter drew on the interconnecting themes between the three main disciplines, namely language, media and childhood. Six main areas of interest were identified here in relation to the research questions, tying together various elements of identity construction. The first area of interest - *media as a nation-building tool*, looked at the role media plays in creating a national consciousness, through for example the broadcast of national events. Again looking at the connection between language and media, the second area of interest, *language prestige and minority language media*, focused on the complexities of class structures and language choice in relation to minority language communities. Specific attention was given to the notion that certain vernaculars carry higher prestige, despite not being based on socio-economic factors. In these instances, the media played a particular role in creating linguistic hierarchies based on language authenticity (connected to particular vernaculars). As engagement with Welsh-language media was the
means by which this research was measured, specific understanding was needed in relation to the changing media landscape. Both the third and fourth area of interest focused on this by looking at the importance of scheduling in children’s broadcasting, and children’s minority-language media in the digital age. The fifth areas of interest concentrated on childhood, media and language through exploring the problematic, yet essential relationship between Welsh medium education and Welsh-language media. Finally Welsh-language education: A varied approach explored the literature relating to the different approaches taken to Welsh-language education in Wales. This perhaps best highlighted the complexities of understanding the linguistic landscape of Wales and why adopting a single approach to media provision may be problematic.

The Global Themes: The final section of this literature review focuses on the research relating to the transition phase, locating it in terms of discipline-based themes. As this was a dual-phased research project understanding the significance of this socially constructed transition was central to this investigation. Three specific areas with specific relevance to this research were identified. The first, peer and adult relations: language choice and self-expression drew on the shift from adult dependencies to the individualisation process through peer interaction during middle childhood. The second, education and the transition phase focused on the institutional changes faced by children as they move from primary school to secondary school and how these changes alter their perceptions of self. Finally, self-identification and affiliation to culture and place during the transition phase concentrated on the increased sense on nation identity felt amongst children, looking specifically at the work of Scourfield et al. (2006).
3 Chapter 3: Methodology

3.1 Introduction

The overall objective of this research was to investigate the extent to which Welsh-language media content plays a role in the construction of individual, group, regional and national identities amongst bilingual children aged between 10- and 12-years-old in Wales. This was achieved by exploring the importance that young people in Wales place on minority-language media and whether Welsh-language (broadcast) media answer the cultural needs of young audiences.

While both qualitative and quantitative research methods have been traditionally used in the study of sociolinguistics, Johnstone (2000) explains how the ‘interest in qualitative approaches to the study of language-in-use has expanded rapidly’ (Johnstone, 2000: 2). While there are clear benefits in conducting quantitative studies, (especially large scale studies that can help map a demographic), issues of identity and specifically the understandings of changes to individual, collective, and even national identities during the transition from childhood to adolescence requires an element of flexibility. One of the aims of this research was to investigate whether attitudes towards the Welsh language changed or remained constant during this period of significant social transition, through focusing on their engagement with Welsh-language media. By utilising a range of data-gathering tools, Punch (2002: 12) suggests that children can ‘display their competencies’ (ibid) more freely and are then better placed to fully participate. With this in mind, a ‘layered’ approach was utilised, incorporating traditional research methods and creative techniques. The data collection process for this research project spanned 18 months, between September 2012 and February 2014, and was designed to collect qualitative data from five groups of children in schools across Wales (during their final year in primary school and again during their first year in secondary school). The purpose of this dual-phase approach was to track any notable changes in their attitudes, and to highlight behaviours and attitudes that remained constant.
For clarity this chapter has been divided into two sections. The first section focuses on the methodologies of data gathering, and the second concentrates on the methodologies of data analysis. Section one is divided into 4 sub-sections. The first sub-section provides a theoretical overview of the data gathering process, focuses on the importance of conducting research with children, appropriate methodological approaches for conducting research with children and ethical considerations when working with children. Drawing on theory of practice, a general theoretical overview of the chosen methodologies, namely focus groups and creative workshops, including an explanation of how these methodologies were applied to the research are detailed. The second sub-section concentrates on the importance of pre-research and pilot studies. As noted in Chapter 1, this doctoral research evolved from a successful KTP project. A detailed description of how these fieldwork experiences influenced the development of the main doctoral research, especially the creative workshops is listed in this section. As a layered methodological approach combining both creative workshops and focus groups was applied to this research, the third sub-section concentrates on the focus group design. A detailed description of the benefits and formulation of a focus group schedule is presented, offering a clear explanation of question set choices and Phases 1 & 2 of the data-gathering process. The final sub-section discusses the sample and site selection in detail justifying the choices made and the overall process and execution.

Section two concentrates on the analytical methodologies utilised in this project. For clarity, section two has been divided into two subsections, theoretical overview and application to research. The first sub-section explores the data analysis methodologies appropriate for focus group research, before detailing the chosen data analysis methodology utilised by this research, namely thematic analysis. The successful application of thematic analysis is presented through specifying the significance of transcription and thematic coding. The second sub-section concentrates on the application of thematic analysis to the doctoral research. Thematic analysis can be utilised for analytical purposes in a variety of ways, this research drew on Crabtree and Miller’s (1992) template analysis model due to the dual-phased nature of the research. This sub-section also
provides a detailed explanation of how thematic analysis was used to present the findings in the following chapters.

3.2 Section 1: Data Gathering Research Methodologies

3.2.1 Theoretical Overview: The Importance of Conducting Research with Children and Appropriate Methodological Approaches

Conducting research with children has long been perceived within the academic world to be a notoriously difficult task. However, over the past 20 years, attitudes have begun to change. Prout (1999: xii) explains how the ‘idea that children are social actors, with a part to play in their own representation’ has now been recognised within the social sciences. Christenson and James (2000: 4) explain how research studies involving children need to be ‘developed specifically for children’ in order to identify the ‘structural relationships which shape the forms that childhood takes in different societies’.

Buckingham (1993: 42) notes how researchers have often ‘sought to speak on behalf of those who lack a voice’, framing children as vulnerable research participants, who have the potential to be upset or misguided. Despite these anxieties, there has been a considerable rise in the number of research projects involving children in recent years by academics such as Ringrose et al. (2012), who undertook a qualitative study of ‘sexting’ by children and young people, and Ofcom’s continued research on Children’s Media Use and Attitude Report[s] (current report 2015).

In light of the UK’s Children’s Act (1989), children and young people now have an active right to be involved in decisions affecting them as individuals and as a collective (Article 12 of the 1989 United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, cited in Morgan et al. 2002: 5). According to this view, the best people to provide information on the child’s perspective, actions and attitudes are children themselves, especially when researchers wish to find out about meaningful events in their lives (Scott, 2000: 99). This significant shift in the way researchers view the process of conducting research with children is
summarised neatly by Christensen and James (2000: 3) as a repositioning of children as ‘subjects rather than objects of research’.

There are a number of research methods available for conducting social research with children. Messenger Davies and Mosdell (2006: 113) explain how ‘children are a special group, requiring special research techniques’ that need to be understood when formulating appropriate research methodologies. Christensen and James (2000: 4) explain the need for research methods, ‘developed specifically for children’ in order to identify the ‘structural relationships which shape the forms that childhood takes in different societies’. While researchers often use the simplification of traditional research methods, participants need to be able to express themselves in a way that is appropriate and suitable for them. Some children, for example, may feel more comfortable expressing their thoughts and ideas in creative ways (for example through art or performance), because they lack confidence or competence to offer written or complex verbal responses. Subsequently researchers have found that combining traditional qualitative methodologies such as focus groups, with creative methodologies such as drawing or the use of visual stimuli, often yield better results (cf. Scott, 2000).

3.2.1.1 Focus Groups

Focus groups are a form of qualitative research that allow access to understanding how people interpret their experiences and ‘construct their worlds’ (Merriam, 2009: 5). In general, this is a more informal way of conducting research compared with structured interviews. Focus groups, which are often conducted with groups of around 6 to 12 participants, look beyond the individual and concentrate on the ‘case’ in question (Flick, 2007: 31). In order for this to work, the group tends to have a connection to the topic under discussion in order to create a discussion (ibid). In relation to this study, the participants were all Welsh speakers attending Welsh-medium schools, and were in the same school year. Despite these basic commonalities, regional variations were of significant importance as they allowed comparisons to be drawn based on
different speech communities, geographic locations, and socio-economic and cultural factors.

Focus groups allow for discussions and ideas to develop under the guidance of a moderator or researcher. Morrison (1998: 210) explains how moderators often have much more control when conducting focus group research than when conducting ‘single in-depth interviews’. The rigidity of structured interview questions does not allow for ideas to be developed outside of the question sets. While there is a case to argue that the dynamism and flexibility of focus groups may weaken the comparability and validity of the results, this freedom to build on certain elements as a result of the responses given, whilst still working within a focused framework is also this method’s greatest advantage. This informal, less structured approach enables the respondents to participate in setting the agenda.

Myers and MacNaghten (1999: 178) explain how one of the great strengths of ‘focus groups as a technique is in the liveliness, complexity and unpredictability of talk’. This unpredictability can provide rich layers of data that the researcher may not have considered. It is this that allows focus groups to provide detailed understanding of specific topics and questions. As this was a study investigating whether minority-language media can mediate or maintain notions of individual, linguistic, regional and even national identities, conducting focus groups whereby elements of the agenda can be set by the participants was much more useful than conducting a large-scale quantitative study. While arguably individual interviews may have yielded more individual accounts, group exercises were deemed to sit more comfortably within the social framework of the child, especially considering the relatively small size of the focus groups. As the ‘case’ (Flick, 2007:24) may indeed be set by the research questions, variants such as geographic location and linguistic competencies meant that the different groups participating in this study set different agendas.

Conducting focus groups with children requires, first and foremost, access to research subjects. Gaining entry via gatekeepers such as teachers is one way of ensuring access to a potentially large number of participants from different
social and cultural backgrounds. Schools and other educational institutions also provide a secure space to conduct research and, to a certain extent, a familiar setting for children to participate in research. Despite this, consideration must be given to the impact that conducting research in a school context can have on the resultant data. As an adult researcher conducting research with children, the generational differences can inevitably have an effect on the power dynamics within the research setting. Buckingham (2004: 43) explains how it is often inevitable that an adult conducting research in a school context will be perceived as a teacher. While there are a number of techniques researchers can adopt to assume a less-adult role (Christensen and James, 2001: 6), balancing-out the power dynamics, consideration must be given to unfamiliarity of the research process, especially when it is conducted within a school context. Buckingham (2004: 43) explains how ‘any adult asking children questions about television within a school context is likely to invite what children perceive as adult responses’. For example, children questioned about the number of hours of television they watch each night might respond by giving a figure which is deemed health or appropriate viewing time, as opposed to a figure which accurately depicts their viewing habits.

Along with access, another significant consideration is the importance of a skilled researcher in the data-gathering process. Morrison (1998: 211) explains how the ‘personality of the moderator’ is essential to the success of a research study. The moderator (or researcher) is there to both direct the discussion around a set of themes central to the research and to allow space for natural interactions to develop amongst the participants. Ensuring flexibility in the direction of the discussion is essential to achieving the objectives of the research. When working with children, moderators also need additional transferable skills and confidence in order to create a relaxed environment. According to Mandell (1991) and Thorne (1993) (cited in Mayall, 2000: 121), adopting the ‘least-adult role’ in order to blend into the social world of the children can help in developing a relationship of trust between the researcher and participants. Simple techniques such as dressing informally, using first/given names, and establishing
an informal tone in the research context (especially in terms of language use) can be deployed.

Stewart (2007) explains how there are two main interview styles that researchers or moderators can adopt – a direct approach or a non-direct approach. A direct approach provides the moderator much greater control over the topics, allowing for ‘a more detailed coverage of specific topics of interest in the time available but at the cost of group synergy and spontaneity’ (ibid: 4). In contrast, a non-direct approach allows participants the opportunity to express individual views, with fewer restrictions imposed by the researcher. Stewart also explains how most focus group discussions require an interview style that is somewhere between these two extremes. Focus group questions need to be designed as ‘triggers’ that encourage discussion whilst also ensuring that potential answers to the research topic are generated by the participants’ talk.

3.2.1.2 Creative and Task-Based Research Methods

Creating a relaxed environment when conducting research with the public is a fundamental element of the data gathering process from the outset, and is perhaps even more significant when conducting research with participants who may be considered vulnerable, such as children. Cameron, (2005, cited in Fargas-Malet et al., 2010: 179) explains how engaging in a period of ‘free narrative’, where general topics of interest such as after-school hobbies and activities are discussed, can be used as a way of creating a ‘settling-in phase’ (ibid) for the child. This technique also allows the researcher to understand the child’s communication style, allowing the researcher to evaluate the most appropriate method of communication to reduce the risk of misunderstanding.

Using visual aids and allowing children to ‘handle things’ rather than ‘just talk’ (O’Kane, 2000: 140) can assist in ‘transforming the power relations between adults and children’ (ibid) and help to overcome any ‘settling-in’ problems that may arise. O’Kane (2000) and Scott (2000) explain how utilising visual stimuli and creative methods to develop communication strategies can help to move beyond the constraints of some more traditional research methodologies.
Allowing children to shape the agenda, through creative expression can produce more valuable results if mediated effectively by the researcher. For example, task based activities such as drawing, writing stories or creating scrapbooks around a theme or question enables the researcher to gain a better understanding of how the child may be interpreting the research. Questions can be formulated based on what has been produced, encouraging a dialogue with actual relevance to the child. Combining discursive methods with creative outlets can provide an alternative mode of expression, especially for those who struggle to communicate verbally. Providing participants with an alternative mode of communication through creative methods can help boost confidence and engagement with the research. Creative output can therefore be used either as a focal point for a discussion or simply as a piece of data in its own right.

In addition to creative methods, activity-based exercises can also encourage and support talk. By providing the group with an activity, the researcher can observe group dynamics. The use of a collective activity is emphasised in the work of Barbour and Kitzinger (1999), with specific reference to the successful design of focus groups. They note how collective activities ‘encourage participants to concentrate on one another (rather than on the group facilitator/moderator), and may force them to explain and defend their different perspectives’ (Barbour and Kitzinger, 1999: 12). Collective activities can be anything from watching a film, discussing a book or even creating something as a group, that can be used as an access point in facilitating discussions on the research questions.

### 3.2.1.3 Ethical Considerations

When conducting research with participants, especially children and vulnerable adults, ethical considerations are an important element of the research planning process. Arguably one of the main reasons for the lack of research conducted with children during the late-twentieth century has been down to the perception of potential ‘risk’. Adult researchers can find it difficult to gain access to child participants, even before the topic of research is discussed with parents, guardians and teachers. Conducting research with children often requires the
permission of a parent or guardian. Some adults may have anxieties about allowing their children to take part, due to concerns relating to child safety and the appropriateness of the research.

From an academic perspective, prior to the commencement of any fieldwork, the project required ethical approval. A series of documents needed to be submitted to Aberystwyth University’s Ethics Committee for Research Procedures, in which the aims and objectives of the project were identified. Such procedures are in place not only to protect the researchers but also to ensure that participants are safeguarded during the data-gathering process. An outline of the research methods was presented to the Ethics Committee, including all supporting documentation, such as letters of consent for parents, guardians, teacher (schools) and the children taking part in the study. Parents, guardians, teachers and, most importantly, the children involved must feel that they have been provided with sufficient knowledge about the proposed study to give their fully-informed consent.

Detailed explanations about the research methodologies were also submitted providing information on how much time each research activity would take, assurance that participants could opt out at any time, and that the data would be stored safely. Data protection is an extremely important factor to consider when conducting research, as a means of protecting the rights of the individuals, who have agreed to participate. Parents, guardians, teachers and children were informed that all data would be stored in a password-protected file and anonymised for use in the research.

Having decided to use schools as the site for all fieldwork, access to participants was obtained through appropriate and responsible gatekeepers, namely teacher and head teachers. Letter templates were provided in both English and Welsh and were distributed accordingly (See Appendix 3). As the nature of the research was not deemed sensitive, many schools regarded the focus group work as a discursive exercise that sat within the schools remit for encouraging debate and expression. The letters to the participants were designed to be a child-friendly way of explaining how their involvement was needed to better understand their
experiences and engagement with Welsh-language media. Having successfully submitted all paperwork, the University’s Research Ethics Committee approved the documents, categorising the research as ‘level 1 pass’. This was based on the assessment that the research did ‘not expose participants to any physical or psychological conditions different to those experienced in everyday life’ (Aberystwyth University, 2011).

As noted in Chapter 1, the foundations of this academic research came following a successful KTP partnership between Aberystwyth University and Boomerang+. As a prerequisite for working with children whilst at Boomerang+, an enhanced DBS check (previously CRB check) was mandatory for me. As the children would be under my supervision whilst conducting the research, additional chaperone and child protection training was also undertaken. The training involved an interview with a child welfare officer, an intensive course on child protection and legislation, and the submission of two character references. Throughout the course of this research, two full DBS checks and chaperone training sessions were undertaken as each licence and check is only valid for 3 years.

Due to the extensive experiences gained from working with children and the working relationships established with a number of schools during the KTP project, the schools involved with this research were happy to allow the research to be conducted unsupervised. Ethical considerations were therefore extremely important when working closely with the children. As a result of the chaperone training undertaken, I was fully aware and equipped with a foundation for understanding the potential issues and risks of working with children, along with practical training for dealing with sensitive issues and findings.

37 DBS Checks refers to the process by which the Disclosure and Barring Service (in the UK) provides a criminal data check on individuals.
3.2.2 Pre-research and Pilot Studies: The Application of Knowledge to Research Design.

The two-year KTP research project with Boomerang+ sought to better understand the media preferences and practices of Welsh-speaking children aged between the ages of 7-and 13-year-old, building on areas of real interest affecting the industry at the time. Initially, the data collected as part of the KTP research was to be used and developed further as part of this doctoral study. However, following some further consideration and the potential commercial confidentiality clause linked to the data, the decision was made to remove all KTP data from the investigation. Despite this, the experiences gained from conducting extensive field-research over a two-year period facilitated the development of a methodology that was rooted in actual fieldwork experiences (and subsequent critical reflection). This enabled the development of an age-appropriate, best-practice model for conducting research with young bilingual children. The following sub-sections explore the research planning process and specific data-gathering methodologies utilised as part of the KTP research, drawing on the benefits and limitations of various methods and how this knowledge was applied to the final doctoral research.

According to Scott (2000: 100), research planning can help gauge issues of ‘language use, literacy and different stages of cognitive development’. Considering the age of the participants involved in this research, gaining a better understanding of successful communication with bilingual preadolescents was essential. Prior to the final research design, a pre-research workshop was scheduled with a Year 7 (11- to 12-year-old) group of children from a secondary school in Cardiff. The children represented the latter years of middle childhood, positioned within the transition phase, which is so central to this research investigation. This exercise was designed to observe language use and television programme preferences, as well as being a way of ‘tuning-in’ to the target audience in preparation for the larger research project.

Through combining art, drama and semi-structured group discussions about media preferences, a creative and participatory approach was adopted (cf. Punch, 2002). The children were observed during a drama class, and prior to the
session, the teacher had suggested using drama warm-up exercises to introduce myself to the group and engage in a familiar activity. Games known to the group were used to maintain a sense of continuity. A brief explanation of the research followed the warm up exercises. As noted by Mayall (2000), explanation and inclusion is essential to the design of successful research with children. As this was a pre-research exercise, the emphasis was placed on how I (the adult researcher) needed their (the child participants’) help in gaining a better understanding of their media preferences in order to build a research methodology. This simple exercise helped engage the children with the data-gathering process and became an important element in the design of the final focus group schedule. As noted by Mayall (2000: 122), asking children, directly, to help an adult understand childhood helps aid in the redistribution of power.

As part of the KTP study, a total of 13 focus groups were conducted in Welsh-language primary and secondary schools across Wales, looking at specific topics such as media engagement, opinion on Welsh-language programming, and programme style and content. This experience aided in the design of the main data-gathering process for this investigation. As the transition phase between primary and secondary school was of significant interest, the experience of conducting focus group research with children in both primary and secondary schools was extremely insightful.

O’Kane (2000) and Scott (2000) refer to how the use of visual stimuli and creative methods can help develop communication strategies, along with providing a focus or ‘case’ (Flick, 2007: 31) for discussion. Three different strategies were tested. Two included the use of visual stimuli by watching audio-visual material, and the third involving an art-based activity. Having researched the various creative methodologies available, the pilot studies provided the means of putting this knowledge into practice.

As group interactions were of significant interest to the research, a task-based research activity was designed that encouraged both individual and collective decision-making. Drawing on the experiences and knowledge gained from the pilot study, two exercises were devised; the first based on Cameron’s (2005,
cited in Fargas-Malet et al., 2010: 179) engagement in a period of ‘free narrative’, and the second based on a collective task-based activity. The following subsections provide specific methodological explanations of each creative task utilised during the pilot study. Drawing on the successes and shortfalls of these exercises a detailed overview of how each pilot study influenced the final doctoral research design is presented.

3.2.2.1 Using Visual Stimuli: Show-reel

The first pilot data gathering approach involved the use of a show-reel of popular Welsh-language children’s programmes. This show-reel was shown at the beginning of every focus group session following a brief explanation of the purpose of the visit. The ‘punchy’ nature of show-reels meant that only snippets of programmes were shown; the show-reel was less than 4 minutes long and consisted of 15 different programmes. As this early pilot was closely linked to the KTP research project, the programmes included in this show-reel were Boomerang+ productions. Through observing the children’s response to the show-reel, their familiarity with specific Welsh-language programmes and presenters was noted. A number of children reacted positively to some of the short clips, shouting out the names of the presenters and laughing when they encountered something funny. The programmes that provoked a reaction were noted in order to generate discussion amongst the group.

Based on the reactions and responses to the show-reel, questions relating to preference, style and content were asked. While this generated varied responses amongst the different groups, the lack of structured question-sets limited comparability. Stewart (2007: 11) explains how ‘one of the most important skills of the moderator is time management’. This open-ended approach to questioning often meant that group discussions were repetitive and stagnant. As a result, the importance of developing an effective focus group schedule became paramount. The significance of this exercise in time management and organisation highlighted the importance of creating a pre-focus group checklist, as a best practice model. This became integral to the approach adopted in this research.
3.2.2.2 Compare-and-Contrast Task: Magazine-Styles Programme

The second block of focus group sessions involved a compare-and-contrast exercise. The groups were asked to watch three short clips taken from three (English-language) children’s magazine-style programmes. The clips were played back-to-back followed, firstly, by an open discussion, and then a list of semi-structured questions. The clips were taken from three popular English-language programmes (*Blue Peter*, *TMI Friday* and *Friday Download*) which were all broadcast on CBBC. The clips were used to act as a prompt for those who were familiar with the shows, and also as a taster for those who were unfamiliar with them. This exercise was relatively successful as it sparked some lively debates. Unlike the show-reel exercise where the video clip was brief (totalling 4 minutes), the video clips in this exercise were much longer in duration (between 3 and 5 minutes per clip), to provide sufficient content for discussion. While some participants embraced the activity, others lost interest. This exercise demonstrated that the duration of an activity was crucial in terms of maintaining group engagement and interest. Extending the length of the activity did not necessarily add value to the discussion, and maintaining engagement was the most important element.

3.2.2.3 Focus Groups Featuring Arts Based Activity

The final block of focus groups moved away from the use of audio-visuals and focused on a hands-on creative approach. As scheduling plays a significant role in the understanding of children’s media, the group was asked to compile their own individual scheduling book. The groups were shown how to create their own origami book, comprising of eight pages with folded pockets. They were then asked to label each page with the days of the week (one day for each page including a cover page). Cutting out programme-related imagery from magazines, drawing pictures of their favourite television brand logos, and writing the names of programmes on card, they were then asked to fill each page’s pocket with their television-related creations. The creation of a
scrapbook-style personal TV guide allowed for a dialogue about choice-making to be generated within the group members.

Despite the success of this exercise, it was a very time-consuming exercise, as the activity required some initial guidance, especially when folding the paper to create the booklet and time to complete the task. Creating this schedule subsequently reduced the time available to discuss the choices in a focus group setting. In addition to this, the activity did not lend itself to the collective nature of focus group sessions. Despite the issues relating to time and individual nature of this activity, the creative schedule-based activity provided interesting topics for discussions; this hands-on approach did encourage additional engagement with the research. Engaging in an activity of *doing*, through creating theory own personal television schedule, as opposed to simply absorbing information through the activity of *viewing* (a video clip), allowed for element of the agenda to be set by the children. Focusing on television scheduling also sparked debates surrounding a number of topics such as programme preferences, the appropriateness of certain content, which also contributed to the way peer dynamics were forming.

### 3.2.2.4 Pilot Study Outcomes

The pilot study acted as a means of developing good working relationships with a number of schools from across Wales. This enabled me to return and conduct a large proportion of the final doctoral research with schools that were known to me. Of the ten schools included in this doctoral research, only two were schools that had not been included in the KTP research. This was due to the logistics of the dual-phased research, ensuring the primary schools used were not feeder schools for more than one secondary school. While working relationships had been formed with the majority of the schools included in the final doctoral research, none of the children included in this research had been part of the previous KTP research. The importance of this was to maintain a level of continuity across the sample. Drawing on the strengths and weaknesses of the pilot study, the design of the final research methodology was formulated. As a
result of these pilot studies, two group exercises for formulated, with Exercise 1 focusing on the individual and Exercise 2 on the collective.

A technique adopted early on in the KTP focus group sessions was the use of an ‘ice-breaker’ question in order to create a relaxed atmosphere whilst conducting the focus group sessions. Each session would begin by asking the children to list two or three of their favourite programmes. Allowing everyone the chance to contribute to this open-ended question not only identified the individual speakers (aiding the transcription process); it also reaffirmed the nature of the research, providing a degree of contextualisation for the children involved. Asking the children to list their favourite programmes meant that from the outset, the agenda was being shaped by the children. This technique proved extremely successful and was subsequently incorporated into the final doctoral research design. Referred to as Exercise 1, each focus group session would begin with the children listing two or three of their favourite programmes. Based on their responses the direction of the discussion could be tailored accordingly. For example, in instances where no Welsh-language programmes were listed, a session could begin by focusing on question sets relating to the groups opinions of Welsh-language content in order to understand why there were no Welsh language programmes listed. As noted, the benefits of including Exercise 1 in the research design also aided in the transcript of focus group sessions through identifying the individual speakers.

While Exercise 1 concentrated on the individual, Exercise 2 focused on group interactions and collective decision-making. One of the main strengths of the video-based approaches was the collective nature of the exercise. Unlike the arts-based activity (scheduling book exercise), which encouraged individual expression, the group activity of watching video clips created a sense of inclusion allowing for group discussions to be more fluid and focussed. Despite this, the levels of engagement were much greater during the scheduling booklet exercise, especially as the methodological approach offered the children a variety of ways to express their creativity. The biggest problem with this specific exercise (scheduling book) was the time needed to complete the task. As the research was conducted during school hours, consideration had to be given to the school
timetables. Teacher and parents were far more receptive to the research if it did not disrupt the teaching timetable too much. This was notably more significant when conducting research with secondary schools, as the children’s timetables differed and finding allocated periods where the children were not missing core subjects was a primary concern for the teachers. Reducing the length of the activity therefore allowed for lengthier discussions. In order to achieve this, a task was devised which could be completed within a relatively short time frame.

The final task-based activity formulated for the doctoral research (referred to as Exercise 2) required the children to work collectively to create a scheduling board. Shaped like a television screen, the Half-hour time slots were listed in two columns with spaces alongside to insert a programme name (see Figure 7).

Figure 7: Example of Scheduling Board

Programme titles and branded imagery were printed, laminated and attached to a small piece of Velcro. Velcro was also attached alongside each time slot to allow the children to fix their preferred choices in place. The scheduling board
comprised two elements, the board itself and the laminated programme titles. The decision to provide the groups with preselected programme titles was based on the time constraints posed by the research setting. The programme choices were made based on comprehensive research looking at programme preferences taken from the pilot studies. In addition to the practical knowledge gained from trialling different creative and activity-based methodologies, the pilot study also produced a detailed programme preference database. Each time a child listed a programme in response to the ‘ice-breaker’ question during the pilot study, their responses were logged on a database. The information gathered though this process allowed for individual programme preferences to be quantified. Each time a programme was mentioned by an individual, it was logged (see Appendix 4). A comprehensive list of over 220 programme titles was gathered from the qualitative pilot study (along with additional responses given during quantitative data gathering stage of KTP research). These programmes were listed in preferential order with the top 80 programme titles used as examples for Exercise 2 (the scheduling board) for the doctoral research. In addition to the 80 examples provided, which included a combination of Welsh and English-language programmes, with varying age-appropriateness, the children were also able to choose programmes not listed. Blank cards were provided in this instance for programme titles to be added. There were two reasons for this, firstly, to account for the introduction of new television programmes, and secondly, to encourage agency.

The activity required the group to work together to create an ideal television schedule based on their favourite programmes. The act of ‘doing’ proved far more engaging, and through the creation of a scheduling board based on popular programmes, lively debates were forthcoming. As the focus group sessions were documented through audio recording equipment, additional field notes were required to capture physical interactions within the groups.
3.2.3 Focus Group Schedule

Focus group schedules act as a management tool for the researcher. As time is often at a premium during school hours, scheduling is essential to the successful running of a focus group session. If time is limited, then it is important that the moderator (or researcher) achieves the goals and agendas set out by the research. The focus group schedule included a pre-focus group checklist to ensure that all equipment was working correctly and that the room allocated by the school was fit for purpose, (see Appendix 5), and as a best practice model for introducing the research project to the participants. Each session would begin with a brief explanation of the research project. The groups were then given the opportunity to ask any questions or voice any concerns they may have had prior to commencing the research activity. As this was a comparative study, the participants were also told that a follow-up study would be conducted in a year’s time (Phase 2), with the intention of asking the same set of questions. The groups were told that each session would be recorded using an audio recorder.

A total of twenty-six questions provided the skeleton for the research, all listed in the focus group schedule. Morrison (1998) explains how schedules such as these can ensure that key themes are discussed, whilst still allowing flexibility in response to the answers given. Morrison explains how focus group research is a ‘discursive activity’ (ibid: 210), and while it is essential that groups ‘cover the same ground’ (ibid: 219) in order to produce comparable data, there is flexibility in the ordering and delivery of questions.

The questions in this study covered the three main research themes: [1] language/linguistic identities, [2] media (uses, preferences and attitudes) and [3] childhood identities during the latter stages of middle childhood. These themes were then placed in the specific context of Wales. The questions were divided into sets based on themes, and were designed to be reordered depending on the flow and direction of the discussion in each unique focus group context. While there was flexibility in the ordering of the question sets, every session began with Exercises 1 and 2 to ensure parity. Allowing the participants to create their own schedule (based on their own programme preferences) ensured that the group discussions were relevant to them. This created different conversational
strategies based on the participants’ engagement with the activity and acted as
tool for further discussion. The question sets are summarised below, with
accompanying justification and clarification on what these sought to investigate
and achieve.

| Question Set 1 | Q.1a Were you familiar with some of the Welsh programmes included in the exercise? |
| Q.1b What do you think about these (Welsh) programmes? |

Figure 8: Focus Group Question Set 1

Using the scheduling board as a reference point, the discussion would start with
an evaluation of the programmes that the children had listed. The inclusion of
Welsh-language content was the focus of Question Set 1, with the discussion
directed towards the inclusion/exclusion of Welsh-language content during
Exercise 2 (Scheduling Board). Where a number of Welsh-language programmes
had been listed, the questions focused on what made these programmes popular.
Where few or no Welsh programmes were listed, the groups were asked to
discuss the reasons why.

| Question Set 2 | Q.2a What is your opinion of programmes made specifically for children? |
| Q.2b Are the programmes selected in Exercise 2 mainly programmes made for children or adults? |
| Q.2c What is your opinion of magazine-style programmes such as Blue Peter\textsuperscript{38}, Friday Download\textsuperscript{39} or Tag\textsuperscript{40}? |
| Q.2d Do you like watching series on television? |

\textsuperscript{38} Blue Peter is the world’s longest running children’s television programme, and continues to use the traditional magazine-style format. http://www.bbc.co.uk/cbbc/shows/blue-peter.  
\textsuperscript{39} Friday Download is a Saltbeef production for CBBC first aired in 2011. The show follows a magazine style format including live music acts, interviews, game and music reviews. The programme is filmed in front of a live studio audience, and is presented by young teenagers http://www.bbc.co.uk/cbbc/shows/fridaydownload.  
\textsuperscript{40} Tag is a Welsh-language magazine style programme aired twice weekly on S4C and is produced by Boom Plant (formerly Boomerang+). A combination of both adult and teen-presenters are used. http://www.s4c.cymru/tag/.
The second set of questions also referred back to the scheduling board; this time the focus was on children’s media, and their engagement with child-orientated content. The group were asked whether the programmes they selected during Exercise 2 were targeted at children or adults. In addition to this, genre- and style-specific questions were asked with the aim of understanding what made programmes appealing to younger audiences. The decision to include the question relating to magazine-style programmes was based on the longevity of this programming format in the production of children’s television, and also to cross-reference the findings with work by academics such as Petterson (2014). As media has evolved, so too has the tradition of children’s broadcasting. In recent years, and in part due to the nature of magazine-style programmes, these programmes have been able to incorporate digital technology in their programme format with relative ease. As these programmes encourage audience participation through communication (for example through phone-ins) embracing new technologies such as e-mail and texting was relatively straightforward. In recent years, this has evolved into audience participation through online gaming and dual-screen technology. The use of dual-screen technology and media preference was another underlying theme in this set of questions, with the potential for interesting comparisons to be made between Phase 1 and Phase 2 results.
channels, such as CBBC?

Q.3b If so, which websites? Can you name them?

Q.3c Do you use Welsh websites?

Q.3d If so, which ones, and for what purpose? Do you use them for schoolwork or entertainment?

Q.3e When you’re watching television do you use other devices such as mobile phones, tablet or laptops?

Q.3f If you miss your favourite television programmes, do you use catch-up or on-demand facilities?

Figure 10: Focus Group Question Set 3

The third set of questions focused on media users and media literacy. The aim of these questions was to focus on engagement with multi-platform media. While broadcast media was the focus of this research, understanding how new media supported traditional media was of specific interest especially as new media plays such as prominent part in the lives of young people in the twenty-first century. The use of the Internet, digital recording devices and on-demand services were discussed in some detail before steering the discussion back to the topic of Welsh-language media. As a catalyst for discussion, the groups were asked whether they had ever used S4C’s on-demand service, Clic, in order to gain a better understanding of active choice-making in terms of their engagement with Welsh-language media. General questions regarding favourite devices, web pages and web usage were asked along with those relating to language preference when using media devices such as mobile phones. This area of questioning was designed with Phase 2 in mind, as the uptake of smart phones by those in their first year of secondary schools is significantly higher than amongst children in their final year of primary school (Ofcom, 2014: 28).
Question Set 4

| Q.4a Do you watch Welsh programmes? |
| Q.4b Can you name some of your favourite Welsh Programmes? |
| Q.4c What is your opinion of Welsh programmes? |
| Q.4d What is your opinion of seeing Welsh presenters and actors on English programmes? |

Figure 11: Focus Group Question Set 4

The fourth set of questions returned to look at the theme of Welsh-language media. This repetitive questioning was not designed to be intentionally misleading, but instead was seen as a way of re-affirming ideas or changing opinions. Considering the role Welsh-language media plays in supporting Welsh-language education through linguistic infrastructure, these questions were designed to gain an insight into the values that children placed on Welsh-language media.

Question Set 5

| Q.5a What is the purpose of S4C? |
| Q.5b If the Welsh-language service provided by S4C was to end tomorrow, how would it affect you? |

Figure 12: Focus Group Question Set 5

Building on responses to Question Set 4, Question Set 5 focused on the values, purpose and engagement with Welsh-language media. This question set began by asking the children to explain the purpose of S4C. Considering the changes made to the (S4C) schedule around the time of the data-gathering process, these questions were aimed at understanding how well the service was received by young audiences, and whether the service provided answered the needs of this young, bilingual audience. Understanding the groups’ views of the service during Phase 1 provided a marker for comparison with Phase 2.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Set 6</th>
<th>Q.6a Have you taken part in a television programme for S4C in the past?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q.6b If so, which programmes? Can you name them?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q.6c Did you enjoy the experience?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q.6d Did you watch the programme on television?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q.6e Have the changes made to the S4C schedule affected you at all?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 13: Focus Group Question Set 6

The sixth and final question set looked at predictions about the future of programmes on S4C. As part of S4C’s inclusion and participation remit, audience participation in the production of (Welsh-language) media content is believed to enhance the media experience for the viewer (S4C, 2014: 18-19). Consequently this question set focused on onscreen participation in television programmes by children. The nature of these questions was to establish how inclusion and participation in the production of Welsh-language content influenced the children’s opinion of Welsh-language media.

### 3.2.4 Site and Sample Selection

The Welsh-language community of Wales consists of a diverse linguistic landscape. The selection of schools for this study had to represent the linguistic diversity that exists in Wales, along with geographic, socio-economic and cultural aspects. While the ‘talk’ as opposed to the ‘language’ was the focus of this research, language competence was always going to be a variant, as Welsh is a minority language spoken by approximately 562,000 of the population (19.8%) (ONS Census figures, 2011). Despite a fall in the number of Welsh speakers since the 2001 census (20.5% in 2001 to 19.8% in 2011), as discussed in Chapter 1, the number of year 2 children being assessed in Welsh as a first language
currently stands at 22.2% (Welsh-medium Education Strategy Annual Report, 2014), suggesting that the number of Welsh speakers under the age of 10 is greater than the national average. The growth in the number of Welsh-language and bilingual schools over the past decade, especially in areas outside of the traditional Welsh-speaking heartlands of Gwynedd, Cardiganshire and Carmarthenshire was an important factor to consider when selecting the sample. The selection of research sites had to consider the linguistic diversities of minority/majority-language communities.

In order to generate a fair representation of the Welsh-speaking demographic, a variety of regions and counties were selected, using the Bwrdd yr Iaith Google Earth Application. From this, 432 Welsh-medium primary schools (according to the Welsh Assembly Government Information Document No 023/2007) were identified. The sample selected represented both urban and rural communities across Wales, with varying minority/majority Welsh-language communities.

As this was a dual-phased research project, it was necessary to ascertain whether conducting the follow-up research with the same group of children twelve months later was feasible. One of the main difficulties was finding secondary schools willing to take part in the research a year in advance, without knowing the children involved. In order to ensure that the same participants could take part in both phases of the research, primary schools that were ‘feeder schools’ for only one secondary school within the locality had to be selected. Subsequently, prior to gaining consent from the primary schools, confirmation from secondary schools stating their willingness to participate was required. Schools from 8 different counties were contacted during the research-planning period of this research, namely Cardiff, Ceredigion, Carmarthen, Powys, Torfaen, Monmouthshire, Wrexham and Caernarfon. Each county represented the different linguistic landscapes of Wales, including areas with both high and low percentages of Welsh-language speakers. A number of schools were contacted in all 8 selected counties, however, due to some logistical issues with some schools, and the lack of response from others, it was only possible to conduct the research with schools from 4 of the named counties. Monmouthshire for

---

41 Google Earth Ysgolion Cynradd Cyfrwng Cymraeg Ionawr 2009 26012010 KML.
example, has only 2 Welsh-medium primary schools (www.monmouthshire.go.uk), and as a result of this, children attending these schools must travel to Torfaen or Newport for their secondary school education. When discussing the details of the dual-phased approach with one Monmouthshire primary school, there were concerns that not all of the children would continue with their Welsh-language education. Due to geographic convenience some parents favoured English-medium secondary schools. A similar situation occurred with the schools contacted in Powys. Despite the county being the largest geographically, the provision of Welsh-language secondary schools is limited, with only Welsh-language streams available (www.powys.gov.uk). Sadly little response was had from the schools contacted in Carmarthen, and one primary school in Ceredigion chose to decline the offer of taking part due to involvement with another academic research project.

The aim of this research was to identify whether Welsh-language media mediate or maintain ideas/aspects of identity amongst young (Welsh/English) bilingual children, and whether the impact of the transition phase influences children’s sense of identity. Increased choice through the availability of digital television has resulted in S4C (along with every other broadcaster), having to work harder to ensure audience satisfaction and viewing figures. As S4C is the only Welsh-language provider, the content available on the channel needs to represent and service the whole demographic by including content that is meaningful to a nation of viewers. Along with age appropriate content, socially, culturally and geographically specific content are also important factors to consider. For example, agricultural programmes may have more appeal to those living in rural areas than those living in urban areas. Chapter 2 explored theories outlined by Scourfield et al. (2006: 4) in relation to the importance children place on local-identity in times of ‘highly globalised mass-media’. As a consequence, the ten sites selected (during Phase 1 and 2) were chosen based on demographic representation.
Group 1 attended a rural primary school in the Welsh speaking heartland of Gwynedd with a declining roll call. Estyn’s\textsuperscript{42} report from 2011\textsuperscript{43} noted that there were 63 full-time pupils (and 13 part-time nursery children) in the school, a decline of 20\% since the 2005 inspection (Estyn 2011: 1). Due to the total size of the year-six class, Group 1 was slightly larger than the other groups in this study. While Scott (2000) explains how focus groups should be conducted with a maximum of 8 children (to prevent individuals being lost in the group dynamic), with only ten pupils in the whole school year, it was deemed unfair (by both research and head teacher) to exclude two pupils from the exercise. This small school serves a rural community that is ‘Welsh in its language and culture’ (Estyn, 2005: 5). At the time of the report, 93\% of the pupils came from Welsh-speaking homes, and the school was listed as having a socio-economic catchment area that was ‘neither advantaged nor disadvantaged’ (Estyn, 2011: 1).

The secondary school for which Group 1, attended was located in one of the county’s largest towns, and is subsequently categorised as a town/fringe school (Figure 14). Unlike the rural setting of the primary school attended by Group 1, this school is located in a former industrial town. Figures from the latest Estyn report in 2014 stated that there were 332 pupils enrolled. Due to the high levels of social deprivation (where the school is located), the area has been designated as an ‘Objective 1’ area\textsuperscript{44}. According to Estyn, this school is a ‘naturally bilingual secondary school’ for pupils aged between 11 and 16, offering both Welsh and English streams, with ‘82\% coming from Welsh-speaking homes’ (Estyn, 2014: 1). As all primary education in Gwynedd is taught through the medium of Welsh, a number of secondary schools offer English medium streams to accommodate personal and family language choices.

\textsuperscript{42} Estyn is the inspectorate for education and training in Wales.
\textsuperscript{43} For the purposes of this research, the Estyn reports used were the reports that were deemed most appropriate in terms of timeframe of conducting the research.
\textsuperscript{44} Objective 1 programme is a European scheme designed to promote the development and structural adjustment of regions whose development is lagging behind, see: http://europa.eu/legislation_summaries/regional_policy/provisions_and_instruments/g24206_en.htm.
Group 2 attended an urban primary school situated in the largest town in North Wales. Located in the northeast county of Wrexham, this was a designated Welsh-medium primary school. The pupils attending this school came from a wide catchment area, which included parts of the town itself and nearby villages (Estyn, 2008: 1). According to Estyn’s 2008 school inspection report ‘pupils’ social backgrounds vary considerably’, with a vast number of pupils coming from homes where parents worked in industry. Linguistically only 4% of registered pupils attending the school came from Welsh speaking homes (Estyn, 2008). However, figures from the 2014 inspectorate report indicated a significant rise in the number of children attending the school from Welsh-speaking homes, a total of 33%, with 22% actively speaking Welsh in the home (Estyn, 2014: 1). Despite this significant rise, the 2014 report sits outside the realms of this research in relation to the Phase 1 data collection.

The secondary school attended by Group 2 was also located in the urban centre, but served a greater catchment area. The school was a comprehensive school for pupils aged between 11- and 18-years-old. According to the 2014 Estyn report, pupils came from both ‘comparatively prosperous’, and ‘economically disadvantaged’ areas (Estyn, 2014: 1). Linguistically 40% come from homes where either one or both parents spoke Welsh, with 60% coming from non-Welsh speaking homes (Estyn, 2014: 1).

Group 3 attended a primary school located in Gwynedd’s largest town. This medium sized school with 183 pupils aged from 3- to 11- years of age (Estyn, 2010: 1) was located on the outskirts of the town. Of those attending the school, 42% come from outside the school’s natural catchment area. Linguistically the report stated that 89% of pupils came from Welsh speaking homes (Estyn, 2010: 1).

The secondary school attended by Group 3 was classed as being a naturally bilingual community comprehensive school for pupils and students between 11 and 18 years of age (Estyn, 2008: 1). The report stated that the comprehensive school served ten primary schools in its catchment area, with two of those
schools serving disadvantaged areas, in receipt of European funding\textsuperscript{45} (Estyn, 2008: 1). Linguistically, over 87\% of pupils came from Welsh speaking homes (Estyn, 2008: 1).

Group 4 attended schools located in the south Wales valleys area in the county of Torfaen; a county nestled between four other counties; Blaenau Gwent to the northwest, Monmouthshire to the east, Newport to the south and Caerphilly to the east. The primary school attended by Group 4 was a designated Welsh-medium primary school maintained by the Torfaen local authority. As with a number of areas in the south Wales valleys the school was located in an area described by Estyn report as industrial (Estyn, 2011: 1). In light of the economic down turn felt by a number of south Wales' valleys communities over the past thirty years, the report noted how the area was neither prosperous nor economically disadvantaged. The school at the time of the report was large in size, with 364 pupils between 3 and 11 years of age enrolled (Estyn, 2011: 1). Linguistically 99\% of pupils came from non-Welsh speaking homes.

Located further north within the same county of Torfaen, the secondary school attended by Group 4 was a designated Welsh comprehensive school for pupils aged 11-18. According to the figures taken from the 2014 inspection report there were 989 registered pupils at the school, including 169 pupils in the sixth form (Estyn, 2014: 1). Of these pupils, and at the time of inspection, 15\% come from Welsh-speaking homes, a considerable increase compared with the number of children from Welsh homes attending the group's primary school.

The final schools selected for this research were located in the City and County of Cardiff, and were the only city-based schools in the study. Historically, Cardiff is not traditionally a Welsh-speaking city but over the past decade figures indicate that the Welsh language has experienced significant growth, especially in regards to Welsh-medium education. The primary school attended by Group 5 was a Welsh-medium primary school with 207 pupils enrolled (Estyn 2009) located in the west of the city. The report noted how around 75\% of the pupils 'come from a residential catchment that is considered privileged, and the

\footnote{The sample primary school attended by Group 3 was not located in either of the disadvantaged areas in receipt of European funding.}
remaining 25% from backgrounds that were neither prosperous nor economically disadvantaged’. Linguistically the report noted how around 33% of pupils attending this school came from Welsh-speaking homes.

Up until 1997, one Welsh-medium secondary school serviced the whole of Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan area. However due to the increased demand for Welsh-medium education, Cardiff now has three secondary schools, with a fourth school in Barry serving the Vale of Glamorgan. The secondary school attended by Group 5 was a designated Welsh-medium school. Based on the 2009 inspection report there were ‘950 pupils enrolled with an additional 179 in the sixth form’ (Estyn, 2009: 1). The school had a very large catchment area, resulting in around a third of the pupils coming from some of the most economically deprived areas of Cardiff, a further third coming from the prosperous residential areas of the city, and the remaining pupils coming from areas that were neither prosperous nor economically disadvantaged (Estyn, 2009: 1). Linguistically around 22% of the pupils came from homes where Welsh was the predominant language spoken.

The sharp rise in the popularity of Welsh-medium education across Wales has resulted in large numbers of children from non-Welsh speaking homes attending Welsh-medium schools. As previously noted with reference to Hodge (2009) and Bourdieu's theory of cultural capital, the relationship that exists between social status and the Welsh language has altered in some areas. Subsequently, choosing schools that represented different socio-economic settings was important in order to illustrate the relationship that exists between social status and bilingualism in Wales in the twenty-first century.

In addition to the differences between use and function of two or more languages in bilingual or multilingual communities, dialectical differences and language competencies were important factors to consider in this research. In light of this, the inclusion of groups that represented both a Welsh-speaking majority/minority communities along with regional identities with distinct Welsh-language dialects was important.
Figure 14 provides details of the linguistic, geographic and socio-economic characteristics of the selected sites, together with information about the age and gender of the participants. The names of schools and participating children have been anonymised in line with best practice models of conducting qualitative social research, however, the local authorities have been listed to demonstrate locality. The statistics were taken from Estyn (school inspection) reports, Streetcheck46, and the Office of National Statistics. According to Johnstone’s (2000: 117) transcription conventions, it is much easier for the reader of a transcript to ‘keep track’ of who is talking when pseudonyms are used. Appendix 6 provides a full list of pseudonyms along with detailed descriptions of both the language of the home and surrounding community. Information relating to spoken language of the home came from the teachers and head teachers prior to the focus group sessions when parental consent letters were sent out. Despite established working relationships with the teaching staff from a number of schools as a result of the pilot studies, the children included in the doctoral research had not previously taken part in the KTP research/pilot study. As the majority of children that had previously taken part in the KTP research were no longer in the appropriate school year, the teachers were responsible for selecting the sample. Guidelines were issued that stated a cross-section of children with varying linguistic abilities were required, with a gender mix when possible. For the purpose of the table, the ‘G’ followed by numerical represents the Group, while ‘Ph’ followed by numerical represents the Phase (Ph1 – Phase 1, Primary School / Ph2 – Phase 2, Secondary School).

---

46 Streetcheck provides in depth information regarding neighbourhoods and areas across the UK https://www.streetcheck.co.uk/postcode/ll112bw.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Code</th>
<th>Group size</th>
<th>No. of boys</th>
<th>No. of girls</th>
<th>County of School</th>
<th>Urban/Rural</th>
<th>Language of School</th>
<th>Primary/Secondary</th>
<th>Population size (based on town/village/city)</th>
<th>% of Welsh spoken at home</th>
<th>Children from Welsh-speaking homes (within group)</th>
<th>% Welsh speakers within the community</th>
<th>% of children receiving free school dinners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>G1Ph1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Gwynedd</td>
<td>Village</td>
<td>Welsh</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>&lt;1,000</td>
<td>98%</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G1Ph2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Gwynedd</td>
<td>Town &amp; Fringe</td>
<td>Bilingual</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>4,875</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>91%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G2Ph1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Wrexham</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>Welsh</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>61,606</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G2Ph2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Wrexham</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>Welsh</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>61,606</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>10.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G3Ph1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Gwynedd</td>
<td>Town &amp; Fringe</td>
<td>Welsh</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>9,615</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G3Ph2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Gwynedd</td>
<td>Town &amp; Fringe</td>
<td>Bilingual</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>9,615</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>11.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G4Ph1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Torfaen</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>Welsh</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>47,254</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G4Ph2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Torfaen</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>Welsh</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>35,447</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>12.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G5Ph1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Cardiff</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>Welsh</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>346,000</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>3.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G5Ph2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Cardiff</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>Welsh</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>346,000</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>5.80%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 14: Site and Participant Selection Indicating Linguistic, Gender, Age, Geographic and Socio-Economic Statistics.

47 The 'Urban’/'Rural’ classification were based on the ONS classifications, with 'Urban' based on population size >1000.
49 Figures taken from https://www.streetcheck.co.uk/postcode/ll112bw.
50 James had since moved schools and was therefore not included in the Phase 2 results.
51 Age was indicated by type of school, Primary referred to children aged 10-11-years-old, and Secondary, to children aged 11-12-years old.
The term “linguistic identity” is often synonymous with bilingual or multilingual communities. It is a term often used when looking at how individuals or groups negotiate their identities based on the languages they speak, often by choice or social setting. Joseph argues that ‘the entire phenomenon of identity can be understood as a linguistic one and that language and identity are ultimately inseparable’ (Joseph, 2004: 13, cited in Scourfield et al., 2006: 129). While language is a prime determinant of identity, linguistic identities (where multiple languages are spoken) present a situation that is far more complex. Despite all the children in this study being Welsh-English bilinguals, the majority of participants were dominant bilinguals, meaning that individuals had greater proficiency in one language over the other (Wei, 2000: 6). Wales is a bilingual nation with both English and Welsh recognised as national languages. Taking Joseph’s argument about language and identity, the children in this study should identify with both the values of their Non-Welsh-speaking and Welsh-speaking identities. This may, at times, exhibit conflicting processes of identification, especially when considering the varying domains in which the individual children assigned each language. While all the children in this study attended Welsh-medium schools, 22 came from homes where neither parent spoke Welsh, with the remaining 20 coming from homes where either one or both parents spoke Welsh (see Appendix 6). Groups 1 and 3 lived in communities where the Welsh-language was regarded as a community language while Groups 2 and 4 (and 5 to a lesser extent) lived in communities where the Welsh-language was spoken by a minority. The groups represented a range of bilinguals, some compound bilinguals others L1 (Welsh) and L2 (English), in addition to L1 (English) and L2 (Welsh) speakers. The varying competencies in each, either or both languages were significant factors when considering linguistic identities, because self-confidence plays an important role in language use and language perception (Park, 2008: 126).

A compound bilingual refers to ‘someone whose two languages are learnt at the same time, often in the same context’ (Wei, 2000: 6).
3.2.4.1 Difficulties and Justifications

The selection of a cross-section of schools from within Wales was a key component of this research, as representation and variation is so often overlooked when discussing minority-language communities. Despite only including five groups of children in this research, the importance of noting the linguistic landscape, geographical locations and socio-economic setting of each school was of significant value in terms of representing the diversities that exist in Welsh-speaking communities. Regrettably, certain localities and areas have not been included in this research; this was due to the lack of response from some areas coupled with logistical issues linked to undertaking the research. However, the key concerns of this research were to represent areas with marked rural/urban variants and areas of both high and low concentrations of Welsh-language speakers, a balance achieved with this sample selection.

While it had been a prerequisite at the planning stage of the project to rule out schools that had more than one secondary school option available to parents/students, one instance did occur that was beyond the control of the project. Despite the primary school attended by Group 1 being a feeder school for one secondary school, it was noted how James, due to his family moving from the area, would not be attending the same secondary school as the rest of the children (see Appendix 6). However, as noted there were only ten pupils in the whole school year of this small rural school. The decision to include this pupil in the study was based on a request made by the head teacher. Considering the circumstances, the removal of one child from the Phase 2 data gathering process was not deemed problematic as such incidences can occur when conducting social science research. Group dynamics and inclusion were important factors in the design of this research, as the topic of identity is often synonymous with feelings of belonging. It is exactly due to such considerations that classroom teachers and head teachers were asked to select participants for this study. It was made clear that in each instance participants needed to be of mixed linguistic ability, gender and from both Welsh- and non-Welsh-speaking homes. While the language of the home may not be a defining factor in understanding how competent a child may be in the Welsh-language, I was interested in
investigating whether the language of the home influenced engagement with the Welsh language outside the classroom.

3.3 Section 2 Data Analysis Research Methodologies

3.3.1 Theoretical Overview of Data Analysis Methodologies Appropriate for Focus Group Research

Braun and Clarke (2006: 4-5) explain that the analysis of qualitative research can be divided roughly into two ‘camps’; the first ‘stemming from a particular theoretical or epistemological position’, such as conversational analysis or discourse analysis, and the second from approaches ‘essentially independent of theory and epistemology, such as thematic analysis’ (Hutchby & Wooffitt, 1998, cited in ibid). Johnstone (2000: 103) describes discourse analysis as a methodology for the understanding of ‘language in use’. Grbich (2007: 146) explains how the term discourse analysis became fashionable during the 1960s as interest in the ‘representations of reality through language’ began to emerge. Johnstone notes that, because discourse analysis is concerned with written, spoken or signed words that are captured in transcripts, recordings or texts, it is impossible to study linguistic interactions in real time by using this method. These texts and recordings act as forms of ‘social practice’ suitable for analysis (Barker and Galasinski, 2001: 64). As with discourse analysis, conversational analysis requires the use of a transcript or recording. Once again the process of transcribing and coding are essential to this data analysis method as the substance of the data comes directly from the conversations that occur naturally. Interaction and behaviour therefore need to be shown in the transcripts as these play a pivotal role in the analysis of conversations. Grbich (2007: 137) explains how the study of everyday conversations can ‘shed light on the rules of social behaviour’, but in order to do this, every aspect of the conversation must be noted. Therefore, the transcription conventions used in conversational analysis are much more detailed as ‘every aspect becomes significant’ from the smallest pause to the loudest yell (ibid). Subsequently the use of conversational analysis (where the repetition of words and phrases may be deemed essential) was not appropriate for this research as it was the ideas within the data that were of
specific interest. Identifying and describing ‘both implicit and explicit ideas within the data’ are based upon the identification of themes (Guest et al., 2011: 11).

### 3.3.1.1 Thematic Analysis

Thematic analysis is the process by which a narrative is created to ‘cast light upon the topic in hand’ (King and Horrocks, 2010: 165), through the identification and analysis of themes from within the data sets. Despite being one of the most commonly used methods in qualitative research (Guest et al., 2011: 10), it does not ‘appear to exist as a “named” analysis in the same way that other methods do’ (Braun and Clarke, 2006: 6). Thematic analysis differs from other analytical methods such as discourse analysis (DA) or grounded theory as it ‘does not require the same detailed theoretical and technological knowledge’, and subsequently can ‘offer a more accessible form of analysis’ (Braun and Clarke, 2006: 9). Due to the flexibility of this analytical tool, King and Horrocks (2010: 149) explain that there are ‘many different styles of thematic analysis’. Despite the variety of different approaches, the first process in any thematic analysis is identifying themes through detailed codification. Themes, defined by King and Horrocks are ‘recurrent features of participants’ accounts, characterising particular perceptions and/or experiences, which the researcher sees as relevant to the research question’ (ibid). According to the authors, this is not simply the act of ‘finding something lying in the data like a fossil in a rock’ (ibid), but requires the researcher to make informed decisions based on what to include (and what not to include), and how to interpret the words of the participants. While the flexibility of this analysis method allows the researcher to explore themes based on theoretical assumptions and the research questions, its reliability can come under scrutiny due to how themes are established and interpreted. Despite this, thematic analysis is common practice when discussing qualitative research findings and, if coded correctly, can provide rich data analysis.
The organisation of thematic analysis research is often formulated either by discussing themes in turn (whereby results are ordered based on themes), or by creating a case-by-case (or, as defined in this research, a ‘group’) narrative whereby cases/groups are isolated and discussed in full before moving onto the next case/group. Successful in turn thematic analysis requires a systematic approach, whereby relevant themes are identified in order to answer the research question through a well-defined narrative. While a case-by-case approach allows for a more holistic discussion of each case by addressing each one sequentially, this method can produce very long and repetitive results.

3.3.1.2 The Successful Application of Thematic Analysis: Transcription

King and Horrocks (2010:142) note that transcription is the ‘process of converting recorded material into text’. As with discourse analysis and conversation analysis, thematic analysis also requires a process of transcription. The transcription of focus group data ‘for substantive analysis’ (Bloor et al., 2001: 59) is, according to Bloor et al., often underestimated. Transcripts do not simply list the words that were spoken, but should accurately note how the speakers communicated with each other.

For academic research, the process of transcribing data is extremely important, as ‘analysis without transcription will lead to loss of much of the richness of the data and will risk a selective and superficial analysis’ (ibid). Transcribing recorded data may also require the use of field diaries or research notes, and observations made by the researcher on the day may help in highlighting certain “stage directions” that might not be clear when listening to the recordings alone. There are a number of ways of transcribing data based on different versions of transcription conventions. Johnstone (2000:17) explains how a transcript is a ‘partial representation of talk’, and transcribers must decide what information to include and what can be left out. This element of choice can direct the research project and is one of the reasons why discussions on transcription conventions can often become heated. Luebs (2000, cited in Johnstone, 2000: 118) explains how ‘no technique could possibly be “correct” for all purposes’. King and
Horrocks (2010: 143) explain how methodologies which focus heavily on ‘how language is used’ generally require a much more detailed and full transcription. As transcription is an extremely time-consuming process, ensuring the correct approach is used is extremely important. Often more detailed transcripts can become harder to read but include more information, whereas basic transcripts can be much easier to decipher but lack the detail needed for more in-depth coding.

The conventions used in the transcription of qualitative material, such as focus group data, are similar to those found in conversation or discourse analysis. However, the detail of the transcriptions may vary. Buckingham (1993: x) lists a simplified transcription convention in his work, based on traditional conventions, and argues that the system offers a workable framework for media and cultural studies. This transcription guide lists stage direction, pauses, interjections, and so on, but with less of an emphasis on the linguistics-driven coded that is needed for both discourse and conversational analysis (See Appendix 7 for Buckingham’s transcript conventions).

McLellan-Lemal (2008: 114) explains how ‘if researchers are fluent in the data-collection language’, there is no need for translation ‘provided that analysis is based on the cultural perspectives of the respondents’. Translation can increase the complexities in terms of data analysis, as there is inevitably an additional element of interpretation required (cf. McLellan-Lemal, 2008). As a bilingual researcher, full translations of the focus group sessions was subsequently not required, however, in order to create a clear thematic narrative of the data, meaning-based translations were included alongside each extract used.

All focus group sessions were conducted in Welsh, however, bilingual code-switching, the process of ‘grammatical integration of one language in another’ (Wei, 2000: 15) featured prominently in the children’s language. As such, additional notes were made to highlight these occurrences, especially if the nature of the code-switching was perceived to have significant relevance in relation to asserting particular ‘identities’. The recordings were first transcribed into Welsh, as per the original language of the focus group sessions, before being
translated into English. Translations were focused on meaning as opposed to literal word-by-word translations.

Another key factor to consider when transcribing is the temptation by transcribers and researchers ‘correct errors’ when transcribing (King and Horrocks, 2010: 148). However, producing a ‘corrected version’ (ibid) is not the purpose of transcription. Also, when audio is unclear, there is often a temptation to insert a 'best guess’ (ibid); again this can have a detrimental impact on the results. Ensuring that the transcripts accurately capture the recorded material was a time-consuming process but an essential part of the data analysis process. Having kept field notes during the data-gathering process, these notes were invaluable when it came to the transcription and translation, enabling additional stage directions to be included which the audio recordings did not capture.

3.3.1.3 The Successful Application of Thematic Analysis: Thematic Coding

Coding is an essential part of thematic analysis. Bazeley explains the process of coding a transcribed text as being complex, requiring the researcher to interpret meaning from a situation in which ‘many things are going on at once’ (Bazeley, 2007: 73) in a specific time frame and social setting with multiple people involved. Coding therefore acts as a way of deciphering appropriate data based on the researcher’s aims and objectives, in addition to highlighting further topics of interest based on alternative directions set by the group. Topics therefore can be broadly coded in two ways, either as a priori or ‘in-vivo codes’ (Barbour, 2007: 115). A priori codes or theoretically-derived codes (Bazeley, 2007: 76) refer to the themes set out by the researcher in advance, meaning that the researcher will ‘come to their data already with a start list of concepts they are interested in exploring’ (ibid). In-vivo or indigenous codes, in contrast, derive directly from the data, and as Kelle (2007, cited in Barbour, 2007: 120) explains, tend to relate to the ‘theories of members of the investigated culture’. King and Horrocks (2010: 168) note how over-reliance on a priori codes can lead to a blinkered approach to the research.
According to Grbich (2007: 32) it is important to reduce the data into meaningful groupings; a 'block-and-file approach', conceptual mapping or a combination of the two can be applied to achieve this. The block-and-file approach refers to a coding system based on themes and can either use a colour coding or a process of underlining. Concept mapping provides a picture of the emerging themes. King and Horrocks (2010: 150) explain how all versions of thematic analysis require the researcher to list and organise the themes in a way that 'reflects how they are conceptualised to relate to each other'.

There are a number of different ways researchers can utilise thematic analysis, but King and Horrocks (ibid: 152-158) outline a basic system that explains the process. The first stage requires the researcher to read through the transcripts, identifying parts of the data that address areas of the research question/s. This is referred to as descriptive coding, and the purpose of this exercise is to look for similarities in terms of 'what is of interest to the participants' (ibid: 152), rather than interpreting meaning. The importance of this preliminary exercise is to allow the researcher to become familiarised with the data set as a whole, as any later analysis of a particular section of transcript will require the researcher to do so 'in context' (ibid) of the whole focus group session. As with the process of transcription and translation, where the inclusion of additional notes can provide a holistic overview of the analysis, the inclusion of additional comments during this descriptive coding process provides further context. This process of descriptive coding can highlight a number of themes relating to the same segment of text. King and Horrocks (2010: 154) explain how this is inevitable 'because as researchers we are imposing distinctions on free-flowing accounts of complex experiences'. As each transcript is coded, patterns relating to frequent and/or relevant features can be noted.

Once these descriptive codes are successfully defined and identified, the second phase is the process of interpretive coding. Through grouping together the descriptive codes based on one's own interpretations, interpretative codes can be identified. Langdrige (2007, cited in King and Horrocks, 2010: 154) explains how, at this stage, it is recommended that theoretical concepts are not applied to the codification process, as this can lead to a blinkered approach to the analysis,
focusing only on aspects of the data that fit within the theoretical framework. The third stage in the codification process relates to the defining of overarching themes. Using the interpretative themes as building blocks, the overarching themes draw directly from ‘theoretical ideas’ (ibid: 156).

While King and Horrocks’ (2010) three-stage thematic analysis system provides a basic guide for conducting thematic analysis, this is not the only approach used, and often, due to the flexibility of thematic analysis, this basic approach is modified to create an approach that best answers the research-specific requirements. There are also a number of different, named versions of thematic analysis, with some better suited for larger sample sizes and others for cross-disciplinary studies. Both template and matrix thematic analyses are two alternative examples used, especially when the research settings or data sets require further or additional coding, when themes have been identified in advance, (a priori themes as discussed by Barbour, 2007: 115) or when visual displays are needed to aid the analytical structure (King and Horrocks, 2010: 172).

Crabtree and Miller (1992) were both prominent scholars in the development of template analysis whereby some predetermined themes are identified and a template for further codification is based on these preliminary themes. These predetermined or a priori themes provide a guide for the researcher, and it is recommended that a small sample of the data set be coded, based on these a priori themes (King, 2014), to act as a template to analyse the remainder of the data sets. The template provided from this exercise allows for the construction of a ‘coding structure’ (King and Horrocks, 2010: 166), a flexible template that can be applied to the data and ‘revised as necessary until it captures as full a picture of the analyst’s understanding as possible’ (ibid). Unlike the basic system of thematic analysis outlined by King and Horrocks, template analysis does not clearly differentiate between the descriptive and interpretative codes because the focus is placed on ‘hierarchical coding’ (King, 2014). Unlike the suggested limits placed on codification in the basic model of thematic analysis, there are no stipulated ‘fixed number of hierarchical coding (King and Horrocks, 2010: 166).
The numbers of levels are set by the researcher and are seen as a way of capturing and organising the meanings found within the data.

One of the most important factors of qualitative research is its flexibility. King and Horrocks (ibid: 173) explain how qualitative analyses should never slavishly follow a “cookbook” of instructions. The nature of this kind of research is to allow the researcher to develop and ‘modify aspects of the analytic process’ (ibid) to best suit the research. As there were 10 data sets included in this dual-phased research (two sets taken from each group), a template approach was deemed to be the most suitable. As this was a cross-disciplinary and multi-layered study, the identification of a priori themes was advantageous. Identity formation sits at the core of this investigation, so identifying the various ways in which the participants negotiated their multiple identities was very important. Highlighting linguistic identities, media identities and childhood identities as themes enabled the formulation of themes, creating additional layers to the research that focused on the interconnections. Another advantage of using template analysis was the emphasis on creating a ‘visual display of the analytical structure’ (King and Horrocks, 2010: 172).

When documenting thematic analysis, the data can be approached and discussed in two ways, either, through the use of an in turn approach, where themes are analysed in terms of the entire data set, or through the use of a ‘case-by-case’ approach (ibid: 165), where a holistic discussion of each case study is presented. While a case-by-case approach can allow for a more complete discussion of each case study, this approach can produce a very linear account for the reader that has the potential of being very long and repetitive. This approach is better suited to research with fewer data sets. For use with larger data sets, an in turn thematic analysis approach is much more appropriate.

### 3.3.2 The Application of Thematic Analysis to the Research.

The justification for using thematic analysis for this research project was anchored in the context of the participants; bilingual children from a variety of language communities across Wales. Whilst language competence was an
important variant, this was not the main focus of this research. The focus was concerned with attitudes towards identity via engagement with Welsh media. Since the main focus of the research related to the sorts of ideas and opinions expressed by the participants, it was important to utilise a data analysis tool that would map ‘talk’ as opposed to the technical details of ‘language’ use.

The complex setting in which this research was conducted, coupled with the need for multi-level theoretical cross-referencing (between disciplines, groups and phases), resulted in the application of a thematic approach modelled on template analysis, similar to those outlined by Crabtree and Miller (1992) and King (2014). As discussed in the codification process, template analysis requires the ‘development of a coding ‘template’, which summarises themes identified by the researcher(s)’ (King, 2014: 166). Significant themes are then organised in terms of meaningfulness, using a hierarchical coding structure. This method does not stipulate ‘a fixed number of hierarchical coding levels’ (King and Horrocks, 2010: 166), and therefore lends itself to this kind of cross-disciplinary research investigation. A template is normally created from a sub-set of data and then applied to the remaining data set. However, as this was a dual-phased study interested in mapping continuities and changes, the template was created using all five transcripts from Phase 1. As the children involved in this investigation represented varying social, cultural and linguistic groups, creating a template from the entire Phase 1 data-set provided a more holistic view of the demographic structure. The questions used during the focus group sessions remained the same during both Phases 1 and Phase 2 of the research, as mapping continuities and change during the transition phase was an integral part of this investigation. Creating a template from Phase 1 findings enabled Phase 2 results to be compared and contrasted.

Whilst this research began as a sociolinguistic investigation into linguistic identities, with children being the research subjects and media engagement the means of measurement, the need to understand other elements of identity became clear as the investigation developed. The result of this was the recognition of the three a priori themes, which sought to explore how ten-to twelve-year-old children negotiated these elements of identity. It is important to
appreciate that identity consists of a number of varying social, cultural, geographical, and physical factors. Drawing on the literature presented in Chapter 2 in relation to the 'Basic Themes', areas of specific interest were identified. The use of a priori themes allows researchers to approach the data with a 'start list of concepts they are interested in exploring' (Bazeley, 2007: 76).

The first a priori theme identified was linguistic identity, focusing on the negotiation of identity through language use by bilingual Welsh/English speakers. As engagement with Welsh-language media was the specific means by which identity was measured (within this investigation), the second a priori theme was media identities. As noted in Chapter 2, the inclusion of children in the production of Welsh-language content is part of S4C's children's remit (S4C, 2014: 18-19). The theme of media identities therefore represented the way in which the children negotiated onscreen inclusion, and how such engagement with media could influence identity construction in terms of self-esteem and confidence. The final a priori theme focused on understanding how children perceive childhood through socially constructed ideas of childhood, in this instance shaped by media. The focus here was on exploring whether the service provided for children by Welsh-language media answered their social and cultural needs.

Having created a basic template from the predetermined a priori themes, a second set of themes was then identified from within the data-sets. These themes were coded as data-focused themes. Data-focused themes correspond to the connections that exist between each a priori theme. These themes were data-led and provided a sub-context to the a priori themes. While King and Horrocks note the importance of identifying themes that are 'distinct from each other’ (King and Horrocks, 2010: 149), as the 'blurring of boundaries’ (ibid) can make it hard for the reader to find clarity in the researcher’s interpretation, the cross-disciplinary nature of this research meant that connections between themes were essential in creating a holistic narrative.

Building on the concept of template analysis, a number of flow diagrams were developed during the analytical process in order to demonstrate the
relationships between each theme and the associated interdisciplinary connections. Again, template analysis encourages the researcher to amend the thematic template throughout the analysis process, adding additional layers or themes based on individual cases. The final template based on Phase 1 results identified 6 data-focused themes. While a number of possible themes were identified during the codification process, in order for themes to be included in the template, firstly, there needed to be a clear interconnection between two of the a priori themes, and secondly, the identified theme could not be exclusive to one group. While a number of interesting topics arose for the group discussions, themes needed to be comparable.

### 3.3.2.1 Linguistic Identity and Media Identity: Interconnecting Themes

Drawing on Phase 1 results two data-focused themes were identified interconnecting linguistic identities and media identities, ‘media as a tool for language acquisition’ and ‘media as a nation building tool’. As evidence of these themes varied from group to group, a second layer of coding was introduced to differentiate between the responses. Responses to the theme ‘media as a tool for language acquisition’ were categorised as linguistic encouragement and promotion, conscious learning and subconscious learning in terms of media use for language acquisition as demonstrated in Figure 15.
Linguistic encouragement and promotion referred to the use of Welsh-language media as a means of promoting interest in the language, specifically amongst non-Welsh speakers. Conscious learning drew on the responses given whereby language instruction/improvement was the primary goal of the programme (for example, through education-specific content). Finally subconscious learning referred to the situation whereby language improvement/instruction was not the primary goal of the (media) content. Responses to the second interconnecting theme - ‘media as a nation building tool’ were categorised based on whether explicit or implicit knowledge of the theme were displayed (see Figure 16). Explicit knowledge was measured through tangible references to the minority-language maintenance campaign in Wales and specific displays of knowledge relating to the development of minority-language media. While implicit knowledge focused on the notion that Welsh-language media offered a tangible category of Welshness, a unique element of cultural heritage that shaped national consciousness and what it meant to be Welsh.
3.3.2.2 **Media Identity and Childhood Identity: Interconnecting Themes**

The codification process identified three data-focused themes interconnecting media identities and childhood identities, namely ‘media engagement and self-representation’, ‘access and service’ and ‘viewing practices and preferences’.

‘Media engagement and self-representation focused on the impact that onscreen visibility and media participation might have on identity construction, and how audiences negotiated the relationship between participant and viewer. Considering S4C’s inclusion remit, the responses were categorised based on negative and positive accounts of onscreen participation. Online visibility focused on the relationship between communication media and identity, drawing on references made to online activity.

---

**Figure 16 Classifications of Media as a Nation Building Tool**
The second interconnecting theme, ‘access and service’ drew from the predominantly negative responses to the service provided by S4C to its younger audiences, subsequently affecting their engagement with Welsh-language media. The results indicated two clear reasons for their lack of or restricted engagement, the shared viewing experience and media othering (see Figure 18). The shared viewing experience focused on the difficulties some of the children from non-Welsh speaking households found engaging with Welsh-language media in the home. Media othering reflected the perceptions that S4C better serviced others, in particular younger children.
The third theme interconnecting media and linguistic identity focused on the viewing preferences of the groups, concentrated specifically on the responses given to Exercise 1 and 2. Through a quantification process of listing responses, emerging patterns were identified. As a result of this, two categories were identified, the group's engagement with child-orientated or child-specific (television) content and their engagement with other television content (for example adult shown after the watershed\textsuperscript{53}, see Figure 19). The significance of formulating a template from Phase 1 results was in order to map continuities and change between both phases. While maturation and development indicate a degree of change, understanding the narrative of continuity is often far less obvious, the significance of this theme was to use programme choices as means of mapping both continuities and change.

\footnote{\textsuperscript{53}The watershed refers to the time when TV programmes, which might be unsuitable for children, can be broadcast in the UK (Ofcom).}
3.3.2.3 Childhood Identity and Linguistic Identity: Interconnecting Themes

The final interconnecting theme related to the relationship between childhood identity and linguistic identity. In this instance, 1 data-focused theme was identified, namely language use. Despite only identifying one data-focused theme, language use was categorised by three unique elements, linguistic self-confidence through engagement and use and peer-group inclusion and exclusion as illustrated in Figure 20. Linguistic self-confidence focused on the impact language competencies played in language amongst young Welsh/English bilinguals, drawing on socio-cultural factors and specifically geographic location. Peer group inclusion and exclusion focused on two specific examples from with the data sets relating to language use in two very distinct language settings, the first, where the majority of children (within the group) came from Welsh-speaking homes, and the second, where the majority of children (within the group) came from non-Welsh-speaking homes.
3.3.2.4 Mapping Continuities and Change

As previously noted the thematic template was devised using the results from Phase 1 findings in order to compare and contrast these findings with those from Phase 2. Phase 2 of the research mirrored the approach taken during Phase 1, utilising the same question sets original exercises (outlined by the focus group schedule). The analytical approach also emulated the structure of Phase 1 analysis but focused on the narratives of change and continuity during the transition phase. As template analysis allows for some degree of flexibility, this method allowed for additional categories to be explored within the existing template (data-focused themes). Continuity was mapped based on elements that remained constant, reaffirming fundamentals of self through repetition of ideals within the highlighted themes. In contrast, change represented the developments in the children’s individual and collective ideals. Comparing responses between Phase 1 and 2 discussions were then cross-referenced against social and organisational changes experienced by the children, for example, different linguistic categorisation of secondary schools compared with primary schools attended by the children. Figure 21 represents the project-
specific thematic network system mapping the dual-phase approach in its entirety.

Figure 21 Thematic Network System Mapping the Dual-phase Approach

3.3.2.5 Writing up Thematic Analysis: Presenting the Findings

Thematic analysis requires the identification of clearly defined themes in order to create a well-defined and concise narrative of the results for the reader. Problems can arise when there is a ‘blurring of boundaries’ (King and Horrocks, 2010: 149) between themes. The cross-disciplinary nature of this research, and the process by which interconnecting data-focused themes were identified, discussing themes in turn without breaking the flow of the narrative proved to be a difficult task. The main area of concern was clarity in the presentation of themes for the reader. In order to avoid a disjointed narrative, the discursive process was divided into three sections. Each section correlated with the
identified interconnections between two a priori themes. Each section was discussed *in turn* in separate findings chapters. Chapter 4 focuses on the interconnections between linguistic identities and media identities, Chapter 5 looks at the interconnections between media identities and childhood identities, and finally Chapter 6 concentrates on the interconnections between childhood identities and linguistic identities. Dividing the findings into three chapters allowed for a holistic discussion of the themes in the context of each discipline (Sociolinguistics, Media Studies and Childhood Studies), exploring existing theories and drawing on the interconnections between them from a project-specific perspective. As a dual-phase study investigating attitudes towards identity during the transition phase, (a period of significance social change in the lives of preadolescents), themes are discussed *in turn* then cross-referenced to map continuity and change between Phases 1 and 2.

### 3.4 Summary

The central research question proposed by this study sought to investigate perceptions of language and identity by young bilinguals in Wales. Focusing on Welsh-language media, this research aims to examine notions of identity based on media engagement through asking the question; does the media mediate or maintain perceptions of language and identity for bilingual children in Wales, and to what extent do social changes during the transitional phase between primary and secondary school influence these perceptions?

Four research questions were formulated to answer this central research question, with the first three questions concentrating on the interconnections between three distinct elements of identity, namely linguistic identity, media identity and childhood identity. The complexities of this cross-disciplinary study led to the formulation of six key data-focused themes that highlighted the interconnections between the a priori themes. As a dual-phased research project, the creation of a template from Phase 1 findings allowed for a comparison study to be formulated in order to address the fourth and final research question; 'how significant are the social changes that occur during the transitional phase
between primary and secondary school on identity construction amongst young bilingual preadolescents in Wales?"

The transition from primary to secondary school represents a significant milestone in the lives of young people, a period where some elements of self-identity become subject to change whilst others remain constant. Durkin notes how a young person’s ‘status’ shifts from being a senior pupil in a manageable environment to a naïve newcomer in ‘an anonymous bureaucracy’ (Durkin, 1995: 508). The familiar is replaced by the unfamiliar, as their daily routines alter dramatically as they mature towards adolescence; their understanding of self and others also develops. While understanding the complexities of identity construction is at the centre of this research, the dual-phased aspect of the investigation represented the original contribution to knowledge. The overarching theme here was the negotiation of both change and continuity during a period of significant transition. As a child’s social setting alters (due to the social progression from primary to secondary school education), the narrative of change is often clearly signposted for the child. Along with socially-constructed norms linked to maturation, such as the norm of responsibility believed to be acquired during middle childhood (Durkin, 1995: 445), physical and emotional changes are also occurring, that shape individuals’ understanding of self. While maturation and development indicate a degree of change, understanding the narrative of continuity is often far less obvious.
4 Chapter 4: Interconnections between Linguistic and Media Identities: Findings

4.1 Introduction

While a wealth of research focuses on the role the media play in the construction of ‘identities’ relating to factors such as gender, age, culture, and religion, work focusing on the interconnections between media and linguistic identities in this context still remains relatively limited. Billig refers to the importance of a national language as a ‘prime determinant of nationalist identity’ (Billig, 1995: 29), where those speaking the same language are liable to claim a sense of ‘national bond’ (ibid). The five groups of children included in this study came from various parts of Wales, and their daily engagement with the Welsh language varied significantly as a result of their locality.

This chapter presents the findings relating to the interconnections between the a priori themes - linguistic identity and media identity. Through the process of thematic codification, two interconnecting (data-focused) themes were identified, namely media as a tool for language acquisition, and Welsh-language media as a nation-building tool. In terms of Welsh-language media’s role in language acquisition, three main themes were identified during the thematic codification of Phase 1 results. These were grouped into three categories: linguistic encouragement and promotion, conscious learning and subconscious learning. Two situations whereby the media represented a means of nation building were identified. The first focused on explicit knowledge, focusing on the children’s awareness of the Welsh-language media campaign and the second, implicit knowledge, whereby Welsh-language media offered a tangible category of Welshness.

One of the aims of this research was to investigate the significance of the transition phase; subsequently each theme is presented in turn through exploring responses from both Phase 1 and Phase 2 results in order to present a comprehensive narrative mapping continuity and change. One of the difficulties in presenting the findings was clarity while avoiding linearity. While Phase 1 and Phase 2 are discussed in turn, the results are cross-referenced in relation to both
Group and Phase in order to highlight continuity and change in the responses.

4.2 Media as a Tool for Language Acquisition (Phase 1 Findings).

![Figure 15 Classifications of Media as a Tool for Language Acquisition (Chapter 3).](image)

Each group in this study referred to the benefits of using media as a means for aiding language acquisition, often in response to Question Set 5 (Focus Group Schedule, which focused on the children’s understanding of the purpose of S4C). During these discussions surrounding ‘purpose’, education, or more specifically language acquisition were often raised when referring to Welsh-language programmes/broadcast media. The children’s perceptions of ‘educational benefit’ were either focused on direct benefits to themselves or simply as a means of demonstrating an understanding of the capacity media has for promoting language learning. While each group reflected on the benefits of media use, the means by which Welsh-language content was utilised both at school and at home differed dramatically from site to site, influencing the responses given.

The findings from Phase 1 revealed that the use of Welsh-language content by schools was often dependent on the number of L1 and L2 Welsh-speakers. Using
the immersion and maintenance teaching classifications outlined by Redknap (2006), Phase 1 results found that immersion schools were far more likely to use Welsh-language programmes as an educational resource than maintenance schools. During Phase 1, Groups 2 (Wrexham), 4 (Torfaen) and 5 (Cardiff) all noted the use of Welsh-language programmes by teachers during lessons. As the majority of the children from Groups 2, 4 and 5 came from non-Welsh speaking homes, and more specifically wider communities where the Welsh-language was spoken by the minority, the use of Welsh-language content by schools demonstrated a means of encouraging and promoting language use. However, evidence of language promotion was not restricted to responses by L2 Welsh-speakers.

Language growth and encouragement through media engagement was based on responses that highlighted the use of Welsh-language media as a means of promoting interest in the language amongst non-Welsh speakers. Drawing on two responses from the Phase 1 sessions, Robert from Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Becca from Group 4 (Torfaen) presented two very different accounts of Welsh-language media being used to encourage non-Welsh speakers to learn/engage with the Welsh language.

Robert: I like the fact that we have both (Welsh and English channels) // with Rownd a Rownd and Pobol y Cwm, the writing is in English (subtitles) // so it teaches English people // that’s what I like

Robert: Dw i’n licio’r ffaith bod y ddau ‘na // efo Rownd a Rownd a Pobol y Cwm, ma’r sgwennu’n Saesneg/ so mae o’n dysgu pobl Saesneg// dyna dwi’n licio.

Extract 1: Group 1, Phase 1

Becca: I think if people who don’t speak Welsh watch S4C// maybe they’d be like wow// I want to do that.

Becca: Fi’n credu os mae pobl sydd ddim yn siarad Cymraeg yn gwylio S4C// falle bydd nhw’n meddwl wow/ fi eisiau neuw hwnna
While both noted the benefits of using Welsh-language media for promoting language growth, there was a marked difference in their responses. For Robert, the use of subtitles was suggested as a means by which 'English people' could be included in the viewing experience, while Becca focused on the desire to learn Welsh based on interest sparked through engaging with Welsh-language media. When looking at these two examples, there is a clear connection between the responses given and the wider linguistic community. Robert came from a Welsh-speaking household and lived in a small rural community where 73% (www.streetcheck.co.uk) of the wider community spoke Welsh. Subsequently, subtitles represented a means by which non-Welsh speakers could access the service, perhaps viewed as an important measure within his community as a means of promoting inclusion for non-Welsh speakers. Becca, on the other hand, came from a non-Welsh speaking home and an area where only 10% (www.streetcheck.co.uk) of the wider community spoke Welsh. In this instance, language promotion was far more prominent in her response, indicating how the media represented an informal means of encouraging Welsh-language growth.

The second situation focused on conscious learning, and drew on the responses given by the participants whereby language instruction/improvement was the primary goal of the programme (for example, through education-specific content). The conscious use of media as a tool for improving language skills was noted by almost every school. Angharad (Group 4 - Torfaen), for example noted how Welsh-language content on S4C was a useful resource for schools. She explained how, ‘it can also help schools, because sometimes schools tell you that when you go home you can watch blablabla on S4C’ (Ie hefyd i helpu ysgolion, achos weithiau mae ysgolion yn dweud os ti’n mynd adref ti’n gallu gwylio blablabla ar S4C). This specific reference to school and media demonstrated the relationship that exists between television and Welsh-language education in Wales, and the way in which this could be viewed as a foundation stone in what the current Welsh-language strategy refers to as ‘language infrastructure’ (Welsh
This promotion of Welsh-language content by teachers perhaps indicates how Welsh-language media have become synonymous with education, especially when considering content for children. Stuart from Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) reiterated a similar point when he explained how 'English programmes are easier to understand but the Welsh ones are better for us' (Mae'r rhai Saesneg yn haws i'w dallt, ond mae'r rhai Cymraeg yn well i ni...).

While Stuart’s comment may have demonstrated conscious learning, it could simply represent ‘school speak’, echoing what children have been told by their teachers or parents. Buckingham notes how ‘any adult asking children questions about television within a school context is likely to invite what children perceive as adult responses’ (Buckingham, 2004: 43). Whether Stuart’s response was based on something that he has been told at home or at school or not, its significance highlighted how the educational value of S4C was transmitted to children by parents and teachers.

Another indicator of the connection between Welsh-language media and conscious learning in regards to language acquisition was the way in which the various groups discussed content of S4C. Again looking at responses to Question Set 5 (purpose of S4C), a number of group discussions focused on who they perceived to be S4C’s target audience. While a comprehensive discussion of othering (in terms of service) is presented in Chapter 5, Extract 3 demonstrates how schedule changes (through increased hours dedicated to pre-schoolers) and the use of media content by teachers during the Foundation Phase may, in fact contribute to preconceived ideas by preadolescents that S4C is first and foremost a language acquisition tool for young children.

Catherine: There are a lot of programmes on Cyw. I think it’s for little kids// but there are some programmes that aren’t suitable for little kids

---

54 The Foundation Phase refers to the Welsh curriculum for children aged between the ages of 3 and 7, designed to encourage creativity and a more enjoyable approach to learning.
Catherine: Mae lot o raglenni ar Cyw. Dwi’n meddwl ma fe ar gyfer plant bach// ond mae yna rhai raglenni sy ddim yn siwtio plant bach...

Jen: Such as rugby and things

Jen: Fel y rygbi a pethau

Jen: I think it's for kids from about year 2 down/from Welsh schools //to improve their Welsh.

Jen: Rwy'n meddwl mai ar gyfer plant o tua blwydyn 2 i lawr/o ysgolion Cymraeg// i wella eu Cymraeg.

Extract 3: Group 2, Phase 1

Considering the children from Group 2 were all (with exception of 1 child – Catherine) L2 Welsh-speakers, the connection between attending a Welsh school and Welsh-language improvement through media engagement, demonstrated how Welsh-language media directly affected them through conscious learning.

The final situation was subconscious learning, whereby language improvement/instruction was not the primary goal of the (media) content under discussion, but through the process of listening and watching, subconscious learning could be achieved. The use of non-educational content by teachers was categorised as an example of subconscious learning, specifically as the genres of programmes used varied from school to school, and often had little or no intrinsic educational value. While the very notion of subconscious learning would suggest a lack of awareness on the child’s part, some demonstrated a clear and informed understanding of this concept, for example, Eluned from Group 5 (Cardiff – Phase 1).

Interviewer: What do you think is the purpose of S4C? Education or entertainment

Cyfwelydd: Beth ydych chi’n meddwl yw pwrpas S4C? Addysg neu adloniant?

Dave: /Both really
Dave: /Y ddau rili.

Mari: =It entertains you too

Mari: =Maen fel entertaino chi hefyd.

Eluned: Sometimes /you're watching it and you don't actually realise that you're learning

Eluned: Weithiau /chi'n gwylio fe a dydych chi ddim yn sylwi eich bod chi'n actually dysgu.

Extract 4: Group 5, Phase 1

For the purpose of this investigation, the use of non-education content for learning purposes was labelled subconscious learning. Despite not formally investigating the reason behind the use of non-educational media content by schools (e.g. by interviewing teachers), in line with the changing policies put forward by S4C in 2013, it was interesting to see which schools utilised this service and in what way. Specific reference to the use of Welsh-language television programmes by teachers was only noted by Groups 2 (Wrexham), 4 (Torfaen) and 5 (Cardiff), with neither Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) nor Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) making any specific reference to the use of Welsh-language programmes at school. Considering the varying linguistic communities of the groups, it is perhaps unsurprising that both Gwynedd schools made no explicit reference to the use of Welsh-language programmes at school. The schools attended by Groups 1 (rural Gwynedd) and 3 (urban Gwynedd) may not have needed to depend on Welsh-language media content as much as the immersion schools, as the immediate communities and home environments provided the additional infrastructure/setting for language use. It was clear from the responses to Exercises 1 and 2 (see Appendix 8.1 and 8.3) that Groups 1 and 3 did, in fact, watch significantly more Welsh-language programmes at home than Groups 2, 4 and 5. As a result of this, when discussing Welsh-language media with the groups, the setting/domain for Welsh-langue media consumption became central to the discussions. The school setting/domain became the main

55 The changes too S4C's policy in 2013 now allows the channel's on-demand content to be used by schools.
point of reference for the children from Groups 2, 4 and 5, compared with the home for the children from Groups 1 and 3.

Looking specifically at the media content utilised by schools, focusing on genres and examples of programmes mentioned by the groups (Groups 2, 4 and 5), there was little in the way of overt educational value to the content shown, again strengthening the argument for subconscious learning.

Mari: What about the programmes we watched in school?

Mari: Beth am y rhai rydyn ni wedi eu gwylio yn yr ysgol?

Interviewer: Which programmes do you watch in school?

Cyfwelydd: Pa rhai ydych chi’n gwylio yn yr ysgol?

[...] Y Lifft and //

[...] Y Lifft a //

[...] Yeah Y Lifft

[...] Ie Y Lifft

[...] The ummm / detectives thing

[...] Yr ummm / ditectifs peth ‘na

Mari: Ditectifs Hanes (...) 

Mari: Ditectifs Hanes...

Dave: =and Dan Glo

Dave: =a Dan Glo

Extract 5, Group 5, Phase 1

Extract 5 provides an example of both the content listed and the context in which the use of Welsh-language content by schools was discussed. Of the programmes listed by Groups 2, 4 and 5, genres included cartoons (Octonauts56 – Group 2, and

---

56 An original Brown Bag Films production for BBC and the reversion for S4C produced by Sain.
Sali Mali – Group 4), game shows such as the Dan Glo57 (Group 5), and the sketch-show Ditectifs Hanes58 (Group 5). While S4C commission and air content that is both factual and educational in nature (for example, the daily news and sport programme for children, Ffeil59), the majority of content that filled the designated Stwnsh slot (for tween viewers) comprised of light entertainment, cartoons, reality shows and quizzes. Specific curriculum-led Welsh-language educational content is created and available through online resources such as the BBC online service Bitesize60. Despite this, no reference was made to any educational resource or programme. A possible explanation for this was the children’s ability to differentiate between (online) educational content and television entertainment content. Since this specific line of questioning focused on Welsh-language television programmes, the children arguably may not have felt it necessary to refer to specific educational content available online, or in fact online content at all.

The use of Welsh-language programmes during lesson time was generally viewed as a positive addition to formal instruction, and perhaps best demonstrated what Lemish refers to as ‘non-threatening, non-demanding’ (Lemish, 2007: 158) approach to language acquisition. The use of Welsh-language content was clearly a popular addition to lessons, with Barrie (Group 2 - Wrexham) noting how he would be ‘gutted’ if S4C no longer existed as this would result in them having to do actual school work!

**Interviewer:** Do you like the fact that there is a Welsh channel?

*Wyt ti’n hoffi’r syniad bod sianel Cymraeg os wyt ti am ei wylio?*

**Catherine:** Yeah

*Catherine: Ie*

**Interviewer:** What about you guys?

*Cyfwelydd: Beth amdanoch chi?*
Barrie: Well// I like watching it in school

Barrie: Wel// dwi'n hoffi gwylio fe yn yr ysgol...

Interviewer: So if S4C no longer existed, how would that make you feel?

Cyfwelydd: Felly pe bai S4C yn stopio, sut fyddde hwana'n neud i chi deimlo?

Barrie: Gutted because we would have to do work and stuff [laughter]

Barrie: Gutted achos bydd rhaid i ni gwneud gwaith a pethau [laughter]

Extract 6: Group 2, Phase 1

As with media use for language promotion and encouragement, responses to subconscious learning through media use was not restricted to responses by L2 Welsh-speakers, where the use of non-educational content was used by teachers. Evidence of subconscious learning through media use was also noted amongst responses from Group 1 (rural Gwynedd). However, the notable differences in this instance were the language of the media content and the domain in which the media was consumed. In the same way that a number of Welsh L2-speakers in the study were encouraged to watch television to improve their Welsh at school, Extract 6 demonstrates how Robert (an L1 Welsh-speaker) used English-language television as a means of improving his English vocabulary. When discussing the children’s programme *Blue Peter* (BBC) with Group 1 (rural Gwynedd), Robert explained how he enjoyed ‘learning new words’ (*dysgu geiriau*) from the programme.

Robert: I like learning from it, I learn new words// they say something and then I ask Mum what it means

Robert: Dwi’n licio dysgu oddi wrtho fo, dwi’n dysgu geiriau// ma nhw’n dweud rhywbeth ac wedyn dwi’n gofyn i Mam be mae’n feddwl.

Researcher: English words?

Cyfwelydd: Geiriau Saesneg?
The significance of this extract highlights the power that the media can arguably have in both conscious and subconscious learning, especially in terms of language acquisition. Despite this, the domains in which Welsh- and English-language media were used may have influenced the way in which the children received specific media content. Robert was the only member of Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) to comment on the value of English-language media for his own linguistic development. The domain in which this learning occurred was the home, with no connection to school or formal instruction. The use of Welsh-language media for language instruction, on the other hand, was far more connected to both the classroom and the need for language improvement. Whether in terms of using non-educational content as a means of familiarising children with Welsh-language content, or schools encouraging children to engage with Welsh-language content at home to improve their Welsh, the connection between Welsh-language content and education was much stronger than that seen with English-language content.

4.2.1 Phase 2 Findings: A Comparative Study Mapping Continuities and Change in Relation to Media as a Tool for Language Acquisition

The most significant difference when discussing the relationship between education and Welsh-language media from Phase 1 to Phase 2 was the use of media by schools. The first notable factor was the reduction in use of Welsh-language television content by schools following the transition to secondary school. While the use of television content for language promotion and learning had been actively encouraged during primary school, there was a distinct lack of use amongst secondary schools during Phase 2. The second factor was the increase in the use of new media by secondary schools compared with primary schools.
Looking firstly at the use of Welsh-language (television) programmes by schools, Extracts 8 and 9 clearly demonstrate a shift in the use of this form of media content between primary and secondary schools.

**Interviewer: Do you ever watch Welsh-language programmes at school?**

*Cyfwelydd: Iawn, ydych chi byth yn gwylio rhaglenni Cymraeg yn yr ysgol?*

**Angharad: Sometimes**

*Angharad: Weithiau*

.  
.  
.  

**Nia: At primary school we used to watch a lot of Welsh stuff, like Nodi and things**

*Nia: Ysgol gynradd ni roedd ni’n gwylio lot o bethau Cymraeg fel Nodi a phethau*

**Multiple voices: =Oh yeah**

*Amryw o leisiau: =Oo ie*

Extract 8: Group 4, Phase 2

**Interviewer: Do you ever watch anything at school/any Welsh-language programmes?**

*Cyfwelydd: Ydych chi byth yn gwylio unrhyw beth yn yr ysgol// Rhaglenni Cymraeg yn yr ysgol?*

**Mena: We used to**

*Mena: O ni arfer*

**Interviewer: When you were at primary school?**

*Cyfwelydd: Yn yr ysgol gynradd?*
Mena: In Year 6

Mena: Yn blwyddyn 6

Mari: But not any more

Mari: Ond dim mwy

Eluned: I remember something like a Welsh version of Horrible Histories

Eluned: Fi’n cofio fel rhywbeth fel Horrible Histories Cymraeg

Extract 9: Group 5, Phase 2

In both instances, the groups differentiate between media use by primary and secondary schools, not only highlighting the change in media use but also demonstrating a tangible difference in the approach to education signified by the transition from one institution (primary school) to the next (secondary school).

The majority of responses in terms of media use by educational institutions during Phase 1 had focused on traditional (broadcast) media. One significant difference between the responses given during Phase 2 was the increased use of online content and new media as educational tools, in addition to the increased individual engagement with social media. When discussing the use of the Internet at school with Group 3 (urban Gwynedd), Frank explained how access had been restricted during primary school lessons, yet actively encouraged during secondary school.

Interviewer: Do they encourage you to use the Internet at school at all?

Cyfwelydd: Ydyn nhw’n annog chi i ddefnyddio’r we yn yr ysgol o gwbl? I ’neud gwaith cartref o gwbl?

Frank: We’re allowed in secondary school, but we weren’t allowed in primary school

Frank: Da ni’n cael yn (*** ysgol uwchradd ond do ni’m yn cael yn ysgol (*** gynradd
There are a number of factors that can attribute to this shift in usage of new media, for example a lack of resources or teacher expertise in promoting media literacy at primary school, in addition to the policies in place to protect young web users. Local authorities often administer the restrictions placed on Internet sites by primary schools. Drawing on past experience of working on research projects with schools, accessing a number of URL addresses were prohibited due to controls in place by council enabled Internet protection software. Unlike secondary schools, where specialist staff members are located in-house, IT provision is often supplied/controlled by the council, meaning that in some instances one individual may be responsible for providing technological support for a number a large number primary schools.

Despite the changing emphasis placed on the use of online content and various new media content, there was still some evidence of secondary schools actively encouraging the use of television content to support education through informal instruction, however this was seen as auxiliary to formal education, and an activity for the home, for example as homework. Barrie from Group 2 (Wrexham), for example noted how programmes were often ‘advertised’ at school, to encourage engagement with Welsh-language media (Extract 11) outside of the classroom.

**Barrie: Yeah they advertise stuff at school**

*Barrie: Ie mae nhw wedi fel advertisio stwff yn yr ysgol*

()  

**Gareth: Sometimes they give us homework to watch something or that has something to do with a programme**

*Gareth: Weithiau maen nhw’n rhoi gwaith cartref i wylio rhywbeth neu sydd i neud gyda rhaglen*
The significance of this encouragement to use broadcast media outside the classroom corresponded with a changing attitude of the children to the educational use of television programmes. While the use of traditional media had demonstrated both conscious and subconscious instruction during Phase 1, Frank explicitly defines television as a tool for entertainment and not for educational use.

**Interviewer: Do you enjoy watching educational programmes sometimes?**

_Cywelydd: Felly ydych chi yn mwynhau gwylio ambell i raglen sydd falle yn addysgiadol_

**George: NO**

_George: NA_

**Marlene: I used to...**

_Marlene: Odda ni yn..._

()  

**Frank: No, I watch telly for enjoyment. Books are for learning.**

_Frank: Na watchad telly i fwynhau, llyfra’i ddysgu._

Extract 12: Group 3, Phase 2

Despite this reduction in use by teachers, one notable finding from the Phase 2 results was the increased understanding by the children of both conscious learning, through the use of specific educational (media) content and subconscious learning, through the use of non-education specific (media) content. Their understanding of how Welsh-language media promoted and supported language learning became far more sophisticated during Phase 2. During Phase 1 discussions, the focus of conscious learning had been on the connection between language acquisition and media use from a child’s perspective, whereby the participants saw Welsh-language media as an
educational recourse used predominantly by children at school or at home, placing its value in relation to their own use. This child-orientated view of the educational value of media demonstrated Durkin’s notion of self-understanding and the development of egocentrism (Durkin, 1995: 512-513), whereby coherence of self-representation (by the child) is still in its developmental stages. According to Durkin, the transition from primary to secondary schools marks a significant shift in the way a child perceives self and others. Physical changes brought on by puberty along with social and structural differences of primary and secondary education all play significant roles in the development of ‘reflective abilities’ (Durkin, 1995: 513). For example, Howe (2011) notes how primary education is far more ‘child-centred’, allowing children the ‘opportunity to grow and develop in their own way’ (Howe, 2011: 6), compared with the subject-centred approach to secondary school education.

When comparing the responses given during Phase 1 and Phase 2, there was a marked difference in the way in which the educational benefits of Welsh-language media were discussed. During Phase 1, the educational benefits of media use for language acquisition had predominantly focused on younger children. Among other things, S4C was seen by many as a means of helping younger children ‘to improve their Welsh’ (Catherine, Group 2, Phase 1, Extract 3). The most notable difference between Phase 1 and Phase 2 responses to the educational benefits of media use for language acquisition was the increased understanding of the benefits for people other than young children. The responses given during Phase 2 appeared far more reflective, with Welsh-language media seen as a general maintenance tool for supporting a variety of [Welsh]-language learners. When discussing Welsh-language learners with Group 3 (urban Gwynedd), George noted how some learners were ‘scared of speaking [Welsh]’ (Ma rhai’n ofn siarad). This demonstrated an increased awareness of others. When asked whether Welsh-language programmes could help give confidence to learners, Marlene explained how programmes, such as *Cariad @ Iaith*[^61], had real educational value for second language learners. The very nature of this programme is centred on Welsh-language learning, its

[^61]: *Cariad@Iaith* is a Welsh-language programme produced by Fflic for S4C that follows a group of celebrities undertaking an intensive Welsh-language course over the duration of a week.
inclusive nature has a broad appeal, attracting viewers with mixed language abilities, from fluent Welsh-language speakers to Welsh-language learners. Previously, the programme had followed members of the public over a period of six weeks whilst they embarked on a Welsh-language course at Nant Gwrtheyrn Welsh Language Teaching Centre. However, since the programme was reformatted in 2004, it has developed into a weeklong live series that adopts the popular celebrity, reality-style format. The success of the series and its benefits in encouraging Welsh-language learning amongst adults has since been recognised by the Welsh Assembly Government which sponsored the 2015 series, which aired in June (Cariad@Iaith, S4C). In addition to building confidence, Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) also explained how media use encouraged vocabulary development amongst learners.

Stuart: There are lots of English people who try and learn Welsh

Stuart: Ma na lot o bobl Saesneg yn trio dysgu Cymraeg

Non: The people who live next door to me have moved to live in Wales and they’re learning.../ they speak better then me [laugh]

Non: Ma’ pobl drws nesa i fi mawr wedi symud i fyw yng Nghymru a ma’ nhw’n dysgu../a ma’ nhw’n siarad gwell na fi [laugh]

() Interviewer: Do you think S4C plays a part in helping learners?

Cyfwelydd: Ydych chi’n meddwl bod S4C wedyn yn chwarae rôl?

Marlene: Yes

Marlene: Ia

Joanna: Yes

Joanna: Yndi

Frank: Yeah because, because people who learn Welsh have a better vocabulary than us.

Frank: Yndy achos. Ma’, achos ma’ pobl sy’n dysgu Cymraeg ’efo vocabulary lot gwell na ni

Extract 13: Group 3, Phase 2
This increased awareness of the benefits of using Welsh-language media to aid language development was also evident amongst other groups. Groups 1 (rural Gwynedd), 2 (Wrexham) and 4 (Torfaen) all made reference to the use of media in aiding younger children's linguistic development. As with the results from Phase 1, when asked what the children saw as the main purpose of S4C, both Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 4 (Torfaen) explained how the channel's primary role was to help children learn Welsh (see Extract 14 and 15).

**Hywel: For kids**

*Hywel: I plant*

**Multiple voices: Yeah kids**

*Amryw o leisiau: Ie plant*

**Morgan: To help them learn Welsh**

*Morgan: Iddyn nhw dysgu Cymraeg*

Extract 14: Group 1, Phase 2

**Angharad: To help little kids learn**

*Angharad: I helpu plant bach dysgu*

**Helen: Yeah to help little kids who go to Welsh schools**

*Helen: Ie i helpu plant bach sydd yn mynd i ysgolion Cymraeg*

Extract 15: Group 4, Phase 2

Angharad and Helen (Group 4) both reiterate the views expressed by Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) but Helen was far more specific in her response. For Helen, the value was placed on those attending Welsh-language schools, children like themselves. As previously noted, all the children from Group 4 (Torfaen) came
from non-Welsh speaking households. They also represented the primary school with the least amount of children attending from Welsh-speaking homes in the study (99% attending from non-Welsh speaking homes). The significance of this response echoed a similar response given by Jen (Group 2 – Wrexham) during Phase 1. Despite having discussed the use of Welsh-language programmes in the promotion of Welsh-language learning during Phase 1 with Group 4, no direct reference had been made to the use of media in developing their own language skills. The response by Helen (Group 4 – Torfaen, Phase 2) indicated an increased ability to reflect on her experience of media to develop [potentially] her own language skills, something that had not been as prominent during Phase 1 discussions.

This notion of self-reflectiveness in terms of how media can aid younger children was also evident in Group 2 (Wrexham); again a group were the majority came from non-Welsh speaking households. Neil explained how Welsh-language programmes provide a means of encouraging young children to learn a little Welsh prior to starting Welsh-medium education, or as Gareth noted, to give them a ‘head start’ (Extract 42).

**Neil:** I think that, the main point of it is/ either for kids who go to Welsh schools, and before they start they can learn a bit...before they start

*Neil: Dwi’n meddwl, lot o’r pwynt o fo ydy/ unai plant sydd yn mynd i ysgolion Cymraeg, a cyn i nhw cychwyn ma nhw’n gallu dysgu dipyn... cyn i nhw cychwyn*

**Gareth:** Like a head start

*Gareth: Fel head start*

Extract 16: Group 2, Phase 2

While the setting for Welsh-language media content had changed from the classroom to the home, the value had remained constant. The children during
Phase 2 also displayed an understanding of how education was not simply restricted to the classroom, especially when considering language acquisition.

4.3 Welsh-Language Media as a Nation-Building Tool

This section focuses on the relevance participants placed on the formation and sustainment of the Welsh-language broadcaster S4C, and how knowledge of, and engagement with the service might shape national consciousness. According to Talfan Davies, Welsh-language media represents more than simply a television station. Its iconic status has helped to shape the identity of the Welsh nation through instilling a distinct set of values, namely intrinsic, public and institutional (Talfan Davies cited in House of Commons Welsh Affairs Committee: S4C, 2011). An aim of this research were to better understand the significance young bilinguals place on Welsh-language media and whether it shapes their own national consciousness.

This section looks at the way in which media can explicitly and implicitly influence feelings of national consciousness through knowledge and engagement with Welsh-language media. Explicit knowledge was identified through tangible...
references to the minority-language maintenance campaign in Wales and specific displays of knowledge relating to the development of minority-language media. Displays of implicit knowledge focused on Welsh-language media as a tangible category of Welshness, a unique element of cultural heritage that shaped national consciousness and what it meant to be Welsh through, for example, the broadcasting of national events. This section draws on the ‘one dimensional’ categorisation of the nation by preadolescence as noted by Scourfield et al. (2006: 101). These two situations are explored below, looking firstly at the responses during Phase 1 followed by cross-referencing with Phase 2 findings to map continuities and change.

In terms of this investigation, the way in which explicit knowledge was measured focused on references to significant events that helped to shape the Welsh-language media movement, and the way in which these events evoked feelings of national pride or consciousness. During Phase 1 the two groups that expressed the most explicit knowledge were Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 3 (urban Gwynedd), articulating a historic understanding of the importance placed on Welsh-language media from a cultural and political standpoint.

Looking firstly at Group 3 (urban Gwynedd), Stuart explained how his understanding of the formation of S4C was based on a programme he had watched on the history of Welsh-language broadcasting. He drew specific attention to the threatened hunger strike by the former president of Plaid Cymru, Gwynfor Evans in 1980 (cf. Sorens, 2005).

**Interviewer: What is the purpose of S4C in your opinion?**

*Cyfwelydd: Beth yw pwrpas S4C yn eich barn chi?*

**Stuart: Before/ I think there was only an hour of Welsh programmes on the television, until this man did something// I can't remember his name/ and he didn't eat for a fortnight/ to get the S4C programme**
Stuart: o'r blaen / dwi'n meddwl taw dim ond awr o raglenni Cymraeg oedd ar y teledu, tan bod y dyn yma'n gwneud rhywbeth// dwi ddim yn cofio ei enw fo/ a nath o ddim bwyta am bythefnos...i gal rhaglen S4C

Interviewer: How did you learn about that?

Cyfwelydd: Sut nes di ddysgu am hwnna?

Stuart: I saw a programme about it on S4C

Stuart: Nes i wylio rhaglen ar S4C

Interviewer: Have you all heard of this – Gwynfor Evans who went on hunger strike for S4C?

Cyfwelydd: Ydych chi i gyd wedi clywed am hwnna - Gwynfor Evans wnaeth gwneud hunger strike er mwyn S4C?

George: How?// like protesting?

George: Sut?// fatha protestio?

Interviewer: He was an...

Cyfwelydd: Roedd e'n...

Stuart: =MP

Stuart: =MP

Interviewer: Yes, that's right. In Westminster

Cyfwelydd: Ie, na fe. Yn San Steffan

Stuart: =Member of Parliament

Stuart: =Member of Parliament

Extract 17: Group 3, Phase 1

This programme represented a tangible reference point for Stuart’s knowledge, a cultural resource that anchored this national narrative. When discussing identity, it is impossible to ignore the importance of agency. Stuart’s response to how this knowledge and understanding had made him feel, demonstrated his individual sense of national consciousness, allowing him to position himself in relation to the programme.
Interviewer: How did this make you feel about S4C? Did it make you feel any different?

Cyfwelydd: Sut nath hwn neud i ti deimlo am S4C? Oedd e’n gwneud i ti deimlo’n wahanol?

Stuart: It made me want to watch it more

Stuart: Nath o neud i fi isio watsiad fo mwy.

Extract 18: Group 3, Phase 1

This understanding of the evolution of Welsh-language broadcast media displayed by some of the children from Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) was also echoed during Phase 1 of the research with Group 1 (rural Gwynedd). This time, the trigger-questions were; ‘What is your opinion of Welsh (language) programmes?’ What do you prefer: Welsh or English? Or do you simply like the fact that you can chose?’ (‘beth yw eich barn ar rhaglenni Cymraeg? Beth sy’n well gennych chi? Cymraeg neu Saesneg neu ydych chi’n licio’r ffaith eich bod chi’n gallu dewis?’ Interviewer: Group 1, Phase 1). The first response to this question came from Robert and Catrin:

Robert: =Catrin’s Dad went to jail for five days for fighting to get S4C

Robert: =Ddaru Dad Catrin fynd i’r jêl am bump diwrnod am ei fod o’n ffeitio i gael S4C.

Interviewer: So Catrin, do you watch a lot of S4C in your house?

Cyfwelydd: Felly (to Catrin) ydych chi’n gwylio lot o S4C yn eich tŷ chi?

Catrin: No we watch a lot of Simpsons in our house,/ it’s Dad that watches S4C

Catrin: Na da ni’n gwylio lot o Simpsons yn tŷ ni, /Dad sy’n gwylio S4C

Extract 19: Group 1, Phase 1
Catrin’s response arguably signals something about the way in which S4C is often pigeonholed as appealing to particular audiences, which is often considered one of S4C’s fundamental problems. Despite Catrin’s family ties to language activism, she did not share her father’s passion for the Welsh-language service. In this instance, it was not Catrin who made reference to her father’s protest, but Robert, who seemed impressed through his eagerness to share this information. The children from Group 1 were part of a small close-knit community in rural Gwynedd. The revelation that Catrin's father had spent 5 days in jail for nationalist protest did not invoke feelings of surprise in the children and the majority treated it in a very matter-of-fact way, thus normalising language activism.

Despite Catrin’s early dismissal of watching Welsh-language programmes, she later expressed very strong opinions on the use of English subtitles in Welsh-language programmes. In this instance, it was not the inclusion of English-language subtitles that concerned the group, but the lack of Welsh-language subtitles for English-language programmes. The differences between the apparent statuses of the two languages had clearly sparked feelings of inequality about how the media are delivered in English and Welsh. This later developed into a discussion about nationalistic hostility.

**Hywel:** Why can’t English people do Welsh writing on the bottom, we do it for them...

*Hywel:* Pam ellith pobl Saesneg ddim neud 'sgwenni Gymraeg ar y gwaelod, da ni’n neud iddyn nhw...

**Robert:** They don’t do it for us...

*Robert:* dydyn nhw ddim yn neud o iddyn ni...

**Catrin:** They don’t respect Welsh

*Catrin:* Dydan nhw ddim yn respectio Cymraeg

**Robert:** We respect them= well apart from the English, but they don’t respect us at all, if the English respected us, then I’d respect them, but they don’t= do they?
Robert: Da ni’n respectio nhw= heb law Saeson de, ond dydan nhw ddim yn respectio ni o gwbl, tasa’r Saeson yn respectio ni, swn i’n eu respectio nhw, ond dydyn nhw ddim yn= nac’ dyn?

Extract 20: Group 1, Phase 1

The response by some members of the group towards English people could be directed at or centred on the discussion of Welsh-language media, with feelings of ‘nationalism in action’ clearly at play. The repeated use of the word ‘respect’, and subsequently ‘disrespect’, was striking in the children’s talk. Whether this is an example of the children mirroring adult-speak or expressing their own views is unclear, given that neither parents nor teachers were included in the data-gathering process. While the children may have been reiterating familiar nationalistic tropes about ‘disrespect’ and ‘difference’, the way in which they compared the lack of Welsh-language subtitles versus the English-language equivalent, suggested an alternative take on their understanding of language rights and fairness. Their understanding and attitudes towards the Welsh language were at odds with media policy; specifically S4C’s public service broadcast remit. Similar notions of fairness or perceptions of unfairness were also voiced by the children from Group 3 (urban Gwynedd). As with Group 1 (rural Gwynedd), Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) were concerned about media unfairness towards the Welsh-language. Geographically, Gwynedd is an area with a much higher concentration of Welsh speakers, where arguably a different value system exists in terms of linguistic makeup compared with the other three areas represented within this study.

During Phase 1, Group 3 (like those in Group 1) were frustrated by the lack of Welsh-language media facilities. Extract 21, below, looks at points raised by Stuart and Non (Group 3). They were both frustrated by the lack of Welsh-language channels, especially in comparison to the number of English-language channels. Despite the significant changes seen to the media landscape over the past ten years, it is important to remember that the children involved in this investigation were from a generation that had experienced pre-digital broadcast media, a time when one out of the five channels on terrestrial television in Wales
was in Welsh. The digital switchover took place in Wales between 2009 and 2010. The first Phase of this research commenced in 2012, only two years after the switchover. Whether or not the children fully remembered this time, the presence of Welsh language on television has been significantly diluted, arguably effecting media navigation by audiences. Both Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) highlighted an underlying theme relating to language and cultural division, specifically the situation of Wales and/or Welsh in relation to the rest of the UK.

**Stuart:** There’s only one Welsh channel – there are loads of English ones but just one Welsh one....

**Stuart:** Dim ond un sianel Cymraeg sydd yna - ma cymaint o rai Saesneg a jyst un Cymraeg...

**Non:** I feel like, why are there so many English ones, but only one Welsh one

**Non:** Dwî’n teimlo fatha pam bo cymaint o rai Saesneg, ond dim ond un Gymraeg

Extract 21: Group 3, Phase 1

Both Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) provided explicit examples of media as a nation-building tool through their awareness of the historical struggle the Welsh-language maintenance campaign has experienced. There was a clear connection that drew on historic and personal accounts of the struggle and the maintenance of the minority-language broadcasting campaign in Wales. The discussions evoked feelings of pride and inequality amongst some group members based on national identity and the role that the media played in maintaining it.

While explicit knowledge referred to an understanding of historical developments in the minority-language maintenance movement with specific reference to media, implicit knowledge focused on the way in which Welsh-language media offered a tangible category of Welshness. According to Scourfield *et al.* (2006: 101), the nation often emerges as a ‘one dimensional category’
during middle childhood, ‘marked exclusively by reference to language and
sport’ and, for the most part, this statement is upheld in the context of this
investigation. Scourfield et al. (2006: 101) explain how, during middle childhood,
there is little said about ‘what people do’ or ‘how they look’ in, for example,
Wales, in terms of defining children’s perceptions of Welshness. However, Group
2 (Wrexham) challenged this theory, suggesting that Welsh-language media in
fact provided a means by which Welshness could be affirmed through the
provision of Welsh-language jobs for Welsh-language speakers.

Despite the majority of children from Group 2 admitting to not engaging with
much Welsh-language media, when asked to imagine a world without S4C the
responses revealed how Welsh-language media were seen as a tool for affirming
national consciousness. As noted, these children came from an area where the
number of Welsh speakers was significantly lower than the other areas included
in this study (11% when compared with the national average of 19.8%). The
core research question linked to this project was locating the role that the media
played in mediating or maintaining notions of (national) identity. For the
children from Group 2, the meaningfulness of Welsh-language broadcasting was
seemingly more detached from their own national consciousness and linguistic
identities. A number of the children explained how terminating the Welsh-
language service (S4C) would not directly affect them but it would have an effect
on others, such as younger children, those who use Welsh more than English in
their day-to-day lives and those who seek Welsh-language employment. The
response by Jen provided an additional layer to the connection that exists
between Welsh-language media and national consciousness:

**Jen: It wouldn’t affect me if there were no S4C, but it would affect the
people that work on it because it gives Welsh people a chance to
have a job…a job speaking Welsh**

_Jen: Bydde fe ddim yn effeithio fi os base ddim S4C, ond bydde fe’n effeithio pobl sy’n
gweithio arno fo oherwydd mae’n rhoi siawns i bobl Cymraeg i gael job...job yn siarad
Cymraeg_

Extract 22: Group 2, Phase 1
For Jen, S4C represented a clear connection between the Welsh language and an industry or career path for Welsh speakers. Continuing with this theme of language and career opportunities, the children were asked if they had considered a career in a Welsh-speaking environment. Hanna was the first to answer, replying ‘it depends’ (‘mae’n dibynnu’ - Hanna, Group 2, Phase 1). The somewhat diplomatic response once again reflected the feeling that these children sit on the peripheral fringes of the Welsh-language community (both geographically and socio-linguistically). Responding to Hanna’s comment, Neil continued the discussion of employment by referring to the Welsh-language (in terms of education and career prospects), and noted that ‘it’s a good education too if you’re looking for a job’ (‘mae’n education da hefyd os ydych chi yn cynnig am swydd...’, Neil Group 2, Phase 1). In both Jen and Neil’s responses there was a clear connection between the Welsh language and future notions of active citizenship. When considering that all but one of the children from Group 2 come from non-Welsh-speaking homes, it highlights the possible extent to which these children were exposed to socio-economic projections from parents and teachers, which shaped (to varying degrees) their sense of linguistic identity. Arguably these responses echoed adult-speak, whereby the importance of Welsh-language ability was deemed to have an economic value. When asked what kind of Welsh-speaking jobs might be available to them, Neil replied ‘actor’ followed by Jen, replying ‘teacher’. The perception therefore of the Welsh language, or more specifically being a Welsh-language speaker, held a degree of socio-economic status for the children. Looking once again at Scourfield et al. (2006) who claim that little is said about ‘what people do’ in terms of defining national identity, Neil and Jen’s comments demonstrate the connection between Welsh-language speakers and professions (including jobs within the media).

Another implicit example of how Welsh-language media represented a tool for nation building was through the broadcast of national events such as the Urdd Eisteddfod, an important event in the calendar of most Welsh-language schools in Wales. In order to understand the significance of agency in the discussion of childhood and geographical identities, it is far more important to recognise how
children interpret representations of the nation in cultural settings (such as the media) and apply it to their understanding of self. There is a strong connection that exists between the broadcasting of significant national events and the shared social activity of watching television. Drawing on Messenger Davies’s (ibid) work on cultural identity, the coverage of the Urdd Eisteddfod is a clear example of the political ideology behind the drive to preserve indigenous television production for children through the broadcast of national events. The Urdd Eisteddfod is arguably a doubly-powerful example in the context of this study, because it is the ‘children’s Eisteddfod’.

Earlier data analysis through both the descriptive and interpretative coding process indicated that there was a strong consensus that the purpose of the channel was to act as a means of ‘keeping the people of Wales Welsh’ (‘Mae’n cadw pobl Cymru’n Cymraeg’, Hywel, Group 1, Phase 1). Though there was no clear explanation of how S4C managed to maintain this Welshness, the coverage of cultural events such as the Eisteddfod was arguably evidence of this. This was echoed in the discussion with both Group 2 (Wrexham) and Group 4 (Torfaen) regarding S4C’s coverage of the Urdd Eisteddfod during Phase 1. Schools compete in a number of events, from singing and dancing to recitation. During the week-long event, S4C’s schedule is altered with live broadcasts directly from the grounds of the Eisteddfod and coverage of certain events being broadcast live. In addition to this, individual school achievements (from the main stage) are available online, so that it is easy to locate and (re)-watch your own/school performances. During the discussion with Group 2 (Wrexham), Owen noted how coverage of the Eisteddfod was not available on other channels such as ITV (see Extract 14).

**Owen:** Also the Eisteddfod was on S4C but it wasn’t on ITV...

*Owen:* Hefyd roedd yr Eisteddfod ar S4C, ond doedd e ddim ar ITV...

[...] so you could see your school compete...

[...] so roeddech chi’n gallu gwyliau eich ysgrif chi’n cystadlu...
Hanna: You can get it on your iPad//you can see who came third, second or first/and you can see repeats of the people who took part...

Extract 23: Group 2, Phase 1

The significance of this statement was not only linked to the exclusivity of this coverage, but also what the coverage of the Urdd Eisteddfod meant to the children. Both Hanna (Group 2 - Wrexham) and Helen (Group 4 - Torfaen) noted how it facilitated the act of peer-spotting, and how the inclusion of their own school in such a national event promoted a sense of cultural belonging.

Helen: Umm not now but when I was younger I'd go on websites to see things like our school on the Eisteddfod and things.

Interviewer: Did you watch the Eisteddfod on the television at all?

Becca: I watched it sometimes

Extract 24: Group 4, Phase 1

While the responses given by the children from Group 2 (Wrexham) and Group 4 (Torfaen) during Phase 1 did not refer to the historical development of the channel, national consciousness was displayed through various ways in which
the Welsh-language media represent unique cultural aspects of Welshness. Despite this, Group 4 appeared non-committal, indicating that the significance of the coverage was no longer as important as it may have been when they were younger. Helen’s comment seemingly indicates a sense that one grows out of doing such things, discussing the subject matter from a third-order position (Boxer, 2003: 2). Buckingham (2004) refers to a similar type of response pattern when discussing media violence and horror films with children. They spoke of the effect on other children, and distanced themselves from any influence or impact. Arguably, this is a method of rationalising information, thoughts and opinions, without needing (or being able) to own them.

4.3.1 Phase 2 Findings: A Comparative Study Mapping Continuities and Change in Relation to Welsh-Language Media as a Nation-Building Tool

During the Phase 1 discussions with the groups, the knowledge some of the children had in regards to the historical events which lead to the formulation of the Welsh-language television service S4C was quite extensive. Their understanding was based on both personal accounts (whereby family or community members had been involved in activism and protest), and learned accounts based on information from school, home or via television programmes. The majority of explicit knowledge was displayed by the children from Groups 1 (rural Gwynedd) and 3 (urban Gwynedd), with very little evidence to support this kind of explicit knowledge by the other three groups. Due to the much higher levels of L1 Welsh-speakers and active users of the service in the communities of these two groups, these responses were unsurprising. It was also unsurprising that during the Phase 2 discussions references to prominent characters in the Welsh-language media campaign such as the MP, Gwynfor Evans, were once again revisited, reaffirming their knowledge and understanding (Stuart, Group 3: Extract 43).
Stuart: Yeah...there was this man/ I can't remember his name / he starved himself

Stuart: ia... nath dyn yma/ dwi’im yn cofio enw fo /nath o lwgu hun

Interviewer: I remember you mentioning that last year

Cyfwelydd: Dwi’n cofio ti’n sôn am hwn llynedd

Stuart: Yeah I think that helped...and I think that there are too many English ones and we need more Welsh ones

Stuart: ia a dwi’n meddwl bo hynna’n helpu... a ma’ na gormod o rhai Saesneg a da ni angan rhai Cymraeg

Interviewer: So do you think that there is a need for Welsh programmes?

Cyfwelydd: Ydych chi’n meddwl fod yna bwrpas i raglenni Cymraeg felly?

Multiple voices: Yes

Amryw o leisiau: Oes

Frank: Because there is only one Welsh channel and there are millions of English ones...

Frank: Achos un channel Cymraeg sydd a ma’ na millions o rhai Saesneg...

Marlene: It would be better if there were more Welsh ones and fewer English ones/

Marlene: Se’n well os sa’ mwy o rhai Cymraeg a llai o rhai Saesneg/

Extract 25: Group 3, Phase 2

In terms of this research, repetition was one of the most obvious ways of mapping continuity, through reaffirming and strengthening views and opinions shared during Phase 1. While reference was made once again to the political activism of Evans, the significance of Stuart’s response during this discussion was the way in which he applied his knowledge to the wider issues. While displaying knowledge had been the focus during Phase 1, Stuart’s comments during Phase 2 were used to highlight the need for a much more extensive
Welsh-language service, a view shared by a number of his peers within the group.

In addition to a shift in the way in which explicit knowledge was utilised during Phase 2, the findings also revealed an increased awareness amongst L2 Welsh-speakers of the historical evolution of Welsh-language media. While groups 1 to 4 represented polar opposites in terms of linguistic make-up, Group 5 (Cardiff) had a mix of both L1 and L2 Welsh-speakers, along with a number of children who came from homes where parents had previously learned, or actively learning to speak Welsh. Bryn, for example, noted how, despite not speaking Welsh at home, his parents had learnt Welsh. Perhaps as a result of his parents’ interest in learning Welsh, or possibly as a result of knowledge learnt at school, Bryn made specific reference to the developments that had occurred in Welsh-language broadcasting since the 1970s (Extract 26). Based on these assumptions, Bryn’s knowledge of the developments in Welsh-language broadcasting could be attributed to his parents Welsh-language acquisition. This would suggest that, as with the personal accounts listed by Groups 1 (Robert’s account of Catrin’s father’s political activism), the importance placed on this historical evolution of Welsh-language media only became significant when there was a personal connection made to it.

**Bryn:** Welsh programmes are relatively new/ because //I think like the 70s they actually started it, so Mum and Dad had to watch English programmes/ then they started making the same programmes in Welsh, because there weren’t really Welsh things when they were younger.

*Extract 26: Group 5, Phase 2*
The most notable shift in responses during Phase 1 and Phase 2 in terms of explicit knowledge was the connections made to personal accounts of affiliations to the historic evolution of Welsh-language media amongst L2 Welsh-speakers.

As with an increased awareness of explicit knowledge during Phase 2 discussions, there were also clear developments in relation to implicit knowledge. The significance of using media as a means of defining Welshness was an important element of this research, yet a number of the children found defining these characteristics difficult. While similar responses were given during Phase 1 and Phase 2, defining features of what Welsh-language media represented were articulated much clearer during Phase 2, demonstrating how developments in the articulation and understanding of identity develop during the transition. For example, looking at responses given by Group 2 (Wrexham), Barrie explains how S4C shows that there ‘is’ Welsh, with Owen defining the service as a ‘community’ (Extract 27). The service provides an outlet by which the Welsh-language community is present and subsequently recognised. Despite this positive affirmation of the service’s community perception, the reality was that a significant number of the children included in this investigation did not necessarily feel part of this community. Barrie’s comment ‘I don’t actually like anything on it like/ but I like the fact that it’s there’ (dwi ddim yn hoffi dim byd arno fo ond fel/ fi’n hoffi’r ffaith bod e ‘na) demonstrates how he did not feel the service provided addressed his own personal needs as a Welsh-speaking viewer.

**Interviewer: What would happen if S4C ended tomorrow?**

*Cyfwelydd: Beth fyddai’n digwydd pe tai S4C yn gorffen fory?*

.  

**Interviewer: Would you feel sad at all?**

*Cyfwelydd: Fydde chi’n teimlo’n drist?*

**Barrie: Um yeah../ well it shows that there is Welsh...**

*Barrie: umm ie well, mae’n dangos bod Cymraeg...*

**Interviewer: Do you feel any affinity towards S4C?**

*Cyfwelydd: Ydydch chi’n teimlo unrhwy affinedd tuag at S4C unrhwy affinity tuag at S4C?*
Multiple voices: YEAH

Amryw o leisiau: IE

Owen: Yeah/ it's like a community/ and it helps people learn

Owen: Ie/ mae fel community yna/ a mae'n helpu dysgu

Barrie: =That's what I feel, I don't actually like anything on it like/
but I like the fact that it's there

Barrie: =Dyna be dwi'n teimlo fel, dwi ddim yn hoffi dim byd arno fo ond fel/ fi'n hoffi'r ffaith bod e 'na

Extract 27: Group 2, Phase 2

Similarly, when discussing the purpose of S4C with Group 5 (Cardiff), ideas of Welshness and pride were connected to the service. The service in this instance provided a tangible and positive example of something explicitly Welsh.

Interviewer: Okay, so what is the purpose of S4C in your opinion?

Cyfwelydd: Felly Beth yw pwrpas S4C yn eich barn chi?

( )

( )

Bryn: To be proud of being Welsh

Bryn: Bod yn browd o siarad Cymraeg

Extract 28: Group 5, Phase 2

Secondly, there was a real sense of identity linked to the channel, which was expressed through the need to keep both English and Welsh language content separate. While code-switching is often commonplace amongst bilingual communities, the conscious use of Wenglish or Cofi was not viewed favourably by the children. During the Phase 2 session with Group 3 (urban Gwynedd), the children were asked whether they would like to see Welsh-language content appear on English-language channels. This question was not part of the focus
group schedule but was asked as a result of a directional change in the discussion. As the focus of the discussion had been Welsh-language content, the question was directed accordingly. The children were asked whether they would like to see Welsh-language content on English-language channels, as opposed to asking whether they would like to see English-language content on Welsh-language channels, a situation that was, until fairly recently the reality62.

**Interviewer:** Would you like to see Welsh-[language] stuff on English-[language] channels?

_Cyfwelydd:_ A fydde chi’n hoffi gwylio stwff Cymraeg as sianeli Saesneg?

_Non:_ No

_Non:_ Na

(...)

_Marlene:_ No I wouldn’t watch// they need to be kept separate

_Marlene:_ Na se ni’m yn watchad// ma isho cadw nhw ar wahan

Extract 29: Group 3, Phase 2

This notion of separatism also resonated into other areas of the discussion. Perhaps as a result of the perceived need to keep linguistic content separate, notions of unfairness were voiced. Later in the discussion with Group 3 (urban Gwynedd), Mari and the group expressed their frustrations at the lack of Welsh language channels other than S4C (Extract 30). While many would argue that an enhanced service would undoubtedly be beneficial, financial restraints and more significantly, the recent budgetary cuts have meant that this is simply not viable. Despite the initial plans of maintaining a second channel by the service following the digital switchover, specifically to house children’s programmes as noted in Chapter 2, this simply was not sustainable. Despite the second channel’s failure, the reality remains that increasing the Welsh-language service was important. As

---

62 Prior to the digital switchover in Wales (2009-2010), S4C functioned as a bilingual channel airing content from Channel 4 alongside Welsh-language content.
with the responses given during Phase 1, this topic of linguistic unfairness and representation by the media remained a concern for the children during Phase 2.

The subject of respect, but more specifically the lack of respect shown towards the Welsh-language had been mentioned during a number of discussions by the groups, with responses more prominent amongst the children from Groups 1 (rural Gwynedd) and 3 (urban Gwynedd). The purpose of this question was to determine whether Welsh-language content could co-exist alongside English-language content in an identifiably English-language space. The results indicated that the group favoured linguistic separatism; with both Non and Marlene firmly expressing the need to keep Welsh and English-language media content separate (Extract 46).

Mari: But there is only one Welsh channel, everything else is English

Mari: Ond dim ond un channel sy’yn Gymraeg, ma pob dim arall yn Saesneg

Robert: There’s only one S4C/ and there are thousands of English ones

Robert: Dim ond un S4C sy’n a ma na filoedd o rhai Saesneg

Extract 30: Group 1, Phase 2

While underrepresentation in the media was a concern for a number of the children in Group 3, as with the response given by Barrie from Group 2 (Wrexham), there was also a degree of cultural distancing by some group members. Interestingly, Non, who had previously expressed the need to keep both Welsh-language and English-language content separately, explains how without a Welsh-language service there would be nothing for those who were ‘Welsh-Welsh’. The concern here by Non was that without such a service others would miss out (Extract 49).
Marlene: It would be better if there were more Welsh ones and fewer English ones...

Marlene: Se'n well os sa mwy o rhai Cymraeg a llai o rhai Saesneg...

Non: I never watch the Welsh ones but for someone who's say Welsh-Welsh, then there'd be nothing for them

Non: Dwi byth yn gweld y rhai Cymraeg ond se’ ‘na rhywun yn Cymraeg-Cymraeg se na’m byd yna i nhw

Extract: 31: Group 3, Phase 2

This awareness of others, especially their peers and younger children were apparent during both Phases. Despite the service provided by S4C not answering their entertainment needs, the institutional and public values of the service were understood. However, the authenticity of Welsh-language content came under question by some, drawing on Davies’s third value placed on the service; that of the service's intrinsic value. While a number of children had spoken favourably during both Phases 1 and 2 of certain Welsh-language programmes, for example *Rownd a Rownd* by both Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 3 (urban Gwynedd), the legitimisation of Welsh-language programmes was questioned based on their originality and production value. In terms of where this sits in regards to national consciousness, arguably the quality of Welsh-language content could have an effect on the way in which young audiences regard the standard of Welsh-language programmes available to them. The topic of authenticity and production value became far more apparent during Phase 2 of the investigation, with examples of this evident in two out of the five groups. Looking firstly at a discussion between Owen and Barrie from Group 2 (Wrexham), both boys are in agreement that Welsh-language programmes ‘copy’ English-language programmes, with Owen even offering an example of this. However, the example provided by Owen appears to be based on presumptions, as both *Hip neu Sgip* and *60 Minute Makeover* were launched in 2004 (S4C.com, itv.com). While both of these programmes came about following the successes of DIY and home improvement programmes popular during the 1990s and 2000s, the assumption by Owen was that it was the Welsh-language programme that...
was copying its English-language competition, and not vice-versa. Despite the
cynicism by Owen and Barrie, the reality remains that *Hip neu Sgip* is a bedroom
make-over programme aimed specifically at children while *60 Minute Makeover*
is a home improvement programme made with an adult demographic in mind.
The assumption made by these two was that Welsh-language content lacked
originality.

**Owen: They mostly copy English programmes**

*Owen: Ma nhw yn mostly copio Saesneg*

**Barrie: =Obviously**

*Barrie: =Obviously*

**Owen: Like *Hip neu Sgip* / that's like *60 Minute Makeover***

*Owen: Fel *Hip neu Sgip* / mae fel *60 Minute Makeover***

Extract 32: Group 2, Phase 2

The same cannot be said about the second example provided by Bryn from
Group 5 (Cardiff). In this instance, the programme in question is the children’s
cartoon *SpongeBob Square Pants*. This successful US cartoon first launched in
1999 by Nickelodeon (nick.com), has since been sold in over 171 different
markets and dubbed in 25 languages (Roedy, 2011: 168). In this example, the
question is not authenticity but rather preference and continuity. Cartoons are
made up of three key components: its animation, story and sound. The issue here
is preference, and how animation adaptations are received, especially when
considering bilingual audiences. While animation adaptations are commonplace
in children’s television globally, the introduction of a Welsh-language version to
an audience already familiar with the English-language version can be
problematic, especially if the cartoon is an established household brand like
*SpongeBob SquarePants*. While Bryn admitted showing interest initially in the re-
versioning of his favourite cartoon, this was not the *SpongeBob SquarePants* Bryn
was familiar with.
Bryn: I hate it when they take an English programme and then turn it in to Welsh, because...like when I used to watch SpongeBob I was like, maybe I'll watch the Welsh version, but then it was like ahhh!

(mimicking the Welsh voice of SpongeBob)

Extract 33: Group 5, Phase 2

Finally, the third example provided a far more reflective view of the process of adaptation, content authenticity and preference. Again looking at responses from Group 5 (Cardiff), the topic for discussion here looked at non-animation examples of Welsh and English-language re-versioning. Two examples were provided by the group, firstly the Welsh-language programme Y Llifft, the inspiration for the CBBC quiz show Ludus, and the drama Hinterland/Y Gwyll. The discussion began with Sally explaining how programmes on the Welsh-language preschool and tween services would copy programmes from the English-language services provided by the BBC. When asked whether this was seen as a negative process, the response from Mena was rather tolerant. She did not feel that this was essentially a bad thing, the debate was seemingly liked to the personal preferences of the audience. Unlike the situation with Group 2 (Wrexham), where Owen provided examples of Welsh-language programmes that, in his view, copied existing English-language programmes, the example provided in this discussion were Welsh-language programmes with an English-language version produced simultaneously. The first example of this was Fiction Factory’s Hinterland/Y Gwyll (Extract 52).

63 A Boom Plant production for S4C.
64 A Boom Plant production produced simultaneously in both English and Welsh for CBBC and S4C.
65 A Fiction Factory Production produced simultaneously in both English and Welsh for the BBC (shown on BBC1 Wales and BBC4) and S4C.
Sally: The programmes on things like Cyw and Stwnsh...they copy
English things from CBeebies and CBBC

Sally: Mae rhaglenni fel ar pethau fel Cyw a Stwnsh...mae nhw’n copio pethau o fel CBeebies
a CBBC o’r Saesneg

Interviewer: Do you think that’s a negative thing? Copying English stuff?

Cyfwelydd: Ydych chi’n meddwl bod hwna’n peth gwael? Copio stwff Saesneg?

Mena: It can be

Mena: Mae’n gallu bod

Eluned: They don’t have much...

Eluned: Dyw nhw ddim hefo llawer o...

Mari: It can be because some people prefer watching it in English

Mari: Mae’n gallu bod achos mae rhai pobl yn preferio gwylio fe’n Saesneg

(...)

Mari: But they’ve done Hinterland...

Mari: Ond mae nhw wedi neud y Gwyll...

Interviewer: Yes they filmed that back to back

Cyfwelydd: Ie na fe, nethon nhw ffilmio hwna ochr yn ochr

Multiple voices: Yeah

Amryw o leisiau: Ie

Interviewer: Did you like it?

Cyfwelydd: Oeddech chi’n hoffi hwna?

Mari: Yeah but I liked the Welsh one more

Mari: Ie ond rwy’n hoffi’r un Cymraeg mwy

(...)

Mari: Yeah, because I understand it... But English people would say the other one because they don’t understand Welsh

Mari: Ie, achos fi’n deall e...Ond byse pobl Saesneg yn dweud yr un arall yn lle achos bod nhw ddim yn deall Cymraeg
The significance of this example was not only the language of the programme in question, but also the inherent Welshness of the programme. Set in Ceredigion, *Hinterland* or *Y Gwyll* is an example of a landmark television drama. Filmed back-to-back, the Welsh-language version (*Y Gwyll*) was aired on S4C, with the English-language version (*Hinterland*) aired initially in Wales on BBC 2 Wales and then on BBC 4 nationally following the success within Wales. The characters, voices and landscapes used in this programme are identifiably Welsh, and unlike other Wales-based productions such as *Torchwood* or *Dr Who* (produced for the BBC from Cardiff’s Roath Lock studios), Welshness or the screening of the nation is an inherent aspect the programme. In addition to framing Welshness onscreen, the use of the Welsh language is also a prominent feature in both the Welsh- and English-language versions. In this example, the identity of the programme is clearly marked as Welsh, not only in its location but also in its voice, and according to Mari, the Welsh-language version is favoured. In the same way that Bryn favoured the English-language version of *SpongeBob SquarePants* due to issues of authenticity, the inherent Welshness of this programme perhaps explains why the Welsh-language version appears more popular amongst the group. This would suggest that the intrinsic value of content is bound up with both authenticity and locating these in terms of national consciousness.

Later in the discussion with Group 5 (Cardiff), the topic of authenticity and originality was once again raised. During Phase 1 with Group 1, reference was made to the Welsh-language children’s quiz show *Y Lifft* (Boom Plant for S4C) an interactive quiz that used touch-screen technology, with the group naming *Y Lifft* as one of the Welsh-language programmes familiar to them. This was the UK’s first second-screen ‘play-along game aimed at children’ (Farber, 2012) and was launched on S4C in 2012. Following the success of *Y Lifft*, Boom Plant were
approached by the BBC to co-produce *Ludus*, an ‘interactive fantasy adventure gameshow’ (televisual, 2013) that became the BBC’s first play along gameshow for children aired on CBBC. Drawing on the successful format of *Y Lifft*, *Ludus* was produced both in English for CBBC and in Welsh for S4C by Boom Plant (S4C.com).

During Phase 2 of the discussions, Group 5 once again made reference to the Welsh-language programme *Y Lifft* and the similarities of *Y Lifft* to the English-language programme *Ludus*. Despite the aesthetics of both programmes being very distinct, the format, which allowed audiences at home to play along with the pre-recorded studio show were identical. The group seemed aware of these similarities, with both Sally and Bryn demonstrating knowledge of programme development in relation to the English-language commission *Ludus*.

**Mena: Y Lifft**

*Mena: Y Lifft*

**Interviewer: Y Lifft is it?**

*Cyfwelydd: Y Lifft ife?*

**Bryn: Oh yeah that was.../**

*Bryn: i.e, odd hwnna’n.../**

**Sally: /they’re doing that on CBBC**

*Sally: /Mae nhw wedi neud hwnna ar CBBC*

**Bryn: Yeah Ludus**

*Bryn: Ie Ludus*

**Interviewer: Yes like Ludus/ they are making a Welsh-language Ludus as well**

*Cyfwelydd: Ie na fe Ludus/ ma’ Ludus Cymraeg hefyd yn mynd i ddod mas*

**Bryn: Ludus is weird**

*Bryn: Oo mae Ludus yn weird*
Interviewer: So what do you think of *Y Lifft* and *Ludus*

Cyfwelydd: Beth ydych chi’n meddwl am, *Y Lifft* a *Ludus*

Mari: I think the Welsh one is more popular because I’ve not even heard about the English one

Mari: Fi’n meddwl mae’r un Cymraeg yn fwy poblogaidd achos sai ‘di clywed am yr un Saesneg

Sally: =I think it’s better the original

Sally: =Fi’n meddwl bod e’n well yr un gwreiddiol

Interviewer: Do you think the originals are better then?

Cyfwelydd: Chi’n meddwl bod yr un wreiddiol wastad yn well te?

Multiple voices: Yeah

Amryw o leisiiau: Ie

Bryn: I think/ I don’t like the new one// *The Lifft* was much better, less weird and disturbing

Bryn: Fi’n meddwl/ sai’n hoffi’r un newydd// Roedd *Y Lifft* yn lot well, llai weird ac disturbing

Extract 35: Group 5, Phase 2

Originality played a prominent role in programme preference, and despite the increased budget in the production of *Ludus* in comparison to *Y Lifft*, the new aesthetic, according to Bryn, was both ‘weird and disturbing’.

While in both instances (with reference to *Hinterland* and *Ludus*) the group favoured the original version, the group had begun the discussion by referring to the perception that Welsh-language content lacked originality and authenticity. Similar to the comments made by Group 2 (Wrexham), Welsh-language programmes were accused of copying English-language programmes, drawing into question the intrinsic value, or its perceived value by young audiences. It is important to note that the comments regarding authenticity came from the two
groups where the Welsh-language was not the dominant language of the home (by the majority) or the wider community. The assumption in both instances, despite Group 5 demonstrating knowledge of Welsh-language programme originality, was that Welsh-language programmes were more often than not ‘copying’ English-language counterparts. To some extent, through diminishing the value of Welsh-language content, and subsequently things associated with Welsh, Welsh (in this instance Welsh-language content) appeared somewhat inferior to English-language (content).

4.4 Summary

The most significant change in terms of the relationship between Welsh-language media and education during Phase 1 and Phase 2 was the use of Welsh-language content as a resource for language acquisition by schools. While a number of primary schools involved had actively utilised the (then) recent (2013) change in policy allowing S4C’s on-demand content to be used by schools, there was very little evidence to support the continued use of Welsh-language television content by secondary schools. In fact, both Groups 4 (Torfaen) and 5 (Cardiff) specifically noted how the use of Welsh-language television programmes during lessons had been a specific feature of primary school, as evident in Extracts 8 and 9. This shift in media use drew specific attention to the institutional changes confronted by the children as they progressed from primary to secondary school, a notable change that highlights Howe’s (2011) theories of transitional changes experienced by preadolescents.

Whilst evidence to support the use of Welsh-language media for language acquisition through both conscious and subconscious learning had been presented during Phase 1, Phase 2 findings demonstrated how the children’s understanding had become more sophisticated in relation to how media is and can be used. Responses had also become far for self-reflecting, demonstrating how the children saw media use for language acquisition in terms of their own linguistic development.
The children in this investigation demonstrated what Talfan Davies (2011) refers to as the three distinct ideals of S4C, namely public, institutional and intrinsic values with certain elements appearing more prominently than others. The research demonstrated that the most notable value placed on the service by the children was its public value, through the service’s capacity to deliver educational and economic benefits to the people of Wales. To a lesser extent, there was also an element of institutional value whereby S4C represented a means of ‘keeping the people of Wales Welsh’ (Hywel, Group 1, Phase 1). This was discussed in terms of the children’s explicit and implicit knowledge of how Welsh-language media shaped national consciousness. Perhaps the most telling was the lack of intrinsic value the service provided (in terms of what is produced) to this specific target audience.
5 Chapter 5: Interconnections Between Media and Childhood Identities: Findings

5.1 Introduction

Socially-constructed imagery in the mass media and the way in which individuals exist online are two well-established areas of academic interest within the discipline of media studies. This chapter presents the interconnections between media and childhood identities, focusing on three specific themes. Through the process of thematic codification, the (data-focused) themes identified were media engagement and self-representation, access and service and viewing preferences. These three themes are discussed in turn, through detailed discussions of the named sub-categories. In regards to media engagement and self-representation two sub-categories were identified and are subsequently discussed, onscreen participation and/or inclusion, which were categorised in terms of both positive and negative impact, and online use and engagement.

The second data-focused theme, access and service, was subdivided into two categories; shared viewing experience and media othering/ self-othering. This section focuses on how factors such as S4C’s scheduling of tween programmes can impact on the preadolescent audience’s perceptions, subsequent viewing trends, and affiliation with the channel/ Welsh-language media.

The final data-focused theme, viewing preferences, concentrates on perceptions of childhood identities through engagement with child-orientated content. Drawing on responses to Exercise 1 (the individual activity of listing favourite programmes) and Exercise 2 (the collective task of creating an ultimate scheduling board), two sub-categories were identified. Based on responses to Exercise 1 and 2, engagement with both child-orientated content and other content produced with a broader, non-child specific audience in mind, was mapped. This final section draws on these findings, discussing the results in terms of childhood identities through media engagement.
5.2 Media Engagement and Self-Representation

As part of S4C's inclusion remit for children's production, a large proportion of content contains audience participation 'expanding their experience of entertainment and media' (S4C, 2014: 18-19). According to S4C's *Future of Welsh Language Television* report, this is achieved by successful collaborations between schools and production companies. While this is not a unique feature of Welsh-language broadcasting, the proportions of programmes that include children/the audience are far higher than on channels such as CBBC. Of the 24 *Stwnsh* programmes available on S4C's online catch-up service, *Clic*, 14 (58%) include children/audience participation (see Appendix 9.1), compared with 25 out of 100 (25%) programmes available on demand on CBBC’s website (see Appendix 9.2). The inclusion of young audiences onscreen by S4C has been used as a tool for not only encouraging audiences to engage with Welsh-language media, but to also promote what Coupland (2010: 111) refers to as a 'mediated community'.
S4C provides a Welsh-language service for Wales, a nation of 3 million people, of which approximately only 20% (ONS, 2012) are Welsh speakers. This small nation and smaller Welsh-language community within it, supports a population that can be easily drawn upon for content creation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appearance on screen</th>
<th>G1</th>
<th>G2</th>
<th>G3,</th>
<th>G4,</th>
<th>G5,</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>As a Group/ Class</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As Individuals</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh-language Pre-school Programmes (Cyw)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh-language Tween Programmes (Stwnsh)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Welsh-language Programmes</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English-language Programmes</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online Content67</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 22: Onscreen Participation and Appearances

During the descriptive coding process of Phase 1 results, it was revealed that every group involved in this study had participated in some kind of onscreen activities for S4C, either collectively or individually. To illustrate the extent to which the sample children actively participated in Welsh-language programme content, Figure 22 offers a summary of the type of contribution (individually and/or collectively) they made, the language of the programme involved, the

---


67 Online content, in this instance, refers to multiplatform elements included in television content (specifically online games played on live television with the audience).
intended target audience of the programme (pre-school, tween or other), and whether the children’s involvement was via an alternative platform (online contribution). The findings were based on answers given to Question Set 6 of the Focus Group Schedule (Appendix 5) and ‘yes’ responses were marked with an ‘x’ in Figure 22.

The five groups included in this investigation represented a cross-section of the Welsh-speaking preadolescent demographic. What Figure 22 demonstrates is the extent of which children are included in the production process of Welsh-language programmes. In addition to indicating frequency, Figure 22 also shows the variety/degrees of inclusion. The levels of engagement and the capacity in which the children were involved in the production process highlighted two areas in need of discussion, the first in relation to onscreen inclusion (both negative and positive accounts) and the second, online inclusion.

5.2.1 Negative Accounts of Onscreen Inclusion/Participation

During the Phase 1 data-gathering process with Group 2 (Wrexham), the topic of onscreen visibility was raised very early on by the children. As the group had been briefed on the nature of the research prior to my visit, (both by their teacher and the individual letters sent out to the children), the group were eager to reflect on their own experiences of Welsh-language television content, specifically the programmes that they had been involved with. Catherine, one of the more vocally confident members of the group, explained how she and her classmates had recently been on television as part of S4C’s coverage of the Pasiant y Plant68 (Children’s Pageant) at the National Eisteddfod. The group were excited to discuss and recall the experience, but when asked whether they had watched themselves on television when the programme had aired, the responses were quite varied. Catherine noted that ‘I don’t mind doing it as long as I don’t have to watch it’ (Dwi ddim yn meindio ei wneud e ond bod fi ddim yn gorfod gweld o…’) (Catherine, Group2, Phase 1). This was a sentiment shared by a

---

68 Pasiant y Plant (Children’s Pageant) is an annual event that is aired on television as part of the National Eisteddfod week. During the Wrexham National Eisteddfod, the children performed Where Children Sleep by James Mollison.
number of the group members, and many agreed with Catherine’s comment, especially the girls. The experience was somewhat uncomfortable for Catherine, and she explained how ‘the most embarrassing thing about doing the children’s pageant’ had been appearing onscreen wearing her ‘pyjamas’ (Catherine, Group 2, Phase 1), (y peth embrarassing am wneud pasiant y plant oedd taw ein gwisg ni oedd ein pyjamas ni...).

According to Robbins and Parlavecchio, embarrassment is understood to ‘signify the core, essential theme of a self that has been exposed to unwanted attention’ (Robbins and Parlavecchio, 2006: 321). The feeling of embarrassment is understood to establish itself during early childhood, and represents a ‘self-conscious emotion that emerges with the ontogenesis of the self’ (Lewis & Brooks-Gunn, 1979; Lewis, Sullivan, Stranger, & Weiss, 1989, cited in Robbins and Parlavecchio, 2006: 325). Miller defines embarrassment as ‘the acute state of flustered, awkward, abashed chagrin that follows events that increase the threat of unwanted evaluations [negative or positive] from real or imagined audiences’ (2001, cited ibid: 327).

Feelings of embarrassment and a sense of ‘being on show’ (Durkin, 1995: 512) were also experienced by two female participants from Group 5 (Cardiff), who expressed similar reservations about appearing on screen. Again, it was not necessarily the inclusion or participation in the activity that caused embarrassment but rather the fact that it was being filmed.

**Interviewer:** What did you make of the experience? Did you watch the programme afterwards?

*Cyfwelydd:* A beth oeddch chi’n meddw o’r holl brofiad? Nethoch chi wylio’r rhaglen yn ôl?

*Mari:* No. My Dad HATED it because he said it was really, really embarrassing/My Dad doesn’t really like it when I’m on the telly because/when we did Cwis Mwyaf Cymru[^69] (...)  

*Mari:* Na. Ma’ Dad fi’n CASÁU e achos mae’n dweud odd e’n rili rili embarrassing/

[^69]: Cwis Mwyaf Cymru was produced by Boom Plant for S4C.
Mae Dad ddim yn hoffi ‘mod i’n mynd ar y teledu lot achos / pan naethon ni Cwis Mwyaf Cymru (…)

Sally: =It was fun when we were there/ but I haven’t seen it since

Sally: =Roedd e’n real hwyl pan o ni mynd yna/ ond sai di gwylio fe ers hynny.

.

.

.

Mari: I bumped into this man’s arm and it was REALLY embarrassing [laughter], everyone else was in the corner but everyone saw me on the telly

Mari: Roeddwn i wedi rhedeg mewn i fraich dyn ac roedd e’n RILI embarrassing [laughter]. roedd pawb arall mewn cornel ac wedyn roedd pawb ‘di gweld fi ar y teledu.

Sally: I thought the camera had stopped recording so I started talking to Tudur that was really embarrassing [laughter]

Sally: Roeddwn i’n meddwl bod y camera wedi stopio nes i ddechrau siarad â Tudur roedd hwnna’n embarrassing [laughter]

Extract 36: Group 5, Phase 1

For Sally, the embarrassment of talking to Tudur, the young male presenter of the broadcast, was amplified by the fact that it was caught on camera. For Mari, running into the arm of one of the production team was embarrassing, as this was again caught on camera. Both Mari and Sally (as with Catherine – Group 2) specifically used the term ‘embarrassing’ when describing their experiences of onscreen inclusion. However, it is the reference made by Mari to her father’s feelings of embarrassment that is perhaps most telling in this exchange. In this instance, the focus was not predominantly her own self-consciousness but rather feelings of embarrassment projected onto her by others. Subsequently, appearing on S4C was not only about the individual experience of taking part but also about the process by which their appearance would/could be viewed by others (Durkin, 1995).
Despite Mari’s reference to her father’s embarrassment, adults were not the intended audience for the programme in question (\textit{Cwis Mwyaf Cymru}). The format of this programme was based on two teams from different schools competing against each other to win prizes. This was undertaken in front of a large studio audience comprising children from both schools. Viewers at home were also able to compete in additional segments for prizes such as tickets for West End shows and rugby matches. When discussing whether the children had continued to watch the series after the airing of their episode, the predominant response had been “No”. Whilst the possibility of winning prizes was alluring for the viewer, Dave (Group 5) noted how without the peer-spotting element of the show, the comedic value diminished.

\textbf{Dave: You think it’s cool when you’re on the programme but/ yeah because we don’t know them// it’s better when you know them because it’s a lot funnier.}

\textit{Dave: Chi’n meddwl mae’n cool pan rydych chi ar y rhaglen ond/ ie achos ni ddim yn gwybod nhw// mae’n well pan ti’n nabod nhw achos mae lot mwy doniol.}

\textbf{Michael: =and when you know the teachers too...}

\textit{Michael: =A hefyd pan rydych chi’n nabod yr athrawon...} 

\underline{Extract 37: Group 5, Phase 1}

As schools featured heavily in the format of this programme, teachers were also included in some competitions. The children’s responses signalled the importance of a meaningful relationship between the viewer and any onscreen participants in fostering engagement and maintaining interest. While the inclusion of children onscreen is perceived as a means of encouraging Welsh-speaking children to engage in Welsh-language media, the impact of adolescent egocentrism (especially amongst girls) does not seem to be addressed by the producers of children's content.
5.2.2 Positive Accounts of Onscreen Inclusion/Participation

Despite a number of the (specifically) girls in this investigation listing various incidents whereby they felt embarrassed and self-conscious of both watching and taking part in programmes for S4C, this was not a representative view of all the children in this study. Stuart, from Group 3 (urban Gwynedd), appeared far more confident about his inclusion and involvement onscreen.

**Stuart: I was on television last night –**

Stuart: Roeddwn i ar y teledu neithiwr –

**Interviewer: Were you? On what?**

Cyfwelydd: O’ ti? Ar beth?

**Stuart: /The Jaguar programme on Dim Byd70**

Stuart: /rhaglen Jaguar ar Dim Byd

[…] What?

[…] Be’?

**George: The Jaguar thing? What?**

George: Peth Jaguar? Beth?

**Stuart: I had to// Huw from year 7 was my friend but he had to try and hit me…with my friend**

Stuart: o’ ni gorad// roedd Huw blwyddyn 7 yn ffrind i fi ond odd o’n trio hitiad fi...hefo ffrind fi…

**Chris: =my brother was on it too**

Chris: =oedd brawd fi arno fe hefyd.

**Stuart: Yeah he was with…**

Stuart: O Oedd hefo....

---

70 *Dim Byd* is a comedy sketch show originally created for older audiences by Caernarfon-based production company *Cwmni Da*, the series has since won two Welsh BAFTAs for Best Children’s Programme 2012, and Best Music and Entertainment Programme 2014.
**Stuart:** Did you see me?...

**Stuart:** Nes di gweld fi?...

**Chris:** No I didn’t watch it this morning

**Chris:** Na nes i’n gwylio fo bora ‘ma

**Stuart:** Ooo [disappointed]

**Stuart:** Ooo

Extract 38: Group 3, Phase 1

The notable difference between Stuart's account of being onscreen and that of Catherine from Group 2 (Wrexham), and Mari and Sally from Group 5 (Cardiff), was his seeming lack of embarrassment. Unlike the responses given by the girls, Stuart made no reference to any feelings of self-consciousness but proactively sought recognition from his peers. While the children were all eager to relay their experiences of appearing onscreen, perception (either of self or by others) was a notable difference in terms of how the children reacted.

One explanation for Stuart’s confidence could be attributed to the capacity in which he appeared onscreen. Unlike the audience participation of Group 5 (Cardiff), where the children appeared as members of a group or as part of an audience, Stuart’s performance was that of a child actor. In fact, Stuart later noted how he had also auditioned for a number of other productions including voiceovers for both Welsh-language cartoons for S4C and English-language productions for CBBC, ‘I’ve had auditions for/ interviews for doing stuff for CBBC, and I didn’t get those ones, but I’ve done ones for S4C and I got them’, (dwi ‘di cael auditions/ interview neud petha hefo CBBC a dwi ddim ‘di’m di cael rheinai ond dwi ‘di neud rhai i S4C a dwi ‘di cael) (Stuart, Group 3, Phase 1). While Stuart had an acting part, the girls were far more ‘exposed’ by having to perform as themselves.
5.2.3 Phase 2 Findings: A Comparative Study Mapping Continuities and Change in Relation to Both Negative and Positive Accounts of Onscreen Inclusion/Participation.

When the topic of onscreen involvement was revisited during Phase 2, a high proportion of the children were reflecting on past experiences, with no clear evidence to suggest that the children had participated in any additional onscreen performances since being at secondary school. As a result of this, themes relating to embarrassment, self-consciousness and onscreen visibility did not feature as prominently during the group discussions, and the reactions were far more varied. One explanation for this could be the length of time which had passed since their television appearance, meaning that feelings of embarrassment may have passed, or were no longer significant when self-reflecting on the experience. During Phase 1 discussions, there had been a clear gender divide in the responses given to appearing onscreen. In general, the boys had either not discussed the matter in great lengths, or in the instance of Stuart (Group 3 – urban Gwynedd), demonstrated an active and enthusiastic approach to onscreen performances. In contrast, the girls had been far more vocal in expressing their feelings of self-consciousness when reflecting on their onscreen experiences. When revisiting the topic during Phase 2, the only group to reflect in any detail on their onscreen experiences were Group 2 (Wrexham). Unlike the gender divide seen during Phase 1, the responses during Phase 2 were far more evenly split.

Catherine: I was on Pasiant y Plant

Catherine: Dwi ’di bod ar Pasiant y Plant

[ ]

Interviewer: You mentioned that last year. What do you think when you see some of your friends on the television?

Cyfwelydd: Nes disôn am hwnna llynedd. Beth ydych chi’n meddwl am weld rhai o’ch ffrindiau ar y teledu?

(…) I think it’s cool

(…) Dwi’n meddwl bod e’n cool
Multiple voices: =Yeah

Armwy o leisiau: =Ie

Interviewer: Do you want to be on the television?

Cyfnewyd: Ydych chi am fod ar y teledu?

Hanna: YES

Hanna: YDW

Owen & Catherine: NO

Owen & Catherine: NA

Barrie: [to Hanna] Well you want to be on television because you’re a fashionista

Barrie: Ti am fod ar y teledu as mi wyt ti yn fasionista

[laughter]

(·)

Owen: We took part in a programme two years ago/ when we were at primary school

Owen: roedd ni wedi cymryd rhan mewn rhaglen 2 blwyddyn ôl/ yn yr ysgol gynradd

Hanna: At the Eisteddfod every camera I see I walk up to them

Hanna: Yn yr Eisteddfod pob camera dwi'n gweld dwi'n cerdded lan i nhw

(·)

[Laughter]

Gareth: If there is a spot light I’m there

Gareth: os ma na spotlight dwi yna

Extract 39: Group 2, Phase 2

Once again, Catherine was the first person to mention the group’s collective performance onscreen as part of the Pasiant y Plant. When the group were then asked whether they had enjoyed taking part in television broadcasts, Catherine and Owen responded with a firm “No”. While Catherine’s response had remained consistent during both Phases, Owen, who had previously not shown any
reluctance in appearing onscreen (Phase 1), positioned himself alongside Catherine, expressing his hesitancy in appearing onscreen. This was the first example of reluctance voiced by any of the boys in the group in terms of appearing onscreen. In contrast, Hanna’s reaction to the same question had been the first overtly positive response to the notion of appearing onscreen by any of the girls in this group. What made Hanna’s response even more significant was the awareness others had of her enthusiasm and eagerness to appear onscreen, with Barrie referring to her directly as a ‘fashionista’, insinuating that her self-confidence was somewhat evident to her peers. Another interesting element that differentiated Hanna’s response to the others was the capacity in which she discussed her onscreen performance/inclusion. Unlike the group participation in the *Pasion y Plant* production (which had been a production associated to the school), Hanna noted how she would actively approach OB camera crews at the Eisteddfod. This demonstration of agency highlighted her own desires to explore her onscreen identity. Outside broadcasting teams are prominent parts of the coverage of Eisteddfods, often reporting life from the Eisteddfod maes. Subsequently, for Hanna the Eisteddfod offered an additional opportunity to expand her experience of the media. In the same way as Hanna, Gareth also demonstrated strong levels of agency when it came to onscreen appearances.

With the exception of Group 2 (Wrexham), measuring self-consciousness though onscreen visibility was not as easily recognisable during Phase 2 of the research. While self-consciousness linked to onscreen visibility played a central role in Phase 1 discussions, the self-reflective nature of the discussions during Phase 2 presented additional areas of interest linked to the legitimisation of the Welsh-language service aimed at maturing tween audiences. As the majority of children were simply reflecting on experiences of the media gained whilst at primary school, onscreen inclusion became synonymous with primary school activities, and something that was perhaps no longer as relevant to them.

---

71 OB is the acronym for Outside Broadcasting, often used to cover events or news reporting which occurs outside of a studio environment.

72 The maes refers to the main location where the Eisteddfod is being held, see footnote 26 (Chapter 2) for full description.
While S4C’s remit notes how the inclusion of children onscreen aims to expand the child’s experience of entertainment and media (S4C, 2014: 18), this approach is also used to promote the service, especially in areas and communities where there are fewer S4C viewers. Programmes with a large audience appeal (due to the high levels of audience inclusion), for example, *Cwis Mwyaf Cymru* act as powerful marketing tools. From a production perspective, primary schools provide the most logical setting for these kinds of productions, due to their manageable size and institutional structure. However, the results indicated that as opportunities for onscreen involvement and inclusion decreased, the service provided by S4C became less relevant. This was substantiated by evidence from a discussion with Group 5 (Cardiff). When asked whether the group watched Welsh-language content on television, Eluned noted how ‘when I was nine or ten I watched Stwnsh...because I was on it’ (*Pam o fi’n fel naw a deg o fi’n gwylio Stwnsh achos o fi arno fe [laugh]*). Despite no reference being made to self-consciousness or embarrassment, the response suggested that without the allure of being included onscreen, the appeal of S4C was somewhat diminished.

Looking once again at the references made in Chapter 4 to the intrinsic value of S4C, quality and production value was clearly an important element of what made Welsh-language appealing to the children as audience members. While onscreen inclusion has been noted by S4C as a unique element of their production remit, there seemed to be juxtaposition between the experience of taking part and the enjoyment of viewing. When discussing the topic of onscreen appearances with Group 4 (Trofaen), the group made reference to two collective appearances on S4C whilst at primary school. When asked to recall their experiences, few could remember the names of the programmes they had appeared in, and the tone of the discussion was relatively blasé. While the group had appeared on both the tween programme *Stwnsh ar y Ffordd*73 and pre-school programme *Bws Cyw*74, Nia explained how these programmes were ‘not serious ones’ (*ie nid fel serious ones*) (Nia, Group 4, Phase 2). This attitude towards participation in Welsh-language programmes highlighted how, for many, this

73 A Boom Plant production produced for S4C.
74 A Boom Plant production produced for *Cyw* on S4C.
inclusion was seen as common practice, almost a proviso of attending a Welsh-language school.

5.2.4 Online Use and Engagement

Despite social media not featuring heavily within this research, it was impossible to ignore the underlying importance of digital or online identities. The decision not to focus on online profiles such as Facebook or Twitter was primarily based on the age of the children when the research commenced. In order to register for sites such as Facebook, users must be 13-years-of-age or older. Despite this, the significance of online identities cannot be overlooked, as they often represent an extension of one’s self, creating a space for identities to be formed, enhanced and even (re)-invented. Whether using Howe and Strauss’s generation theory, or Livingstone’s (2009) ‘digital generation’ classification, ‘youth make use of the internet as a realm to try out, play with and perform their identities through provisional combinations of images, words and narratives’ (Driver, 2006, cited in Polak, 2006: 178). In acknowledgement of this, Question Set 3 of the Focus Group Schedule (Appendix 5) pursued a line of questioning linked to the children’s engagement with multi-platform media; specifically Welsh-language sites intended to accompany TV programmes.

When asked about onscreen participation during Phase 1, Group 1 was the only group not to collectively appear in an S4C production (see Table 2). While only two members of Group 1 had appeared on a Welsh-language programme, other members of the group had been involved with the interactive segment (Clic Slic) featured on the Saturday morning show Stwnsh Sadwrn. Clic Slic (2012 – 2014) was an interactive quiz played with audience members at home during the live Saturday morning broadcast. Participants were asked to login using their individual Stwnsh profiles and answer a series of questions in the shortest period of time. Each profile set up on the Stwnsh webpage required the user to select and create an avatar. Avatars, according to Sant (2014: 47), are extremely important as they represent the ‘way you appear online’, thereby instantly

---

75 See https://www.facebook.com/help/210644045634222 for further information.
76 A Boom Plant production produced for S4C.
activating the ‘possibility of being someone else’. Users were encouraged to personalise their avatars by choosing hair and skin colour along with additional characteristics and accessories. The top-ten highest scorers competed against each other live during the show for the chance to win a prize. Unlike the enforced involvement with Welsh-language programmes seen in previous examples (group participation), the children taking part in the online activities had chosen to participate. This demonstrated agency versus compulsion and had a significant effect on the way in which the children spoke about their experiences.

In comparison to Catherine’s (Group 2 – Wrexham, Phase 1) response to onscreen involvement, which focused on feelings of self-consciousness, or Nia’s blasé account of appearing on Welsh-language programmes, discussions relating to online involvement (through taking part in Clic Slic) was much more enthusiastic.

Anna: I go on Stwnsh (website) to play Clic Slic-

Anna: Dwî’n mynd ar Stwnsh i chwarae Clic Slic –

Interviewer: Does anyone else play that, Clic Slic?

Cyfwelydd: oes unrhywun arall wedi chwarae hwnna, ClicSlic?

[...] Me

[...] Fi

Interviewer: Do you enjoy it?

Cyfwelydd: Chi’n joio fe?

Anna: =YEAH I was tenth once

Anna: =lE o ni’n degfed unwaith

Bethan: The um, week before last um two weeks before last I was second on that...

Bethan: Yr ym, wythnos cyn dwetha um dau wythnos cyn diwetha roeddwn i’n 2il ar hwnna...

Extract 40: Group 1 Phase 1
Unlike having to be physically visible on screen, both Bethan and Anna (Group 1, rural Gwynedd) were able to participate using their online profiles. While the allure of winning prizes may have been the main appeal for taking part in *Clic Slic*, the anonymity of online profiles as opposed to the onscreen visibility may also have been a factor worth considering. The prize-winning element was not unique to the online involvement, as there were both prizes and other benefits of taking part in a number of the television programmes listed in the previous section (onscreen involvement). However, the nature of their participation (online/onscreen) was determined through the use of a space that is both public and private (Polak 2006: 177). Their online identities allowed for engagement with the programme without exposing their full identity. No reference was made to the real name of the contestant (only to their online profile name), and users were able to manage their own participation in the game, so anonymity arguably played an important part in their willingness to engage.

On two separate occasions during Phase 1, the topic of online gaming featuring avatars was raised. Anna and Bethan from Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) discussed how they would often take part in the competition *Clic Slic*, while Ffion from Group 4 noted how she enjoyed playing games, which allowed you to ‘create your own person’ (*creu person dy hunain* - see Exercise 41). In contrast to television performances, the creation of avatars or games where people and worlds can be created (such as *Minecraft*77) involves increased levels of agency, as it encourages ideas of role-play to some extent.

**Ffion:** I like playing games

*Ffion:* Fi’n hoffi chwarae gemau

**Interviewer:** What kinds of games do you like playing?

*Cyfwelydd:* Pa fath o gemau ti’n hoffi chwarae?

**Ffion:** Like when you can create your own person and...things

---

77 A Sandbox Independent video game, Published by the Swedish company, Mojang.
This notion of role-play perhaps acts as a mask, encouraging creativity, and even fantasy whilst concealing the true identity of the player. In fact, there has been a growing amount of literature focusing on the use of role-play games (RPGs) in the understanding of identity construction in recent years. Due to the growth in popularity of these games, academics such as Waggoner (2009) have begun to draw comparisons between RPGs and identity, Butler’s (1990) work on performing identities, and Friedman’s (1994) performative phenomenon. Citing Friedman, Waggoner (2009: 28) notes how ‘identity is reduced to a mere mask or role to be taken on at will…. The ability to be able to shift from one identity to the next is a performative phenomenon’. He goes on to question whether avatars may in fact represent a new incarnation of this mask, suggesting that ‘role-playing experiences are as significant to identity construction as any other real life experience’ (ibid). It is significant, when looking at the findings of the Phase 1 research, that a number of the children (particularly the girls) found online gaming involving avatars more appealing than appearing on television. As noted in the previous section, onscreen visibility (on Welsh-language programmes) has been a feature of S4C since its creation in 1982. However, as new media continue to evolve, traditional media have begun to encompass multi-platform elements in order to engage with audiences on a variety of levels.

5.2.5 Phase 2 Findings: A Comparative Study Mapping Continuities and Change in Relation to Online Use and Engagement.

Despite not including specific questions relating to social media in the original research design, the developments and increased accessibility to technology has meant that online profiles have become increasingly significant in the lives of preadolescents. Figures from Ofcom’s 2014 media literacy report noted how 20% of 8-11-year-olds had active social networking profiles compared with 71% of 12-15-year-olds (Ofcom, 2014: 81). In line with Ofcom’s report, Phase 2
results indicated a sharp rise in both awareness and use of social networking sites and apps.

While Phase 1 results highlighted how girls were more likely to display signs of self-consciousness when discussing on-screen visibility, they were also more likely to take part in online games where the creation of an online profile or avatar was required. On two separate occasions during Phase 1, the topic of online gaming featuring avatars was raised. Anna and Bethan (Group 1 – rural Gwynedd, Phase 1) made reference to S4C’s Clic Slic, while Ffion (Group 4 – Torfaen, Phase 1) expressed enjoyment in online gaming, which allowed her to ‘create your own person’ (creu person dy hunain - see Exercise 41). In contrast to television performances, the creation of avatars or games where people and worlds can be created (such as Minecraft) involves increased levels of agency, as it encourages ideas of role-play to some extent.

In contrast to this notion of role-play (associated with online gaming), social networking sites encourage ‘real-play’ (Sant, 2014, 48-49), where people can create ‘versions of themselves’ (ibid), representations of how they want others to view them. Ofcom’s latest report on Media Use and Attitudes notes how girls aged between 12 and 15 are more likely to have Instagram (42% vs 30%), SnapChat (33% vs 20%) and Tumblr (11% vs 3%) accounts than boys of the same age (Ofcom, 2014: 6). In line with Ofcom’s figure, the research indicated that social media sites and apps had grown in popularity and significance following the transition from primary to secondary school, especially amongst girls.

As the only all-female group in this study, Group 4 (Torfaen) provided an interesting case when looking at the changing attitudes towards role-play and real-play during the transitional phase. The most prominent discussion that focused specifically on social media during Phase 2 was recorded with Group 4. As girls mature (generally) at a faster rate than boys both physically and mentally (cf. Durkin 1995), issues of self-image could be seen as a driving factor in the increased interest by the group to be more involved with social media. The age restrictions placed on sites such as Facebook represent a barrier facing
children during this transitional phase. None of the girls from Group 4 had (or at least admitted to having) Instagram or Facebook profiles during Phase 1 of the research. However, during Phase 2 of the research, the girls were happy to discuss their participation in this online world of social networks. Extract 42 lists the responses given to an earlier question asking if the girls were social media users:

**Nia: Yeah and Instagram**

*Nia: le a Instagram*

**Helen: Well, I don’t yet**

*Helen: Well fì ddim eto*

**Meleri: Snapchat**

*Meleri: Snapchat*

**Helen: Not yet**

*Helen: Dim eto*

**Meleri: Yeah Snapchat a Instagram**

*Meleri: le snapchat a Instagram*

**Helen: I can’t yet but I will soon**

*Helen: Dwi methu eto ond bydd fi yn soon*

Extract 42: Group 4, Phase 2

While a number of the group already had access to apps and sites such as Instagram and SnapChat, for Helen, the promise of an online profile was aspirational, an almost rite-of-passage into secondary school life. The restrictions placed on Helen by, presumably, her parents represent a clear indicator of the process of peer/parental dependencies as highlighted by Durkin (1995: 525). Helen’s remark that she ‘can’t yet’ [access Instagram], but ‘will soon’ demonstrates what Durkin describes as a shift in parental dependencies. As children mature, the preadolescent’s relationship with his or her parents
changes, while the role of peers becoming increasingly significant (Durkin 1995: 525), highlighted in this instance by the importance placed on cultural context. While the other girls listed a number of social networking sites, Helen repeatedly stated that she was not yet part of this online community. Looking again at the ‘constructive’ and ‘interpretive’ (James and Prout 1997: 8) theories of childhood introduced in Chapter 2, the use of online profiles can be seen as an example of what James and Prout refer to as the ‘active in the construction of their own social lives’ (ibid).

The advances in new media technologies during the twenty-first century have transformed the home into a ‘site of multimedia culture’ (Livingstone, 2002: 1), influencing both perceptions of self and others through engagement with media on a variety of platforms. The affordability of media devices means that more and more children have access to, and ownership of, multiple media devices. Ofcom figures (2014) noted how 65% of children aged between 12 and 15 had their own smartphones with the biggest rise in uptake from non-smart phone to smart phone occurring amongst children aged 11 (Ofcom, 2014: 5-6). For the majority of children under the age of 18 in the UK today, technology plays an important part in their daily lives and routines, reinforcing and shaping their own ideas of self. Livingstone (2002) explains how the increased ‘personal ownership of media’ during early teenage years is ‘part and parcel of the development of identity’ (Livingstone, 2002: 153), and can represent both the tangible (media devices) and the intangible (the occupation of cyberspace through online gaming and social media) ownership of media.
5.3 Access and Service.

As discussed in Chapter 2, in relation to this research, ‘othering’ (Johnson et al., 2004: 257) refers to the classification of difference, a process by which a group or individual is identified as being different from the mainstream (ibid). In terms of this research, media othering reflected the perceptions that Welsh-language broadcast media better served others. Firstly, through looking at the shared viewing experience, this section will shed light on the difficulties facing children from non-Welsh speaking backgrounds in terms of their media engagement. Secondly, the notion that S4C better serves younger children is discussed with specific reference to the changes made to the schedule since the funding reforms announced in 2010.

5.3.1 Shared Viewing Experience

The availability of portable devices, such as laptops and tablets with the capacity to connect to the Internet, means that individuals are able to watch television in a place and time that suits them. The shared viewing experience of households
coming together to watch a television programme has been altered in recent years due to the shifting media landscape and emphasis on multi-platform media (Gibson et al., 2013: 132). While there is still a demand for family viewing, (especially on weekends with shows such as X Factor and Strictly Come Dancing, increased access to digital media and the capabilities of hand-held portable devices has led to a shift in emphasis from the collective to the individual, highlighting how personal relationships with media have altered over time.

The focus of this section was to better understand the significance of the shared viewing experience in relation to the children’s engagement with Welsh-language broadcast media. This notion of shared viewing with parents is a topic discussed at length by Lemish (2007: 24), who explains how the viewing of television by parents with their children can often be seen as a desirable activity. Parents are able to aid their children in the understanding of both television as a medium, and its content (Messenger Davies, 1989).

More than half of the children in this study came from non-Welsh-speaking homes (22 out of 43). As a result, a number of the children explained how their engagement with Welsh-language content was limited, in part, due to Welsh not being the dominant language of the home. Becca, for example, noted how she ‘couldn’t watch’ Welsh-language programmes (at home) because her parents ‘didn’t speak Welsh’ (Group 4, Phase 1).

Corsaro (1997, cited in Livingston, 2001: 38) explains how the social activity of watching television negotiates ‘access to, and the meanings of, shared space, time, and resources’ consequently ‘negotiating identities, relationships and domestic power’. Whether limited engagement with Welsh-language content was down to a lack of interest in the content available, or the unfamiliarity of watching Welsh content in an English-speaking home environment, there was a notable consideration given to the non-Welsh speaker, in this instance, Becca’s parents. In these instances, the imperatives of everyday family life appeared to be far more important to the child than language use or media content.

---

78 A SYCOtv production produced for iTV.
79 A BBC production produced for the BBC.
In addition to the shared viewing experience between parent and child, the significance of the shared viewing experience between siblings was also an important element in need of further investigation. Considering that over half of the children involved in this research came from non-Welsh speaking homes, siblings were often the only other family members able to speak Welsh in the home. Understanding whether this influenced their experience of Welsh-language media was an area of specific interest.

The Phase 1 finding in relation to shared television viewing with siblings indicated that this collective activity was not necessarily a common occurrence, especially in relation to Welsh-language content. When discussing Stwnsh with Group 4 (Torfaen) both Angharad and Helen noted how they did not watch the service but their siblings did; ‘I don’t watch it but my little sister does’ (fi ddim yn gwylio fe ond chwaer bach fi yn) (Angharad, Group 4, Phase 1). A similar situation was noted with the children from Group 5 (Cardiff), with Dave describing a similar experience when discussing Cyw; ‘I haven’t really seen much/ {Cyw} only sometimes when my brother watches it’ (fi ddim really wedi gweld lot / dim ond weithiau pan mae brawd fi’n gwylio fe) (Dave, Group 5, Phase 1).

The shared viewing experience, or lack thereof, with siblings was not restricted to discussion relating to Welsh-language content, Lois from Group 4 (Torfaen) explained how she would often watch television alone, while her sister watched ‘in the other room’ (a chwaer fi yn yr ystafell arall).

5.3.2 Phase 2 Findings: A Comparative Study Mapping Continuities and Change in Relation to Shared Viewing Experience.

When revisiting the topic of shared viewing experiences and Welsh-language programmes, the most notable difference between Phase 1 and Phase 2 responses was the reference made to the overall activity. Very few examples of shared viewing experiences were noted during Phase 1, especially in relation to siblings. The focus had been predominantly on the parent/child-shared experience, with results revealing that communal viewing trends tended to occur between parents and children as opposed to with siblings. While some reference was made to various programmes watched by siblings, for example, Angharad’s
(Group 4 – Torfaen) reference to Stwnsh, there was little to indicate that these programmes were viewed collectively. In contrast, the number of instances of collective viewing amongst siblings was significantly higher during Phase 2 of the data-gathering process. Extract 43 demonstrates how both Bryn, Mari and, to a lesser extent, Eluned, all actively participate in shared viewing with siblings in relation to Welsh-language programmes.

**Interviewer:** Do some of you watch Welsh-language programmes at home?

*Cyfwelydd:* Oes rhai ohonoch yn gwylio rhaglenni Cymraeg?

**Mari:** Not really

*Mari:* Dim rili

**Bryn:** Well/ I do because by my brother does //but I don’t know the names of them

*Bryn:* Wel/ fi yn oherwydd mae brawd fi yn // ond sai’n gwybod rhaglens

**Eluned:** My sister does=

*Eluned:* Fy chwaer fi=

**Mari:** =I never watch television on my own/ my little sister is usually with me and she doesn’t want to watch Welsh things

*Mari:* =Sai byth yn gwylio teledu ar ben fy hun/ mae chwaer bach fi usually gyda fi a dyw hi ddim eisiau gwylio pethau Cymraeg

Extract 43: Group 5, Phase 2

Despite the question not being explicitly about shared viewing experiences (the opening question in this instance was based on general viewing of Welsh-language content), Bryn explains how his engagement with Welsh-language content is dependent on his younger brother’s desire to watch Welsh-language programmes. In Mari’s case, the opposite is true. Mari explains how she rarely watches television alone and because her younger sister does not like watching Welsh-language programmes, her engagement with the channel was limited.
Referring back to Chapter 4 and the increased amount of content available for pre-schoolers on S4C, it is perhaps unsurprising that so many of the children (especially those from non-Welsh speaking homes) associated Welsh-language content with the linguistic development of younger children, as this became a reference point for their own experience of the service.

In addition to the evidence to suggest that the shared viewing experience (in terms of Welsh-language content) with (younger) siblings increased following the transition phase, there was some evidence to suggest that child/parent shared viewing became less significant as the children matured. When discussing Welsh-language content with Group 4 (Trofaen), Angharad explained how her mother would often watch Cyw with her younger sister, (mae Mam fi yn gyflanio Cyw achos chwaer bach fi). In cases where there were younger siblings, the shared viewing experience seemed to shift from parent/child to sibling/younger sibling. As the children mature, their role within the family also changes, perhaps indicating an increased level of responsibility placed upon them in terms of supervising/caring for younger siblings.

### 5.3.3 Media Othering

As noted in previous chapters, 2010 saw the DCMS announce that S4C would face a 24.4% cut to its £102m annual budget over a period of 4 years (Welsh Affairs Committee: S4C, 2011). It was also announced that the BBC would be taking over from the DCMS as the main funding body (ibid). Drastic cuts and the employment of a new chief executive led to major internal restructuring, and schedule review (S4C press release, 2012). According to the (then) newly-appointed chief executive, Ian Jones, the revised schedule ‘sought to reflect the diversity of lives and communities in Wales’ (Jones, 2012). However, Jones notes how ‘not all aspects of the new schedule were well received’ (ibid.). One of the biggest and most significant changes made was to the provision of children’s programming on the channel. The revised schedule saw pre-school programmes (Cyw) increased to fill both morning and afternoon slots, encroaching on the tween slot Stwnsh and reducing it by half. Despite additional changes being made to the service, including changes made to the airing of teen drama Rownd a
Rownd\textsuperscript{80}, at the time of conducting Phase 1 research the daily provision of tween programming had reduced from a two-hour slot (4pm-6pm) to a one-hour slot (5.30pm-6.30pm).

Establishing whether the changes to the schedule had directly affected the participants’ engagement with Welsh-language media was important in order to structure the focus group schedules appropriately. As noted in Chapter 4, when discussing media use in language acquisition, there was a general consensus that the channel better served younger viewers. Whether or not this was a direct result of the changes made to the schedule or based on experiences of the service, this avenue of investigation was an area in need of further research.

During both Exercises 1 (the opening question to determine individual programme preferences) and Exercise 2 (collective scheduling board activity), Group 1 had listed a number of Welsh-language programmes (see Appendix 8.1). Subsequently, it was no surprise that a number of these children felt frustrated by the changes that had been made to S4C’s schedule.

\textbf{Carys: They’ve started doing Awr Fawr Cyw…}

\textit{Carys: Ma nhw wedi neud Awr Fawr Cyw…}

\[\text{[...] /I don’t see the point of it}\]

\[\text{[...] /Dwi ddim yn gweld point hwnna}\]

\textbf{Hywel: Cyw’s on from 3/ and then Awr Fawr Cyw’s on…}

\textit{Hywel: Ma Cyw mlaen am 3/ wedyn ma Awr Fawr Cyw wedyn…}

\textbf{Robert: = Yeah Hip neu Sgip’s now on later}

\textit{Robert: = Ma Hip neu Sgip yn hwyraich}

\textbf{Carys: / we have to wait for it.}

\textit{Carys: / Da ni’n aros amdano fo.}

\textsuperscript{80}As noted the allocated time slot has since been altered and \textit{Stwnsh} is now aired between 5pm and 6pm. \textit{Rownd a Rownd} is no longer included in the \textit{Stwnsh} allocated timeslot and is regarded as a teen drama (separate from \textit{Stwnsh} content) aired three times-a-week, taking a break from filming during school holidays.
Robert: They tell us to watch Welsh things, but they put this stuff on...we’re older now =Cyw’s on in the morning, they have Cyw from 3 = and then they have Awr Fawr Cyw / [frustrated] it’s annoying

Robert: Ma’ nhw’n deutha ni i wylio petha Cymraeg ynde, ond ma’ nhw’n rhoi ‘hein...da ni’n hŷn rŵan =Ma’ nhw’n rhoi Cyw yn bora, ma’ nhw’n cael Cyw am 3 o’r gloch, ma’ nhw’n cael Awr fawr Cyw wedyn / ma’n annoying

[...] Yeah, that’s why I watch so much English stuff on the telly

[...] Ie dyna pam dwi’n gwylio cymaint o stwff Saesneg ar y telly

[...]: Yeah, because of the crap stuff

[...]: Ia, achos y petha crap, de.

[...]: And me too

[...]: A fi hefyd.

Hywel: Cyw is on from 7 in the morning until 1.30/ then from 3 o’clock until 4 then 4.30 until 5.30...

Hywel: Ma Cyw on o 7 y bore tan 1.30/ wedyn am 3 o’r gloch tan 4 wedyn 4.30 tan 5.30...

.

.

.

Carys: Little kids get to watch everything

Carys: Ma plant bach yn cael watchad pob peth

Extract 44: Group 1, Phase 1

Frustrated by these alterations, a number of the group felt that the decrease in schedule time for tween programming, coupled with a significant increase in pre-school programming, indicated that the broadcaster favoured younger audiences. These feelings of othering were also voiced by Carys, who noted how ‘little kids get to watch everything’ (Ma plant bach yn cael watchad pob peth). Regardless of the efforts made through government policies and public service broadcasters in Wales, the disappointment felt by these children revealed an
alarming truth about how tween audiences in Wales are underrepresented and serviced by Welsh-language media.

In 2013, a report commissioned by the Welsh Government, BBC and S4C (undertaken by Beaufort Research, 2013), entitled *Exploring Welsh Speakers’ Language Use in their Daily Lives* was published. One of the aims of the report was to produce a comprehensive overview of the whole Welsh-speaking demographic, including children. At first glance the inclusion of children, both in the research and in relation to content specific findings appears quite proportional. However, on closer inspection there appears to be major flaws in the research relating to children and young people. Media engagement was a prominent feature in this report as a means of measuring language use through media engagement. Despite a number of references made to the preschool brand, *Cyw*, there was no reference made to the tween brand, *Stwnsh*. It is disappointing that no reference was made in the aforementioned report to the service provided to tween/teen audiences and even more surprising that the opinions of young audiences were excluded from the report. Information gathered on children aged between 0-and-15-years-old was collated based on parents’ responses. Parents taking part in this study were asked whether their children were aged between 0-2-years-old and 3-15-years-old, indicating that very little distinction was made between the varying stages of child development. Arguably this could indicate that discussions relating to ‘children’s television’, were regarded in singular terms, with little acknowledgement given to variations within the age-range. Subsequently the information provided by the Beaufort Report is extremely misleading, as no distinction is made between preschool, tween or teen programming.

While children may not have been directly included in the aforementioned research, the opinions of parents were a prominent feature. One opinion in particular resonated with what Robert had to say about the tween provision by S4C. The Beaufort Report noted how one of the key ‘triggers’ for the promotion of Welsh-language in the home, by parents, was through the encouragement of ‘children to watch Welsh-language children’s TV programmes’ (McAllister *et al.*, 2013: 15). It is rather telling therefore that Robert (Group 1 – rural Gwynedd)
notes how ‘they tell us to watch Welsh things, but they put this stuff on/ we’re older now’ (Ma nhw’n deutha ni i wylio petha Cymraeg ynde, ond ma nhw’n rhoi hein - da ni’n hyn rwan/). While it is not clear who ‘they’ are in Robert’s statement, it captures the frustrations felt by many of the children in the study.

When considering the work of James and Prout (1997), one of the central aims of this research was to highlight the importance of listening to the voice of bilingual children, in order to better understand the way in which they negotiate aspects of their identity through media engagement. Given the drastic changes that were made to S4C’s schedule in recent years, it was not surprising that a number of the children included in this research saw S4C as a channel that better served younger audiences. The frustrations felt by Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) were substantiated by their detailed understanding of the programming schedule, and indicated genuine grievances about the new arrangements. As previously noted, Group 1 represented what could be defined as S4C’s core target audience from within the Welsh-speaking heartlands. However, they were not the only ones voicing concerns in relation to underrepresentation by the channel. Group 2 (Wrexham) also felt that Welsh-language media better served others. When asked to explain the purpose of S4C, one of the most common answer given by the participants echoed the traditional public service broadcasting rhetoric, namely a service to educate and entertain younger audiences.

Extract 45, which was taken for the discussion with Group 2 (Wrexham), draws attention to the channel’s educational focus when looking at children’s content, and is indicative of other common perspectives. Indeed, when looking at the findings published by the Beaufort Report (2013), supporting education was a prominent feature.

**Interviewer:** Okay, I’ve asked you a lot of questions about Welsh (-language) programmes… What do you think S4C would have to do to encourage you to watch Welsh (-language) programmes?

**Cyflwynydd:** Ok dwi wedi gafyn llwyth o gwestiynnau am raglenni Cymraeg, beth ydych chi’n meddwl fydd rhaid i S4C neud i chi wylio rhaglenni Cymraeg?
When asked what could be done to improve the service, it is clear from Angharad’s response that the children felt that the channel needed to do more to entice them to watch Welsh-language programmes. With the exception of Catherine (Group 2), all members from Group 2 (Wrexham) and Group 4 (Torfaen) came from non-Welsh-speaking homes. While these children may have all attended a Welsh-medium primary school, their language ability did not necessarily ‘translate into language use’ (Morrison, 2010, cited in McAllister et al., 2013: 8). Language maintenance campaigners along with the Welsh Government have invested time and resources in better understanding ways of promoting the use of the language outside of the classroom. Despite efforts made to promote the use of Welsh-language media through media engagement, this exercise is arguably pointless if the service does not respond to the specific needs of both L1 and L2 Welsh-speakers.

5.3.4 Phase 2 Findings: A Comparative Study Mapping Continuities and Change in Relation to Media Othering

During the codification process of Phase 1, the most notable feature relating to media othering was the levels of grievances felt amongst some of the children.

---

81 Smot y Ci is the main character in the popular Welsh-language books and cartoon series Anturiaethau Smot (The Adventures of Smot) by Eric Hill.
Mapping the patterns of responses, these grievances were most notably felt amongst L1 Welsh speakers; specifically those from Group 1 and Group 3. When the topic of Cyw and preschool services was revisited during Phase 2 with Group 3, the levels of frustration felt by the group regarding the lack of service provided by S4C for tween/teen audiences remained. However, while these grievances had been voiced during Phase 1, Exercise 46 demonstrates how these frustrations had manifested into action. While a number of the group responded “No” when asked whether they watched S4C regularly, the most telling response came from George, who noted that since Cyw had ‘taken over’, he no longer watched S4C regularly.

Non: There’s too much Cyw

Non: Ma na ormod o Cyw

Joanna: =I don’t watch it

Joanna: =Dwi’im yn watchad o

Non: It’s on all morning until like 5

Non: Mae o drwy’r bora tan fatha 5 o’r gloch

George: =No 6 o’clock until 4

George: =Na 6 o’r gloch tan 4

Marlene: Stwnsh is an hour while Cyw’s on all day

Marlene: Awr ma Stwnsh a Cyw drwy’r dydd de

.

.

.

Interviewer: Do you watch S4C regularly?

Cyfwelydd: Ydych chi’n gwylio S4C yn rheolaidd?

Multiple voices: No

Amryw o leisiau: Na

Marlene: Never
This direct action noted by George was not restricted to Group 3. Sally from Group 5 (Cardiff) also explained how the changes to the schedule had affected the amount of Welsh-language content she viewed. The reduction in hours dedicated to Stwsh had subsequently resulted in her engaging less with the service due to the lack of content suitable for her.

*Sally: I don’t watch it so much anymore / only Stwsh really/ and there’s less and less of Stwsh now and loads of Cyw*

*Sally: Sai’n gwylio fe cymaint rhagor/ dim ond Stwsh rili a ma’ Stwsh wedi mynd yn llai a ma’ loads o Cyw nawr*

*[…] Yeah*

*[…] Ie*

*Bryn: =Yeah it’s on all the time now {with reference to Cyw}*

*Bryn: =Ie mae ar trwy'r amser nawr*

*Eluned: Yeah*

*Eluned: Ie*

*Mena: Yeah and I think that makes people not want to watch S4C*

*Mena: Ie a fi’n meddwl mae hwnna’ n neud pobl ddim eisiau gwylio S4C*
This direct action displayed by George and Sally demonstrates the power of the audience, and the ease in which channels can become obsolete if they no longer provide the service required by the audience. Despite S4C representing more than just a channel (in terms of Talfan Davies’ definition), if the content provided does not entertain or the service provided does not serve its audience, channel loyalties will inevitable waver. Looking again at the work of Lury and the changing media landscape, George’s response perhaps best demonstrates what Lury argues when she states channels are ‘no longer given but chosen’ (Lury, 2002: 25).

5.4 Viewing Preferences

![Figure 19 Classifications of Viewing Preferences (Chapter 3)](image)

This final sub-section discusses the relationship between media and childhood identities by focusing on the child’s viewing preferences. Drawing on the findings from Exercises 1 and 2 (Focus Groups Schedule, Appendix 5), the construction of childhood identities in popular culture is discussed through children’s engagement with television. Lewis (1990, cited in Durkin 1995: 290) explains how ‘achieving identity’ requires the acquisition of a set of beliefs ‘about the self’, and is a developmental process linked to the socialisation of human beings.
Markus and Nurius (1984: 151) explain how, during middle childhood, significant developments occur in the understanding of self where increasing differentiations are made between ‘what is “me” from what is “not me”. This section explores self-concept in relation to childhood through media preferences, looking specifically at both child-orientated content and content produced with a broader, non-child specific audience in mind.

In order to analyse the findings, the data first had to be coded. Programmes listed during Exercises 1 and 2 were recorded (see Appendices 8.1-8.5), which were categorised based on the perceived target audience. Five categories were identified and colour-coded, as summarised in Figure 23 below;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Classification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Programmes with no relevance to children and/or with content that was targeted at adults</td>
<td>Adult</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Programmes with a broad appeal but with adult-focused content</td>
<td>Prime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Programmes aimed at teenagers and young adults</td>
<td>Teen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Programmes aired during prime-time slots that had a family appeal.</td>
<td>Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Branded children’s programme</td>
<td>Child</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 23: Classification of Content

In order to minimise any ambiguities surrounding the classifications ‘family’ and ‘teen’, ‘family’ relates to programmes such as *The Simpsons*, whereby there is both a clear child- and adult-appeal to the programme. ‘Teen’ also had an adult/child appeal but was aimed at an older target audience with a strong

\[82\text{ A 20th Century Fox Television production aired on Sky1 and Channel 4 in the UK.}\]
affiliation to the 16-24-year-old bracket. ‘Teen’ programmes often including schools/community colleges as backdrops for storyline development (for example *Rownd a Rownd* and *Hollyoaks*[^83]). Programmes such as *I’m a Celebrity Get Me Out Of Here*[^84] were classed as ‘prime’ due to their prime-time allocation and broad appeal.

Despite outlining the criteria of each category, there were a number of programmes that did not sit neatly within these categories. For example, *Family Guy*[^85], described on BBC iPlayer as a ‘subversive animated comedy’ contains content that is adult in nature and features offensive language. Despite its adult content, its bright yet basic colour pallet and simplified animation aesthetic (Weinstock, 2008: 88), appears childlike. As this programme is broadcast after the 9.00p.m watershed in the UK, *Family Guy* has been categorised as ‘adult’ in this study. *American Dad*[^86] and *South Park*[^87] were also categorised accordingly, based on the same rationale.

### 5.4.1 Engagement with Child-orientated Content and Other Content

Exercise 1 and 2 were designed to create an additional dimension to the research, drawing on creative methodologies to facilitate the data-gathering process (Focus Group Schedule – Appendix 5). Exercise 1 required the children to identify two or three of their favourite programmes. This was undertaken in order to identify the speaker, encourage turn-taking and, more importantly, gain a better understanding of the groups’ programme preferences. Exercise 2 was a group activity to create their ultimate television schedule. The participants could select programmes from an existing list or choose their own viewing suggestions. Using the programme classification outlined in Figure 23, the programmes listed during Exercise 1 and 2 were coded and placed in preferential order (based on the frequency specific programmes were listed).

[^83]: A Lime Pictures production for Channel 4.
[^84]: An ITV production for ITV.
[^85]: 20th Century Fox Television production created by Seth MacFarlane, aired on ITV2 (UK Freeview).
[^86]: 20th Century Fox Television production created by Seth MacFarlane, aired on ITV2 (UK Freeview).
[^87]: An LLC production produced for Comedy Central.
The results from Exercise 1 are listed in Appendix 10.1 (Phase 1) and the results from Exercise 2 listed in Appendix 11.1 (Phase 1). Drawing on these findings, the top-ten most listed programmes from each exercise were collated in order to cross-reference the findings. The aim of this was to ascertain whether there was a marked difference in the individual programme preferences compared with the collective choices made during Exercise 2. The results are listed in Figure 24 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exercise 1</th>
<th>Exercise 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Programme Title</td>
<td>Rank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I'm a Celebrity Get Me Out of Here</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Simpsons</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You've Been Framed</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Take Me Out</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracey Beaker</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Guy</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rownd a Rownd</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Dad</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waterloo Rd</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Bean</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 24 10 Top Ten Most Listed Programmes during Exercise 1 & 2 Phase 1

During Exercise 1 (Phase 1), Groups 1-5 listed forty-nine different programmes. Of the top-ten favourite programmes, 1 was categorised as ‘adult’ 3 were as ‘prime’, 1 as ‘teen’, 3 as ‘family’ and finally 1 as ‘child’. Exercise 2 asked the children to create a collective scheduling board using the template provided. There were 16 time slots available on the board, collectively (Groups 1-5), a total of 38 programmes were selected. This time only three out of the five categories were listed; 3 were categorised as ‘prime’, 6 as ‘family’ and 1 as ‘child’. 
When looking at Figure 24, the first notable feature is that the top-four listed programmes are identical, indicating the appeal of these programmes across the board. Interestingly these four programmes were categorised as either prime or family viewing, with neither a strong child-orientated nor adult-orientated appeal. Looking at the classifications of the results, it is interesting to see that of the five categories available, it is ‘adult’ and ‘teen’ that are missing from the collective choices listed in Exercise 2. One possible explanation for this could be based on the collaborative nature of the exercise. The selections subsequently had to appease the majority. In addition to this, as this was an overview of the entire dataset these choices were indicative of the children’s choices as whole.

The reason for mapping these programme preferences was in order to gain a better understanding of the children’s engagement with television content and how this influenced their perception of self. When discussing the specification of programme appropriateness with the groups, a number of children found differentiating between content regarded as child-orientated or for adult-orientated problematic. This perhaps exemplifies Buckingham’s suggestion of ‘blurred boundaries’ between childhood and adulthood (Buckingham, 2002: 7). Despite the restrictions and guidelines placed on both traditional and new media content through film/game classifications and the 9pm watershed, some programmes often challenge the socially constructed views of childhood and adulthood. According to Buckingham, Hollywood films such as *Big*\(^{88}\) (1988) and *Hook*\(^{89}\) (1991) often represent the nostalgia felt by adults reflecting ideas about childhood that differ from those held by children in today’s society. Inasmuch as age-appropriate classifications are placed on certain films and programmes to protect young audiences, so too the branding of programmes as ‘child-orientated’ can arguably be seen as contributing to the social construction of childhood.

When discussing programme choices with Group 4 (Torfaen) during Phase 1, a sound example was given relating to children’s perceptions of both child-orientated and adult-content, and the difficulties some children have in

---

\(^{88}\) A Gracie Films production.  
\(^{89}\) An Amblin Entertainment production.
differentiating between certain classifications. One example in particular came from Helen, Group 4 (Torfaen) who, when asked about *The Simpsons*, explained how this cartoon was unquestionably a children’s programme. *The Simpsons*, especially in the UK has been orientated around its family appeal, being described as ‘perfect family viewing’ by the BBC on the eve of its launch on BBC1 in 1996 (BBC, 1996). Unlike the overtly adult themes present in cartoons such as *Family Guy*, *American Dad* and *South Park*, *The Simpsons* has adult themes and undertones running throughout whilst retaining an appropriate family feel through its language choices. As a consequence, its adult appeal is a little subtler than perhaps other cartoons of this kind.

Maturation and media tastes vary amongst children, teenagers and young adults. While some approached the task of differentiating between adult-orientated and child-orientated content in a matter of fact way, based, for example on genres (e.g. cartoons for children), others recognised the broader appeal of certain programmes. Joanna (Group 3 – urban Gwynedd), for example, noted how ‘some adults like watching things for children and some children like watching programmes for adults’.

Along with understanding that content can appeal to both younger and older audiences, there was also an aspirational element connected to specific programmes perceived to be for older audiences. *Waterloo Road* featured prominently in the discussion with Group 4 (Torfaen) during Phase 1. Nia made specific reference to the fact that she enjoyed the programme as it had a more mature audience in mind; ‘I like *Waterloo Road* because it’s more for like teenagers’ (*Fi’n hoffi Waterloo Road/ achos mae’n mwy i fel teenagers*) (Nia, Group 4, Phase 1). Interestingly, the only specific reference made to teenage-specific content came from this group, the only all-female group in the study. As previously noted, in general girls mature at a faster rate than boys, and this has been evidenced by the work of Durkin (1995) and many more, in relation physical maturation (in terms of puberty) and emotional maturation (in terms of egotism and self-confidence). Therefore Nia’s preference for content with a more mature audience in mind supports the existing evidence to suggest that girls mature at a faster rate than boys, evident through their media choices.
When thinking of children’s television, it is often easy to categorise the genre into broad viewer groups based on age. Preschool, tween and teen are often regarded as the main categories. However, children do not necessarily view themselves in the same way as society does, creating distinct groups based on varying affiliations.

5.4.2 A Comparative Study Mapping Continuities and Change in Relation to Engagement with both Child-orientated Content and Other Content.

As children develop and aspire to become more adult, it is no great surprise that their attitudes towards children’s media alter. Not only do media tastes become more sophisticated, but engagement with other forms of new media, such as social networking sites increases. This section draws on comparisons between Phase 1 and Phase 2 by looking once again at the results from Exercises 1 and 2. Drawing on comparisons between Phase 1 and Phase 2 results, shifts and changes in the children’s attitudes towards child-specific television content is measured.

Considering the dual-phase approach to this research, (children revisited after a 12 month period), it was not surprising to see that the children’s tastes had matured. Figure 25 lists the responses from Exercise 1 and 2 side by side in order to draw comparisons between the findings. These were then cross-referenced with Phase 1 findings to map any continuities or changes. The first notable similarity is the continued appeal of The Simpsons and I’m a Celebrity Get Me Out Of Here. Again, as with the findings from Phase 1, both these programmes appeared within the top-ten programme choices by Groups 1-5. However, unlike the continuity of programme preference seen during Phase 1, Phase 2 results appeared far more varied, especially in terms of Exercise 2 results (see Figure 25). While ‘teen’ programmes seemed to feature more prominently during the individual exercise, ‘teen’ preferences did not feature in the top-ten programme choices during Exercise 2. Once again Exercise 2 findings appeared to be more focused on ‘family’ and ‘prime’ viewing. Interestingly, not a single children’s
programme made the top-ten list of either Exercise, again demonstrating a natural shift away from child-orientated content on the whole.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exercise 1</th>
<th>Exercise 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Programme Title</td>
<td>Rank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Big Bang Theory</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I’m a Celebrity Get Me Out Of Here</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hollyoaks</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waterloo Rd</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coronation Street</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X Factor</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How I met your Mother</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rownd a Rownd</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastenders</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Simpsons</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 25 Top Ten Most Listed Programmes during Exercise 1 and 2 (Phase 2)

During Phase 1, Exercise 1 (the individual task) 49 different programmes were listed (Appendix 10.1). The results show that fewer programmes were mentioned during Phase 2 of the data gathering process, totalling 41 different programmes (see Appendix 10.2). While this reduction is quite notable, the most telling results are found when the groups are analysed individually. Exercise 1 was participant-led and aimed at encouraging individual choice and agency. Figure 26 lists the number of programmes listed based on individual choices. While this task was designed to act as an ‘icebreaker question/activity, peer dynamics were extremely clear during this exercise. Observations based on group dynamics and peer relations showed in some instances children would select programme choices that mirrored previous examples given by other group
members, perhaps as a way of conforming to peer expectations/norms. While this was evident in every group, it was more prominent is some than in others. On average around 14 different programmes were selected during Exercise 1 (Phase 1), dropping to an average of 12 during Phase 2. Individual choices were often extremely broad, and drew not only form popular television, but also films (such as *Marley and Me*) and music channels (such as *Kerrang*). However, while Group 2 (Wrexham), Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) and Group 5 (Cardiff) appeared to display similar patterns in relation to individual choices, there was a significant drop in the individual choices selected by those from Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 4 (Torfaen) (highlighted in green, Figure 26). Interestingly these were the two groups with the highest proportion of girls, with a 6-to-4 ratio of girls in Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and all (8) members of Group 4 (Torfaen) being girls. In line with earlier findings relating to rates of maturation, these findings strengthen the argument that suggests girls mature at a faster rate to boys, evidenced in this instance through peer group dynamics. As children mature, the significance of peers becomes increasingly more important in the lives of young people (*cf.* Durkin, 1995). Arguably the reduction in individual choices by Group 1 and Group 4 demonstrates a move towards peer group conformity by these predominantly female groups.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exercise 1</th>
<th>Phase 1</th>
<th>Phase 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Group 1</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group 2</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group 3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group 4</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group 5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Programme Selection</td>
<td>14.2</td>
<td>12.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 26 Individual Programme selections, Exercise 1 Findings
Figure 27 shows comparable pie charts of the overall results from Exercise 1 and Exercise 2 during Phase 1 and Phase 2. The findings show that individually the children were less likely to select programmes that were perceived as for children, than during the group exercise (Exercise 2). Whilst this could be attributed in part to the varying number of programmes required to be selected individually (between one and three) and collectively (a total of 16 slots were available on the Scheduling Board); there is evidence to suggest that, individually, participants were more aware of age-appropriate content, along with the reactions certain choices can evoke within peer groups.

Figure 27: Comparable Pie Charts to demonstrate changing programme preferences for Exercises 1 and 2 from Phase 1 to Phase 2.
Looking specifically at Exercise 2, as this presented the collective opinions of the group, when looking specifically at child specific content (as a whole) the results show a significant drop in the number of children’s programmes listed. During Phase 1 21 children’s programmes were listed (see Appendix 12.2). This figure dropped to 12 during Phase 2. This fall in popularity of children’s content is unsurprising, as media tastes change as children develop and mature. However, what is interesting in terms of this research is the operation of group dynamics and decision-making processes used by the children when they decide which television programmes to include in the Scheduling Board. While Figure 28 shows general trends, when looking at the groups separately some differences were noted, which can be attributed to regional variations and gender.

![Graph showing number of selected children's programmes](image)

**Figure 28: Number of Selected children’s programmes During Exercise 2**

Figures 28 compares the number of children’s programmes selected during the Scheduling Board exercise during Phase 1 and Phase 2. The most significant changes appear in Group 2 (Wrexham), Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) and Group 4 (Torfaen) compared with Groups 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 5 (Cardiff). Groups 2, 3 and 4 (in terms of this study) came from small- and medium-sized provincial towns (see Appendix 6), while Group 1 (northwest rural village) and
Group 5 (suburban city) represented opposite ends of the rural/urban landscape in Wales. The number of children’s programmes selected for the Scheduling Board dropped significantly between Phase 1 and Phase 2 for Groups 2, 3 and 4. However, there was little or no change seen in Groups 1 or 5, with both selecting the highest proportion of children’s programmes.

As an illustration of this, Extracts 48 and 49 are two responses given by Bryn and Eluned (Group 5, Cardiff) during Exercise 1. Despite the viewing trends highlighting a degree of increased maturity in programme choices evident by the reduction of children’s content listed and an increase in teen and adult content, a number of children still enjoyed child specific programmes. Bryn (Group 5 – Cardiff), for example, explains that even though *Sponge Bob Square Pants* may be a little 'babyish', it still remains one of his favourite programmes. While the tastes of the children matured during the course of the data-gathering process, age appropriate perceptions did not always match-up to the child’s reality.

While Eluned and Bryn selected specific children’s programmes when asked to list some of their favourite programmes, they both make specific reference to the fact that they are aware that their choices are no longer age-appropriate (or at least in the eyes of their peers):

**Interviewer: And what about you?**

*Cyfwelydd: A be amdano ti?*

**Bryn: Simpsons, ...Duck Quacks don’t Echo... and I know that everyone is going to laugh but SpongeBob SquarePants**

*Bryn: Simpsons, ...Duck Quacks don’t Echo...a dwi’n gwybod mae pawb yn mynd i chwerthin ond SpongeBob SquarePants*

[laughter]

Extract 48: Group 5, Phase 2

**Eluned: Tracey Beaker**
Eluned: Tracey Beaker

Eluned: Yeah (giggle)...it’s my guilty pleasure

Extract 49: Group 5, Phase 2

Both Bryn and Eluned demonstrated a confidence in their selection of children’s content despite knowing the reactions their choices might (and in fact did) invoke. While Tracey Beaker (Eluned’s choice) did not make it on to the final Scheduling Board (Group 5, Phase 2), SpongeBob Square Pants (Bryn’s choice) did, despite the initial ridicule that it was pitched at a younger target audience. This group was not evenly split in terms of gender; there were fewer boys (3) than girls (5). Perhaps the inclusion of Bryn’s ‘childish’ choice (SpongeBob Square Pants) and exclusion of Eluned’s ‘guilty pleasure’ (Tracey Beaker) may have also been influenced by gender dynamics and perceptions of innocence versus nostalgia. Nostalgia and innocence are two terms that are often connected to the study of childhood and children’s media. Again referring back to Buckingham’s work on the ‘blurring of boundaries’ (Buckingham, 2002: 7) between adulthood and childhood in the media, he explains how these films often represent the nostalgia felt by adults and reflect ideas about ‘childhood’ that differ from those held by children themselves.

Arguably Bryn’s acknowledgement that ‘everyone’s going to laugh but...’ (dwi’n gwybod mae pawb yn mynd I chwerthyn ond) indicated his awareness that the programme choice was somewhat childish and/or no longer age-appropriate, but it remained one of his favourite programmes in spite of potential criticism or ridicule from his peers. There was an innocence and vulnerability to the way in which he presented his decision, highlighted by the reaction from the rest of the (predominantly female group). Kincaid (1998: 54, cited in Seaton, 2005: 35) notes how, ‘innocence’ can make you ‘vulnerable’. The group’s decision to allow the programme to be part of the schedule, despite the decision could be seen as
both a diplomatic compromise and an attempt to protect Bryn’s innocence, or even an indication that the other members also enjoyed the programme, but were unwilling to admit it. Eluned’s reference to *Tracey Beaker* being her ‘guilty pleasure’ indicated the changing relationship that she had with her childhood-self as she matured. Eluned displayed signs of nostalgia in her reference to the programme.

### 5.5 Summary

This chapter presented the interconnecting relationships between media identity and childhood identity; three data-focused themes were identified and discussed in turn through a series of subcategories. These subcategories were identified through the process of thematic coding and template analysis. Focusing on Phase 1 results, a template was devised and used to cross-reference Phase 2 results. This created a comparative study in order to map continuities and change following the transition from primary to secondary school.

The first data-focused theme identified was media engagement and self-representation. The focus of this section was onscreen and online inclusion and participation, especially in terms of Welsh-language media engagement. As part of S4C’s inclusion remit, the use of children in the production of Welsh-language content is significantly higher than that seen by English-language broadcasters in the UK. The aim of this section was to assess the impact of this inclusion in the lives of preadolescents, specifically in terms of their identity construction. The results found that onscreen participation often led to increased levels of self-consciousness, especially amongst girls.

The second data-focused theme, access and service focused on the practices and preferences of tween audiences and their engagement with Welsh-language media. This section drew specific attention to ‘othering’ and the perceptions that Welsh-language media better served other target audiences, especially younger children. A large proportion of the children stated how the appeal of the Welsh-language service was drastically reduced due to the amount of preschool-focused content on the channel. Othering and underrepresentation were all listed as
reasons why the appeal of Welsh-language content was not as prominent as English-language content. As children matured, there appeared to be a shift in their patterns of shared viewing experiences, moving away from a child/parent experience towards a sibling-focused dynamic.

The final data-focused theme looked at viewing preferences in relation to a maturing child audience. Specific attention was given to the results of Exercise 1 and 2 of the focus group schedule in order to explore the significance of peer group dynamics in relation to media preferences.
Chapter 6: Interconnections Between Childhood and Linguistic Identities: Findings

6.1 Introduction

The interconnections that exist between varying elements of identity inevitably influence multiple layers of an individual's personality. This chapter explores elements of linguistic identity through focusing on how the social developments that occur during middle childhood can influence and shape language choice and use. Language is an inherent part of an individual's identity, not only as a means of communication but also as something that affects one's view the world.

6.2 Language Use

Figure 20 Classifications of Language Use (Chapter 3)

The final data-focused theme identified through thematic coding focused on language use, drawing on two specific areas of interest, namely linguistic self-confidence through engagement and use and peer group inclusion and exclusion. Drawing on these themes, this chapter explores the relationship between childhood and linguistic identities through language use.
Linguistic self-confidence through engagement and use focuses on the unique relationship between Welsh-media and linguistic identity. For the purpose of this investigation, linguistic self-confidence referred to language confidence based on use and understanding, focusing specifically on Welsh-language media use. Accent variation was highlighted as a key area of interest as it presented a number of challenges affecting both comprehension and the children’s engagement with (Welsh-language) media.

Peer group inclusion and exclusion looks at the significance of peer in relation to language use. This section draws on the complexities of the linguistic landscape of Wales from the perspective of the preadolescent child. Durkin explains how the transition phase between primary and secondary represent one of the defining features of middle childhood. As peer and adult relationships alter, understanding the significance of these changes in terms of language use is presented based on findings relating to peer group dynamics. Two unique situations are presented based on L1 and L2 speakers.

6.2.1 Linguistic Self-confidence Through Engagement and Use

As noted in the focus group schedule (Appendix 5) each session began with the children individually listing a number of their favourite programmes, before undertaking the hands-on task of creating their ultimate schedule (Exercise 2). Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) listed a number of Welsh-language programmes during Exercise 1. One programme, in particular, was extremely popular amongst the group - the Welsh-language teen drama, Rownd a Rownd. When discussing what the group liked about the drama series, Carys explained how one of the biggest appeals was the fact that the characters in the show ‘talk like us here’ (siarad fatha ni fama) (Carys, Group 1, Phase 1). The importance of this statement in relation to regional accents highlights the significance of linguistic identity. It also reaffirms a push by British broadcasters, (specifically publicly-funded broadcasters), over the past decade to increase representations of regional accents. In 2008, the BBC’s then Director General, Mark Thompson,

---

90 A Welsh-language teen drama set in North Wales produced by Rondo Media.
released a statement in response to complaints that there were not enough regional accents represented on BBC television and radio (Martin, 2008). One of the key criticisms facing the BBC was that entire groups of people felt that they were not being represented, with ‘large swathes of the country’ being ignored due to the underrepresentation of some regional accents (ibid). Reflecting this concern, when the tween brand *Stwnsh* was launched by S4C in 2010, eight presenters from various parts of Wales were employed\(^{91}\) to represent the face and voice of tween broadcasting on the channel\(^{92}\). The weekly *Stwnsh* slot on S4C mirrored the BBC format first used in 1985, whereby a live in-vision studio-based presenter was used to link the scheduled children’s programmes (www.thebroomcupboard.co.uk, 2013). These presenters were also used on a number of programmes produced by Boom Plant in varying capacities. The six weekday presenters were evenly split in terms of gender (despite the overall gender split displaying a male gender bias). Of the three female presenters, one came from Swansea, and two from Gwynedd, whilst the three male presenters came from Cardiff, Carmarthenshire and Gwynedd. The two additional weekend presenters (both male) came from Denbighshire and Pembrokeshire. This was a conscious effort made by Boom Plant to adhere to the commitment laid out in their tender agreement with S4C to address the issue of representation and inclusion, ensuring that a range of different Welsh accents would be heard. However, due to the significant cuts made to the funding of the channel, only four of the original six mid-week presenters remained during the data-gathering period (Phase 1 and 2), representing only Gwynedd and Carmarthenshire\(^{93}\).

Despite a diluted mix of accents being retained on the channel, the predominant accent for *tween* content at the time of this investigation was that of the northwest\(^{94}\).

\(^{91}\) Five of these presenters already had established careers in children’s television, and three were newly appointed.

\(^{92}\) Six presenters hosted the weekday live links, with the additional two presenters appearing on Saturday mornings alongside one of the female weekday presenters.

\(^{93}\) From April 2015, *Stwnsh* presenters are no longer used for in-vision studio-based links. They have been replaced by graphics (S4C, 2015).

\(^{94}\) This refers to the linguistic landscape of tween coverage on S4C for the time frame of this study. As noted, from April 2015, the channel restructured its format, and due to further budget cuts, presenter slots were replaced.
While Carys (Group 1, Phase 1) focused on positive reinforcement of Welsh-language content on S4C, and the appeal of hearing similar accents to her own, the majority of comments on accent variation reflected the difficulties in understanding accents that differed from one’s own. When discussing the topic of Welsh-language content, many of the children noted that not being able to understand accent variations was a key factor in choosing not to watch Welsh-language television. Three out of the five groups (Group 2 (Wrexham), Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) and Group 4 (Torfaen)) expressed difficulties in understanding different regional accents, with the main issue being the difference between north and south vernaculars.

Following the Phase 1 focus group session with Group 2 (Wrexham), the head teacher of the school explained that the children’s use of the Welsh language was mainly confined to the classroom or school-based activities. Their exposure to accent variation was therefore more than likely dependant on the vernaculars spoken by teachers and school staff. Group 2 (Wrexham) and Group 4 (Torfaen) had the highest proportion of children from non-Welsh speaking homes, with all-but-one member from Group 2, and all children from Group 4 coming from English-speaking households. Following a discussion regarding S4C’s shortfalls in servicing them as an audience, accent variation was raised as one of the main problems.

Nia: The problem with S4C is the people who make it// they’re all from the north, so we don’t understand it

Interviewer: Do you think that’s true?

Multiple voices: Yeah

Interviewer: So it’s hard for you to understand accents from the north?
Multiple voices: Yeah

Amryw o leisiau: Ie

Angharad: My Mum turns Pobol y Cwm on and she asks me/ “what are they saying” [code-switching] and I don’t really know because they’re all from the north

Angharad: Mae Mam fi’n troi Pobol y Cwm ymlaen ac mae hi’n gofyn/ “what are they saying” a fi ddim yn rili gwybod achos mae nhw i gyd o’r gogledd

Nia: Yeah/ you go to a Welsh school for 8 years and you don’t know what they’re saying

Nia: Ie/ ti’n mynd i ysgol Gymraeg am 8 blynydd a dwyt ti ddim yn deall beth ma’ nhw’n dweud

Multiple voices: Yeah

Amryw o leisiau: Ie

[...]: You have to learn to speak Gog95

[...]: Mae’n rhaid dysgu siarad Gog

Angharad: =They speak too fast

Angharad: =Nhw’n siarad rhy gyflym

Becca: And sometimes their voices are really Welsh, and you’re like/ WHAT!

Becca: A weithiau mae voices nhw’n rili Welsh, a ti’n fel/ WHAT!

Extract 50: Group 4, Phase 1

The tone of this discussion indicated levels of discontent within the group. The lack of understanding was blamed on ‘the people who make it [S4C]’ (Nia, Group 4, Phase 1). Nia’s comment about attending a Welsh school for eight years and

---

Gog’ is the abbreviation of the word Gogledd, meaning North in Welsh. It is often used to refer to someone from north Wales.
still not being able to understand the characters in a Welsh-language soap opera
was extremely telling, and highlighted some of the difficulties facing Welsh L2
speakers. The Welsh language becomes compartmentalised, representing
something that is restricted to the classroom, whilst English is for everything
else, including the home and activities such as viewing television. The perceived
annoynaances with S4C and the children’s apparent problems with understanding
accent variation were perhaps masking a wider issue of language competencies.

Along with accent variation, the formality of the language used by S4C was also
raised when discussing Welsh-language television content. The majority of
children in Groups 1 (rural Gwynedd) and 3 (urban Gwynedd) were Welsh L1
 speakers, and their engagement with S4C was far greater than those from Groups
2 (Wrexham), 4 (Torfaen) and 5 (Cardiff). Despite this, the linguistic variety96
used on certain programmes did cause problems for some in Group 3. Joanna
from Group 3 noted how ‘sometimes…sometimes, I don’t understand the
language’ (weithia…weithia, dwi ddim yn dallt yr iaith…). This statement by
Joanna was particular significant as she herself identified as a Cofi. While Cofi is
recognised as being one of the most notable regional dialects, it may not
necessarily adhere to S4C’s language guidelines in relation to the production of
content for children, which states the Welsh used must be grammatically correct,
with the use of English heavily restricted97 (S4C 2008: 7).

When discussing, with Group 3 (urban Gwynedd), the purpose of S4C, George
explained how the broadcaster taught him new Welsh words (’gallu geiriau
newydd Cymraeg’) (George, Group 3, Phase 1). Joanna agreed with George and
explained how ‘we have to stop talking Cofi..stop saying ia (yeah)...and cos
(because)...’ (’da ni’n gorfod peidio siarad Cofi..peidio deud ia...a cos...’). This is an
important point when discussing minority-language communities, and is one
that is often overlooked when discussing linguistic identities in terms of
minority/majority-language communities. In Chapters 2, the complexities of

---

96 The term linguistic variety refers to the ‘language, dialect (or lect of any sort)’ (Kiesling, 2011, xiv).
97 According to S4C guidelines all content on children’s programmes must be in Welsh, with the
exception of interviews with, for example, celebrities/sports personalities who are non-Welsh
speakers.
categorising language communities were discussed with reference to Ferguson, 1959, Fishman 1967, Garcia, 2009 and Baker, 2011.

What is interesting about the linguistic community of Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) is the recognition of the Cofi dialect. In addition to their Welsh-speaking and English-speaking identities, the children in Group 3 identified themselves as being Cofi. The examples of Cofi terminology given by Joanna ‘ia (yeah)... a cos (because)...’ demonstrated a use of borrowing from English, and even an example of what Fishman highlights as ‘pidginization’ (Fishman, 1967: 52), where ‘languages and varieties formally kept apart come to influence each other phonetically, lexically, semantically and even grammatically’. As an example, the term Wenglish was used when discussing the topic of bilingualism with the group. While this was a term unfamiliar to some, Stuart explained how the Cofi dialect in his opinion was an example of such language amalgamation.

**Frank: What is Wenglish?**

*Frank: Be ydy Wenglish?*

**Interviewer: Someone who speaks Welsh but who uses a lot of English words...**

*Cyfwelydd: Rhywun yn siarad Cymraeg, ond yn defnyddio lot o eiriau Saesneg...*

**Non: Gwilym does that!**

*Non: Ma Gwilym yn union fel yna!*

**Stuart: My Nan is like that...and Cofis too...like do you know about the game like**

*Stuart: Ma Nain fi fel yna... a Cofis hefyd... fel do you know about the gêm s’di*

**[...] Yeah like Cofis**

*[...] ia fel Cofis*

---

98 In this instance Stuart’s response used Welsh/English code-switching to highlight the use of borrowing used in Cofi dialect.
However, while Cofi may in fact borrow words from English, demonstrating Fishman’s theory of ‘transition’ (ibid: 52), it is regarded as one of the most distinctive Welsh regional dialects, and has been celebrated in recent years, especially through the creative arts. The publication of the book ‘Hiwmor y Cofi’ (Cofi Humor) by the Welsh actor Dewi Rhys, and the composer Owain Llwyd’s Cofi Opera99 aired on S4C, are just two examples of how this regional dialect has been culturally celebrated. The Cil Peblig-based charity, Cofis Bach, provides free artistic opportunities (Cofis Bach, 2015) and is linked to one of north Wales’s most underprivileged estates (BBC, 2012), the Ysgubor Goch, in Caernarfon. While the children involved in this study were not from this specific area, the nature of the project was to build enthusiasm and pride amongst young people towards Cofi identity, indicating that it is on the language and identity agenda.

Joanna (Group 3) consciously noted how ‘we have to stop talking Cofi…stop saying ia (yeah)…a cos (because)…’ (‘da ni’n gorfod peidio siarad Cofi…peidio deud ia…a cos...’), indicating the way in which she views the dialect as a ‘lower’ variety of Welsh (cf. Madoc-Jones et al., 2013). The work of Madoc-Jones et al. note how the Cofi dialect is considered a non-standard form of Welsh often associated with the lower classes of Caernarfon (Madoc-Jones et al., 2013: 408). While negative views of Cofi may be deeply rooted in socio-cultural perceptions of language prestige and schooling, S4C’s remit for language correction may also play a part. As previously noted, S4C’s language guidelines state that content for children aged between 10- and 15-years-old must be in Welsh only, and grammatically correct, with the use of English heavily restricted (S4C 2008: 7). In this instance, a situation of diglossia appears between the standardised Welsh used on S4C and the Cofi dialect, a vernacular spoken in day-to-day lives of those within the Cofi community.

The Cofi dialect is unique to the Caernarfon area, however as noted by Stuart in his explanation of Wenglish and Cofi, there is an element of bilingual-code-switching attached to it. The use of code-switching is common practice in bilingual and multilingual communities, but there is often a reluctance to discuss

---

99 Composed by Owain Llwyd, the idea behind the Cofi Opera was to create, produce and perform a unique opera in the Ysgubor Goch estate (BBC, 2014). Professional opera singers worked alongside children and young people associated with the Cofis Bach project.
the validity and authenticity of this practice in the context of minority-language communities, for fear of language dilution (Wei, 2000). The process of code-switching occurred in every focus group session and was evident in a number of the extracts explored in this research. While certain programmes on S4C have been designed with the less proficient speaker in mind, where rules on Welsh-language ‘correctness’ are perhaps relaxed and the inclusion of some English words is tolerated, this does not apply to children’s programming. S4C’s strict guidelines arguably hinder the channel’s appeal. Code-switching was clearly a prevalent feature of the sample children’s Welsh/English bilingual talk. Yet, from a language-planning perspective, the inclusion of code-switching elements in children’s television content is a highly contentious issue. When the term Wenglish was presented to Group 2 (Wrexham) during Phase 1 discussions, it became clear that not all members of the group were familiar with the term. In this instance Catherine provided the group with an explanation of the term in relation to her own view and understanding.

Catherine: *Wenglish is horrible…*

*Catherine: Mae Wenglish yn horrible…*

*Catherine: Some kids, because they don’t know the word in Welsh, they say it in English and then add on ‘i’...or ‘o’ at the end...like ‘fly-o’, ‘relax-io’ and ‘swim-io’*

100 Language planning (LP) is the term used to refer to ‘deliberate efforts to influence the behavior of others with respect to the acquisition, structure, or functional allocation of their language codes’ (Cooper, 1989: 45 cited in Baker, 2011: 49). Traditionally there are three types of LP: corpus planning, referring to the modernization of a language for use in evolving societies (including the creation of new words), status planning, referring to the reallocation of language status within a society, and acquisition planning referring to the government/local authorities drive to increase the status of the language through its use in schools and public office. Baker explains how, in Wales, it is also useful to ‘consider a fourth category: usage or opportunity language planning’ (ibid). This fourth category refers to the promotion of language use in areas such as sport, technology and leisure ‘to foster social networking through Welsh’ (ibid).
According to Catherine, *Wenglish* was used when a person did not ‘know the word in Welsh’, a practice she described as ‘horrible’. Despite Catherine’s clear dislike for *Wenglish*, on two occasions the (English) word ‘horrible’ was used to describe this practice. Neither Catherine nor the rest of the group commented on this, highlighting how ingrained the linguistic practices of code-switching was in their everyday talk.

The conscious and subconscious use of code-switching represents the ways in which the children negotiated their own relationships with language. While English was the dominant language of the community for Group 2 (Wrexham), the Welsh-language was far more dominant within the wider community for Group 3 (urban Gwynedd).

**Stuart:** Everyone speaks like that in Caernarfon, but in Cardiff, there aren’t as many people who speak Welsh. They’re like “where are you going mate”, and I’m like “I’m Welsh actually”

**Stuart:** Ma’ pawb yn siarad fel’na yng Nghaernarfon, ond yng Nghaerdydd, sdin gymaint o bobl yn siarad Gymraeg. Ma’ nhw fath, “where are you going to mate”, a dwi fath “I’m Welsh actually”

**Interviewer:** Do you like the fact that you live here and that Welsh (language) is so important?
Cyfwelydd: Chi’n hoffi hwnna y ffaith bo chi’n byw fan hyn a fod Cymraeg mor bwysig?

George: I thought everybody in Cardiff could speak Welsh...

George: Roeddwn i’n meddwl bod pawb yng Nghaerdydd yn gallu siarad Cymraeg...

Interviewer: No, about 20% - it’s quite low

Cyfwelydd: Na, tua 20% - mae’n really isel.

George: (gasp) 20%!!!WOW

George: (gasp) 20%!!!WOW

Extract 53: Group 3, Phase 1

Unlike Catherine’s subconscious use of code-switching in Extract 52, George’s code-switching in Extract 53 was used for impact. While George (Group 3) expressed surprise at finding out the proportion of Welsh-language speakers in Cardiff was so low, Stuart (Group 3) appeared far more aware of the varying linguistic situations present in Wales. George’s perception of the wider Welsh-language community mirrored that of his own reality, and did not necessarily match that of Welsh-speaking communities outside of his own locality (urban Gwynedd). Stuart’s decision to use English to deliver his comment - ‘I’m Welsh actually’ - expressed a connection between language and place (Extract 53). The conscious decision to code-switch emphasises the connection that he places on both being Welsh and speaking Welsh. This comment suggested that, in Stuart’s eyes, his use of the Welsh-language marked a prominent feature of his own identity and subsequent ‘Welshness’.

6.2.2 Phase 2 Findings: A Comparative Study Mapping Continuities and Change in Relation to Linguistic Self-confidence Through Engagement and Use

The topic of Wenglish was discussed by a number of Groups during Phase 1, for example in relation to Cofi (by Group 3 – urban Gwynedd) and also by Group 2 as an example of diminished linguistic competency. In both instances, Wenglish and Cofi were regarded as being a negative linguistic trait. Joanna explained how she needed to stop ‘talking Cofi’ (Group 3, Phase 1), while Catherine explained
**Wenglish** as the process that used English words in place of Welsh words when the Welsh word was not known. The debate surrounding the authenticity of **Wenglish** was evident in Catherine's explanation of the term. As she represented the only child from a Welsh-speaking home in the group, her dislike for the vernacular may have been a result of reiterating parent-speak. Her response highlighted what can arguably be seen as linguistic prestige bestowed on this particular vernacular. One of the most interesting findings from the Phase 2 sessions came from the discussion with Group 4 (Torfaen). While Catherine (Group 2 – Wrexham) had expressed her dislike for **Wenglish**, Lois explained how **Wenglish** was simply part of her linguistic identity. In a similar vein to Joanna (Group 3, urban Gwynedd), who positioned herself as *Cofi* (based on her dialect), Nia, when expressing her views on S4C, explains how the use of English was simply beyond her control 'I don’t do it on purpose I just do it' (*fi ddim yn neud e ar purpose fi just yn neud e*).

**Nia:** Yeah because S4C is for people who speak Welsh, I don’t just chose to speak English it’s just what I do, I don’t do it on purpose I just do it

*Nia:* *Ie achos mae S4C yn fel i bobl sydd yn siarad Cymraeg, fi ddim just yn dewis siarad Saesneg mae e just yn beth fi’n neud, fi ddim yn neud e ar purpose fi just yn neud e*

**Angharad:** YEAH

**Angharad:** IE

**Lois:** I just speak **Wenglish**, where half the sentence is in Welsh and half is in English

*Lois:* *Fi just yn siarad Wenglish ble mae hanner brawddeg yn Cymraeg a hanner brawddeg yn Saesneg*

**Extract 54:** Group 4, Phase 2

In addition to linguistic prestige, during Phase 1 discussions linguistic self-confidence was also addressed through focusing on accent variation. One of the
main points raised during Phase 1 discussions was the difficulties some had in understanding certain dialects or accents, with the most notable being the difference between the north and the south. Many listed this as the main reason for not engaging with Welsh-language media.

The north/south divide in terms of accent variation had been raised by a number of groups during Phase 1, specifically by the groups with a high number of L2 Welsh-speakers. As Phase 2 findings represented a way of mapping continuities and change, responses in relation to accent variation and comprehension indicated a clear example of continuity, with difficulties in understanding various dialects or accents a prominent topic for discussion during Phase 2.

When looking at Extracts 55 and 56, two situations are presented that appear to contradict one another. While Group 2 (Wrexham) perceived S4C to be a channel that better served southern audiences; Group 5 (Cardiff) felt that the channel was better suited for northern viewers. In both instances, the term language was used to describe a vernacular that differed from their own. As with Dean’s reference to ‘the language of the south’ (*iaith y de*) as opposed to the southern ‘accent’ (*acen*), Dave (Group 5), also uses the word ‘language’ (*iaith*) in place of accent. He explained how when northern words were used he often couldn’t understand what was being said.

*Dean: Well, normally it’s in the language of the South and we don’t understand*

*Dean: A fel arfer mae’n iaith y De a dydyn ni ddim yn deall*

*Multiple voices: Yeah*

*Amryw o leisiau: Ie*

*Interviewer: So you find the language of the south (southern accent) harder to understand?*

*Cyfewlydd: Felly wyt ti’n ffeindio iaith y de yn anodd i’w ddeall?*

*Dean: Yeah*

*Dean: Ie*
Jen: YEAH

Jen: IE

Extract 55: Group 2, Phase 2

Dave: A programme like Atlantis, they should do it in Welsh

Dave: Rhaglen fel Atlantis falle, dyle nhw neud e yn Gymraeg

Sally: Yeah/ Like Google Translate language

Sally: Ie/ Fel Google Translate language

Dave: Yeah, but not with that ODD language [laughter]

Dave: Ie, ond dim hefo iaith OD [laughter]

Dave: No like/ you know when they use northern words/ I don’t understand that

Dave: Na fel/ ti’n gwybod fel pam mae nhw’n defnyddio geiriau y Gogledd/ sai’n deall hwnna

Mari: Like/ we should have different channels, so that one is more north and one is south

Mari: Fel/ dyle ni cael fel gwahanol sianeli so ma un o nhw yn fwy Gogledd a un yn De

Extract 56: Group 5, Phase 2

While dialectical variation can signify the use of different vocabulary, legitimising the use of the word ‘language’ over ‘accent’, the use of the phrase ‘odd language’ (when referring to the northern accent) may also represented something far more distinct. While a different accent or dialect could be seen as a
variation of linguistic identity, a different language represents something far more foreign or alien.

Another group that had explicitly expressed their difficulties in understanding different accents during Phase 1 was Group 4 (Torfaen). Angharad, for example, explained how she would often have difficulties in understanding what actors were saying on the Welsh-language soap *Pobol y Cwm* despite having attended a Welsh-medium school for 8 years (Extract 50). These feelings of frustration felt in their own linguistic ability during Phase 1 highlighted the issue of language use vs language proficiency. As a result of these concerns, it was important to map whether their attitudes had changes over the course of a year. During Phase 2 of the research with Group 4 (Torfaen), there was a marked difference in the way in which the group discussed the topic of accent variation and language correctness. While the group displayed high levels of frustration during Phase 1, the discussion seemed far more balanced and reflective when the topic of accent and understanding was revisited during Phase 2 (Exercise 55).

**Interviewer: Do you think the Welsh [language] you speak differs from that spoken on the television?**

*Cyfweolydd: Ydych chi'n meddwl bod y Gymraeg chi'n siarad yn wahanol i'r Gymraeg sy'n cael ei siarad ar y teledu?*

**Angharad: It's different because the accents are different**

*Angharad: Mae'n gwahanol achos mae acenion gwahanol*

**Meleri: Yeah because they speak Welsh all the time/ and we only speak it at school**

*Meleri: Ie achos mae nhw yn siarad Cymraeg trwy'r amser/ a ni dim ond yn siarad e yn yr ysgol*

**Angharad: Yeah sometimes it's like/ you just don't understand them because they are going really fast in a different accent.**

*Angharad: Ie weithiau mae fel/ ti just ddim yn deall nhw achos mae nhw yn mynd yn rili gloi mewn acen gwahanol*

[...] **Yeah in a different way**
The tone of the discussion was far less fraught and no specific reference was made to a specific accent variation (for example, that of the northwest). While the group still found understanding various (Welsh) accents and dialects difficult, partly due to the speed with which people spoke (specifically on S4C), the group appeared far less frustration when the topic was raised during Phase 2 discussions. The emphasis was, instead, placed on variation as opposed to conformity; ‘the accents are different’ (Mae’n gwahanol achos mae acenion gwahanol) (Angharad Phase 2) compared with ‘you have to learn to speak Gog (Mae’n rhaid dysgu siarad Gog) (Nia Phase 1).

Lack of exposure to accent variations can be an issue for minority language communities, especially in terms of language acquisition by children whose parents have little or no proficiency in that language. One of the reasons for choosing the primary school attended by Group 4 (Torfaen) was the exceptionally high percentage (99%) of children who came from non-Welsh speaking homes (see Appendix 6). The secondary school attended by the Group had a different linguistic landscape, with around 15% coming from Welsh-speaking homes (see Appendix 6). Exposure to new peer groups with different relationships to the language may provide an explanation for these changing attitudes towards accent variation. In addition to this, the secondary school was much larger in size with far more teachers speaking a greater variety of accents than those involved in this research.

One of the key issues with any minority language maintenance campaign is effective status planning (cf. Wright, 2004). Status planning calls for the allocation of functional domains within a society in which the language can be used. Education is an example of a functional domain, facilitating the education of younger generations through the language in question. The Welsh-language campaign has been extremely successful in terms of the spread of Welsh-language education. As previously noted, following the establishment of the first
state-funded Welsh-language primary school in Llanelli, Carmarthenshire in 1947 (Williams 2003), the growth of Welsh-language education has been rapid. The 2009-10 census showed that 22% of Year 1 pupils in Wales were taught Welsh as a first language, a figure that is increasing year on year (England, 2012). Despite the successful growth of Welsh-language education, many campaigners fear that the dependencies placed on Welsh-medium education for language survival may, in some instances, be counterproductive, especially when considering L2 immersion. Rhys notes how the ‘gap between the increasing number of children receiving their education through Welsh, and the levels at which the language is used outside the classroom’ (Rhys, 2014) is the real issue facing the future of the Welsh language. When looking at the five groups collectively, two language situations are presented. The first situation is one of dominant social (Welsh) language use. In relation to this study, Groups 1 and 3 demonstrate examples of this. The second situation is one of subservient social (Welsh) language use; this is evident amongst Groups 2 and 4 (and 5 to a lesser extent), where the Welsh language is not the dominant language of the community. In this second instance, the Welsh-language for a number of children was associated with education. The connection between language and education may result in some children only associating the language with classroom learning.

A clear example of this situation was recorded with Group 4 (Torfaen). When discussing the use of Welsh outside school with the group, Meleri noted how, on occasion, she and her friends would find themselves talking Welsh to one another, despite not being in school. Meleri’s response demonstrated a clear connection between language use and language functionality. For this group of girls, Welsh had connotations with education, serving little or no purpose outside of the classroom.

**Meleri: When we were in primary school/ we would have sleepovers and we would all be speaking in Welsh**

*Meleri: Pam roedd ni yn ysgol gynradd/ a roedd ni gyd yn cael sleep over roedd ni gyd yn siarad Cymraeg*
Helen: Yeah

Meleri: ...and then we were like why are we speaking Welsh, we're not in school!

Extract 58: Group 4, Phase 2

Eluned: When I'm out of school I speak English/ but when I come into school I just speak Welsh

Extract 59: Group 5, Phase 2

A similar situation was also noted during the discussion with Group 5 (Cardiff). Eluned explained how on entering school, she would switch from using English to using Welsh. These variations can be explained by the localities each group represented. Groups 2 (Wrexham) and 4 (Torfaen) were located in areas where the Welsh language was not the dominant language of the community. For the children, the use of the Welsh-language was both associated with, and often confined to the classroom. These findings resonated with work conducted by Hodges (2009) discussed in earlier chapters. In her work, a similar situation was found amongst young school leavers (that had attended Welsh-medium schools) in the Rhymney Valley. Her research found, without the formal setting of a school environment, very few continued to use their Welsh after leaving school, with the exception of those who went on to work in an environment where the Welsh-language was used. In these instances the workplace replaced the formal setting for language use.
6.2.3 Peer Group Inclusion and Exclusion

For a number of bilingual/multilingual children, issues of cultural belonging and cultural identity can often challenge ideas of self-representation. Language competencies can vary and, for many, confidence in one’s own language ability cannot only determine language use, but also participation within friendship groups. Adler and Adler (1995: 145) note how one of the most dominant features of middle childhood is the ‘popular clique structure that organises their social worlds’. As noted in Chapter 2, middle childhood represents a period whereby children’s parental dependencies begin to alter, and the significance of peer groups becomes increasingly important. Research conducted on cliques and friendship groups offer evidence to support the idea that children ‘clump together into racial groups, class-stratified groups and gender-segregated groups’ (ibid), and that this tendency is especially intense during middle childhood and early adolescence. Considering this ‘clumping together’ or formation of friendship groups based on socio-cultural factors, understanding whether linguistic competencies and orientations influenced peer group inclusion and exclusion was an area of specific interest in this investigation.

As noted in Chapter 3, the vast majority of participants in this study were dominant bilinguals, with over half of the participants in this study came from homes where English was the dominant language (see Appendix 6). As a result, the children taking part in this study, whilst being English/Welsh bilinguals attending Welsh-medium schools, did not have the same Welsh language competencies. Throughout this thesis, reference has been made to the varying education structures that exist in Wales (immersion/maintenance approach). While the majority of the children in Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) were L1 Welsh-speakers, and the majority of the children in Group 2 (Wrexham) and Group 5 (Cardiff) were L2 Welsh-speakers, it was only Group 4 (Torfaen) that represented a peer group with corresponding linguistic ability (in that all members of the group were L2 Welsh-speakers, from non-Welsh-speaking households).

Similar to Group 4 (Torfaen), Group 2 (Wrexham) represented an area where the Welsh-language was only spoken by a minority, a figure well below the national
average (see Figure 14). Located in the northeast town of Wrexham, the children from Group 2 came predominantly from non-Welsh-speaking homes, with the exception of one, namely Catherine. She was the only member from a Welsh-speaking home and it later became clear that Catherine’s parents were, in fact, from South Wales. When discussing the differences between Welsh and English humour and the dubbing of English-language programmes (specifically cartoons) into Welsh, the majority of the group explained how they felt that the English-language versions were often funnier than Welsh-language versions. The only member of the group to dispute this was Catherine who noted how ‘the Welsh ones are funny too...’ (*mae'r un Cymraeg yn ddoniol hefyd*...). Catherine’s defence of Welsh-language humorous content led the discussion towards the topic of accent variation. Once again, the linguistic distinction between the north and south was raised, based on levels of understanding in terms of accent variation. Barrie felt that Welsh-language content (specifically the dubbed Welsh-language cartoons) used predominantly southern accents.

**Barrie:** Yeah like with the south and things/ I just don't understand them

*Barrie: Ie fel yn y De a pethau/ fi just ddim yn deall nhw*

**Catherine:** I understand them...

*Catherine: dwi'n deall nhw...*

**Barrie:** Yeah well you're from the south

*Barrie: Ie wel ti o'r De*

Extract 60: Group 2, Phase 1

Despite the initial discussion relating to Welsh-language humorous programmes, the underlying theme of accent variation soon became apparent as a possible explanation for why the group choose not to view certain Welsh-language programmes. When discussing comedy on S4C, Barrie explained how he often
struggled with Welsh humour, as comedy shows on S4C used southern dialects. For Barrie, the humour was often lost due to a lack of understanding or linguistic comprehension. To this, Catherine responded stating that she had no problem in understanding content that used southern accents. It is Barrie’s reference to Catherine ‘being from the south’ (o’r de) that is pertinent to this research. Having previously noted how her parents were Welsh-speakers from south Wales, it was not surprising that Catherine did not find certain southern dialects or accents difficult to understand, (given that her Welsh-speaking parents presumably spoke with a southern accent). In terms of accent variation, Catherine spoke the same northeast vernacular as her Group 2 peers. In contrast, Barrie’s lack of engagement with Welsh-language media (namely S4C) was based on his lack of understanding, not of the Welsh-language itself but rather certain accents or dialects he associated with the channel. Catherine’s ability to understand a variety of both north and south accents challenged Barrie’s view, prompting him to react by highlighting difference. By defining Catherine as different or ‘other’, he was subsequently excluding her from the group norm. Once again the notion of othering was presented, but this time from a different perspective. Catherine was singled-out on this occasion as being ‘different’ which, to some extent, strengthening the divide felt by L2 Welsh-speakers.

A similar situation was seen with Group 1 (rural Gwynedd). This time, all group members came from Welsh-speaking homes with the exception of Siân, whose parents were English. When discussing Welsh-language content, the unfair predominance of English-language content on television and the lack of Welsh-language subtitling on English-language programmes (Extract 20), prompted Catrin to suggest that the ‘English’ did not respect the Welsh, and a number of the group agreed with her. Siân, however, found Catrin’s remark to be hurtful, and despite being in the minority, confidently voiced her grievances.

Siân: Catrin, that hurt when you said that [code-switching, use of English]. I’m English...

Siân: Catrin, that hurt when you said that. Saes ydw i...
Robert: =Well, she’s not actually English, she was born in Dolgellau. Some of her family are English, but she’s from Dolgellau.

Robert: =Wel dyw hi ddim actually yn Sais, nath hi gael ei geni yn Nolgellau. Ma’ ran o deulu hi’n Sais, ond ma’ hi’n dod o Dolgellau.

Extract 61: Group 1, Phase 1

Unlike the situation of exclusion seen in the discussion with Group 2 (Wrexham) between Catherine and Barrie, Robert’s response to some extend signifies an element of inclusion. Despite Siân’s own labelling of herself as ‘Saes’ (English), and purposeful use of code-switching to emphasise her point, Robert rejected her self-identification. Extract 20 (Chapter 4) demonstrates some hostility towards ‘the English’ (Y Saeson) when discussing the lack of respect shown towards the Welsh-language. This was substantiated through the lack of Welsh-language subtitles on English-language programmes, and also non-Welsh speaking people moving to the community and refusing to learn Welsh. An ‘us’ and ‘them’ binary emerged from the group’s comments; ‘us’ representing the Welsh-speaking community, and ‘them’ representing the non-Welsh-speaking community. Despite Siân identifying herself as being English, Roberts was unwilling to accept this. While Siân was part of the Welsh-speaking community, she presented a contradictory argument to Robert’s theory regarding respect. Previously Robert had noted how the lack thereof shown by ‘English’ people towards the Welsh language could be measured by the “unwillingness” of non-Welsh speakers (often referred to as ‘English’ people) to learn Welsh.

6.2.4 Phase 2 Findings: A Comparative Study Mapping Continuities and Change in Relation to Peer Group Inclusion and Exclusion

Phase 1 results looked specifically at peer group dynamics in terms of linguistic inclusion and exclusion. Two specific case studies were explored, and in each instance one individual within the group differed linguistically from the group norm. Siân, Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) was the only L2 Welsh-speaker with non-Welsh speaking parents, while Catherine, Group 2 (Wrexham) was the only L1
Welsh speaker, and the only member of the Group with Welsh-speaking parents. In addition to this, Catherine’s parents were from South Wales and as a result the linguistic variations between the north/south had been a topic of discussion. North/south accent variation was not a unique feature of the Group 2 (Wrexham) discussions, and was raised by a number of participants during both phases, especially in relation to the ease or difficulties the children had in understanding Welsh-language media content (covered in sections 6.2.1 and 6.2.2). However, what differentiated the Group 2 (Wrexham) discussion from other groups was the group exclusion of Catherine, a conscious othering by the group due to her familiarity with other linguistic varieties.

Siân, Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Catherine, Group 2 (Wrexham) represented two individuals with linguistic identities (in terms of Welsh-language) that differed from their peers. Previously, the negotiation of these identities was discussed in terms of inclusion and exclusion. While Catherine, singled out as being ‘from the south’ (‘o’r de’) due to her (Welsh-speaking) parents had not disputed these claims during Phase 1, Siân, on the other hand self-segregated herself (as ‘English’), distancing herself from the group. While the group had excluded Catherine in the Group 2 instance, it was Siân that distanced herself from the collective, only to be met with dismissal of her claim (cf. Extract 61). This section will map the changes in the way that both girls confronted these notions of group inclusion and exclusion over the transition phase.

Looking firstly at the dynamics at play with Group 2 (Wrexham), Catherine was singled out as being ‘different’ in both Phases. During Phase 1 (Extract 60) when discussing accent variation, Barrie explained how he had difficulties in understanding southern Welsh accents. Catherine responded by saying that she did not find the accent hard to understand. Both Catherine and Barrie had prominent northeast Welsh accents. Despite this, Barrie claimed that Catherine understood the southern vernacular because she was in fact from the south (‘o’r de’). During Phase 1, Catherine had not disputed Barrie’s claim and the conversation continued. However, during Phase 2 (Extract 62), when accent variation was revisited (in this instance with reference to the re-versioning of Family Guy into Welsh) Catherine’s response was much more fraught. Dean felt
that if there were a Welsh-language version of *Family Guy*, it would probably be dubbed in *‘iaith y De’* (the language of the south/ southern accents), perhaps due to the children’s perception of the south being the epicentre of media production. While the majority of the group agreed with Dean in respect of the use of southern accents, Catherine once again, noted how she did not share her peers’ difficulties in understanding the southern accents. This time, it was Owen who challenged her by once again categorising her as being ‘from the south’ (*‘o’r de’*).

**Interviewer:** So would you rather hear northern accents?

*Cyfwelydd:* A fyddwch wedi’i chlywed acenion gogleddol felly?

**Multiple voices:** Yeah

*Amryw o leisiau:* Ie

**Catherine:** I don’t mind

*Catherine:* Dwi ddim yn meindio

**Dean:** Yeah but she’s from the south

*Dean:* Ie ond ma hi o’r De

**Catherine:** No I’m not

*Catherine:* Na dwi ddim

**Owen:** Yes you are

*Owen:* Ie ti yn

**Catherine:** I’m not from the south

*Catherine:* Dwi ddim o’r De

**Interviewer:** Are your parents from the south?

*Cyfwelydd:* Ydyd rhieni ti fel o’r De?

**Catherine:** Yeah, but I’m not from the south

*Catherine:* Ie, ond dwi ddim o’r De

**Hanna:** You were born in the south

*Hanna:* Ti ’di cael dy eni yn y De

**Catherine:** No I wasn’t
Catherine: Na fi ddim

[...] Yeah you were

[...] Ie ti yn

Extract 62: Group 2, Phase 2

While there are a number of factors that could explain the varying responses given by Catherine, for example, the relationship to the person making the accusations (Barrie during Phase 1 and Owen during Phase 2), Catherine’s response was far more assertive during Phase 2. Catherine did not see herself as being different from the rest of the group and rejected the claims made by Owen and other group members. Her peers maintained the notion that Catherine's identity was 'southern', based on the perceived linguistic and regional affiliations she had due to her parental links to the south. This indicated that, for these children at least, accent and language were closely aligned with notions of 'identity'.

As noted, the linguistic situation in Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) was that of predominance of L1 Welsh-language speakers. Positioned in the Welsh speaking heartland, the group displayed strong affiliations to Welsh-speaking nationalist consciousness. During Phase 1, there was a heated debate about the predominance of English-language content on television and the apparent lack of respect shown by the English towards the Welsh. Siân explained how hurtful this was, because she identified herself as English. However, her claims were met with dismissal by some of her peer, most notably Robert. Despite the hostility, Siân detached herself from the group, showing clear signs of agency when showing affiliation with her English heritage. While Siân saw herself as English, Robert was unwilling to accept her claim. Arguably, Siân did not fit the stereotyped view he had of the English, because she spoke Welsh.

This hostility towards English people (or perhaps more accurately non-Welsh speakers) was a key feature of Group 1 discussions during both Phases, culminating in Mari's use of extreme language when discussing her feelings towards the English during Phase 2 (Extract 63). This time, however, Siân's response was far more exasperated. Having expressed feelings of hurt following
Sara’s comment during Phase 1, Siân’s rolling of the eyes and sarcastic ‘thank you’ (again choosing to use English as opposed to Welsh) demonstrated an element of dismissal when dealing with prejudices. Her decision to defend her English nationality was again strengthened by her use of code-switching, once more demonstrated the linguistic ties that exist between language and nation.

Mari: Mega hate the English

Mari: Mega hate'r Saeson

Siân: Thank you (rolls her eyes)

Siân: Thank you

Extract 63: Group 1, Phase 2

6.3 Summary

The aim of this chapter was to draw on the connections between childhood identities and linguistic identities from the perspective of the preadolescent child. Through the process of thematic codification the main data-focused theme identified was language use. Language use was discussed in terms of linguistic self-confidence and peer group inclusion and exclusion.

Linguistic self-confidence through engagement and use drew on notions of linguistic prestige and linguistic competency. In terms of media engagement, accent variation represented a significant hurdle for many, especially amongst L2 Welsh-speakers. Engagement with Welsh-language media was subsequently restricted based on linguistic competencies associated with vernacular variations.

Peer group inclusion and exclusion drew on affiliations to linguistic groups highlighting the significance of self and other. Peer group dynamics represent an important aspect when discussing middle childhood. Drawing on the work of Adler and Adler (2001), the research indicated a ‘clumping together’ of groups based on linguistic identities.
7 Chapter 7: Discussion and Conclusion

7.1 Introduction

The aim of this research was to explore the connections between the three main areas of interest, namely linguistic identities, media identities and childhood identities. The foundations of this research were rooted in a Knowledge Transfer Partnership between Aberystwyth University and the production company Boomerang+ (2010-2012). The purpose of the KTP research had been to gain a better understanding of the media practices and preferences of bilingual tween audiences in Wales. Due to the commercially driven nature of the research, wider cultural issues surrounding linguistic representation by Welsh-language media had largely been overlooked. The shortfalls of this KTP research provided the catalyst for further investigation based on my own academic interests, specifically from a sociolinguistic perspective. As the KTP research spanned the period between primary and secondary school, the significance of this transition became an area of interest to me. The challenges facing children during this period of substantial social change became a central part of this doctoral research. By placing engagement with Welsh-language media at the core of this research it facilitated the formulation of complex discursive issues surrounding linguistic and cultural identities.

The aim of this chapter is to draw together the major findings of this research based on the initial research questions listed below.

*Does the media mediate or maintain perceptions of language and identity for bilingual children in Wales, and to what extent do social changes during the transition phase between primary and secondary school influence these perceptions?*

1. What importance do children in Wales place on Welsh-language media?

   To what extent does geographic location influence engagement with Welsh-language media?

2. Do Welsh-language programmes aimed at tweens answer the social and cultural needs of the target audience?
How does media engagement influence perceptions of self?

3. To what extent does linguistic competence influence tween perceptions of Welsh identity?

Are Welsh-language programmes perceived by tweens to be representative of the whole Welsh-speaking community in Wales?

4. How significant are the social changes that occur during the transition phase on the construction of identity amongst Welsh bilinguals during middle childhood?

When formulating these research questions, the core values of S4C, as outlined by Geraint Talfan Davies (House of Commons Welsh Affairs Committee: S4C, 2011), played a major part in gaining an understanding of how Welsh-language media is viewed both culturally and politically. According to Talfan Davies, S4C provides a service with public, intrinsic and institutional values (ibid). This research aimed to explore the significance of these values from the perspective of the bilingual preadolescent, drawing on the importance of these values in relation to identity formation. Another key focus of this research was to ascertain whether the social changes associated with the transition phase between primary and secondary school affected these above-mentioned views.

Due to the cross-disciplinary nature of this research, a thematic approach to the literature was presented utilising Attride-Stirling’s (2001) Thematic Networking System. This facilitated the thematic interconnections to be identified and discussed. Drawing on early observations from the literature review, research focusing on media engagement by preadolescent bilinguals remains relatively under-researched. While research focusing on the social developmental stages of childhood (Durkin, 1995), national identity during middle childhood (Scourfield et al., 2006), linguistic identities (Coupland, 2010) and children’s media engagement (Buckingham, 2001, 2006) exist, this research sought to draw on the interconnections between these themes whilst focusing specifically on the transition phase.
By drawing on initial observations connected to the existing research in the fields of media studies, childhood studies and sociolinguistics, this chapter discusses the key findings in turn, focusing on the connections between the a priori themes and the relevance of the transition phase. A critical evaluation of the methodological approaches of the research design, implementation and analysis is then provided, looking specifically at the benefits and shortfalls of this dual-phased research. Considering the recent debates surrounding the future of Welsh-language broadcasting in Wales and the wider discussions around the future of the BBC, the timeliness of this research is then addressed in terms of its potential to contribute to this ongoing debate. The outcomes of the research are summarised by drawing specific attention to linguistic diversity and the scope for further research in this field. The chapter concludes with an overview of the main findings addressing the original contribution to knowledge.

7.2 The Relationship Between Linguistic Identity and Media Identity

Through the process of codification, the themes identified in Chapter 4 built upon some of Talfan Davies’s core ideals. For example, the service’s public value was demonstrated both by the children’s understanding of conscious and subconscious learning (aiding schools with language acquisition and maintenance) along with the children’s implicit knowledge of how Welsh-language media offered a tangible category of Welshness (through the provision of a vibrant Welsh-language media industry).

In terms of the importance placed on Welsh-language media by the children, this research drew on the relationship between linguistic and media identities focusing on two specific areas; firstly, the use and understanding of media as a tool for language acquisition, and secondly the role media plays in affirming national consciousness. In relation to media as a tool for language acquisition, three areas of interest were identified during the Phase 1 analysis. The first looked at the varying ways in which Welsh-language media represented a means of encouraging language growth through media engagement. The second focused on conscious learning, whereby the active use of Welsh-language content for
language acquisition was seen as one of the primary goals of Welsh-language media. In this instance, the children displayed a conscious understanding of the value of using media content to improve language ability. Finally, subconscious learning highlighted how the children understood the conceptual and practical use of media as a language acquisition tool in various domains (for example at schools and at home). One specific area of interest in relation to subconscious learning was the use by schools of initiatives that promote Welsh-language media.

7.2.1 Education

The transition phase from primary to secondary school clearly marked a significant trigger for changes in media use by schools, both in terms of Welsh-language (broadcast) media and use of new media and the Internet. The findings revealed that Welsh-language programmes were used far more frequently by primary schools, especially by those with fewer L1 Welsh-speakers, than by secondary schools. Also, the use of new media by schools was far greater during Phase 2 (in line with Key Stage 3) than it was during Phase 1 (Key Stage 2). A possible explanation for this shift in programme use by primary and secondary teachers may be due to the orientation of these two very different teaching institutions. As noted in Chapter 2, Howe’s (2011) work focuses on the contrasting approaches to teaching and learning between primary and secondary schools. He notes how the class teacher plays a central figure in the educational structure at primary school, compared with the subject-focused education structured at secondary school. Generally speaking, secondary school teachers are therefore subject-specific teachers, with an expertise in a given area of academic instruction, compared with primary school teachers whose area of expertise is often education. In some instances, limited access to subject specific resources and expertise means that primary school teachers often depend on alternative resources (such as media) to aid instruction (Howe, 2011).

While Howe’s (2011) definition of the organising structures of primary and secondary school and teaching is accurate, his research is focused on the transition from [English] monolingual primary schools to [English] monolingual
secondary schools. When looking at the transition from primary to secondary schools in a bilingual setting, there is often an additional factor to consider, namely the varying linguistic competencies of bilingual children. Howe notes how primary school education is preparatory, teaching the basics of reading and writing. However, this function is perhaps even more significant for bilingual children, especially for L2 Welsh-speakers, and to lesser extent L2 English-speakers. Over half of the children involved in this research came from non-Welsh speaking homes with the majority of these from Groups 2 (Wrexham), 4 (Torfaen) and 5 (Cardiff). The secondary schools attended by these children were categorised as Welsh-medium schools unlike the secondary schools attended by Groups 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 3 (urban Gwynedd), which, at the time of the research were categorised by Estyn as 'naturally bilingual' schools. Therefore, ensuring that the basic standard of Welsh was at a sufficient level was essential to the child’s development. When considering the situation of Group 4 (Torfaen), where, at the time of conducting Phase 1 research, 99% of the children attending the [primary] school came from non-Welsh speaking homes (Estyn Report, 2011), it was unsurprising that this primary school made use of the additional linguistic infrastructure available through Welsh-language media. In addition to these factors there is also a notion that primary education should be ‘concerned with enjoyment and a child’s individual needs’ (Howe, 2011: 6), and therefore, non-educational Welsh-language content could be seen as a means of encouraging a certain degree of informality to the engagement with the Welsh language. As a result of the structural and organisational differences between primary and secondary schools, it is not surprising therefore that the use of Welsh-language television content was far more prevalent by primary schools. The subject-focused approach to teaching at secondary school does not necessarily lend itself to the

101 In this instance the term ‘lesser extent’ means the number of L2 English-speakers in comparison to L2 Welsh-speakers.
102 Since conducting the Phase 2 research in 2013, both secondary schools attended by the children from Group 1 and 2 have been re-categorised by the local authority as Welsh-medium schools as reported in Estyn’s ‘Linguistic Progression and Standards of Welsh in Ten Bilingual Schools’, published in 2014.
use of non-educational programmes, partly due to the time constraints placed on lessons within the highly structured timetables.

In addition to Howe’s explanation of the institutional differences between primary and secondary school and their approaches to education, another key factor to consider is the organisation of the national curriculum. The transition from primary to secondary school also marks the transition from one educational key stage to another. The educational structure of schooling in England and Wales follows a sequence of stages. The transition phase marks, not only the move from primary to secondary school, but also the transition from Key Stage 2 to Key Stage 3. In terms of information technology, the curriculum states that during Key Stage 2 learners ‘should be taught to:

- Consider the sort of information they require to support their tasks and activities and how they might locate that information.
- Use an increasing range of ICT tools and resources to find, process and communicate relevant information from a variety of given safe and suitable sources.
- Develop and communicate their ideas in appropriate ways with a developing sense of purpose and audience’

(Welsh Government, 2008: 10).

As children progress between Key Stages 2 and 3, the curriculum indicates how learners should be given opportunities to build on these skills, knowledge and understanding through developing an ‘awareness of the relevance and plausibility of information and begin to identify and question bias in sources’ (ibid).

7.2.2 Nation Building

Throughout this thesis reference has been made to Talfan Davies’s notion that Welsh-language media has helped shape national consciousness in Wales. By applying a distinct set of values, namely institutional, public and intrinsic Talfan Davies notes how Welsh-language media, specifically S4C, represents more than
simply a television station. In Chapter 4 these values were examined further in
order to establish whether the children in this study shared these values, and if
so, how these values influenced their own ideas of national consciousness. In
terms of Welsh-language media and its role in affirming national consciousness,
two themes were identified. The first, focused on explicit knowledge of historical
accounts of the Welsh-language media campaign and how these invoked feelings
of national consciousness. The second, explored implicit knowledge, and
concentrated on engagement with Welsh-language media as a tangible category
of Welshness.

Explicit knowledge focused on how members of the groups displayed knowledge
relating to the historical development of Welsh-language media, and its
importance from a cultural and political perspective. These examples drew on
Talfan Davies’s notion of institutional value placed on S4C by the people of
Wales. Examples of explicit knowledge were most notable in Groups 1 (rural
Gwynedd) and Group 3 (urban Gwynedd); the two groups with the highest
percentage of L1 Welsh-speakers and who, on average engaged more frequently
with Welsh-language media. In one instance, reference was made to a
programme on the history of S4C, and the actions of one man in particular,
Gwynfor Evans. Stewart (Group 3, urban Gwynedd, Phase 1) recalled how
Gwynfor Evans, following the newly elected Conservative Government’s reversal
of a promise made to establish a Welsh-language channel, threatened to go on
hunger strike in 1980, if the commitment to provide a Welsh-language television
channel was not honoured. This programme had a profound influence on Stuart,
who referred to it during both Phase 1 and Phase 2 of the research.

The majority of examples relating to explicit knowledge were linked to language
activism associated to the foundation of S4C. While Stuart (Group 3, urban
Gwynedd, Phase 1) made reference to a political figure, other examples drew on
family accounts of language activism. For example, Robert (Group 1, rural
Gwynedd, Phase 1) made reference to Catrin’s father spending 5 days in prison
‘fighting to get S4C’ (’fffeitio i gael S4C’ Robert, Group 1, Phase 1). While parents
were purposely not included in the data gathering process, it was difficult to
make specific reference to the significance of these claims; however, these
displays of language activism often became an important point of reference for the children in this research. These statements of knowledge surrounding the establishment of S4C often sparked further discussions surrounding notions of national consciousness, specifically with reference to respect and fairness. For a number of children, especially from Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) discussions turned to address the topic of inequality in relation to the delivery of Welsh-language media in comparison to English-language media.

While the other groups provided limited examples of explicit knowledge during Phase 1, the findings revealed that during Phase 2 there was an increased awareness amongst L2 Welsh-speakers of the historical evolution of Welsh-language media. Once again these discussions were predominantly focused around personal accounts associated with parents or adults. For example Bryn (Group 5, Cardiff) noted how Welsh language programmes were ‘relatively new’ (‘relatively newydd’, Bryn, Group 5, Phase 2), and subsequently, when his parents were younger there ‘weren’t really Welsh things [on television]’ (‘doedd dim rili pethau Cymraeg’ ibid). Explicit knowledge therefore was identified through tangible references to the minority-language maintenance campaign in Wales, and the findings revealed that the importance placed on this historical evolution of Welsh-language media became far more significant when there was a personal connection.

While explicit examples appeared more frequently amongst L1 Welsh-speakers, examples of implicit knowledge were evident across the board. As noted in Chapter 4, implicit knowledge focused on the way in which Welsh-language media offered a tangible category of Welshness and how the children connected this to their own reality. These examples often drew on Talfan Davies’s notion of public value assigned to S4C, and its role in supporting Welsh-language education along with the economic benefits provided by a thriving media industry. In Chapter 2 reference was made to the work of Scourfield et al. looking at the ‘representations of nations and national identities’ by children during middle childhood (Scourfield et al. 2006: 48). According to Scourfield et al. (2006: 101), the nation often emerges as a ‘one dimensional category’ during this
developmental stage, with national identity often ‘marked exclusively by reference to language and sport’ (ibid). In relation to national consciousness they note how very little is said about ‘what people do’ or ‘how they look’ (ibid) in terms of defining children’s perceptions of Welshness. Whilst there was significant data to support these claims by Scourfield et al., there was also evidence that challenged these ideas. During a Phase 1 discussion with Group 2 (Wrexham), there was a notion that Welsh-language broadcasting represented a viable career path for Welsh-speakers. This would suggest that Welsh-language media provided a means by which Welshness could be affirmed through Welsh-language jobs for Welsh-language speakers, drawing a clear connection between the Welsh language and future notions of active citizenship. Education, or specifically Welsh-medium education was also discussed in a similar way, with Welsh-medium education described as ‘a good education too if you’re looking for a job’ (‘mae’n education da hefyd os ydych chi yn cynnig am swydd...’, Neil Group 2, Phase 1). Echoes of Hodges’s work are found here whereby language is an example of a social asset with the ability to promote social mobility beyond financial means (Hodges, 2009: 21-22). In relation to this research this was most notable amongst L2 Welsh-speakers.

In addition to implicit knowledge demonstrating the positive perceptions of Welsh-language media and its influence of national consciousness, displays of negative perceptions were also evident in the research findings. The third value associated with S4C according to Talfan Davies was its intrinsic value as a broadcaster. While a number of children, specifically from Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) enjoyed a number of Welsh-language programmes, others felt that Welsh-language content simply mirrored or ‘copied’ English-language programmes, suggesting that Welsh-language content often lacked originality or authenticity. While this was not true in every example, there was often an assumption that English-language programmes were original, with Welsh-language programmes seen as merely derivative works. Arguably, by diminishing the value of Welsh-language programmes on the basis that English-language programmes are more original, an assumption is made that Welsh-language content is somewhat inferior.
As previously noted, the themes identified in relation to the role media plays in nation-building developed from Talfan Davies’s set of specific values assigned to Welsh-language media (specifically S4C). The specific themes identified through the use of thematic codification were explicit and implicit knowledge of how Welsh-language media shaped national consciousness. The research revealed that, in terms of its public and institutional values; S4C was viewed positively, and represented a means of ‘keeping the people of Wales Welsh’ (Hywel, Group 1, Phase 1). Evidence suggested that the historical development of Welsh-language media instilled pride amongst a number of the children. In addition to this, aspirational opportunities presented by a thriving media industry demonstrated how the ability to speak Welsh increased the opportunity for social mobility, a topic that was specifically noted by those groups outside of the Welsh-speaking heartlands. Despite this, in terms of intrinsic value, issues relating to originality (when compared with English-language media provision) were identified. In addition to highlighting the dominance of English-language media in the lives of the children, questions relating to authenticity and originality may also be deep-rooted in notions of media inferiority, whereby Welsh-language media is seen as sub-standard in comparison to English-language media. Considering the negative press S4C has received in recent years following reports of low viewing figures (cf. Chapter 2), arguably, negative perceptions of Welsh-language media are as prevalent now as they were during the mid twentieth century (cf. Section 1.3, Chapter 1).

7.3 The Relationship Between Media Identities and Childhood Identities

This section looks at the key findings presented in Chapter 5, drawing on the relationship between media identities and childhood identities. Considering S4C’s inclusion remit, onscreen (and to a lesser extend online) participation was discussed from the perspective of self-representation, and the impact [media] inclusion has on the lives of preadolescents. Findings revealed that onscreen participation often led to increased levels of self-consciousness, especially amongst some of the girls included in this research. The second theme addressed
in this section focuses on access and service, and specifically the notion of ‘othering’. In terms of this research the term ‘othering’ was used in relation to the service provided by S4C and the perception that Welsh-language media better served others. As a result of the changes made to the provision of children’s content on S4C, a number of participants noted how the appeal of the Welsh-language service had drastically reduced. This section concludes by looking at the negative impact this kind of othering may have on the appeal of Welsh-language media by preadolescents.

7.3.1 Media Engagement and Self-Representation: Onscreen and Online Visibility

The notion of media identities discussed in Chapter 5 focused on perceptions of self and self-consciousness through onscreen participation. While engagement with social networking sites had not been a primary concern of this research, due in part, to the age of the participants involved, the significance of online identities through online engagement became an area of interest, especially during Phase 2. Both onscreen and online visibility focused on the way identities are performed through media engagement. Considering the age and developmental stage of the participants in this research, the influence social change (brought about by the transition from primary to secondary school), had on the children was relevant to the research. Subsequently, the development of embarrassment was discussed and the way in which gender and maturity influenced both self-perception and perceptions of others.

Audience participation and onscreen visibility in the production of Welsh-language children’s content was explored from the unique perspective of S4C’s inclusion remit in Chapter 5. As noted, every group had either appeared individually or collectively on a programme for the channel, or had viewed their peers onscreen. The majority of children had taken part in programmes as a group; an onscreen experience shared with peers. Very few had taken part individually, and appearances were predominantly linked to collaborations between schools and production companies. During Phase 1, when questioned
about their experiences of appearing on screen the responses had been fairly mixed. Some had found the experience extremely embarrassing, for example Catherine from Group 2 (Wrexham), while others had embraced the opportunities presented by the Welsh-language service, such as Stuart from Group 3 (urban Gwynedd).

While self-conscious emotions develop during early childhood, research indicates that these emotional developments occur at varying rates due to a variety of factors including societal change. Durkin (1995) explains how, as children develop through middle childhood into adolescence, they acquire a more sophisticated understanding of how the world works along with an increased awareness of self. Through the process referred to as ‘adolescent egocentrism’, young adolescents/preadolescence are ‘prone to entertain feelings of an imaginary audience – a sense of being on show’ with their thoughts, feelings and behaviour being viewed by the rest of the world (Durkin, 1995: 512). This emotional state evidently applied to the children’s experiences of being visible on-screen. While both girls and boys demonstrated signs of embarrassment and self-consciousness when discussing onscreen participation, such responses were far more prevalent amongst the girls. Arguably, this model for tween production leans towards a patriarchal system, whereby the format is arguably better suited to the preferences and needs of preadolescent boys rather than girls. Over dependency on this this format of tween programming by S4C may, in fact, be detrimental to securing loyal viewers, and indicates the service’s shortfalls when considering the voice of the viewer.

In 2001 Messenger Davies and Mosdell (2001, in Messenger Davies, 2010: 110) conducted a research study for the Broadcasting Standards Commission (BSC), investigating the ‘use and perceived exploitation of real children in adult factual programming on television’ (ibid). While the onscreen visibility of the children in this doctoral study differed from those in the aforementioned report, (the majority of programmes that the children were involved with were aimed at children), it highlighted an interesting finding regarding media participation. The BSC report recommended that the assumptions made about ‘children wanting to appear on television, and having the necessary confidence to do so, should be re-
examined’ (ibid). Arguably, with S4C placing so much significance on the inclusion of viewers onscreen, the apparent enthusiasm expressed by some of the children in this study may, in fact, simply echo the message that they hear from the broadcasters rather than signal any genuine sentiments that they may hold for themselves. As with the recommendations put forward by Messenger Davies and Mosdell, a revaluation of this format by S4C may be beneficial to ensure the service provided is appropriate, relevant and considerate of its audience.

While the argument put forward by S4C suggests audience participation allows children to expand ‘their experience of entertainment and media’ (S4C, 2014: 18-19), the inclusion of young audiences onscreen also acts as a tool or ‘hook’ to encourage audiences to engage with Welsh-language media. This notion of a ‘hook’ refers to the idea that once a child has participated on a programme they will, in turn, watch this programme, and, if successful continue to watch the programme in future. S4C’s low tween viewing figures have been criticised in recent years resulting in drastic changes to the tween/teen schedule on S4C. In Chapter 5, a comparison was made between the proportions of programmes on S4C compared with CBBC that include children/the audience, with 58% of programmes on S4C compared 25% of programmes of CBBC. While the BBC allocates £100million to CBBC with a further £41million to CBeebies (Kirk, 2014), S4C’s total annual budget is £71.3million. Producing (children’s) content that included audience participation can often be a very cost effective way of producing original content. It is not surprising therefore that S4C rely heavily on this format for content creation. However, there was very little evidence in this research to show that onscreen inclusion creates loyal viewers, as noted in Extract 37.

**Dave:** You think it’s cool when you’re on the programme but/ yeah because we don’t know them// it’s better when you know them because it’s a lot funnier.

**Dave:** Chi’n meddw i mae’n cool pan rydych chi ar y rhaglen ond/ ie achos ni ddim yn gwybod nhw// mae’n well pan ti’n nabod nhw achos mae lot mwy doniol.

**Michael:** =and when you know the teachers too
The significance of appearing onscreen altered during the period between primary and secondary. In terms of inclusion, the use of primary school children in the production of Welsh-language content appeared to be far greater than the use of secondary school children. Inclusion in television production also appeared to shift from a collective to an individual experience during this transitional phase, with agency and choice playing a much more prominent role in whether the child chooses to participate in such activities. Collectively, Group 2 (Wrexham) had appeared in *Pasiant y Plant*, and for Catherine this had not been a welcomed experience. By contrast, both Gareth and Hanna (Group 2, Wrexham) had expressed their eagerness to take part in television programmes, demonstrating how they, individually sought the spotlight. In terms of production value and media engagement, the inclusion of children onscreen presented additional issues when considering the intrinsic value of children’s programmes on S4C. Targeting young audiences for collective inclusion often resulted in preconceptions being made about the service, cementing the idea that the service (S4C) better suited younger viewers, once again tying in with notions of othering.

Despite online activity and social media not featuring prominently during the Phase 1 research, the results from Phase 2 indicated a sharp increase in the number of social media users, which coincides with Ofcom’s report looking at social media. According to Ofcom’s 2014 report 70% of 12-to-15-year-olds have social media profiles, with *Facebook* remaining the most popular amongst this age group (Ofcom, 2014: 6). What the Ofcom report also demonstrates is the rate at which media literacy in terms of online use and preferences has developed, and continues to develop in line with technological advancements and changing social attitudes. The report indicated that the number of *Instagram* users amongst 12-to-15-year-olds had doubled during the period between 2013 and 2014, highlighting the fast pace and increased uptake of different social media.
networks. During the lifespan of this research project, social media applications such as Instagram, launched in 2010, have developed rapidly. In 2012, when the first Phase of research was conducted Instagram had just been acquired by Facebook for $1 billion. Since its acquisition, the site now has over 200 million monthly users; compared with 10 million users in 2010 (Landsverk, 2014), with 12-to-15-year-olds making up an important part of this steep increase in users. Understanding the relationship that exists between media identities through online engagement and the negotiation of self-consciousness was an area overlooked during the initial research design stages. Subsequently, the focus group questions listed (see Appendix 5) focused on questions relating to websites connected to children’s television content and not gaming or social networking sites. Despite this, the flexibility of both the research gathering and data analysis methodologies did allow for online visibility to be discussed in relation to onscreen visibility and produced some interesting comparisons.

Unlike onscreen visibility, where it is much harder to conceal physical and character traits, individuals can hide behind an online profile revealing little or none of their identity. Driver (2006, cited in Polak, 2006: 178) explains how young people ‘make use of the internet as a realm to try out, play with and perform their identities’), allowing them to present their own specific versions of themselves. In terms of this research, the girls in both Group 4 (Torfaen) and Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) demonstrated the importance placed on online space for engaging with social activities. Online- and onscreen-visibility represent social factors that affect the way in which self-conscious emotions develop. Given that audience participation is part of S4C’s remit for children’s production, perhaps a greater focus needs to be placed, by the service, on understanding how preadolescent children negotiate their online and onscreen identities. For some girls, the forced inclusion in television programmes may in fact be counterproductive. While the desired effect of the inclusion and participation remit is to allow viewers to ‘expand their experience of entertainment and media’ (S4C, 2014: 18-19), onscreen visibility was not always welcomed. While some of the children, particularly some of the girls, found the experience of appearing on television embarrassing, online gaming, where fictional characters
or avatars can be created were notably popular amongst a number of girls during Phase 1.

As the children involved in this research represented the transition phase between primary and secondary school education, the focus from a media perspective was (Welsh-language) broadcast media. New media, and specifically social media were not a primary focus, due in part to the legality and age restrictions placed on sites such as Facebook. Despite this, Phase 2 results showed how social networking sites and apps had grown significantly in popularity especially amongst the girls (with specific reference to Group 4, Torfaen). When considering that over half of the participants involved in this research were girls, the emerging literature on girl-focused cyberspace and identity formation during preadolescence (Polak, 2006), Seaton, 2005) had significant relevance to this research.

Seaton (2005) notes how middle childhood, and specifically the transition from childhood to adolescence, marks significant behavioural changes relating to 'gender power relations' (Seaton, 2005: 29). Polak's (2006) study on girl-focused net space provides an insight into the relationship some girls have with online identities and the struggle to 'find their voice' (Polak, 2006: 179) during early adolescence. Corsaro and Eder (1999) explain how for many children the period of transition between childhood and adolescence, is a time when 'children struggle to gain stable identities' (Corsaro and Eder, 1999: 48). While Corsaro and Eder's statement is not gender specific, Polak focuses specifically on the significance that this transitional phase has on young girls. According to Driscoll (2005), even the categorisation of transition suggests that preadolescent or tween girls ‘fall “in between” crucial developmental crises’ (Driscoll, 2005: 224). This gap represents an interim period between ‘the formation of social identity, and thus gender identity, in early childhood and the crescendo of bodily and social change in adolescence’ (ibid). Perhaps as a result of how we as adults view – specifically - tween girls, the difficulties of self-expression are magnified. The struggle for self-expression during this period has been well documented by those who research 'girl culture'. Gilligan (1982) noted how tween girls ‘struggle against losing voice’ (Gilligan, 1982 cited in Polak, 2006: 177), marginalised to
some extent in a patriarchal society. Subsequently, silence becomes the means by which some girls navigate this transition to adolescence.

Despite this, young girls are now regaining their voice through the use of online spaces. According to Polak (2006), the Internet has allowed girls to become ‘comfortable in the familiarity of her silence’ while allowing ‘her space to explore the voice she is learning to use’ (Polak, 2006: 177). Preadolescence presents a number of issues for both boys and girls however; girls are coming of age in a ‘more sexualised and media-saturated culture’ (Pipher, 1994: 12), and as a result are faced with additional uncertainties when trying to claim an identity. Extract 41 demonstrated how Ffion (Group 4, Torfaen, Phase 1), one of the more quiet members of Group 4 noted how she enjoyed playing online games, which allowed you to ‘create your own person’ (creu person dy hunain - see Extract 41). According to Osborne (2012) ‘online identities are informed by off-line performances, and therefore online spaces provide stages for performed selves’. Establishing a voice is an important element of affirming oneself. The loss of voice can also lead to a loss of self. Polak explains how for some girls, the use of new media becomes a platform for their voices to be heard (ibid: 179).

With reference to Durkin’s work, as children move towards adolescence they acquire an increased awareness of self. As girls generally mature at a faster rate than boys (cf. Durkin 1995), this notion was substantiated by the research findings in relation to the feelings of self-consciousness expressed by a number of girls when discussing onscreen participation. Drawing on the findings in relation to both onscreen and online visibility, one of the most notable features was the different account of media engagement and self-representation experienced by the girls and boys in this research. The results found that onscreen participation often led to increased levels of self-consciousness, especially amongst girls. In terms of identity construction, the most notable gendered difference was found in relating to media identities, cementing the role gender plays in this debate.
7.3.2 Access and Service

In relation to this research, access and service focused on the media practices and preferences of bilingual (Welsh/English) tweens and their engagement with Welsh-language media. The term ‘othering’ (Johnson et al., 2004: 257) was used to reflect the perceptions that Welsh-language broadcast media better served others. In response to the announcement in 2010 that S4C would face a 24.4% cut to its annual budget (Welsh Affairs Committee: S4C, 2011), S4C was forced to undertake major internal restructuring, and a comprehensive schedule review (S4C press release, 2012). Despite the newly appointed chief executive, Ian Jones, explaining how the revised schedule ‘sought to reflect the diversity of lives and communities in Wales’ (Jones, 2012), ‘not all aspects of the new schedule were well received’ (ibid.). In Chapter 5 reference was made to a number of accounts by children stating how S4C no longer met their needs as viewers. While preschool programming increased dramatically, the daily timeslot allocated to tween programming reduced by almost half, demonstrating a lack of commitment by the channel to address the needs of these young Welsh speakers.

The social changes that occur in the lives of children during the end of primary school and the beginning of secondary school in western societies have been categorised as the transition phase, and represents one element of the social construction of childhood in western societies. Through the process of categorisation, society has long sought to explain the relationship that exists between children and socialised adults by highlighting difference through the stages of maturation. As children enter their final year of primary school, the emphasis within the school environment is placed on change. The transition to secondary school represents a new chapter in the lives of children. They leave behind the familiarity of their primary schools and enter a new school, full of new people where little remains constant. Lesson structure is reorganised often based on ability, resulting in new friends and peer group dynamics. For the Welsh/English bilingual children in this research, this transition also presents challenges in terms of language ability and language use. Through outlining the developmental stages of the transition phase, society creates a clear narrative of change that is apparent to the child. The move to secondary school allows them
to enter into adolescence, leaving childhood behind. Subsequently, the narrative of continuity during this period is often much weaker.

Despite this, the findings of this research demonstrate that in some instances television provides the means by which the narrative of continuity can be maintained. Through demonstrating agency, a number of children in this study expressed their affiliation to certain television programmes as a means of holding on to their childhood identities. While societal changes are given and not chosen, media choices provide an avenue by which children are able to express agency and choice. Broadcast media provides a designated space for affiliations to childhood nostalgia to be maintained. As the aim of this research was to gain a better understanding of how bilingual preadolescents negotiate feelings of self through engagement with media, with specific attention given to the provision of Welsh-language media. Looking at the rescheduling and reduction in tween programming by S4C over the past six years, the frustrations felt by many in this research is perhaps exacerbated by the loss of control over another aspect of their social lives. While these feelings were most notable amongst regular S4C viewers (predominantly L1 Welsh-speakers), all the children in this research had some affiliation with the channel at some level.

While changes to the media landscape were an essential part of the reorganisation of S4C following the cuts, the continued rescheduling of tween programming (an already limited commodity) demonstrated a perceived lack of commitment, by the service, to their younger viewers. On numerous occasions the children presented the concept of media othering, with the most notable example being the perception that S4C better suited younger children. As noted, alterations to the schedule were met with particular frustration amongst L1 Welsh-speakers who regularly frequent the channel. The strength of frustration in some instances resulted in the children opting to disregard the channel as they felt their social and cultural needs were not being met. Changes made to the schedule angered many of the children in this study, especially as preschool programmes (at the time of this research) then occupied the after-school timeslot. The significance of scheduling was addressed in Chapter 2 in relation to the changing media landscape. Lury notes how we have now left the ‘four
channel era’ behind (Lury 2002: 25), entering the digital era of choice where temporal viewing and scheduling have become increasingly obsolete. However, there is convincing evidence to suggest that the schedule is still extremely important to children. When discussing the alterations made by S4C to the provision of tween programming, changes to the allocated time slots was the biggest cause for concern amongst the children. Very few made reference to using catch-up services such as iPlayer. This coincides with Ofcom’s latest figures, which state recordings or catch-up services only account for ‘14% of total TV viewing time amongst children aged 4-15’ (Ofcom, 2015: 212).

Ultimately, scheduling remains an important part of children’s viewing culture, yet changes made to the scheduling of tween programming on S4C has perhaps been the most notable during this period of schedule review. In Chapter 2, reference is made to research conducted in 1987 by Thomas, reviewing S4C’s first five years of broadcasting. Specific attention is given to the provision of children’s content by S4C. In his report he noted how S4C did not start broadcasting its children’s content until 5.05p.m, significantly later than its competitor-channels, HTV and the BBC, which resulted in a loss of viewers to these other channels. Despite the concerns voiced by Thomas almost thirty-years-ago, when looking at the current situation on S4C in relation to the scheduling of tween programing, very little appears to have changed in this respect.

Othering and underrepresentation were all listed as reasons why the appeal of Welsh-language content was not as prominent as English-language content. During a period of significant change in the lives of young people, media provides a degree of familiarity, a constant in their lives. Whilst media can provide continuity and stability, especially in the form of scheduled programming and childhood nostalgia, drastic alterations can create tensions and feelings of unrest. When looking specifically at preadolescents during this period of transition, this research has highlighted the difficulties facing this cohort in terms of identity construction during a period of both significant social and physical change. Media provide an element of continuity while everything else around them is changing. S4C, however, with its constant changes to tween
programming, is perhaps ignoring the voice of a group already struggling to find its own voice in society. The disappointment felt by some highlights the shortfalls of the channel in providing a service for ‘tween’ audiences.

7.4 The Relationship Between Childhood Identities and Linguistic Identities: Language Use

Phase 1 results highlighted how the different groups in this study negotiated their complex linguistic identities both individually and collectively. Understanding how language competencies amongst Welsh/English bilinguals differ highlighted the significance that linguistic self-confidence plays in language use. This was also true of the engagement with the language outside the classroom. When looking at the findings from this research, comparisons can be made with the work of Hodges (2009) and her work on school leavers in the Rhymney Valley. Hodges found that without the structure and formality of the educational system for example, the use of the Welsh language by the participants was extremely low, even amongst those from Welsh-speaking homes. While the participants in Hodges’s work were much older than those included in this research, the association of language use to formal settings/domains was evident in both instances. Despite the rise in the number of Welsh-medium schools outside of the Welsh-speaking heartlands, there is a real danger that language use is not sustained outside the formal domains of education or the workplace (Hodges, 2009). Similar to Hodges’s findings, evidence from this research supported the notion that without a formal setting for language use there is a real danger that a number of children in this research may, in time, lose their Welsh. Both Group 4 (Torfaen) and Group 5 (Cardiff) discussed how Welsh was the language spoken at school, but English was the language used in everyday life outside of school.

Despite the growing number of Welsh-medium schools in Wales and the number of young people able to speak Welsh, the Welsh-language community still remains a minority community with around 562,000 speakers (ONS Census figures, 2011). While relatively small in size, the linguistic makeup of this
community is extremely complex, with a number of distinct dialectical variations. As noted in Chapter 2, situations of linguistic prestige are said to be much more prominent in areas where Welsh is more widely spoken (Garrett et al., 2003). In relation to this research, both Group 1 and Group 3 undoubtedly represented areas where the Welsh language was commonplace, however, neither group demonstrated examples of perceived prestige linked to their own accent or dialect. Joanna even noted how her Cofi dialect was, in fact, less correct. Other than the negative perceptions of both Cofi and Wenglish expressed by a number of the groups, there was no reference made to linguistic prestige that favoured one dialect over another. While dialects like Cofi or Wenglish that seemingly 'borrowed' (from the English-language) were considered the least favourable, no reference was made to the preferred or most prestigious Welsh-language dialect.

The other main area of interest discussed in terms of language use was linguistic inclusion and exclusion, based on peer group dynamics and linguistic difference. In the case of Siân (Group 1 – rural Gwynedd) and Catherine (Group 2 – Wrexham), the complexities of peer group inclusion and exclusion were presented in relation to linguistic, regional and national identities. For Catherine (Group 2, Wrexham), she was defined by differences based on her ability to understand southern Welsh [language] accents. In addition to her parents being from south Wales, Catherine represented the only L1 Welsh-speaker in the group. Arguably this distinguished her further from the rest of the group in terms of her perceived language ability. While the children in Group 2 (Wrexham) drew defining lines between regional identities based on accent variation, Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) dismissed Siân’s self-proclaimed difference based on her English roots. Despite Siân’s parents being English, and her referring to her self as English, a number of children in Group 1 were unwilling to accept this. For these children, being Welsh was specifically linked to the ability to speak Welsh. The significance of group inclusion and exclusion based on language ability and regional/national affiliations was clearly extremely important to the children in both groups. During both phases with Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 2 (Wrexham) the linguistic identities of Catherine and Siân
were brought into question. Despite both situations being unique, there was a similarity in responses by both girls. While Catherine (Group 2, Wrexham) had neither acknowledged nor denied being 'from the south' (o’r de) during Phase 1, her response to the same statement during Phase 2 was one of strong denial. While Siân (Group 1, rural Gwynedd) had firmly defended her English roots when questioned during Phase 1, her response during Phase 2 was far more exasperated. In both instances acknowledgment and acceptance of their linguistic difference had been far more prominent during Phase 1, indicating a willingness to be different. However, during Phase 2 this had diminished somewhat suggesting the desire to conform to the norm, perhaps as a result of their new environment.

7.5 Critical Evaluation of the Methodological Approach

This section critically evaluates the methodological approaches utilised in this research, drawing on three areas in particular. Firstly, the benefits of conducting a child-focused study are discussed, along with the justification for not including parents/guardians or teachers in this research. Secondly, the research design is assessed, drawing on the success and shortfalls of the dual-phase study, the pilot study, and the decision to utilise a combined creative and traditional data gathering approach. Finally, the data analysis methodologies are evaluated, looking at the benefits of using thematic analysis in cross-disciplinary research, and specifically, the strengths and weaknesses of template analysis.

7.5.1 A Child Focused Study

Placing children at the heart of this research was a conscious decision to acknowledge the importance of including children in research projects that directly affects them. While information from parents and teachers would have added an addition contextual layer to this research, the focus of this work was to investigate how children themselves negotiate their own relationships with language through media engagement. Despite a number of the responses
displaying characteristics of ‘adults-speak’, voicing adult views or agendas, the decision to not include parents/guardians or teachers in this research was based on the importance of listening the child’s voice.

Media represents an important aspect of social life, especially amongst a ‘digital generation’ (Livingstone, 2009: 1), with no concept of pre-digital life. The aim of this research was to explore whether the media mediate or maintain perceptions of language and identity for bilingual children in Wales. Identity construction was examined from various perspectives focusing on their linguistic, media and childhood identities. As noted by Prout, ‘children are social actors, with a part to play in their own representation’ (Prout, 1999: xii). By utilising a number of methodological approaches designed with young participants in mind, the aim of this research was to provide the children with ample means for self-expression. This was achieved through a combination of both creative and traditional qualitative research methodologies.

In addition to the importance of including children in research from an ethical perspective, dependence on parents/guardians to provide accurate information on their children can also be problematic when considering the validity of research. In Chapter 1, reference was made to the 2013-2014 National Survey; in which it stated 40% of 3-to 15-year-olds in Wales were fluent Welsh speakers (see Figure 3). This figure has since been challenged, with the IWA, stating that serious doubt has been cast over the validity of these figures due to overestimations by parents of their children’s language abilities (Gruffudd, 2012).

While research conducted with children has developed significantly over the past 30 years, the belief that children are not always the best people to provide information on child-related topics still exists in some instances. In Chapter 5, reference was made to the 2013 report commissioned by the BBC, S4C and the Welsh Government entitled *Exploring Welsh speakers’ Language Use in their Daily Lives*. Conducted by Beaufort Research, the objective of this report was to produce a comprehensive overview of the whole Welsh-speaking demographic in Wales in order to; ‘understand what drives Welsh speakers’ behaviours and
perceptions around using the language’ (Beaufort research, 2013: 4), and ‘identify strategies, which may encourage more use of Welsh in daily lives, and more use of Welsh language media content’ (ibid). Specific attention was also given to Welsh-language education in Wales in relation to language ability not translating to language use (Beaufort research, 2013: 8). While the research claimed to include results that reflected the views of children, the data was collected through parental participation on behalf of the child. This demonstrates an approach to research that undermines children’s agency and the salience of their view. While children’s media and education were two topics discussed in this 2013 research, the absence of children in the research gathering process suggests that the voice of the child still remains silent for some researchers.

7.5.2 Research Design and Dual-phase Research

As noted in the previous section, the methodological approach of this research had been designed with great consideration for the participants involved. A combination of traditional and creative research methodologies was used to provide the children with ample means for self-expression. This section looks to evaluate the research design and its implementation through drawing on the advantages and disadvantages of this specific type of dual-phased research. The combined approach of creative and traditional methodologies is then discussed before concluding with an evaluation of the data analysis methodologies.

The transition phase between primary and secondary school represents one of the most significant transitions in the developmental stages of childhood in western society (cf. Durkin 1995). In order to understand the significance of this transition in the lives of preadolescents, a dual-phased approach to the research was formulated in order to track any notable changes in attitudes and behaviours. In addition to the navigation of new environments and social groups, preadolescent children are beginning to experience the physical changes brought on by puberty. Conducting follow-up research with the same group of children before and after their transition from primary to secondary school enabled these changes to be mapped.
While the benefits of conducting a dual-phased study provided a means of framing a comparative narrative between the transitions from primary to secondary school, there were a number of logistical limitations associated with this approach. Despite all efforts to represent a cross-section of the Welsh-speaking demographic, large areas of Wales were not represented in this research. While Groups 1 (rural Gwynedd) and 3 (urban Gwynedd) represented one side of the linguistic spectrum (areas with high number of L1 Welsh-speakers), and Group 2 (Wrexham) and Group 4 (Torfaen) the other (areas with high numbers of L2 Welsh-speakers), including other groups with a greater linguistic diversity may have yielded additional interesting results.

As noted in Chapter 3, ensuring follow-up sessions where possible with the same group of children twelve months on was often problematic. A number of issues arose during the planning stage associated with the feasibility and willingness of schools to participate. Despite contacting schools from 8 different counties in Wales, namely Cardiff, Ceredigion, Carmarthen, Powys, Torfaen, Monmouthshire, Wrexham and Caernarfon, the eventual research undertaken was only possible at schools within four of the counties listed. There were a number of reasons listed, for example finding primary schools that were ‘feeder schools’ for only one secondary school within the locality, and also the availability of Welsh-language education in some areas. Whilst the opinions of children from areas where the provision of Welsh-language education was limited would have been extremely valuable to this research, securing a consistent dual-phased approach did present some logistical problems.

As a result of these logistical problems, the research consisted predominantly of two polar opposite linguistic situations. As noted, both Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 3 (urban Gwynedd) represented predominantly L1 Welsh-language speakers, while Group 2 (Wrexham) and Group 4 (Torfaen) represented predominantly L2 Welsh-speakers. While Group 5 (Cardiff) did represent both L1 and L2 Welsh-speakers; the majority were L2 Welsh-speakers (with 3 L1 and 5 L2 Welsh-speakers). On reflection, it would have been interesting to include groups with even numbers of L1 and L2 speakers. When looking again at Figure 1 (Chapter 1), large areas of Carmarthenshire and Ceredigion have between 30-
50% and 50-70% Welsh speakers. Perhaps more work should have been done to ensure schools from these areas were included in the research, despite the initial difficulties experienced. Having established a number of contacts with schools during the pilot study, there may have been an over dependency on these existing working relationships. On reflection, the establishment of connections with schools in these other areas may have contributed to the research.

As with the process of securing sites for conducting the research, the pilot study also acted as basis for the formulation of the final research methodology design. Having evaluated the strengths and weaknesses of the pilot study, two group exercises were formulated. Exercise 1 was designed to act as an ‘ice-breaker’ question to ease the children in to the research. This opening exercise focused on the individual and asked the children to list their favourite television programmes. Exercise 2 focused on the collective, and was a group activity designed around a large scheduling board. Working as a group, the children needed to build their own television schedule based on their favourite programmes.

When conducting group-based research, consideration must be given to the intra-group dynamics. In relation to this research, and especially considering the age of the participants and the significance of the transition phase, group/peer dynamics played a prominent role when undertaking Exercise 1 and Exercise 2. Dominant characters often influenced both the collective and individual decision-making process. During Exercise 1, individual decisions were occasionally influenced by others, with a number of children choosing programmes based on previous responses given by other members of the group. Initially, I had perceived this to be problematic, whereby results were being influenced by group dynamics leading to inaccurate results. However, when comparing Phase 1 and Phase 2 results and looking at the number of different programmes listed, mapping these decision making patterns became a way of better understanding the changes in peer group dynamics. Figure 26 (Chapter 5) notes how the biggest change in the number for programmes listed during Exercises 1 and 2 were found in the responses given by Group 1 (rural Gwynedd) and Group 4 (Torfaen). In both examples, programme choices often mirrored
previous examples given by other group members. In Chapter 5 this is discussed from the perspective of conforming to peer group expectations/norms, and specifically the influence this had on some of the girls. While initially, Exercise 1 had focused on the individual, there was evidence to suggest that this exercise also demonstrated signs of inter-group dynamics. Overall, Exercise 1 was a successful way of engaging with the children on an individual level while directing the conversation towards a topic that interested them, namely their favourite television programmes. Inevitably there were some children who appeared nervous when initially questioned. As a result of this if they did not want to answer the question immediately, it was important to allow them time to think. On reflection it may have been beneficial to provide the children with pens and paper for them to write down their favourite programmes first, before sharing with the group. However, this may have affected the way in which group dynamics could be observed.

As noted, while Exercise 1 (in theory) had focused on the individual, Exercise 2 was orientated around the collective. Unlike the relative ease of Exercise 1, Exercise 2 required a little more planning. The scheduling board had been designed to be large enough for the children to work on at the same time, however, organising the activity was demanding at times. While observing the groups’ collective decision-making was an important part of the research, some groups’ over-enthusiasm for the task led to a chaotic outcome. In some instances, intervention was needed to ensure focus remained on the task in hand. From a logistical standpoint, schools did not always provide rooms with sufficient seating arrangements or tables, and in these instances, conducting the collective activity proved challenging. The activity worked at its best when conducted at a large table where all participants could clearly see the scheduling board, or on the floor in a hall/ gymnasium where the laminated cards with programme titles could be spread out.

Having successfully completed both exercises, the scheduling board became a reference point for the focus group sessions. While there are a number of benefits to using focus groups, specifically as they allow part of the agenda to be set by the participants, there are, however, drawbacks, especially when
considering the settings in which the research is conducted. Focus groups create an unnatural research setting devised by the researcher. The location or domain in which research is conducted plays a significant role in the design of focus groups research. For example, public, private or educational domains, and the position the researcher holds in the research dynamic, can inevitably influence the outcomes of the research. This is even more prevalent when conducting this type of research with children and young people. For example, conducting research with a child in a school environment could lead the child to view the exercise as an extension of their lesson or even a test, where there must be a right or wrong answer. Buckingham (1993) highlights some of the key issues relating to the way in which children perceive the interview situation, which has significant relevance to this research project. It could be argued that using schools as the setting for conducting research, may affect their perceived freedom to influence the direction of the discussion, as they are in an environment synonymous with rules and agendas set by adults. Gaining access through teachers and conducting research in this environment may lead the child to over-think or judge what is deemed ‘appropriate to say’ (Buckingham, 1993: 63). In addition to this, as an adult researcher in this environment, the dynamic between adult/ child and the question of who holds the power needs to be compared to the relationship that would occur in an adult/ adult research situation.

Dominance by individuals within the peer group can also influence the outcome of focus group research. As a dual-phase research project, the changes within the peer group dynamics during the transition phase were also an area of interest for the research itself. Dominant characters can influence not only group dynamics but also dominate the direction of the discussion.

The limitations associated with focus groups are centred on subjectivity. As a researcher, it is difficult to know how best to interpret the materials produced by the participants, leading to the potential risk of generating unintended meanings. Despite designing the focus group sessions around the notion of inclusion, some participants were reluctant to engage, possibly due to a lack of confidence. Other, more confident participants took charge and subsequently steered the
conversation in their direction. When observing the group activity, it was clear that some participants found voicing their views more difficult than others. It was very important here, as mediator, to ensure individual members of the group felt included and not isolated or alienated.

7.5.3 Data Analysis Methodologies: Thematic Analysis and Template Analysis

As noted in Chapter 3, thematic analysis is the process by which a narrative is created to ‘cast light upon the topic in hand’ (King and Horrocks, 2010: 165). Due to the cross-disciplinary nature of this research, a thematic approach was incorporated throughout this thesis. In Chapter 2, the literature was presented using a ‘soft clustering’ (Wilbur, 2002: 386) approach based on a thematic networking process outlined by Attride-Stirling (2001: 389). This allowed for key themes to be identified and discussed in a cross-disciplinary manner. Reviewing the literature in this way, cemented the three specific a priori themes used in the data analysis.

Considering that the main focus of this research was to explore attitudes towards identity via engagement with Welsh media, it was important to utilise a data analysis tool that would map ‘talk’ as opposed to the technical details of ‘language’ use. While language competence was an important variant, this was not the main concern of the research. Subsequently, the use of thematic analysis was considered the most appropriate, as opposed to other methodologies such as discourse analysis (DA) that focus more on the understanding of ‘language in use’ (Johnstone, 2000: 103). As outlined in Chapter 3, there are many forms of thematic analysis (cf. King and Horrocks, 2010), but, due to the comparative nature of this research (mapping changes between Phase 1 and Phase 2), template analysis was deemed the most appropriate for this dual-phased research.

Having presented the cross-disciplinary connections in Chapter 2, data-focused themes were applied in an attempt to answer research questions 1 to 3. Each theme was then discussed in terms of continuity and change in order to address
the fourth and final research question. The transition phase was the main thread that ran through this dual-phased research. A template was drawn up using the Phase 1 results. In order to map continuities and change, the template was then used to plot Phase 2 results.

**Figure 21 Thematic Network System Mapping the Dual-phase Approach (Chapter 3)**

King and Horrocks (2010) explain how the overlapping of themes is often inevitable when coding data during the preliminary processes of thematic analysis. The nature of this cross-discipline research and the group dynamics of the focus group setting meant that, even after meticulously grouping together themes based on descriptive, interpretative and overarching codes, some segments of text continued to contain overlapping codes. Othering, for example, was one area perhaps overlooked during the initial stages of this research that proved to be an area of significant interest when mapping both continuities and
change during the transitional phase. On reflection, a better-defined set of questions may have helped develop further some of the key themes identified through the codification process.

7.6 Relevance, Impact and Future Research

7.6.1 Importance of Research and Impact

From its foundations rooted in a KTP project, to the development of a substantive doctoral research project, this research has observed one of the most turbulent times in S4C’s 34-year history. As a measure to address the economic recession, the 2010 Comprehensive Spending Review announced funding cuts to a number of government bodies and departments (Edwards, 2011). In addition to a 24% cut to the annual budget, the DCMS announced a three-year plan to hand the majority of the channels’ funding over to the BBC. This abandonment of S4C’s funding formula was met with strong opposition and has since been described as the most ‘damaging thing to happen to the Welsh-language in the last two years’ (Welsh Government, 2012: 3). As a result of these significant changes, the channel underwent a complete internal restructure, forcing the institution to revaluate its content and services. As a consequence, in 2014, S4C published a report entitled The Future of Welsh Language Television, looking at the service’s future beyond 2017. This was S4C’s first public contribution to the discussion and highlighted the severity of the threat facing the future of the service. The review looked specifically at children’s broadcasting and highlighted the success of the channel’s pre-school service. In addition to this, the unique relationship S4C has with education was explored, looking specifically at how its inclusion remit allowed children to expand ‘their experience of entertainment and media alongside their Welsh medium education’ (S4C, 2014: 18-19).

In light of these events, this research has the potential to contribute to this ongoing discussion relating to the future of Welsh-language broadcasting in Wales from the unique perspective of tween audiences. The uncertainty linked to the future of the service arguably poses a real threat to Wales, both economically and culturally, and understanding how this might affect young people in Wales
sits at the heart of this research. Arguably this research also has the potential to be used by media practitioners, policy makers and academics interested in minority language media.

While media engagement by preadolescents was the focal point of this research, there is also potential for this work to be used to gain a better understanding of Welsh-language education, the way Welsh-language education utilises media, and wider studies relating to middle childhood. Lewis (2006) explains how the approach to Welsh-language education in Wales is heavily dependent on regional and linguistic settings. According to his 2006 research, only a small percentage of children in Welsh-medium primary schools in Wales came from homes where Welsh was the dominant language of the home and wider community (Lewis, 2006: 24). With Welsh-language education showing healthy signs of growth, understanding how L2 Welsh-speakers engage with the Welsh language outside of school is a topic of interest for many. Media has long been understood to aid the language maintenance movement, and is especially important for children from non-Welsh speaking backgrounds, who may not have the opportunity to use the language outside the classroom. The educational benefits of own language media were presented in Chapter 4 in relation to the benefits of media use for both conscious and subconscious learning. The use of Welsh-language content by (predominantly primary schools) demonstrated the institutional value of the service, however, as noted by Fennell (2005, cited in Kelly-Holmes), this is not the sole purpose of minority language media. Over reliance can produce content that no longer serves as a platform for the existing language community but simply a tool for education. With the drive to see 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050 (Welsh Government, 2016), understanding how education and digital infrastructure such as media can be utilised is extremely important, making this research both valuable and timely.

7.6.2 Recommendations for Future Research

While the aim of this research was to map continuities and change during the transition phase, it would have been rewarding and informative to expand the
investigation over a four-year period. This would have allowed for continuities and change to be mapped over a longer period of time, highlighting further age-specific trends.

While new media did not play a prominent part in this investigation, there was clear evidence to support the need for further investigations in this field, especially in relation to gender differences and use. Further research focusing on online gaming, social networking sites and Internet use could provide a further dimension to this work, building on the existing cross-disciplinary fields of this research. Despite all efforts made to include groups that represented the diverse linguistic landscape of Wales (in relation to Welsh-speakers and communities), a larger investigation encompassing more areas may have yielded additional interesting results.

7.7 Concluding Remarks

The focus of this investigation was bilingual preadolescents and the extent to which Welsh-language media mediates or maintains perceptions of identity. This study focused on three elements of identity construction, namely linguistic, media and childhood identities. Focusing specifically on Welsh-language broadcasting, one of the key undertakings of this research was to examine how Welsh-speaking children negotiated their complex, multi-layered identities in relation to Welsh-language media as they developed through middle childhood.

The complexity of the media landscape in Wales has allowed Welsh-speaking children to develop a more sophisticated understanding of how broadcast media works. According to S4C’s report on the future of Welsh language broadcasting in Wales, collaborations between production companies and Welsh-language schools enables children to be ‘included on screen, expanding their experience of entertainment and media alongside their Welsh medium education’ (S4C, 2014: 18-19). Through their involvement with the production of broadcast media, and the ways in which the children negotiated both their approach to, and use of Welsh-language media, ideas of self and others have become embedded in their ideologies.
When considering the overarching research question in terms of the media’s role in mediating or maintaining ideas of language and identity amongst bilingual children in Wales, this high proportion of onscreen inclusion provides additional layers to the understanding of identity construction. For the children involved in this research, appearing on Welsh-language television had been normalised by the provision of children’s television on S4C. Whether the experience had been an enjoyable one or otherwise, the children’s involvement in Welsh-language television programmes undoubtedly influenced their feelings of self, either through enhanced feelings of self-consciousness or self-confidence. While S4C’s use of audience participation in the production of children’s programming claims to expand children’s ‘experience of entertainment and media alongside their Welsh medium education’ (S4C, 2014: 18-19), very little work has been done questioning the validity of this ‘inclusion’ remit. While the media is often seen as a way of supporting Welsh-language education in Wales, blurring the boundaries between education and entertainment may lead to negative perceptions of Welsh-language media by young people through its association with the formality of education.

Looking at the Welsh Government’s 2016 draft strategy to achieve 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050, both the prominent roles of education and media are discussed in terms of achieving this goal. Language maintenance campaigns, as outlined in this thesis, place a high level of importance on the need for own language broadcasting to provide a platform/voice for the community in order to be considered as a fully-fledged modernised language community. In addition to this, media provides a ‘robust and modern infrastructure’ (Welsh Government, 2016: 4) to support language growth and maintain language use. Thomas explains how the ‘modern language community is so diverse that it requires broadcast media in order to remain cogent and cohesive’ (Thomas, 1971 cited in Hourigan, 2004: 2). The power of broadcast media is undeniable, especially when considering how television provides language communities with ‘an open channel’ (ibid) for discussion. Language is inherently expressive of culture, and broadcast media provides the sphere in which language can develop, and a sense of identity formed.
Throughout this thesis reference has been made to the statement that Welsh-language media represents more than simply a television station. According to Talfan Davies (2011: 6), S4C ‘holds an iconic position in Wales’ and has helped ‘shape the identity of the Welsh nation’ (ibid) based on three distinct values. Firstly, the channel has a public value, whereby Welsh-language media directly supports the people of Wales culturally and economically. Reference has been made in this research to the ways in which Welsh-language schools, especially those outside the Welsh-speaking heartlands encourage media engagement to sustain language use outside the classroom. The educational benefits of S4C were noted by a number of children in this research, both as a means of supporting their own language acquisition and that of others. In addition to educational support, S4C’s public value refers to the economical benefits of maintaining a thriving media industry. Interestingly, and with reference to Hodges (2009) and Scourfield et al. (2006), this was a means of defining Welshness by the notion that Welsh-language broadcasting represented a viable career path for Welsh-speakers. Secondly, the channel has an institutional value, whereby the channel provides a means of cultural support, servicing the Welsh-speaking community of Wales. In terms of this research, discussions relating to the coverage of national events such as the Urdd Eisteddfod highlighted cultural distinctions between S4C and other channels. Reference was made to the lack of coverage of the Urdd Eisteddfod by other channels, and subsequently how the channel acted as a means of ‘keeping the people of Wales Welsh’ (‘Mae’n cadw pobl Cymru’n Cymraeg’, Hywel, Group 1, Phase 1). Thirdly, the channel has an intrinsic value as a broadcaster; whereby it is responsible for commissioning and airing quality content that appeals to the people of Wales. When looking at the findings from this research, reference was made to a number of Welsh-language programmes that appealed to, and were viewed by the children. However, the topic of authenticity in relation some Welsh-language programmes was questioned, as some felt they often mirrored English-language programmes.

By revisiting the values outlined by Talfan Davies (2011), with reference to the research findings, it is evident that Welsh-language media does in fact mediate and maintain perceptions of language and identity for bilingual children in
Wales. While S4C represented something different for a number of the participants in this research, the values highlighted by Talfan Davies are clearly ingrained in the understanding of national consciousness from a young age. Despite this, the lack of intrinsic value placed on the service by this specific audience is cause for concern. Considering the growth of Welsh-medium education and the increase in the number of Welsh speakers under the age of 16 in Wales, ensuring a service that addresses the social and cultural needs of young people is essential to the survival of the service.
8 Bibliography


BBC, Lleol Gogledd Orllewin. (2014) Cofi Opera. Available at:

BBC, (2015) Denbighshire head teacher sparks Welsh language row. Available at:

BBC, (2015) Celebrating 30 years of Children’s Presentation. Available at:
http://thefroomecupboard.co.uk/page2.htm (Accessed: 30 September 2015.).


Beaufort Research, (2013) Exploring Welsh Speakers’ Language Use in their Daily Lives. Available at:


Department for Education. (2011) *How do pupils progress during Key Stages 2 and 3?* Available at:

Department for Culture, Media and Sport. (2010-2012) *Government Response to the Welsh Affairs Committee's Report on S4C: Fifth Report of Session 2010-12.* Available at:

Department for Media, Culture and Sport. (2015) *BBC Charter Review: Public Consultation.* Available at:


Digital UK (2012) *London.* Available at:

Digital UK (2012) *Wales.* Available at:


308


